AN EXAMINATION OF INTEGRATED MARKETING AS A MEANS OF ACHIEVING RESPONSIVENESS IN AN INSTITUTION OF HIGHER EDUCATION IN ISRAEL: A CASE STUDY

Thesis submitted for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

at the University of Leicester

by

Noga Friedman

Centre for Educational Leadership and Management

School of Education

University of Leicester

October 2005
Abstract

"An Examination of Integrated Marketing as a Means of Achieving Responsiveness in an Institution of Higher Education in Israel: A Case Study"

Noga Friedman

Integrated marketing has become relatively widespread in higher education. Nevertheless, only few formal studies have been carried out on integrated marketing in institutions of higher education. Therefore, the purpose of this study was to examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in an institution of higher education in Israel during a period of change. This change resulted from the creation of several one-year programs, intended to increase student enrollment, which were planned to give students a professional diploma with accreditation in academic courses. However, to implement these programs created a need for marketing to permeate all areas of the organization, i.e. for integrated marketing. This enabled research on integrated marketing to be undertaken as a case study using the research tools of interviews, questionnaires and documents. The main findings were that the institution had a low level of responsiveness, the extent of integrated marketing was low with almost no commitment by senior management, systematic market research was not carried out, no strategic orientation took place, implementation failed, and even the university's performance was low with a decrease in enrollment and dissatisfied students. However, these failures were not negative for this thesis, since they were instrumental in developing a theoretical model for the implementation of integrated marketing. This model, built as a chronological clock, emphasizes that implementing integrated marketing is a circular ongoing process, since marketing is a dynamic activity. It puts a committed top management at its centre because without top managers' true commitment to integrated marketing throughout its implementation, integrated marketing will ultimately fail. The model also suggests that senior management must be committed to continuous research, including not only external market research such as potential students' needs, but also internal research such as satisfaction of current enrolled students and employees' understandings of the importance of integrated marketing.
# List of Contents

Abstract  
List of Contents  
List of Appendices  
List of Tables and Figures  
Acknowledgements  

Chapter 1 – Introduction  
  International Perspective  
  Israeli Perspective  
  Institutional Context  
  Key Marketing Concepts  
  Purpose of the Study  

Chapter 2 – Literature Review  
  Marketing  
  Responsiveness  
  Integrated Marketing  
  Management of Change  
  Subsidiary Research Questions  
  Conceptual Framework  

Chapter 3 – Methodology  
  Defining a Case Study  
  Adopting a Paradigm  
  Selecting Research Tools  
  Interviews
List of Contents

Survey Questionnaires ---------------------------------------- p. 170
Documents-------------------------------------------------------- p. 176
Analysis--------------------------------------------------------- p. 180
Ethical Considerations---------------------------------------- p. 182

Chapter 4 – Findings -------------------------------------------- p. 190

Organizational Structure---------------------------------------- p. 191
The Main Findings of the Case Study--------------------------- p. 195
The Referencing System---------------------------------------- p. 195
The Main Findings Categorised According to the
Research Questions---------------------------------------- p. 197
1. Current level of responsiveness of the university, including
the existing status of the 'One Year Programs'--------- p. 198
2. Present extent of integrated marketing at the
university----------------------------------------------- p. 232
3. Past management of change: implementation of integrated
marketing----------------------------------------------- p. 257
4. Overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts p. 272

Chapter 5 – Discussion------------------------------------------ p. 284

Level of Responsiveness -------------------------------------- p. 286
Extent of Integrated Marketing------------------------------ p. 299
Implementation of Integrated Marketing ------------------ p. 285
Effectiveness of Integrated Marketing--------------------- p. 285
List of Contents

Chapter 6 – Conclusions---------------------------------- p. 332
Recommendations----------------------------------- p. 333
Contribution of this Case Study------------------------ p. 346
New Directions for Further Research --------------- p. 348

References ---------------------------------------------- p. 350

List of Appendices

Appendix A - Interview Schedules ---------------------- p. 366
Appendix B - Student Survey Questionnaire ------------ p. 384
Appendix C - Marketing-Effectiveness Rating Instrument p. 387

List of Tables and Figures

Figure 2.1 - The Process at International University----p. 27
Figure 2.2 - The Exchange between an Educational Institution and its Markets------------------------------- p. 40
Table 2.1 - Levels of Institutional Responsiveness -------- p. 60
Table 2.2 - 4 Ps vs. 4 Cs --------------------------------- p. 85
Table 2.3 - The Stages of Evolution of Integrated Marketing--------------------------------------------------- p. 93
Figure 2.3 - Possible Strategies to Achieve Responsiveness --- p. 97
Figure 2.4 - Organizational Integration ------------------- p. 121
Figure 2.5 - Organizational Segregation------------------- p. 122
Figure 2.6 - Conceptual Framework------------------------ p. 130
Table 4.1 - Management Interviews ----------------------- p. 162
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2 - Administration Interviews</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3 - Marketing Interviews</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.4 - Responsible for Telemarketing Interviews</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.5 - Israeli Marketing Department Interviews</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.6 - Russian Marketing Department Interviews</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.7 - Lecturers Interviews</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.8 - Student Pilot A Interview</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.9 - Student Pilot B Interview</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.10 - Student Pilot C Interviews</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.1 - Former Organizational Structure</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.2 - Current Organizational Structure</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.1 - The Referencing System</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.3 - Satisfaction with Management</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.2 - Satisfaction with Management</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.4 - Satisfaction with Marketing Department</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.3 - Satisfaction with Marketing Department</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.5 - Satisfaction with Secretariat</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.4 - Satisfaction with Secretariat</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.6 - Satisfaction with Lecturers</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.5 - Satisfaction with Lecturers</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.7 - Satisfaction with Ambience</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.6 - Satisfaction with Ambience</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.8 - Satisfaction with Content of Studies</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.7 - Satisfaction with Content of Studies</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.9 - Satisfaction with Level of Studies</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.8 - Satisfaction with Level of Studies</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.10 - How Students came to the University</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.11 - Past and Present Students</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4.12 - New Immigrants 10 to 20 Years in Israel</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4.13 - New Immigrants less than 10 Years in Israel --- p. 277
Figure 4.10 - Satisfaction with the University --------------- p. 281
Table 4.14 - Satisfaction with the University --------------- p. 281
Table 4.15 - Scores in the Marketing-Effectiveness Rating
Instrument --------------------------------------------------------- p. 283
Figure 5.1 - Conceptual Framework------------------------------- p. 284
Table 5.1 - International University's Level of Institutional
Responsiveness ---------------------------------------------------- p. 287
Table 5.2 - Grading the Level of Institutional
Responsiveness ---------------------------------------------------- p. 288
Figure 5.2 - Scale for Levels of Institutional
Responsiveness ---------------------------------------------------- p. 289
Table 5.3 - Grading International University’s Level of
Institutional Responsiveness with Equal Weights given to each
Factor --------------------------------------------------------------- p. 290
Table 5.4 - Grading International University’s Level of
Institutional Responsiveness with Different Weights given to
each Factor--------------------------------------------------------------- p. 291
Table 5.5 - Grading the Level of Institutional Responsiveness
by Academic Quality ----------------------------------------------------- p. 297
Table 5.6 - Grading the University's Level of Responsiveness
by Academic Quality----------------------------------------------------- p. 298
Table 5.7 - 4 Ps vs. 4 Cs--------------------------------------------- p. 300
Figure 5.3 - Scale for Tendency towards the 4 Ps or towards the
4 Cs --------------------------------------------------------------- p. 300
Table 5.8 - The 4 Ps vs. 4 Cs at International University ---- p. 304
Table 5.9 - The Extent of Integrated Marketing ------------------- p. 306
Figure 5.4 - The Ongoing Process of Integrated Marketing -- p. 307
Table 5.10 - The Weighted Extent of Integrated Marketing-- p. 308
Table 5.11 - The Extent of Integrated Marketing at International University ---------------------------------- p. 313
Figure 5.5 - Organizational Integration ------------------------- p. 319
Figure 5.6 - Current Organizational Structure ----------------- p. 320
Figure 5.7 - Former Organizational Structure------------------- p. 321
Figure 5.8 - Typology of Customer Satisfaction --------------- p. 326
Figure 5.9 - Typology of Perceived Performance --------------- p. 327
Figure 5.10 - Enrolment as a Continuous Process------------- p. 328
Figure 6.1 - Clock Model for the Implementation of Integrated Marketing ---------------------------------------------- p. 333
Acknowledgements

In a similar manner to integrated marketing where all the departments of one institution collaborate to achieve a common goal, my own journey towards the Ph.D. degree has been an integrated collaboration of number of people that I would like to thank.

Firstly, I would like to thank Dr. Mark Lofthouse, my tutor, who supervised my work, helped me a great deal and supported me and my family in good times as well as in some difficult times we went through.

I would also like to thank Dr. Neil Burton who was my first tutor and started with me the process of my Ph.D. work and the focus of this study.

All people at Leicester University also deserve my gratitude for their continuous support. This includes the wonderful lecturers from the summer school and winter schools as well as the administration personnel who were always willing to lend a helping hand. I would like to offer special thanks to Dr. Marianne Coleman who let me be a guest in one of her lectures in a summer school that took place before I enrolled to the Ph.D. studies. I enjoyed this lecture very much and it helped me in my decision to join the Ph. D. studies at Leicester University.

I would like to thank the numerous participants in this case study. I could have never completed this research without their help. This is especially the true of the president of the Israeli institution who gave me the permission to research in depth integrated marketing in his organization.
For me, undertaking the Ph.D. studies was indeed a long journey not only of hard work but also in a period in which I had three more children. (When I started my Ph.D. studies I already had a one year old child.) I came to the summer and winter schools with babies and also came to Leicester twice when I was pregnant. Therefore, I would like to thank my wonderful family that without their support I would never have been able to accomplish my studies. A very special thanks to my mother, Mrs. Etty Redler, who not only helped us daily but even came with me and all the family to Leicester to all the summer and winter schools. I don’t know how I could have done it without her. I would like to thank my four children, Shlomo, Tehila, Nathaniel and Inbar, for having a lot of patience during this period.

Finally, I would like to thank my love Moti who took care of our four kids so I could spend the necessary time studying. His never-ending support allowed me turn an impossible mission to a possible one.

Sincerely yours,
Noga Friedman
Chapter 1: Introduction

Marketing is so basic that it cannot be considered a separate function... It is, first, a central dimension of the entire business. It is the whole business seen from the customer's point of view. Concern and responsibility for marketing must, therefore, permeate all areas of the enterprise. (Drucker, 1973, p. 63)

From the date, it can be seen that the importance of marketing for the organization as a whole has been known for quite some time. However, it is only relatively of late that universities and colleges worldwide are adopting business approaches, such as the one proposed by Drucker, as 'making a direct comparison between a university and a business would have been shocking a few decades ago' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 4). Today, institutions of higher education realize that their success is also dependent on their students, who are regarded as informed consumers (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 4). With the dramatic rise in the sophistication level of the general public with regard to media promotion, marketing an institute of higher education demands much more than media blitzes and fancy promotional gimmicks (Zeiss, 1986, pp. 1-2).

Enrolment management, which is an organizational concept and systematic set of activities whose purpose is to exert influence over student enrolments (Hossler and Bean, 1990, p. 5), is becoming increasingly important. In order to increase enrolment, universities and colleges are responding to the market by developing new curricula and programs, as 'the curriculum must be regarded as central to any marketing considerations' (Coleman, 1994, p. 368). These programs, in order to satisfy stakeholders' actual demands, are trying to gain a competitive edge through price, quality, content (cross discipline and vocational) and convenience such as course provision via the

An Israeli institution of higher education (where the author of this thesis has been both a consultant and a part-time lecturer) also tried to gain a competitive advantage by developing new programs to respond to market demand. Due to a decrease in student enrolment to several three-year degree awarding programs, the management of the institution decided to create several one-year programs. These programs were planned to give students a professional diploma with accreditation in academic courses. The students could then choose to leave with the diploma or continue for two more years and get a degree. Yet to implement these programs created a need for marketing to permeate all areas of the organization. This situation offered a unique opportunity to research the business oriented subject of marketing in an institution of higher education during a period of change, thus shedding more light on a subject which has remained problematic to assess in colleges (Lumby, 2001, p. 67).

This thesis will present, in detail, a case study focusing on the implementation of marketing in an entire institution of higher education. In this chapter, as an introduction to the subject of the research, the international changes in the world of higher education, including Israel, will be discussed first. Secondly, the institute of higher education, on which this case study is centred, will be introduced. Thirdly, several definitions of marketing and key related issues will be examined in both general and educational contexts. Fourthly, the purpose of this study, including its research questions, will be elaborated. Finally, the remaining chapters of the entire thesis will be outlined in the context of the research purpose and its research questions.
INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE

Higher education is changing worldwide as universities are opening branches in various countries and are entering the world of distance learning. 'The now-ageing adage of 'think global, act local' has been given new impetus in education due to widening participation, increasing demand for knowledge skills and the removal of the protective barriers of time and space' (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 6). A useful framework for analyzing the international changes in higher education is that offered by Yee (1998, pp. 1-2), stating that the key sources of externally motivated reforms in higher education institutions, such as colleges, are:

- **Societal needs and expectations.** Higher education institutions face increasing pressure to respond to shifting societal trends.
- **International competition.** The industrial globalization requires workers that are highly skilled in adapting to international cultures.
- **Educational competition.** One method of handling the increasing educational competition is to revise curricula to meet students' future needs.
- **Technological developments.** There is a need for students to gain technological literacy, due to economic and labour force pressures.
- **Legislative action.** In some instances, legislation is the driving force behind reform in higher education.

Societal Needs and Expectations

The shifting societal trends, such as the addition of older workers, women and immigrants to the work force, are changing the labour market worldwide. According to Imel and Kerka (1989) the labour market is:
The labour market is the interaction of individuals competing for jobs (occupations) and employers (industries) competing for workers, usually in a particular geographic area. Although for some occupations there is a national labour market, for most the applicable labour market area is local. (P. 1)

Any labour market, due to technical changes in the workplace, is in a constant state of change with rising demand for further education (Cohen, 1995, p. 73). This puts pressure on institutions of higher education to supply the increasing demand, creating a situation where ‘new providers are emerging into the learning environment to meet this demand’ (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 6).

International Competition

The demand for higher education is also increasing due to international business competition, and hence ‘global corporations are also reaching into areas of teaching and knowledge traditionally held to be the preserve of higher education institutions’ (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 6). According to Philpott (1994, pp. 21-25) in order to meet the competitive challenges of a global economy, businesses are looking for employees who have intercultural communication skills, and an understanding of the political, geographical, and technological conditions that influence work in other countries. Voght and Schaub (1992) compared the United States in the international community relative to other countries, such as Japan and the Western European nations. Their conclusion is that:

We lack citizens in many professional fields who can communicate in foreign languages and understand other cultures and value systems. For the most part, our schools do not incorporate global perspectives in their curricula. Most college students do not develop the expertise to understand even one foreign language and culture. (P. 1)
Voght and Schaub (1992, p. 1) therefore argue that American professionals have a problem with relationships with colleagues in foreign countries and are not as open as they should be to ideas from outside the USA. This demand for skills, not only in the USA, can be handled by educational institutions in different ways. For example, in Turkey, due to the high demand of English skills in order to work abroad and to land lucrative jobs, English-only universities are continuously being opened (Boss, 1999, p. 16).

**Educational Competition**

The increase in demand for higher education has increased competition among higher education institutions, not only with other institutions from their own country but from institutions in other countries as well. There is an increase in popularity of study abroad programs and other limited international opportunities (Sanborn, 1991, p. 1). In the European Community nations, student mobility is increasing. The goal is to enable at least 10 percent of European Community students to acquire academic training in another member state (Pickert, 1992, p. 2). The United States draws more foreign exchange students than any country (Chandler, 1989). According to Pickert (1992), Asian students make up the majority of foreign students enrolled in U.S. institutions. Smith and Steward (1995) noted that ‘currently there are 240,000 Asians studying in the U.S.’ (p. 25).

The international educational competition is pushing institutions to work together on international projects with local, national, and international businesses and organizations. According to Pickert (1992):
The decentralized nature of American higher education allows state and private institutions to make contact with educators abroad, bring curricula into consonance with job requirements, and devise ways to carry out the international aspects of institutional missions... As colleges and universities worldwide expand joint educational endeavors, they influence one another's views of and participation in this field. (P. 2)

Technological Developments

Developments in information and communication technology (ICT) have also altered the world of higher education, as they 'have accelerated global collaboration and offer a springboard for future growth' (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 6). One of the primary examples is e-learning. According to Ryan et al. (2000), a round table of high-level educators and administrators, focusing on the impact of technologies on universities, concluded that:

- new learning technologies can transform the way knowledge is packaged, delivered, accessed, acquired, and measured, altering higher education's core production and delivery processes;

- students will demand flexible, targeted, accessible learning methods, potentially altering higher education's traditional role;

- a huge population of new learners - estimated at millions more students in the next decade - would expand the total market for education and entice new competitors;

- relying on technology rather than bricks and mortar, non-traditional competitors will give colleges and universities a run for their money.

(Rpp. 12-13)

Ryan et al. (2000, pp. 15-17) state that there are similar international trends in the use of ICT in higher education, including various countries such as
the USA, Australia and even Africa with the World Bank-funded African Virtual University. According to Ryan et al. (2000, p. 13), the international interest in using ICT for teaching and learning is partially due the fact that ICT provides a cost-efficient way of expanding higher education. In the UK, universities are now investing heavily in ICT and some examples of investments characterized by large numbers of networked workstations are found in library extensions in De Montfort University, resource centres at Hertfordshire or learning centres in John Moores and Sunderland (Ryan et al., 2000, p. 13).

**Legislative Action**

Finally, nations are trying to sustain a competitive advantage in the international world of business through legislation regarding higher education. For example, in a major U.S. government initiative, the National Security Education Act of 1991 tripled federal spending on undergraduate study abroad. This law provides more money for overseas graduate research and also grants to support programs in international studies and foreign languages (Pickert, 1992, p. 2). This legislation, however, decreases the competitive advantage of the local U.S. institutions of higher education, increasing the importance of marketing not only for U.S. institutions, but also for any institution of higher education worldwide.

    Universities and colleges will have to be more aggressive in the way they market themselves with this much broader and global competition. To survive they will need to adopt the language and the nature of the market. (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 7)

This is especially true of Israel, where there have been extreme changes in higher education, ranging from competition to legislation.
ISRAELI PERSPECTIVE

In Israel, as in other parts of the world, the higher education system has gone through various changes. The increased competition in Israel, due to the entry of international universities and new Israeli colleges, is forcing all institutions of higher education to constantly examine whether their marketing strategies are in touch with the market’s needs. Accordingly, in this section, the higher education system will be presented, from its history up to its present competitive situation. Then, the soaring demand for academic degrees in Israel will be discussed, including the market segments that create this demand for higher education.

The Higher Education System in Israel

According to the Council for Higher Education in Israel (July 2003, Online), the beginnings of the higher education system in Israel can be found in the 1920's when the Technion (in 1924) and the Hebrew University of Jerusalem (in 1925) opened. These were the only universities when the State of Israel was established in 1948, with about 1,600 students. In response to a demand for higher education (due to the increase in population, economic developments and social developments) five new universities were established during the 1950's and 1960's: Bar-Ilan University, Tel-Aviv University, the University of Haifa, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, and the Weizmann Institute of Science.

In 1958 the Council for Higher Education was founded under the ‘Council for Higher Education Law’ (Council for Higher Education in Israel, July 2003, Online). It is the state institution in Israel responsible for higher education, including teaching and research. This includes permitting an
institution to open an institution for higher education, granting accreditation to an institution as an institution of higher education and authorizing an accredited institution to award an academic degree. The council’s chairman is the Minister of Education who is responsible for the implementation of the Council for Higher Education Law and appoints the council’s director-general.

According to the Council for Higher Education in Israel (July 2003, Online), in the middle of the 1970’s there was a further stage in the development and diversification of the higher education system in Israel. The Open University of Israel began its operation and soon extended all over the country. Also, at the end of the 1970’s, post-secondary teacher training seminaries were transformed into institutions of higher education. In the 1980’s the demand for higher education continued to rise which created the basis for international universities to enter Israel. One of the first was Boston University that awarded a joint degree with Ben-Gurion University of the Negev with all studies in the English language.

However, the greatest period of change to Israel’s higher education system can be found in the 1990’s (Council for Higher Education in Israel, July 2003, Online). Firstly, in the 1990’s, the 10th amendment to the Council for Higher Education Law made possible the opening of various academic colleges such as general colleges, technological colleges and colleges devoted to one profession or discipline. Secondly, the innovative extra-budgetary status was introduced. This meant that some of the new colleges would not be publicly supported (or budgeted) by any government or State agent. This also gave a basis for international institutions to open an extension in Israel.
The mid 1990's were the peak of the international extensions with close to forty institutions operating in Israel from countries as the USA, Britain, Australia, South Africa, Spain, Moldavia and Latvia. However, in February 1998, the 11th amendment to the Council for Higher Education Law was created (Council for Higher Education in Israel, October 2003, Online). It stated that any institution wishing to create an extension in Israel must get a license from the Council for Higher Education in Israel. The result was that during the next several years, the licenses of over ten universities were revoked. By April 2001 there were only 25 different international institutions of higher education allowed to operate in Israel including 14 from the USA, 9 from Britain, one from Australia and one from South Africa (Council for Higher Education in Israel, April 2001, Online). All of them had to improve in order to continue to stay open.

Today, only 18 extensions remain of which 12 are from the USA, 3 from Britain, one from Australia, one from South Africa and a new one from Russia (Council for Higher Education in Israel, October 2003, Online). The higher education system in Israel also includes eight universities, about twenty-four academic institutions that are not universities (both budgeted and extra-budgetary), twenty-six institutions for the training of teachers and a number of academic programs at regional colleges, for which universities are academically responsible (Council for Higher Education in Israel, July 2003, Online). All these competitors in Israel and even technological changes in the way studies are being offered to students - such as the Open University of Israel's use of information and communication technology (Beller, 1997, p. 1) - are caused by the increasing demand for higher education.
Demand for Higher Education in Israel

The demand for academic degrees has changed enormously in Israel over the past several years both in terms of the increasing number of students and the shifts in subjects of studies. The number of students at all degree levels, whether bachelor's, master's or doctorate, increased from 76,000 in 1990 to 216,939 in 2002 (Council for Higher Education in Israel, July 2003, Online). However, the most popular are business studies, according to Lan (2001, p. 48), as there are some forty different programs in business administration for students to choose from. Lan (2001, p. 49) states that the number of students learning towards a degree in business in Israel is estimated over 20,000 in the various universities and colleges.

This increase in enrolment to business programs is not even being slowed by the economic situation in Israel. According to Fleisher-Levy (2002, p. 8), even though there is talk of recession in Israel, those at the head of the various business schools testify that the demand for business administration is just rising. This is partially due to the fact that, although there is no equality in managerial positions between men and women in the Israeli market, the various academic institutions report that there is an increase in the number of female students that enrol to business studies (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). Another reason is that there have been decreases in other subjects studied.

According to the Council for Higher Education in Israel (April 2001, Online), there was a decrease of 14% in the year 2000 in enrolment to the faculties of humanities (including history, philosophy, literature, linguistics and Jewish studies) as only 6,000 students enrolled. One of the main reasons that before more students enrolled to humanities is that there was
an unanswered demand for higher education which Israeli universities refused to meet (Ritov, 2001, p. 36). Therefore, a student that was not accepted to studies such as business, law or engineering would go study in one of the faculties of humanities. However, this created a situation in Israel where the demand for higher education in several fields of study had out paced the local supply, resulting in extensions of foreign universities answering this demand (Ritov, 2001, p. 36).

Kotler (2000) defines demands as ‘wants for specific products backed by an ability to pay’ (p. 11) and people were indeed willing to pay for a higher education in Israel that could meet their demands. Although foreign universities’ fees are expensive when compared to the local Israeli institutions, they are in high demand by various segments of Israeli students (Ritov, 2001, p. 36). According to Izraeli (1980, p. 83) a market segment is part of the potential market of the firm. The market segments that created the soaring demand for higher education in Israel include:

- Status seekers.
- Convenience seekers.
- Degree seekers.
- Career changers.
- Professional advancers.
- Quality seekers.

**Status seekers** feel that a degree will lead to increased income and prestige (Miaoulis and Kalfus, 1983, p. 14). According to Ritov (2001, p. 36), the employees of public institutions will get a higher salary due to an academic degree, as in Israeli public institutions wages are determined by seniority and academic degrees. As seniority is only a matter of time in the
institution, the only thing that can be acquired is an academic degree, which automatically increases the salary of the employee of the public institution. Therefore, these employees of public institutions were not only interested in status but in convenience as well.

Convenience seekers enrol in programs that are located near their homes or jobs and have simple registration procedures with low acceptance standards (Miaoulis and Kalfus, 1983, p. 14). Ritov (2001, p. 36) maintains that the high demand for higher education from extensions of foreign universities in Israel was due to the fact that these have lower acceptance standards as compared to the Israeli institutions of higher education. These extensions also allow the more flexible (and therefore convenient) solution of completing an academic degree for students who have accumulated credits in past higher education studies.

Degree seekers believe that a degree is essential to being job-competitive in today's business environment and therefore want programs, which are "credible" and conveniently located (Miaoulis and Kalfus, 1983, p. 14). Lan (2001, p. 49) argues that a degree in business administration is perceived today in Israel as an essential requirement for top management in the Israeli market and as profession enables to enter numerous fields, which can allow to change a career.

Career changers want different job positions or employees as they have worked for several years and typically perceive themselves to be in dead-end jobs, so the benefit they seek is career flexibility (Miaoulis and Kalfus, 1983, p. 14). As a degree in business administration, according to Lan (2001, p. 49), allows to enter various fields ranging from entrepreneurship to management, it can provide the benefit of career and job flexibility.
**Professional advancers** strive to climb the corporate ladder, wanting professional advancement, higher income, job flexibility, and upward mobility (Miaoulis and Kalfus, 1983, p. 14). Fleisher-Levy (2001, p. 18) argues that recent rush of students in Israel to computer studies was mainly due to the financial rewards promised to them at the end of their studies, without any interest in the quality of the studies. However, Fleisher-Levy (2001, p. 19) maintains that this trend is changing due to the crisis that started in the year 2000 in the high-tech industry in Israel with thousands of employees being laid off work. Therefore, in her research, which included interviews with the heads of departments of computer science in universities such as Bar-Ilan, Haifa and the Hebrew University, it was discovered that there is a consensus that today those who come to study are interested in quality and not just getting a degree.

**Quality seekers** are the members of a segment that desire the highest quality education available in their communities and that believe a first-rate education will benefit them throughout their business lives (Miaoulis and Kalfus, 1983, p. 14). In his interview (Fleisher-Levy, 2001, p. 20), Prof. Dolev, head of the School of Engineering and Computer Science at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, maintained that before the main focus of the students was on their workplace. Today, he claims, more and more students are focusing only on studying, having realized the importance of academic studies, the necessity of understanding processes in depth and that few successes are born from improvisations. Therefore, all institutions of higher education in Israel had to make changes, including the institution on which this case study centres.
INSTITUTIONAL CONTEXT

The chosen institution for this research is one of many international universities offering various relatively similar degrees to potential Israeli students. This institution was one of the survivors of the 11th amendment to the Council for Higher Education Law. This amendment stated that any institutions wishing to create an extension in Israel must get a license from the Council for Higher Education in Israel (Council for Higher Education in Israel, October 2003, Online). Like all the other 'survivors' it was desperately trying to improve its quality in order to continue to get a permanent license from the Council for Higher Education. This resulted in the one-year programs, which initiated this doctoral thesis. One of the conditions of access (which will be presented in detail in the methodology chapter) is that the researched institution must remain as anonymous as possible. Therefore, a pseudonym was given to the institution calling it 'International University' and certain identifying details were omitted.

The ‘Mother’ Institution

International University is located in an English speaking country and is focused on professional preparation with an emphasis on technology. International University offers various different majors, ranging from Accounting and Business to Computer Information Systems and Web Development. International University has developed a number of programs to help the students get acquainted with the growing global village. Students at International University can spend a semester abroad, and foreign students from over twenty countries are currently studying at the home campus. Students are even earning International University
degrees and taking courses through International University On-line, the university's distance learning program, which allows students to take courses from their own homes via the World Wide Web.

There are also campuses in several other countries (including Israel) that allow students to earn International University degrees without the expenses of leaving their own countries. According to Kotler (1997, p.413), 'companies that operate in one or more foreign markets must decide how much to adapt their marketing strategy- mix to local conditions'. At one extreme: a standardized marketing mix- standardization of the product, advertising, and distribution channels. At the other extreme is an adapted marketing mix- the producer adjusts the marketing-mix elements to each target market. International University has chosen a marketing mix strategy and therefore a local company runs each campus in each country.

The Israeli Extension

International University offers the completion of undergraduate degrees in Israel through a contractual agreement with an Israeli company. The Israeli company managing the extension has administrative responsibility for actions such as enrolling students or recruiting lecturers and employees. However, all academic decisions must be coordinated with International University. Israeli students can earn International University bachelor's degrees in Business or Professional Studies with career concentrations in business, software development, travel and tourism, hotel-restaurant management, and public relations and media-communications. Israeli lecturers and English speaking lecturers (that either stay in Israel for a semester or lecture through video conferencing) teach the students.
Marketing in the Israeli Extension

In the past, International University, just like its competitors, was able to enroll students using ads in the newspapers. However, in 1998, with the new regulation derived from the 11th amendment to the Council for Higher Education Law, new marketing strategies were needed. Potential students were now very wary of international institutions offering degrees in Israel since some of these universities’ licenses were revoked leaving their students in a delicate situation. Potential students were now demanding to see confirmation of approval from the Council for Higher Education before enrolling. In 1999 the Israeli senior management decided that there is need to create a marketing department that basically did not exist until then.

KEY MARKETING CONCEPTS

A firm theoretical basis for this study on the subject of marketing will be established in the literature review chapter. However, it is important at this stage to give brief definitions of the terms to be used as the focus of this research was marketing in higher education. Accordingly, the first question is ‘What is marketing?’ According to Izraeli (1980), there is agreement among professionals on the general issues but there is an ongoing debate on which fields of marketing should be emphasized. He offers the following definition:

Marketing is a process whose objective is to satisfy people’s needs through an exchange transaction agreed upon its participants. (Izraeli, 1980, p. 14)

Although this definition gives a general idea of the subject of marketing it is not a detailed one. According to Kotler (1997):
Marketing is a social and managerial process by which individuals and groups obtain what they need and want through creating, offering, and exchanging products of value with others. (p. 9)

Although this definition has some similarities to that of Izraeli, Kotler’s definition is more complete as it also explains that the process of marketing is ‘social and managerial’, it includes both ‘individuals and groups’ and involves ‘creating, offering, and exchanging products of value’. However, even in this more complete definition, it is not clear where the emphasis should be. Should it be on the needs of the customer (the student in higher education), on the exchange process, which is the actual selling (known as student enrolment) or on the product itself (that is also composed of the curriculum)? According to Foskett (1998, p.49), who also agrees that marketing is a problematic concept and not just in the area of education, there are three perspectives on marketing:

1. Product-orientated organizations which are concerned primarily with the product or service that they have skills and expertise in producing, and the customer’s perspective is subordinate to this aim. This is the traditional perspective in education where the student is not seen as a customer and must receive what the ‘professionals’ dictate.

2. Sales-orientated organizations, which have a strong product focus, but recognize that selling is central to their survival. For example, in higher education in Britain in the 1970s there was a great deal of excess demand to supply, so universities could adopt the product-oriented approach. When this later changed, and the supply was greater than the demand, universities tried to sell vigorously what they were already offering.

3. Marketing-orientated organizations, in which the satisfaction of customer ‘wants’ is central. Therefore, it is not enough just to
vigorously sell what is already offered but to change what is offered as to satisfy customer 'wants'. Marketing must not just be seen as 'sales' team activity but must be seen as part of the whole organization.

In this last perspective Foskett answers the question raised earlier and puts responsiveness to the customer needs and wants at the centre of importance. According to Berry and Parasuraman (1991, p. 16), responsiveness is the willingness to help customers and to provide prompt service. Although this definition addresses the fact that for an organization to be responsive, it must prepared to satisfy the customer wants it does not deal with initiative which is essential for responsiveness to succeed. Lumby (1999), in a working definition of responsiveness, suggests 'that responsive schools and colleges are neither those who do as they wish taking no account of others, nor those who do as students, parents, employers ask without question, but rather those who have resolved the issue of to whom they wish to respond with some exactness and commitment, and have moved beyond involving others to empowering them' (p. 195).

In this definition Lumby is stressing that not only willingness is important for successful responsiveness but also how an institution responds is imperative. Lumby, by emphasizing empowerment, is also suggesting that responsiveness could be created by the whole organization, which is in agreement with Foskett that implies in this last perspective of marketing-orientated organizations that marketing should be an integrated process across an organization without, however, defining it. Kotler (1997) offers the following definition:

**Integrated Marketing**- when all the company's departments work together to serve the customer's interests, the result is integrated marketing. Integrated marketing takes place on two levels. First, the various marketing functions-sales force,
advertising, product management, marketing research, and so on—must work together... second, marketing must be well coordinated with other company departments. (p. 23)

Integrated marketing starts with commitment from top administration to a strategic marketing process, which according to Zeiss (1986, p. 1) is the first step necessary in order to create positive positioning of a higher education institute such as a college.

Indeed, a comprehensive marketing strategy, to be effective, must involve the efforts of the entire campus staff and must be based upon sound marketing research. Further, top-level management must utilize a strategic decision-making process that involves 1) a clear focus of institutional mission, 2) a clear understanding of whom the college serves, and 3) precise knowledge of what makes its services unique. (Zeiss, 1986, p. 2)

In International University, marketing research was the first stage in implementing a new strategy. The pursuit of a new marketing strategy was driven by a decrease in student enrolment to several existing three-year degree awarding programs. Thus, in an attempt to improve the institution’s responsiveness to the market, the new marketing manager - through research conducted by informal interviews of students, potential students and employers - identified a need for the development of professional skill-based programs. The result was the creation of several one-year programs that were intended to give students a professional diploma with accreditation in academic courses.

However, for this initiative to succeed, it was required that all the departments of the institution work together in integrated marketing as to respond to the customer's interests. As 'few formal studies have discussed integrated marketing in the higher education setting' (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 9), this presented a unique opportunity to research a topic which
‘could very well bring a permanent change to how colleges and universities in the future are planned and managed all over the world’ (Lauer, 2001, p. 141). Furthermore, in Israel, not only did this lack of formal research on integrated marketing exist, but also the general subject marketing has surprisingly received little attention. For example, during the time this thesis's purpose was being formulated, none of the 52 faculty members in Bar-Ilan University's School of Education had published any material regarding the subject of marketing in education (School of Education at Bar-Ilan University, August 2001, Online).

PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

The outline purpose of the research that was conducted at International University is:

♦ To examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in an institution of higher education in Israel during a period of change.

From this it can be seen that although there is the question whether the marketing department succeeded in correctly identifying the customer wants, the main focus of this research is on the implementation of the actual responsiveness through integrated marketing. Consequently, the research questions in this subsection also concentrate on integrated marketing.
Research Questions

1. What is the current situation of the 'One Year Programs', which were initiated due to International University's responsiveness to the market?
2. As responsiveness created a need for integrated marketing, since it required all the departments of this educational institution to work together to implement the 'One Year Programs', did effective integrated marketing take place?
3. What could be concluded from this case study on integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness and could a theoretical framework be developed that would be relevant to other institutions of higher education?

OUTLINE OF THE THESIS

To answer the research questions, the thesis will be composed of the following remaining chapters:

The literature review chapter will adopt Yin's (1994) point of view of reviewing ‘previous research to develop sharper and more insightful questions about the topic’ (p. 9). Therefore, it will assess the topics of responsiveness (in the context of marketing in education and its importance in program design which comprises curriculum development), integrated marketing (including comparing it to traditional marketing) and management of change. Examining these subjects will allow adding detail to the research questions as to further focus them. Consequently, the literature review chapter will end with the sharpened research questions that are the basis for the methodology chapter.
The **methodology** chapter, in the context of the sharpened research questions, will present the case study tools of interviews, documentary analysis and a survey. It will include a discussion on the reasons these tools were adopted for the study on integrated marketing at International University and how will the data they collected be analyzed. It will also address aspects of triangulation, possible generalization of the findings, trustworthiness, access and ethics.

The **findings** chapter, based on the issues raised by the sharpened research questions, will describe the collected data on integrated marketing at International University. It will only present the results from the methodological tools in the form of major themes that emerge from the study, leaving the analytical level to the next chapter, the discussion chapter.

In the **discussion** chapter the findings on integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness will be scrutinized, comparing them to the material covered in the literature review chapter. This will allow discussing possible rival theories that explain the findings, creating the basis for the **conclusions** chapter.

The last chapter of this thesis, the **conclusions** chapter, will evaluate retrospectively the research at International University and its contribution to the field of marketing in higher education. General recommendations for improving the implementation of integrated marketing will be given. This chapter will bring to a close the entire thesis by suggesting new directions for further research on the subject of integrated marketing.
SUMMARY

In this chapter, the introduction to the research was presented, starting with the importance of marketing to the whole organization. It was noted that due to a decrease in student enrolment to several three-year degrees awarding programs, management decided to create and market several one-year programs. As the implementation of these programs created a need for marketing to permeate all areas of the organization, a unique opportunity arose to research a business oriented marketing approach in an Israeli institution of higher education during a period of change.

Firstly, the international changes in higher education were analyzed using the following framework:

- **Societal needs and expectations.** Higher education institutions face increasing pressure to respond to shifting societal trends.
- **International competition.** The industrial globalization requires workers that are highly skilled in adapting to international cultures.
- **Educational competition.** One method of handling the increasing educational competition is to revise curricula to meet students' future needs.
- **Technological developments.** There is a need for students to gain technological literacy, due to economic and labour force pressures.
- **Legislative action.** In some instances, legislation is the driving force behind reform in higher education.

The Higher Education System in Israel was then overviewed as to create a basis for comparison in further discussion. It was shown to include eight universities, about twenty-four academic institutions that are not
universities (both budgeted and extra-budgetary), twenty-six institutions for the training of teachers, a number of academic programs at regional colleges, for which universities are academically responsible, and eighteen extensions of international universities. This section also presented the soaring demand for academic degrees in Israel, as the number of students increased from 76,000 in 1990 to 216,939 in 2002. The section ended with the market segments of status seekers, convenience seekers, degree seekers, career changers, professional advancers and quality seekers.

Then, International University, one of the many extensions of international universities attempting to meet the rising demand by offering various similar programs to Israeli students, was introduced with certain characteristics being omitted as to ensure confidentiality. It was stated that this institution is part of an international university and offers various undergraduate degrees in Israel. It was also mentioned that it only recently built its marketing department.

Several definitions of key marketing concepts were examined next, including the social and managerial process of marketing, the three perspectives on marketing (product-orientated organizations, sales-orientated organizations and marketing-orientated organizations) and responsiveness (which is the willingness of an institution to respond on its own initiative). However, the key definition in the context of the research at International University was integrated marketing, which occurs when all the company’s departments work together to serve the customer’s interests.
Towards the end of the introduction chapter, the purpose of this research was presented. This was 'to examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in an institution of higher education in Israel during a period of change'. It included the research questions, which were the basis for building the entire thesis. The chapter concluded by presenting an outline of the remaining chapters of this thesis, which are the literature review, the methodology, the findings, the discussion and the conclusions chapters.
Chapter 2 - Literature Review

In planning the research at International University, the literature review was an essential preparatory stage, since it allowed the development of the necessary theoretical frameworks through examination of literature critically relevant to the focus of this study. According to Neuman (1997), one of the main goals of a literature review is ‘to learn from others and stimulate new ideas’ (p. 89). Yin (1994) furthers this point by stating that ‘a literature review is therefore a means to an end, and not – as most students think – an end to itself. Budding investigators think that the purpose of a literature review is to determine the answers about what is known on a topic; in contrast, experienced investigators review previous research to develop sharper and more insightful questions about the topic’ (p. 9). Consequently, as ‘research questions follow from the review of the literature’ (Rudestam and Newton, 1992, p. 60), this chapter will end with the developed research questions.

To accomplish this, it was vital to decide which bodies of literature to select for the review. This was done by analyzing the outline purpose of this study, which is:

♦ To examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in an institution of higher education in Israel during a period of change.

From this outline purpose, the process that occurred at International University can be understood:

![Figure 2.1 - The Process at International University](image-url)
Responsiveness created a need for integrated marketing. In order to achieve integrated marketing in this institution of higher education, management of change was necessary. From this process it would seem that these three subjects should be the three bodies of literature covered in this chapter. However, as all these three are in the context of marketing in education, it was necessary to add at the outset a fourth body of literature on the subject of marketing, thereby establishing a theoretical basis for marketing in education. Therefore, the four bodies of literature to be reviewed in this chapter are marketing, responsiveness, integrated marketing and management of change.

In the initial section of the literature review on marketing, firstly, definitions of marketing in both in general and in the context of higher education shall be discussed, converging on defining the product in higher education. Then, major theories/schools of thought in marketing, particularly in terms of assessing the market place and potential customers, will be introduced. These theories will also include strategic marketing theories in general and in the context of higher education. Also, this section will include research findings from marketing studies in an educational context. Then, in the discussion chapter, these will be compared with the empirical findings of the investigated organization, International University.

In the second section of this chapter responsiveness will be examined in the context of education and its relationship to marketing. Then, different types of institutional response will be presented. This section will also discuss the issue of just how responsive should an institution be. This will lead to an examination of how an institution should respond based on a
framework where academic quality involves the curriculum, the faculty, the facilities, quality of students and outcomes.

In the third section of this chapter, integrated marketing will be presented in detail. Firstly, several definitions of integrated marketing will be reviewed, allowing the development of a definition for this research. Additionally, integrated marketing will be compared and contrasted to traditional marketing, including a presentation of some of the factors that have led institutions of higher education to implement integrated marketing. Finally, this section concludes with a discussion on the relationship between integrated marketing and responsiveness.

The fourth section of the literature review focuses on management of change. Definitions of change will be offered in the context of higher education. Then, resistance to change in higher education will be introduced, including conflict and organizational politics. Next, the changes required of an institution of higher education in implementing integrated marketing will be presented in detail. This section of the literature review chapter concludes with a proposal regarding the measurement of the effectiveness of integrated marketing. This enables an evaluation of the findings relating to the performance of integrated marketing at International University to be undertaken at a later stage.

The concluding section of this chapter will elaborate on the general research questions presented in the introduction chapter by creating additional more comprehensive subsidiary research questions, which are based on the materials in this literature review chapter, including the conceptual framework offered at its end. These new subsidiary research questions will thereby set the stage for the next chapter, methodology.
MARKETING

Early as the middle of the 19th century, educational institutions such as American colleges and universities, both public and private, were already involved with marketing actions that included advertising, publicity, lobbying, fund raising and student enrolment activities (Cutlip, 1970, pp. 21-28; Cutlip, 1971, pp. 25-33). However, even in today’s modern world when ‘education is big business’ (Gray, 2000, p. 15), there are still various myths and misconceptions regarding marketing ranging from the compulsory sector in education (Davies and Ellison, 1997, p. 9) to the post compulsory sector (Gray, 2000, p. 15). Therefore, in the following first section of the literature review, the subject of marketing will be examined in detail.

First of all, definitions of marketing generally and in the context of higher education will be compared. Secondly, the product in higher education will be defined, including addressing subjects such as core offerings. Thirdly, some of the misconceptions regarding the use of marketing in education will be presented and addressed. Finally, in order to discuss major theories of marketing generally and in the context of higher education, an analytical framework will be offered. This framework is composed of six stages in the evolution of educational institution marketing applied to enrolment: marketing is unnecessary, marketing is promotion, marketing is segmentation and marketing research, marketing is positioning, marketing is strategic planning and marketing is enrolment management. This section will end with the connection of enrolment management to the next three sections of the literature review chapter.
What is *marketing*?

According to Izraeli (1980, p. 14), there is agreement among professionals on the general issues but there is an ongoing debate as to which fields of marketing should be emphasized. Izraeli (1980) offers the following definition:

> Marketing is a process whose objective is to satisfy people's needs through an exchange transaction agreed upon by its participants. (p. 14)

Another definition that was approved by the American Marketing Association Board of Directors is as follows:

> Marketing is the process of planning and executing the conception, pricing, promotion, and distribution of ideas, goods, and services to create exchanges that satisfy individual and organizational objectives.

(American Marketing Association, 1985, p. 1)

In comparing and contrasting these two definitions, it can be seen that they are somewhat similar although the definition proposed by the American Marketing Association is more detailed. While Izraeli's definition simply defines marketing as a process, the American Marketing Association's definition lists what functions this process includes. Another difference is that Izraeli's definition states that marketing 'an exchange transaction agreed upon its participants' without elaborating on who are the participants. The American Marketing Association's definition adds that these are both individuals and organizations, focusing on 'objectives' not on 'needs'. Yet from both these definitions, it is difficult to clearly make out what is and what isn't marketing. Therefore, Kotler (1997) presents another definition:
Marketing is a social and managerial process by which individuals and groups obtain what they need and want through creating, offering, and exchanging products of value with others. (p. 9)

There are similarities between his definition to those of Izraeli and the American Marketing Association, but his definition is more complete in several ways. Firstly, it explains that the process of marketing is 'social and managerial' and not only managerial as implied by that of the American Marketing Association and not addressed at all by Israeli's. Secondly it differentiates between needs and wants, which is a differentiation not made by the two former definitions. Also, by stating that marketing involves the exchange of products of value, Kotler's definition is implying that there is a positive Win-Win situation, as everyone involved in the marketing process gains from the exchange.

However, even in this more complete definition by Kotler, it is clear that marketing is an exchange of information concerning consumer needs and seller products, allowing a decision to 'produce' or 'purchase' to be made, it is not clear where the emphasis should be. Should it be on the needs of the customer (for example, the student in higher education), on the exchange process, which is the actual selling (known in higher education as student attraction) or on the product itself (that is also composed of the curriculum)? Moreover, although this definition offered by Kotler is essential for laying the foundations of understanding the concept of marketing, it is not within an educational context, which is the focus of this research. Therefore, as to aid in building the theoretical framework for this study at International University, it is important to discuss other definitions of marketing that consider educational settings.
Marketing in Education

Foskett (1998, p.49) maintains that most educational institutions clearly identify marketing as an important management function. Yet the variety of interpretations of the term leads to diversity and contradictions in the way colleges perform marketing. Davies and Ellison (1997) define marketing in education as 'the means by which the school actively communicates and promotes its purpose, values and products to the pupils, parents, staff and wider community' (p. 3). Davies and Ellison (1997, p. 3) argue that whereas in commerce and industry marketing it is often considered to be about managing the exchange between producers and consumers, in the educational world, marketing is about managing relationships through effective communication.

However, the definition by Davies and Ellison implies a one-way communication process, where the school communicates to the pupils, parents, staff and wider community but does not receive feedback. Also, their perspective is not of higher education but is more oriented towards schools, which are not the focus of this study. Therefore, it was necessary to examine the following definition for marketing in education by Kotler and Fox (1995):

> Marketing is the analysis, planning, implementation, and control of carefully formulated programs designed to bring about voluntary exchanges of values with target markets to achieve institutional objectives. Marketing involves designing the institution's offerings to meet the target markets' needs and desires, and using effective pricing, communication, and distribution to inform, motivate, and service these markets. (p. 6)

This definition also includes communication as the one by Davies and Ellison. However, the communication here is a dynamic two-way process...
that is composed not only of institutional objectives but also of a planned feedback from the target markets. Additionally, in this definition there is an important distinction between the terms ‘programs’ and ‘offerings’. Gibbs and Knapp (2002, p. 4) argue that in higher education the offering – or product as they also refer to it – is complex. As Sevier (1996) put it:

Contrary to popular belief, an institution’s product is not limited just to its academic program. Rather, the product is the sum of the student’s academic, social, physical, and even spiritual value experiences. (p. 2)

Gibbs and Knapp (2002) agree that the product is ‘an educational experience for the student, who is simultaneously a consumer of that experience’ (p. 4). They add that it ‘is also a resource provided to society’ (p. 4). Gibbs and Knapp (2002) claim that other experiences, such as support services, ‘are value additions that enhance the student's ability to absorb and acquire the courses of instruction’ (p. 4). In this they are implying that the core offer is instruction. However, Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 278) maintain that the core offer is different from one customer to another. For example, ‘a college provides instruction, but some students are seeking marketability, and others are seeking a good time before going to work’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 279). Sevier (1996) mirrored this view by stating:

It is very important to note that different target audiences will value different aspects of your product. Students, for example, might be very interested in the academic and social dimensions of the product while parents might want to know more about the academic and values dimension. (p. 2)

Consequently, Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 6) argue that marketing, which includes knowing the institutions’ markets, is an essential activity for modern educational institutions in order to survive and succeed. They assert that ‘without the ability to attract students, money, staff, faculty,
facilities, and equipment, the institution would cease to exist' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 6). What is surprising, according to Sevier (1996, p. 2), is that educational institutions often have the most trouble in marketing the academic aspect of their product.

Typically, institutions tend to focus on faculty and to stress such factors as faculty credentials, availability, student-to-faculty ratio, class size, and other variables. However, a successful portrayal of an institution's academic quality should consider all four of the foundation stones of academic quality: curriculum, faculty, facilities, and the quality of the students. Each of these four dimensions of the academic experience can also be positioned and promoted. (Sevier, 1996, p. 2)

Reviewing the Internet site of the Department of Public Administration at the Maxwell School of Syracuse University it would seem that they have adopted Sevier's recommendation of positioning and promoting these four dimensions of the academic experience when they state:

Our three programs have earned world-wide reputations for their intellectual rigor, quality of students and faculty, and first-rate facilities.

(Maxwell School of Syracuse University, 2004, Online)

Therefore, it is important to examine how these four aspects were positioned and promoted in International University. However, these are not the only dimensions of the academic experience that should be examined. Sevier (1996, p. 2) also adds that 'outcomes' are another tangential aspect of academic quality as most students and parents are very interested in and motivated by outcomes, wanting to know about the job and career and graduate school successes of an institution's alumni. The Department of Public Administration at the Maxwell School of Syracuse University demonstrated that it is aware of the importance of outcomes when it stated in that 'here you acquire the knowledge and skills necessary to begin or enhance your career in public service' (Maxwell School of
Syracuse University, 2004, Online). Then, even before presenting the first four dimensions of the academic experience on the same online page, they illustrated further the importance of outcomes regarding their three offered programs by stating:

The MPA and MA degrees emphasize professional development and prepare students for management and leadership positions in government and non-profit organizations. The PhD in Public Administration is an academic/research degree, designed to prepare the next generation of scholars and academicians.

(Maxwell School of Syracuse University, 2004, Online)

Another example where universities are meeting the market needs by focusing on desired outcomes can be found in Turkey. According to Boss (1999, p. 16), Turkish students want to learn the English language, in order to be able to work abroad and to seek lucrative jobs. However, meeting the market needs has its price as the Turkish language itself is struggling due to the increase use of English and the fact that Turkish is not spoken at the best high schools and universities (Boss, 1999, p. 16). This resulted in recent legislation by the Turkish government designed to limit the number of universities that educate only in the English language. However, the law is being ignored as English-only universities continue to open and succeed (Boss, 1999, p. 16).

Yet, this success is the very reason 'educationalists are often very suspicious of marketing because of the link with commercialism and selling. The very word seems to sum up high-powered salesmen, plastic packaging, insincerity and something slightly disreputable' (Davies and Ellison, 1997, p. 3). Cowan (1993, p. 23) stated that in England and Wales, although the marketing of educational institutions is largely accepted as an obligatory part of management, it is sometimes also considered
dishonourable. Gray (2000, p. 15) argues that the dangerous relationship between consumerism and education clearly poses a threat to the quality of thinking and reasoning. The feeling expressed here is that marketing will lower the standards of education in order to increase student enrolment. Stevens (2000), a business school dean, expressed this lowering of the standards of education in the following way:

Academic leadership - administrators and faculty - is not providing the kind of proactive, sustained leadership that is required to be at the forefront of executive thinking and action as higher education approaches the 21st century. Academicians have allowed the media, the organizations they seek to serve, and the public to dictate our agenda rather than lead the way. (p. 21)

There is a fear of lowering standards in Israel as well. Fleisher-Levy (2002, p. 10) raises the question that as with any business solely for profit, will the students not fall victims to a money making industry that is only selling illusions? In her research she discovered that all the managers of institutions, whether they are Israeli ones or foreign ones, fear that the extensions of low quality will stain their name as well. According to Fleisher-Levy (2002, p. 10), the danger in the created situation is double. On one hand, charlatan extensions find customers who are only interested in a diploma and are even willing to pay for it tens of thousands of dollars - thereby creating a market for the trade of fictitious degrees. On the other hand, naïve students, who are really interested in education, think that because an extension has received a license to teach in Israel from the Council for Higher Education, has indeed passed some sort of quality control. This is not the case, as no one has examined the level of studies or contents in those extensions, and therefore, there are instances where students simply lost all their money (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10).
However, although in higher education there has been criticism of some of the less savoury attributes of the commercial marketing being introduced into educational marketing (Gray, 1991, p. 11), marketing can make a positive contribution as it is not only about turnover or profit (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 2). Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 10) stress that although some students may view the institution as a sort of retail store whose function is to sell them what they want to purchase, most educational institutions have several objectives. Kotler and Fox (1995) state that ‘an educational institution must weigh the needs and preferences of students while preserving the institution's academic reputation and other institutional goals and commitments’ (p. 10). Stevens (2000) believes that in the future, more institutions of higher education will ‘assure that its graduates take from their learning experience academic content as well as the skills, knowledge, and abilities they will need to succeed in life and their chosen career. One excellent example is Renssalaer Polytechnic Institute’s blend of incubators, technology park, research, inventions, applications, student learning opportunities, and intellectual property’ (p. 26).

Others share the belief that quality of studies is gaining in importance for institutions of higher education. According to Gal-Ezer (2002, p. 36), in recent years the institutions of higher education have had to improve their awareness of the importance of quality, and have therefore invested substantial efforts in the subject, including increasing budgets for quality issues. Quality has become an integral part of higher education in the world for various reasons that include the competition among the multitude of institutions for higher education and that there is an increase awareness of students to demand and receive better “service” in the academic world (Gal-Ezer, 2002, p. 38).
This international trend of enhancing quality in education is evident in Israel. Fleisher-Levy (2001, p. 19) maintains that today in Israel those who come to study are interested in quality and not just getting a degree. According to Gal-Ezer (2002, p. 38), there are a variety of initiatives to improve quality in higher education in Israel. It can be assumed that these initiatives will only increase, with each institution handling the components of quality in a unique fashion, prioritizing them according to the institution’s set objectives (Gal-Ezer, 2002, p. 38). One of these objectives is working within the boundaries of the law. In Israel a university must not only consider its students’ needs but has to take into account legislative actions such as the 11th amendment to the Council for Higher Education Law that was created in February 1998. It stated that any institutions wishing to create an extension in Israel must get a license from the Council for Higher Education in Israel. Therefore, satisfying only the students’ needs could result in the university being closed down, as was indeed the case for several universities in Israel whose license was revoked (Council for Higher Education in Israel, May 2001, Online). This situation in Israel is contrary to the situation in Turkey where English-only universities could ignore the Turkish law (Boss, 1999, p. 16).

Not only this but, according to Kotler and Fox (1995, pp. 9-11), students have long-term needs that they do not yet perceive. Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 10) point out that although certain students may say that they rather ‘take it easy,’ their longer-range interests may necessitate not only receiving a diploma but also getting the real knowledge that the diploma stands for. Kotler and Fox (1995) validate the importance of an educational institution, such as a university, taking into account students’ long-term interests through their societal marketing approach:
A societal marketing orientation holds that the main task of the institution is to determine the needs, wants, and interests of its consumers and to adapt the institution to deliver satisfactions that preserve or enhance the consumer's and society's well-being and long-term interests. (p. 10)

These long-term interests can be established by differentiating between educational marketing and strategic educational marketing:

Educational marketing involves developing or refining specific school programs in response to the needs and desires of specific target-markets (e.g. 'at risk' families, parents of pre-school children, voters) and using effective means of communication to understand those needs and inform and motivate those markets. Educational marketing can take on a short-term focus, but strategic educational marketing takes the long view.

(Hanson and Henry, 1992, p. 257)

The importance of the long view is demonstrated by analyzing the following figure of one exchange between an educational institution and its markets (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11):

![Figure 2.2 - The Exchange between an Educational Institution and its Markets](image)

In this figure, Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 11) are widening the definition of 'customer' in the context of higher education as to include an employer that
supports financially the studies of an employee in order to increase both company loyalty and job performance. In this situation, it may be argued that it is essential for universities to create partnerships with employers who are part of the ‘paying customers’. For example, in Israel in 2002, a trend emerged where more and more organizations wish that those leading them will not be the best engineers or doctors, but the most suitable managers for the job (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 8). As a result organizations conduct various tests for suitability, before promoting their employees and even sponsor the studies in business for groups of managers in the industrial sector, as did Bezek (the Israeli Telephone Company) and ECI in Ben-Gurion University of the Negev (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 8). Consequently, it was important to examine whether International University has any such partnership with a business organization.

Stevens (2000, p. 25) maintains that in the future, there will be even more university partnerships with business and learning organizations. If the employer feels the level of studies to be too low, resulting in low job performance, then the financial aid to the student might be reduced or even terminated. In such a situation some of these students might drop out. Seymour (1993, p. 42) even widens the scope of customers to not only include students or industry employers, but also parents of students, alumni and professors, and as a result argues that a primary goal of causing quality in higher education should be developing a lot of happy, satisfied customers. Therefore, an educational institution that satisfies only students’ short-term immediate needs, while neglecting their long-term requirements, may not only lower the academic level, but actually decrease student enrolment as well.
Enrolment Management

A useful framework, for discussing theoretical concepts in marketing and presenting empirical research on marketing in an educational context, is composed of the six stages in the evolution of educational institution marketing applied to enrolment (Kotler and Fox, 1995, pp. 11-12):

1. Marketing is unnecessary.
2. Marketing is promotion.
3. Marketing is segmentation and marketing research.
4. Marketing is positioning.
5. Marketing is strategic planning.
6. Marketing is enrolment management.

Although these were the six stages in the evolution of marketing in educational institutions in the context of enrolment management, some institutions have not yet fully evolved, while others have not evolved at all.

Stage 1: Marketing is unnecessary.

The word ‘university’ stems from ‘Universitas’, meaning “community of scholars” and it was a term first embraced in the 12th century by faculty and students at the University of Paris (Clayton, 2000, p. 12). It was then that the perspective in higher education developed, where marketing was deemed unnecessary. This is still the traditional perspective in education where the student is not seen as a customer and must receive what the ‘professionals’ dictate (Foskett, 1998, p.49).

Many educational institutions assumed that the value of education was obvious, and that those who valued education would make their way to the school doors to enrol ... Students
enrolled because they wanted exactly what the school offered—or because there were no alternatives. The school felt it did not need any recruiting—or marketing. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11)

Foskett (1998, p.49) classified such schools as product-orientated organizations, concerned primarily with the product or service that they have skills and expertise in producing, and the customer’s perspective is subordinate to this aim.

Stage 2: Marketing is promotion.

According to Kotler (2000, p. 87), promotion comprises all the actions a company undertakes to communicate and promote its products to the target market. An organization [such as a university] has to hire, train, and motivate salespeople (Kotler, 2000, p. 87). It has to arrange communication and promotion programs including advertising, sales promotion and public relations (Kotler, 2000, p. 87). Foskett (1998, p.49) classifies such organizations as sales-orientated organizations, which have a strong product focus, but recognize that selling is central to their survival. For example, in higher education in Britain in the 1970s there was a great deal of excess demand to supply, so universities could adopt the product-oriented approach. When this later changed, and the supply was greater than the demand, universities tried to sell vigorously what they were already offering (Foskett, 1998, p.49).

Schools found that they were not enrolling enough students, or enough of the students they most wanted to attract... They established a recruiting function (perhaps a faculty committee) and later an admissions office, which functioned primarily as a sales department for the school. The head of the admissions office was the director of admissions. The admissions-office staff operated as salespeople, making "sales calls" and sending out catalogs, brochures, and posters. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11)
This mass marketing strategy of where the admissions-office was promoting one educational product for all consumers could no longer be used. Kotler (2000, p. 257) contends that Henry Ford personified this marketing strategy when offered to produce the Model T-Ford 'in any color, as long as it is black'. Therefore, in evolving from the orientation that marketing is promotion, universities began to research its markets in order to segment them.

Stage 3: Marketing is segmentation and marketing research.

Stevens (2000, p. 26) claims that in the future, all universities will see themselves as serving one or more sections of a segmented student market. Izraeli (1980, p. 83) defines market segmentation as categorizing customers according to kinds that have meaning from the viewpoint of the marketing effort of the firm. ‘You cannot be all things to all people and you must analyze the market and concentrate your marketing efforts towards those market segments for which you are more efficient’ (Liraz, 1996, p. 126). According to Kotler (2000, pp. 256-257), market segmentation is an approach midway between mass marketing and individual marketing. In an effort to increase a company's precision marketing, since each segment's buyers are assumed to be quite similar in wants and needs, yet no two buyers are really alike. At this stage, as described by Kotler and Fox (1995), some of the more advanced, or perhaps most distressed, educational institutions ‘began to realize that the admissions office's resources could be used more effectively if they could be directed to the most attractive and likely prospects’ (p. 11).

If the admissions office could better understand those who enrolled, the admissions staff could direct their efforts to attract similar students. If the admissions staff understood how the
college-choice decision was made, they could provide the right
information at the right time. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11)

To provide the needed information, universities began marketing research.
Kotler (2000) defines marketing research as 'the systematic design,
collection, analysis, and reporting of data and findings relevant to a specific
marketing situation facing the company' (p. 103).

The admissions office either developed a research capability,
worked with the school's director of institutional research (if
there was one), or hired outside consultants to conduct, analyze,
and draw implications from marketing research.
(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11)

Stage 4: Marketing is positioning.

As more schools intensified their recruiting and promotion
activities and sharpened them with research, some schools sought
a new basis for competition. Some began to appreciate the
importance of achieving distinctiveness in the minds of
prospective students...They decided to examine their histories,
distinctive characteristics, and opportunities, and to "take a
position" in the constellation of educational institutions.
(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11)

Kotler (2000, p. 298) defines positioning as the act of designing the
company's offering and image to occupy a distinctive place in the target
market's mind, with the end result being the successful creation of a
market-focused value proposition, a cogent reason why the target market
should buy the product. However, Kotler and Fox (1995) argue that
positioning in education is not just image making:

Positioning is an attempt to distinguish the school from its
competitors along real dimensions that students value in order to
be the preferred school for certain student segments. Positioning
aims to as help prospects to know the real differences the school
represents, so that they can match themselves to the school that can satisfy their needs best. (p. 11)

By the end of the 1990’s, universities were finding themselves contending with a period of extreme change in the higher education system in Israel. For example, the 10th amendment to the Council for Higher Education Law made it possible to open various academic Israeli institutions such as colleges that are devoted to one profession or discipline (Council for Higher Education in Israel, May 2001, Online). This created more competitors for the various universities and each university wanted to position itself in the marketplace as very professional institution. For example, today, as the demand for business studies is increasing in Israel, each school is trying to differentiate itself from the others (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). However, other changes were taking place that were not only competition with other educational institutions.

Some schools were buffeted not only by competition from other schools, but also by major changes in the economy, in demographics, in values, and other areas outside the institution’s direct control. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, pp. 11-12)

Therefore, universities realized that although it may be considered that positioning is the very heart of the marketing strategy (Warshavsky, 1997, p. 17), it is not enough only to focus on positioning. It is necessary to concentrate on strategic planning as well.

Stage 5: Marketing is strategic planning.

According to Kotler and Fox (1995) several ‘schools began to realize the interconnection between these external changes and the school’s image, its positioning, its programs, and many other facets of the school - including
its ability to attract and serve students’ (p. 12). As a result, Kotler and Fox (1995) maintain that these schools began a strategic planning process that included extending ‘their planning efforts to identify major trends and to assess how well the school was responding to these trends. The school revised its programs, procedures, and other activities to better align its efforts with these trends’ (p. 12). Kotler (2000, p. 64) argues that marketing plays a critical role in the strategic-planning process and in order to understand marketing management, strategic planning must be understood.

Therefore, it is first of all necessary to address the term strategy.

By strategy, managers mean their large-scale, future-oriented plans for interacting with the competitive environment to achieve company objectives. A strategy is a company's "game plan." Although that plan does not precisely detail all future deployments (of people, finances, and material), it does provide a framework for managerial decisions. A strategy reflects a company's awareness of how, when, and where it should compete; against whom it should compete; and for what purposes it should compete. (Pearce and Robinson, 1991, p. 3)

Kotler (2000, p. 64) maintains that the first area in strategic planning is managing a company's businesses as an investment portfolio, as the aim of strategic planning is to mould the company's businesses as to produce the target profits and growth. However, Pearce and Robinson (1991) argue that the first step in strategic planning should be to ‘formulate the company's mission, including broad statements about its purpose, philosophy, and goals’ (p. 3). Pearce and Robinson (1991, p. 13) define the mission of a company as a distinctive purpose that not only identifies the scope of its operation but sets it apart from other similar companies. Without this distinctive purpose it would be difficult to decide which investment to keep or not in the portfolio.
In the second key area of strategic planning, according to Kotler (2000, p. 64), an assessment must be undertaken of each business strength by reviewing information, such as the market's growth rate and the company's positioning and fit in that market. Pearce and Robinson (1991, p. 3) refer to this as developing a company profile reflecting its internal capabilities, assessing the company's external environment and analyzing the company's alternatives by matching its resources with the external environment.

The third and final key area in strategic planning, according to Kotler (2000, p. 64), is the strategy itself. The company must develop a game plan for achieving its long-run objectives (Kotler, 2000, p. 64). Pearce and Robinson (1991, p. 3) suggest that a set of long-term objectives should be selected that will achieve the most desirable options, with each option being evaluated in light of the company's mission. This also includes determining what makes the most sense regarding its industry position, objectives, opportunities, skills and resources as Kotler (2000) demonstrates in his definition:

> Market-oriented strategic planning is the managerial process of developing and maintaining a viable fit between the organization's objectives, skills, and resources and its changing market opportunities. (p. 64)

To create this viable fit it is necessary to 'develop annual objectives and short-term strategies that are compatible with the selected set of long-term objectives and grand strategies' (Pearce and Robinson, 1991, p. 3). Kotler (2000) recommends achieving this using the marketing plan, as it operates at two levels:

The *strategic marketing plan* lays out the broad marketing objectives and strategy based on an analysis of the current market situation and opportunities. The *tactical marketing plan* outlines specific marketing tactics, including advertising, merchandising, pricing, channels, and service. (p. 64)
However, developing a marketing plan is not the end of the strategic process. Pearce and Robinson (1991) argue that it is also necessary to 'implement the strategic choices by means of budgeted resource allocations in which the matching of tasks, people, structures, technologies, and reward systems is emphasized' (p. 3). Pearce and Robinson (1991, p. 3) also maintain that for future decision making, an evaluation of the success of the strategic process is essential. It was therefore realized that strategic planning is not enough and in order to accomplish effective implementation of a strategy, it must be institutionalized; meaning the strategy must become a part of the day-to-day life of the organization (Wernham, 1984, p. 35; Miles and Louis, 1986, p. 36). To achieve this institutionalization, the concept of enrolment management began to take form.

**Stage 6: Marketing is enrolment management.**

Educational institutions that perceive marketing as enrolment management are marketing-orientated organizations. According to Foskett (1998, p. 49), marketing-orientated organizations are those in which the satisfaction of customer 'wants' is central. Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 12) contend that enrolment management calls for greater concentration on research on student and alumni satisfaction. Enrolment management's objective, as described by Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 12), are no longer to just "do one's job" but rather to react to student needs and wants. In an educational institution, these needs and wants include students wishing to have a positive experience in school during the whole period of enrolment.

Therefore, several schools realized that strategic planning that results in 'attracting students, processing their applications, and encouraging admitted students to enrol were all extremely important activities, but these
schools began asking themselves what it would take to optimize the students' experience at the school' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12).

Their answer was to view each student admission as the beginning of a relationship with the school that would continue through the period of enrolment to graduation and extend into many years as a satisfied alumna or alumnus and, hopefully, as a donor and supporter of the school. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12)

Stevens (2000, p. 26) predicts that as more and more educational institutions understand this long-term relationship they will thereby deliver essential parts of the life long learning approach to education, which he refers to as cradle-to-grave education. However, Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 12) maintain that regarding each student as a valued partner in a relationship calls for considerable supplementary changes in policies, procedures, and services. 'In fact, many schools named a dean or vice-president of enrolment management to spearhead coordination among admissions, financial aid, registration, academic advising, residence life, career development and placement, and on-campus employment. Instead of asking students to walk around to various offices to get their questions answered, systems were devised to provide better information and smoother handling of both routine situations and problems' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12).

From this last paragraph three inferences can be made. Firstly, to achieve successful enrolment, responsiveness to students' needs is essential. Secondly, to be responsive, educational institutions must integrate their marketing efforts. In this integrated marketing is implied. Thirdly, change is necessary in implementing integrated marketing. These three subjects of responsiveness, integrated marketing and management of change are the following three sections of the literature review chapter.
Summary of Marketing

In this first section of the literature review, the subject of marketing has been examined in detail. First of all, definitions of marketing in general are compared as to give an understanding of the concept of marketing. Then, other definitions of marketing that consider educational settings are discussed, focusing on the complex product that educational institutions offer.

Secondly, some of the misconceptions regarding the use of marketing in education are presented. It is argued that there is a fear that marketing will lower the academic level of studying as to satisfy students' needs. However, this fear and other factors were addressed so as ‘an educational institution must weigh the needs and preferences of students while preserving the institution's academic reputation and other institutional goals and commitments’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 10).

Then, in order to discuss major theories in marketing in general and in the context of higher education, as well as to present empirical research on marketing in an educational context, an analytical framework was offered. This framework is composed of the six stages in the evolution of educational institution marketing applied to enrolment:

1. **Marketing is unnecessary.** This is still the traditional perspective in education where the student is not seen as a customer and must receive what the ‘professionals’ dictate (Foskett, 1998, p.49).

2. **Marketing is promotion.** Foskett (1998, p.49) classifies such organizations as sales-orientated organizations, which have a strong product focus, but recognize that selling is central to their survival.
3. **Marketing is segmentation and marketing research.** According to Kotler and Fox (1995), some educational institutions 'began to realize that the admissions office's resources could be used more effectively if they could be directed to the most attractive and likely prospects' (p. 11). The admissions office either developed a research capability, worked with the school's director of institutional research (if there was one), or hired outside consultants' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11).

4. **Marketing is positioning.** It was discussed that as schools realized they could not offer all programs and be the best school for all students, a new basis for competition emerged: positioning (in order to achieve distinctiveness in the minds of prospective students).

5. **Marketing is strategic planning.** Kotler and Fox (1995) maintain that schools began a strategic planning process that included extending 'their planning efforts to identify major trends and to assess how well the school was responding to these trends. The school revised its programs, procedures, and other activities to better align its efforts with these trends' (p. 12).

6. **Marketing is enrolment management.** Educational institutions that perceive marketing as enrolment management are marketing-orientated organizations in which the satisfaction of customer 'wants' is central.

Marketing as enrolment management laid the foundations for the next three sections in the literature review chapter: responsiveness, integrated marketing and management of change.
RESPONSIVENESS

Schools and colleges face the challenge of transforming the multitude of pressures into a process of value to all and of crucial importance to education, that of responsiveness.

(Lumby, 1999, p. 193)

Responsiveness is a popular term in the field of education. For example, in further education it is much more prevalent than that of marketing (Lumby, 2001a, p. 68). Yet 'many educational institutions fall short of being highly responsive' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 38), and this is especially true in higher education. According to Sevier (1998), 'higher education has always had problems and surely always will. What is more significant is our inability to respond effectively' (p. 18). To comprehend why such a lack of effective responsiveness exists, it is first necessary to understand what responsiveness is.

In this section of the literature review, the term responsiveness will be examined in the context of education, including its relationship with the term marketing. Then, different types of institutional response will be presented. The subsequent subsection will discuss the issue of just how responsive should an educational institution be. This will lead to the next subsection, which examines how an institution should respond based on a framework where academic quality involves the curriculum, the faculty, the facilities, quality of students and outcomes. The connection of this section to the following sections on integrated marketing and management of change will also be made clear.
Definitions of Responsiveness

As responsiveness brought about all the changes in International University, it is initially necessary to understand the term responsiveness. Michael, Holdaway and Young (1994) define responsiveness as 'the ability of an institution to sense and serve the changing needs of its relevant environment' (p. 54). Although this definition gives a general overview of responsiveness, it is too lacking in detail. Firstly, how does an institution 'sense' the changing needs? Also, why the very broad term 'relevant environment' and not another term such as the 'customer'? Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 35) offer such a definition of responsiveness where the customer is central.

Responsive institutions focus on the customer—identifying who is the "real" customer, striving to see things from the customer's viewpoint, and satisfying the customer's needs and concerns. The institution makes every effort to sense, serve, and satisfy the needs and wants of its customers and publics within the constraints of its mission and resources. Once it understands customers' needs and preferences, the institution can determine how responsive it can be and then implement programs to manage responsive relations. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 35)

This definition is much more detailed than that proposed by Michael, Holdaway and Young. It clearly describes the process of responsiveness. However, this definition does not draw the line how far should the efforts be to satisfy the customer. It only states that these should be 'within the constraints of its mission and resources'. Additionally, the difference between responsiveness and marketing is not at all clear when Kotler and Fox's definition is compared to their very own definition of marketing in education (which was presented in the previous section):

Marketing is the analysis, planning, implementation, and control of carefully formulated programs designed to bring about voluntary exchanges of values with target markets to achieve
institutional objectives. Marketing involves designing the institution's offerings to meet the target markets' needs and desires, and using effective pricing, communication, and distribution to inform, motivate, and service these markets.

(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 6)

These are very similar definitions of two different terms. Although some terms are not identical and the order of the subjects is a bit different, both definitions stress that needs result in developing programs to respond to those needs. The definition of responsiveness could instead of starting with ‘responsive institutions focus on the customer’ start with ‘marketing-oriented institutions focus on the customer’ and no harm would be done. However, as this study at International University included both aspects of responsiveness and marketing, the differences and the relationship between the two terms had to be made clearer before actual research could begin.

In order to differentiate responsiveness from marketing, another definition of responsiveness was necessary. Lumby (1999) suggests a working definition of responsiveness, noting ‘that responsive schools and colleges are neither those who do as they wish taking no account of others, nor those who do as students, parents, employers ask without question’ (p. 195). Rather responsive schools and colleges are ‘those who have resolved the issue of to whom they wish to respond with some exactness and commitment, and have moved beyond involving others to empowerment’ (Lumby, 1999, p. 195). This working definition by Lumby does not have the process of responsiveness that was offered by Kotler and Fox's definition, but it does, nonetheless, bring something new to the table. It stresses that responsiveness is not an extreme adherence to customer needs only limited by an institution's mission and resources, but it is new way of
educational thinking. It goes beyond just involving others in accentuating interaction.

The emphasis on interaction is worth stressing for responsiveness is not being customer-driven. It is not simply doing what others demand. Neither is it an assault on the professionalism of those in education, or a devaluing of their role. Rather it makes great demands on their capacity to empower others and to harness the full range of resources for learning. From a responsiveness perspective, the role of the professional who assumes an automatic control of education is an impoverished one, with a hidden agenda of adopting superiority, in contradiction to genuine education, which is founded on a bedrock of mutual respect and equality. (Lumby, 1999, p. 205)

Thus, those who view education as based on respect and equality embraced the term responsiveness as an alternative to marketing. For example, the term responsiveness, in a survey conducted in further education, was in much more use than that of marketing (Lumby, 2001a, p. 57). This should hold no surprise as discussed earlier in the literature review, in the first section on marketing, ‘the word ‘marketing’ often evokes feelings of concern, even mistrust, within the world of education’ (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 1). While some educational practitioners ‘are comfortable with using the term ‘marketing’ which correlates with a more commercial approach’ (Lumby, 2001a, p. 57), others ‘believe that marketing is for profit-making businesses’ (Kotler and Fox, 1985, p. 14) and therefore ‘often feel uncomfortable and want to distance themselves from it’ (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 2).

They feel that educational values and techniques are direct opposites of the values and techniques of business and the two worlds cannot and should not be brought together.

(Kotler and Fox, 1985, p. 14)

Consequently, they use the broader term responsiveness (Lumby, 2001a, p. 57), which they would argue is about meeting needs and not about making
a profit. However, this use of responsiveness instead of marketing demonstrates that the relationship between the two terms is not clear to all educational practitioners. The reason these educational practitioners want to distance themselves from marketing is because ‘it is associated with sales, advertising and public relations’ (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 1), in other words promotion.

Most schools and colleges interpret marketing as being essentially about promotion. While this is so, responsiveness will inevitably be hampered, in that the need to present the glossy and positive image will preclude honest engagement between stakeholders with the issues that confront the organisation.

(Lumby, 1999, p. 204)

However, marketing is not only about promotion. According to Foskett (1999, p. 34), marketing is as an overall philosophy, which is fundamental to the operation of an organization. If it is understood as such a philosophy, then Lumby (1999) identifies responsiveness as ‘the cultural stance underpinning the practical planning and structures of a complete marketing strategy’ (p. 204). In other words, marketing depends on responsiveness, as no marketing efforts will succeed unless the educational institution has the level of institutional responsiveness necessary to culturally support those efforts.

Levels of Institutional Responsiveness

In order to classify the level of institutional responsiveness that exists in International University, it was first necessary to categorize levels of institutional responsiveness, as ‘educational institutions vary considerably in their level of responsiveness’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 36). Kotler and Fox (1995, pp. 36-38) define three general levels of institutional responsiveness:
• The Unresponsive Institution,
• The Casually Responsive Institution and
• The Highly Responsive Institution.

The unresponsive institution, according to Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 36), is not very responsive to its students or to other internal and external publics. In these institutions, administration might like the institution to be more responsive, but they sometimes feel they lack the resources or influence over employees as the budget may be insufficient to hire, train, and motivate good faculty and staff (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 36).

Unresponsive institutions usually reflect a bureaucratic mentality... Bureaucrats are not concerned with innovation, with problems outside their specific authority, or with nuances that affect specific situations or, for that matter, with the institution as a whole. They will serve people as long as the people's problems fall within the limits of their jurisdiction. People's problems are defined in terms of how the bureaucratic institution is set up rather than having the institution set up to respond to people's problems. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, pp. 36-37)

There overconfidence of unresponsive educational institutions in assuming that they know what people need has been eroded in recent years as students have many options (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). Some institutions are more concerned with other things than customer satisfaction, such as universities that focus on research and treat their undergraduate students as annoyances (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). They refuse to respond to the needs of their students and thus ‘the unresponsive educational institution is probably already out of business or on the way’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). By not responding, they might also create further competition, as was the case in Israel (Ritov, 2001, p. 36).
According to Ritov (2001, p. 36), Israeli universities refused to respond to the needs of more flexible studies and lower entry standards. As a result, this created a situation in Israel where demand for higher education had outpaced local supply (Ritov, 2001, p. 36). Foreign universities responded to this demand, resulting in the fact that although foreign universities’ fees are expensive when compared to the local Israeli institutions, they are in high demand by Israeli students (Ritov, 2001, p. 36). This situation has resulted in increased competition in Israel. Consequently some Israeli universities and foreign universities now experience decline in student enrolments, as was the case at International University. This forced them to be more responsive.

In the casually responsive institution, administrators listen more to the students by leaving their doors open, making occasional surprise appearances in the student union, encouraging suggestions from students and adding student members to university committees (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37).

The result is a better feeling among the institution's consumers, building a partnership between the servers and the served. Whether or not the increased consumer satisfaction continues depends on whether the institution makes a show of listening or actually does something about what it hears. The institution may merely offer a semblance of openness and interest without intending to use the results in any way. If so, some consumers will resent the institution and may try to force it into greater responsiveness. (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37)

The highly responsive institution is different from a casually responsive institution in not only surveying ‘current consumer satisfaction but also researches unmet consumer needs and preferences to discover ways to improve its services’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). The highly responsive institution also ‘selects, trains, and empowers its people to become
customer-minded' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). According to Kotler and Fox (1995), many educational institutions do not succeed in being highly responsive, as 'most rarely take formal surveys of their students' real needs and desires, nor do they encourage and train their faculty and staff to be student-minded' (p. 37). The three levels of institutional responsiveness can be compared by the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>UNRESPONSIVE</th>
<th>CASUALLY RESPONSIVE</th>
<th>HIGHLY RESPONSIVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Complaint system</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveys of satisfaction</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveys of needs and preferences</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer-oriented personnel</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.1 - Levels of Institutional Responsiveness (Source: Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 36)

This table was important for the research at International University since it enables examining these four attributes in the specific case of International University and thus classify the university's level of responsiveness. However, this classification does not state unambiguously just how responsive should an institution be in order to succeed.

**How responsive should an institution be?**

Although it would seem from the previous subsection that highly responsive institution is the recommended course of action to any institution of higher education, this is not the case. To be responsive an institution of higher education must change its marketing mix, which 'is the four controllable variables- product, price, place, and promotion (the four Ps) - that a college of university emphasizes or mixes to meet the needs of
its recruiting, fund-raising, and other target audiences' (Sevier, 1998, p. 86). This is not a simple task as there are factors that may restrain educational institutions from responsiveness that are outside their control (Lumby, 1999, p.201). One issue is that of resources as 'the development of a new product tends to be expensive and time-consuming, whatever type of organisation is involved’ (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 36).

As a result, ‘in a world of limited resources and high competition, there are no rules for attracting students to one faculty instead of another’ (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 8). Lan (2001, p. 49) states that all the universities and colleges in Israel are investing resources to attract both young people and managers to enrol in their institutions. To achieve this, all of them try, and usually succeed, in adapting themselves to the needs of the student (Lan, 2001, p. 49). However, this constant responsiveness often puts colleges and universities in a dilemma at this point, since ‘some institutions, responding to each trend in the marketplace, appear to change their product mix at the drop of a hat’ (Sevier, 1998, p.32).

Consequently, to be too responsive is not necessarily a good thing. For example, ‘because further education provides such a diverse range of courses and caters for many different types of clients, it has not developed a clear identity or sense of purpose. Its very responsiveness, although a vital aspect of the sector, makes it difficult to demonstrate a distinctive mission’ (Bush, 2000, ix). Additionally, it is the responsibility of the institutional curriculum manager ‘to ensure that the students receive a coherent curriculum which is consistent, between year groups and courses, across the whole of the school or college’ (Burton, 2001, p. 62). In short, responding constantly to the market may damage this coherency. Therefore, institutions should not change their product mix too quickly, nor
should they ‘ignore significant changes in their marketplace and persist with a product mix that is antiquated and unappealing. Smart colleges and universities must find a balance between these two extremes’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 32).

Yet even when this balance in responsiveness is found it is still not enough. A university may be very responsive in its product mix and as a result offer something which is exactly what other competing institutions offer, as they are responsive as well. ‘From the perspective of students and donors alike, too many offer the same programs in the same ways’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 32). In Israel, universities have realized this. Hence, as the demand for business studies increases, each business school tries to differentiate itself from the others (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). In this it would seem another major connection between responsiveness and marketing is revealed. It is not enough to be responsive but the question is how responsiveness is being carried out based on relevant marketing research.

**How to respond successfully?**

Responsive institutions realize that to attract students and other needed resources, they must offer programs and other benefits that their publics desire in exchange.

(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37)

Institutions realize that although students are at the centre of any responsiveness process, ‘acceptance of student-centred approaches does not mean a slavish adherence to the maxim ‘the customer is always right’” (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 36). Not only this, but students are not the only interest group as ‘various publics and customers of the institution may have differing expectations and perceptions of the school’s performance’
(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 41). Additionally, although the most exciting part of the marketing of education can be designing new programs, ‘it can also be the most ineffective use of resources if the issues of cost and practicality are an afterthought’ (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 53).

Consequently, if an educational institution is to be practical in its responsiveness process, it must first ‘make choices about to whom to respond. If every group were assumed to be an equal priority, then there is no basis for distinguishing how to act in the face of the potential contradictory requirements of different groups’ (Lumby, 1999, p. 195). For example, ‘parents may focus on the school’s academic outcomes and consider a school excellent in every respect, while their children may consider the classes boring or school policies too restrictive. Donors may judge the school by one set of criteria, while faculty may use another’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 41). Therefore, in a process of responsiveness, an institution of higher education must distinguish explicitly its priority group/s for response (Lumby, 1999, p. 196).

Once it is clear to whom the institution is responding, research can be undertaken to ascertain audiences’ expectations (Sevier, 1998, p. 32). Knowing these expectations is the key in the creation of an effective product mix (Sevier, 1998, p. 32). Seeing that the product in higher education may be defined as ‘the sum of an institution’s academic, social, physical, and values/spiritual dimensions and the opportunities that are available to graduates’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 30), the product mix can be viewed in two ways (Sevier, 1998, p. 31). ‘First, how the institution decides to mix different aspects of its academic, social, physical, and values/spiritual dimensions, and second, how external target audiences perceive and value this mix’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 31). This decision is also dependent on the range
of possibilities established by an institution's mission and vision (Sevier, 1998, p.32).

How an institution chooses to mix its product should depend on its founding mission and how the president interprets that mission and articulates it through her or his vision. However, the product mix should also recognize and even anticipate market realities. An institution may have a product mix that has served it well for 100 years. But changes in the numbers, composition, or interests of students or donors may require that it reexamine the mix. (Sevier, 1998, p.32)

However, to be truly responsive to these changing market realities, the product mix should not just be re-examined as suggested by Sevier (1998, p.32), but it should be 'kept under continual review to ensure that it is making the optimum contribution to the achievement of corporate objectives' (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 35). This is not a simple task as an institution's product mix could ‘be varied according to factors such as course level, subject area, mode of study, duration and qualification, in order to meet customer needs at the optimum relationship of benefits and costs’ (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 35). These costs have risen as one of the international market realities is academic quality (Gal-Ezer, 2002, p. 36).

According to Gal-Ezer (2002, p. 36), in recent years institutions of higher education have had to increase their awareness of the importance of quality, and have therefore invested substantial efforts in the subject, including increasing budgets for quality issues. Quality has become an integral part of higher education in the world for various reasons that include the competition among the multitude of institutions for higher education (Gal-Ezer, 2002, p. 38). Indeed, there is an increase awareness of students to demand and receive better ‘service’ in the academic world (Gal-
Ezer, 2002, p. 38). This international trend exists also in Israel, as there are a variety of initiatives to improve quality in higher education (Gal-Ezer, 2002, p. 38).

For example, one of the unique characteristics of Israeli students in business studies, according to Fleisher-Levy (2002, p. 10), is that most of them work full time. As a result, in order to give students better service, a substantial amount of the studies take place in the afternoons and on Fridays, where in the world most students 'take a break from life' to dedicate themselves to their studies (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). Others, such as the management faculties in Israel, respond to the market demand and practical requirements by trying to make it as easy as possible for working students by concentrating studies into condensed days (Lan, 2001, p. 49).

Therefore, in order to better understand the process of responsiveness that occurred at International University, a framework for academic quality was necessary enabling external comparisons of what actually took place in the university. Such a framework was presented earlier in this literature review by Sevier (1996, p. 2), who maintains that the academic quality of an institution is based on its curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of its students and outcomes. Most students and parents are very interested in, and, motivated by outcomes, wanting to know about the job and career and graduate school successes of an institution's alumni (Sevier, 1996, p. 2). Consequently, the following subsections will focus on these five components of academic quality.
The Curriculum

One of the most important dimensions of an institution of higher education's product mix, especially for student recruiting, is its curriculum (Sevier, 1998, p. 32). However, 'many colleges and universities fail to use their curriculum to differentiate themselves from the competition' (Sevier, 1998, p. 32). Not only this, but according to Sevier (1998), too many of them are also 'offering the exact same courses and programs as their competition and teaching these courses and programs in the exact same way' (p. 32). Hence, curriculum development, which 'is concerned essentially with the maintenance and improvement of the quality of existing products and the development of new ones' (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 36), is essential for the differentiation of an institution of higher education.

It is very important to consider carefully how you can use your curriculum to differentiate yourself from your competition in meaningful ways. You must offer courses and programs that no one else in your marketplace is offering. Or you must offer similar courses and programs in ways that students and donors will find attractive. As your curriculum matures, you must always be scanning the marketplace to anticipate new curriculum trends—not fads, but meaningful responses to how your marketplace is changing. (Sevier, 1998, p. 33)

Indeed, when properly directed, a customer-centred curriculum becomes a critical part of an institution of higher education's ability to respond to changing needs (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 36). Therefore, it is important to research how and in what were the 'One Year Programs' in International University responsive to the market and what procedures were necessitated in planning them. According to Burton (2001, p. 61), there are various procedures involved in the planning process of a curriculum. These procedures, 'including internal resource allocation and mid/short-term
planning and evaluation, need to be communicated and shared between staff, as an operational embodiment of a shared vision for the curriculum and institution as a whole’ (Burton, 2001, p. 61).

However, although Lumby (2001b) agrees that managing the curriculum could also ‘indicate the internal arrangements within a school or college to facilitate learning’ (p. 4), there are many different external pressures, in addition to the internal ones, which impact upon the educational institution, on which the organization of the curriculum is dependent upon (Burton et al., 2001, p. 18). In the study at International University, both internal and external factors should subsequently be researched. Furthermore, although Lofthouse (1994, p. 143) maintains that there is a small chance that one perfect, composite definition of the curriculum will ever be found, a definition of the curriculum that takes into account these internal and external factors must be considered. Toombs and Tierney (1992, Online) proposed such a definition of the curriculum.

The curriculum is an act of collective response by a collegiate faculty. It is an expression of intellectual accountability as a faculty to external factors—society's expectations and changes in knowledge—and to internal factors, such as students' needs. That response might be imaginative or creative, merely pedestrian, or even servile. At its best, it is the product of an independent reading by an academic community of what is needed at a particular time and an educational expression of that need.

(Toombs and Tierney, 1992, Online)

This definition by Toombs and Tierney has several advantages in focusing the research at International University. First, it addresses internal factors such as student needs, which are also a key part of integrated educational marketing. Burton et al. (2001, p. 22) argue that matching individual needs
and learning styles to the teaching styles will enable individual (and thus class and school) learning targets to be achieved. Therefore, it is important to examine how student needs were addressed when developing the 'One Year Programs' in International University. Secondly, not only students' needs are being attended to, but external factors, such as society's expectations and changes in knowledge, are being addressed as well.

According to Stevens (2000, p. 23), there is external pressure on higher education to check the relevance and currency of the curriculum by various stakeholders such as corporate leaders, legislators, members of boards of regents and parents. Robertson (1993) demonstrates this external pressure by who argues that 'a consensus exists on the inadequacy of prevailing arrangements to protect Britain from inexorable economic decline. The self-attributed strengths of British post-secondary and higher education do not appear to be commensurate with national prosperity, technological inventiveness, exceptional national leadership or greater public ease' (p. 73). These external factors also include international pressures to develop the curriculum to meet the market needs, as competition from international universities is increasing worldwide.

For example, Clayton and Ramos (1999, p. 16) describe an American University in Bulgaria and the differences of its curriculum to the traditional European higher education institutions. These differences include the fact that all teaching at the university is in English and that in the American University, teaching is stressed instead of research and the students are expected to explore several majors, which is quite a contrast to the approach to higher education in Europe. In Israel this is also the case. According to Lan (2001, p. 49), most of the management faculties pride themselves on adapting their curriculum to market demands and practical
requirements. Several faculties, such as the faculty of management in Tel-Aviv University, have even declared a reform in business studies that will allow students a wider choice of courses and will improve the connection between theory and practice (Lan, 2001, p. 49).

However, although it has considerable value, the definition by Toombs and Tierney does not address the difference between theory and practice in the curriculum. As the 'One Year Programs' in International University included both the theoretical aspects of planning the curriculum as well as aspects of how this was carried out in practice, there is need of a wider view that takes into consideration how the curriculum actually operates. Middlewood (2001, p. 109) offers such a wide approach of the actual operation of the curriculum. He maintains that the curriculum functions at the following four levels:

1) The *rhetorical* curriculum (what is stated in policies and statements of aims).
2) The *planned* curriculum (found in schemes of work, syllabuses).
3) The *delivered* curriculum (how it is taught in the classrooms or through other media).
4) The *received* curriculum (what is ultimately in the minds and some would say hearts of the students).

(Middlewood, 2001, p. 109)

Middlewood (2001, p. 109) argues that the importance of this fourth level is pivotal as the received curriculum is the individual learner's experience in an educational institution and that this experience will deeply affect the identity of that individual. Therefore, it was important to research at International University not only the first three levels of the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs', but to research the received curriculum as perceived by the students of these programs. Furthermore, the third level of
the curriculum - the delivered curriculum - insinuates the weight of the faculty in the implementation of the curriculum, as it stresses the actual teaching of the curriculum in the classrooms or through other media. Accordingly, to be truly successful in the process of responsiveness, an institution of higher education cannot only plan a responsive curriculum, but it must also ascertain that it has the type of faculty to deliver it.

The Faculty

The type of staff selected and allocated to a course can be influential on its quality as perceived by particular market segments. (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 37)

Thus, it is no surprise that many institutions of higher education market the quality of their faculty. For example, the School of Education at Gardner-Webb University states in its Internet site that it 'has an outstanding faculty who balance teaching, advising, and service. They recognize that excellence in teaching and service is founded on scholarly inquiry. They maintain a high degree of commitment to excellent teaching and contribute hours of valuable service to local, district, state and national agencies. Through their ethical and professional practices, they serve as leadership and scholarly models for future professional education leaders' (Gardner-Webb University, 2004, Online). In another example, an American University in Bulgaria promoted the fact that most of its faculty, of more than 60 professors, was composed of Americans (Clayton and Ramos, 1999, p. 16). In this, both universities demonstrate that they are aware of the importance of faculty in enrolment management, which includes not only responding to the market but student retention as well.
In higher education academic institutions found themselves responding to their students' needs, as 'faculty members spent time talking with prospective students about courses and careers in their field, viewing themselves as members of the enrolment management effort. The instructor offering to help a student cope with academic difficulties realized that he or she was aiding retention every bit as much as was the counselor or the financial aid officer' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12). As the cost of getting a new customer is on average five times as much as keeping an existing one (Peretz, 1999, p. 53) and in order for faculty to respond to the students needs, universities will have to invest in developing their employees.

Recruitment, training and development of college staff can clearly make an important contribution to product quality.

(Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 37)

Stevens (2000, p. 26) maintains that in the future, more institutions of higher education will be committed to the development of their own administrators, faculty and staff. According to Davies and Scribbins (1985), if an institution of higher education's 'product mix is to adjust continuously to changing market needs, staff must clearly be very adaptable in their ability to absorb new teaching methods, to update their existing subject knowledge and gain competence in new subjects. All this is unlikely to be achieved without a coherent policy for development, retraining and redeployment, backed by adequate resources' (p. 37). After all, the course quality is also determined by resources other than staff as 'many vocational courses require complex and sophisticated equipment to keep in pace with employer needs' (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 38).

Teachers and the resources which support them are not the only significant influence on the quality of a course. Administration of student admissions, queries, results and periodic reports to employers are also part of the product as perceived by the customer. Inefficiency in these areas creates discontent and
throws doubt on quality in other areas... The initial administrative responses to those attracted by a college's marketing and recruitment strategies are of particular importance in shaping their perception of the product under consideration.

(Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 38)

Therefore, the study at International University should not only examine the lecturers and the resources which support, but it should research the administrative responses that exist in the university as well. Moreover, it should also investigate the importance of other resources such as the facilities offered by International University, since facilities are one of the cornerstones in achieving academic quality in an institution of higher education (Sevier, 1996, p. 2).

Facilities

Apart from the explicit communication that the institution has with its stakeholders, the state of its physical location can contribute greatly. Clean rooms, carpeting, regular washroom cleaning, all set a context in which the individual learner comes to understand who he or she is in the context of the learning experience. (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 55)

Davies and Scribbins (1985, p. 38) also agree that the learning experience is influenced by an institution's facilities. For example, they state that in order to sustain a favourable attitude to a course amongst students, sufficient library resources to support the given work is necessary. It is no wonder that an American University in Bulgaria stressed the fact that it has 90,000 books in English, satellite and Internet links (Clayton and Ramos, 1999, p. 16). In this the American University emphasized the advantages of its facilities over those of existing Bulgarian universities. Therefore, the study at International University should research students' satisfaction with
facilities such as library resources. Davies and Scribbins (1985, p. 38) argue that the standard of accommodation is of particular importance in attracting senior personnel from industry and commerce to study in an institution of higher education. ‘It is often this aspect, as much as the quality of content, teaching and equipment, which causes this segment of the market to turn to private sector providers’ (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 38). Attracting such senior personnel may raise the perceived quality of students.

Quality of Students

As the academic quality of an institution is also dependent on the quality of its students (Sevier, 1996, p. 2), and it may be even argued that the quality of students determines an institution's credibility (Padmanabhan, 2002, Online), institutions of higher education use the quality of their students as a means of attracting new students. For example, an American University in Bulgaria highlighted the fact that it was selective, admitting only 43% of 680 students who applied (Clayton and Ramos, 1999, p. 16). This positions the university as one of academic quality as not anyone can be accepted to it. This university also stated that its students are from 22 countries, including three-quarters from Bulgaria and a half dozen from the US (Clayton and Ramos, 1999, p. 16). This was done to position it as on one hand a local university where most of the students are Bulgarian and on the other hand as a global university where Bulgarian students will study with their international counterparts.

The people they will study with are an important consideration for prospective students, as it gives an institution its credibility (Padmanabhan,
2002, Online) and consequently, various institutions publicize who its prospective students will study with. For example, the Department of Public Administration at the Maxwell School of Syracuse University state that 'while each program has its own criteria for admissions and guidelines for application, the students in the MPA, MA and PhD programs study together and thereby create a unique environment that contributes to the Maxwell School’s distinctive character among graduate programs of public policy and management' (Maxwell School of Syracuse University, 2004, Online). In this it is not only attempting to differentiate itself from other universities, it is also implying that a student in any of these programs will get to know students in the other programs, which may be a valuable outcome for prospective students in the field of public policy and management.

The connection between the quality of students and outcomes can be seen in the Internet site of the School of Education at Gardner-Webb University. It states in its that its 'students are among the best as measured against traditional standards such as career success, test scores and leadership capabilities... students who become the professional leaders in public and private sectors of education' (Gardner-Webb University, 2004, Online). By stating this, the university is declaring that if a potential student is accepted to it, he or she will become part of the high quality of students that succeed in their careers. As most students and parents are very interested in and motivated by outcomes (Sevier, 1996, p. 2), this delivers a message that the outcome of enrolling to the School of Education at Gardner-Webb University is a positive one.
Outcomes

Peretz (1999, p. 38) maintains that many of the companies that failed in their relationship with their customers made one little critical error of not asking themselves why this is worthwhile for the customer. This is also true of institutions of higher education who do not ask themselves what are the outcomes for the students who enrol to their institution, as most students and parents want to know about the job and career and graduate school successes of an institution’s alumni (Sevier, 1996, p. 2). In Israel, as students come to the university with some business or military experience, they demand that their studies have practical outcomes (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10).

Consequently, some universities’ banner has become practicality (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). For example, the extension of Swinburne University in Israel requires that each student that applies for the school must come with a business idea that will be developed with the aid of the university’s professional staff and could become a real product in the market (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). This demand for practical outcomes can be seen all over the world, where in universities such as Tel-Aviv University, Harvard and Boston University, students under the supervision of their lecturers are employed in planning and implementing marketing research (Kotler and Hornik, 2000, p. 140). As faculty members they are looking for small and large marketing projects in the local communities that can be incorporated into the courses they teach (Kotler and Hornik, 2000, p. 140).

These examples also demonstrate that in order to achieve academic quality in an institution of higher education, its five dimensions of curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of students and outcomes (Sevier, 1996, p. 2)
must be coordinated together. To enable a university to participate in the actual planning and implementing of a real product or in marketing research, firstly it must change its curriculum accordingly. Then, it must train or recruit the faculty with the professional knowledge to support such a practical endeavour. It must also have the necessary facilities to sustain the efforts by the students. The students themselves must be of a high enough quality to treat these real-life projects with a degree of seriousness so as to achieve their desired outcomes. Therefore, accomplishing such responsiveness in all five dimensions of academic quality would require integrated efforts across an institution that may necessitate a change process in the organization.

**Responsiveness, Integrated Marketing and Management of Change**

Responsiveness can demand change in terms of organisational structures able to learn of and respond to external views, and curriculum change as a result of the dialectic of internal and external opinion. (Lumby, 1999, p. 196)

Additionally, organizational change and curriculum change are interconnected. One definition of the curriculum noted that it 'is an act of collective response by a collegiate faculty' (Toombs and Tierney, 1992, Online). Thus, it is implying that there is need of an integrated effort of responsiveness from the entire staff of an institution of higher education. However, there may be barriers to responsiveness such as 'a professional culture which is resistant to openness is using a mirage of barriers to justify a stance which actually has its basis in staff attitudes' (Lumby, 1999, p. 202). With this resistance to change, 'if responsiveness is to be more than rhetoric, then making it a reality will need be sufficiently important to those with the most power in any organization'(Lumby, 1999, p. 204). Lumby
(1999) also raises several other issues for educational managers in implementing responsiveness, including the following three:

- Where there is conflict in values, beliefs and preference for action, what criteria will be brought to bear to arrive at a resolution?
- Are sufficient resources given to allow responsiveness to happen, going beyond a promotional or marketing budget to reframing staff's time to allow them to work in different ways?
- Are organisational structures in place which will complement cultural change and support genuine interaction? (P. 205)

These issues demonstrate that there is a need for an organizational structure supported by sufficient resources to enable various conflicts to be tackled. One possible organizational structure is based on integrated marketing. However, to implement integrated marketing across an institution in order to achieve responsiveness requires active management of change. This was the case at International University, where the 'One Year Programs' demanded integrated efforts from the entire organization in the undertaking of a change process. Therefore, the following two sections in this literature review chapter present the two subjects of integrated marketing and management of change.

**Summary of Responsiveness**

This section of the literature review examines in detail the subject of responsiveness. Firstly, the term responsiveness is defined in the context of education, stating that responsive institutions focus on the customer satisfaction in implementing programs. Secondly, it is shown that if marketing is considered an overall philosophy, then responsiveness is the
cultural viewpoint sustaining the marketing efforts in an institution of higher education. The third subsection presents the three general levels of institutional responsiveness, which would later allow matching them up to the type of responsiveness that exists at International University. These were:

- The Unresponsive Institution,
- The Casually Responsive Institution and
- The Highly Responsive Institution.

The subsequent subsection discusses the issue of just how responsive should an educational institution be, stating that an institution of higher education must find a balance between being unresponsive to being overly responsive. It is maintained that being responsive is not enough as a university may be very responsive in its product mix and as a result offer something which is identical to what other competing institutions are offering, as they are also responsive. This led into the next subsection, which examines how an institution should respond, asserting that if an educational institution is to be practical in its responsiveness process, it must first decide to whom to respond, as various groups may have contradictory requirements. As a result, it is argued that only after it is clear to whom the institution is responding, can research be undertaken to ascertain customers’ expectations, which is the key in the creation of an effective product mix.

Therefore, in order to better understand the process of responsiveness that occurred at International University, a framework for academic quality is presented, including its curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of its students and outcomes. The curriculum was defined as an act of collective response
Chapter 2 – Literature Review

by a collegiate faculty, expressing the intellectual accountability as a faculty responds to external factors and to internal factors. It was also shown that curriculum functions at the following four levels:

1) The rhetorical curriculum
2) The planned curriculum
3) The delivered curriculum
4) The received curriculum

Following the curriculum, the importance of recruiting, training and developing an institution's faculty in achieving academic quality was established. Subsequently, the significance of an institution's facilities in influencing this quality was ascertained, as clean rooms, carpeting, regular washroom cleaning, all give a perspective to the individual learner to understand who he or she is in the context of the learning experience. Then, the weight of outcomes was accentuated, as most students and parents want to know about the job and career and graduate school successes of an institution’s alumni. Finally, as to implement integrated marketing across an institution in order to achieve responsiveness requires management of change, the connection of this section on responsiveness to the following sections on integrated marketing and management of change was made clear.
INTEGRATED MARKETING

Integrated marketing became a very popular buzzword on college campuses during the 1990s. By 1999, a majority of colleges and universities in the United States reported practicing integrated marketing concepts at some level. (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 4)

According to a study by Lipman Hearne (1999, Online), a higher education communications and marketing firm, integrated marketing is indeed becoming a powerful force in higher education, as more than half of institutions with integrated marketing plans reported having increased their marketing budgets and formed a campus-wide marketing committee. However, integrated marketing is still ‘a relatively new and unfamiliar concept, despite its seeming popularity among U.S. colleges and universities’ (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 5). Furthermore, as it is ‘a relatively recent addition to the higher education lexicon... there is - at least at this point - no one, generally accepted definition of integrated marketing’ (Sevier, 1999, p. 1).

This section will set out to define integrated marketing by contrasting it with traditional marketing. This includes a comparison of the 4 Ps of traditional marketing to the 4 Cs of integrated marketing, of which the fourth C is integrated marketing communications. Then, the connection between enrolment management (as presented in detail in the first section of this chapter on the evolution of marketing) and integrated marketing will be made clear, including some of the factors which have led institutions of higher education to embrace integrated marketing. This section concludes with the relationship of integrated marketing to responsiveness, setting the stage for the final section of the literature review chapter on the management of change.
Definitions of Integrated Marketing

Integrated marketing is a concept 'developed primarily from marketing models developed by Dr. Philip Kotler of Northwestern University in the mid-1970s' (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 5). Kotler (1997) defines integrated marketing as follows:

Integrated Marketing - when all the company's departments work together to serve the customer's interests, the result is integrated marketing. Integrated marketing takes place on two levels. First, the various marketing functions-sales force, advertising, product management, marketing research, and so on-must work together... second, marketing must be well coordinated with other company departments.

(Kotler, 1997, p. 23)

To examine this definition, it is useful to consider that although currently there is 'no one, generally accepted definition of integrated marketing' (Sevier, 1999, p. 1), there is however a reasonably common consensus that integrated marketing has the following six key elements:

- An outward focus
- Desire to address strategic problems strategically, rather than tactically
- Strategic, organizational, and message integration
- Active listening to the customer
- Database dependence
- Coordination of messages (Sevier, 1999, pp. 1-2)

Kotler's definition does have an external focus stating that integrated marketing serves the customer's interests. Indeed, in more recent work which did not change the definition, Kotler (2000, p. 22) stressed that in integrated marketing not only do all the marketing functions need to be coordinated from the customer's point of view, but also other departments must "think customer" in embracing integrated marketing. Kotler's 1997 definition also implies coordination of messages since it asserts that all
departments of an organization must work together. However, it does not have a strategic aspect to it, nor does it address database dependence. Additionally, it is still in a general business-oriented context and not in the context of higher education. Consequently, as integrated marketing was used in International University, it is essential in this research to examine a definition for integrated marketing in the context of education. One such definition of integrated marketing is offered by Lauer (2001):

Integrated marketing is a strategic approach to advancing colleges and universities that ultimately seeks to involve everyone in the institution in attracting good students, raising money and enhancing visibility. It leads to more focused institutional goals and to getting everyone 'on the same page' with respect to the institution's competitive advantage and unique strengths. (Lauer, 2001, p. 129)

Lauer's definition does have in it, as does the one offered by Kotler, an outward focus, active listening to the customer and coordination of messages. It is different from Kotler as it also includes a strategic aspect. However, although stresses that in integrated marketing everyone should be involved, unlike Kotler's definition, it does not explain how to involve the various members. In addition, it does not address the subject of database dependence (which Kotler did not tackle as well). Therefore, a new definition is offered here that unites the advantages of Kotler's and Lauer's definitions as well as being based on the six key elements recommended by Sevier:

- **Integrated Marketing** is a strategic approach to advancing institutions of higher education that involves all of an educational institution's various departments working together to achieve the institution's objectives and to actively respond to the students' short and long-term interests. Defining these interests should depend on a database of
marketing research which is updated continuously. Integrated marketing in higher education takes place on two levels. First, the various marketing functions, such as academic advising, registration, advertising and marketing research, must work together in the coordination of messages. Second, marketing must be well coordinated with other departments in the institution to ensure strategic, organizational, and message integration.

Examining this new definition reveals how it has united the positive factors identified in previous definitions. The structure of this definition is based on the definition offered by Kotler, but while the terms used in Kotler are in a general business-oriented context, the proposed definition is specific to education. Additionally, this new definition contains Sevier's six key elements of integrated marketing. It also includes in it a strategic aspect and the institution's objectives as recommended by Lauer. These objectives are being influenced by corporate leaders, legislators, members of boards of regents, parents and other stakeholders who are putting pressure on higher education to check the relevance and currency of what is being taught (Stevens 2000, p. 23).

However, this new definition of integrated marketing does more than just unite the previous definitions as it adds another issue that the previous definitions did not address directly: students' long-term interests. Kotler discusses the customer's interests without differentiating at all the short term interests from the long-term interests. (A detailed discussion on the importance of the long-term interests of a student for an institution of higher education was discussed earlier in this literature review on pages 39-41.) Therefore, the new proposed definition of integrated marketing has
widened the students' interests to include in it both the short and the long-term interests.

Although this new definition of integrated marketing was instrumental in focusing the research at International University, it still does not explain what the difference between integrated marketing and traditional marketing is. After all, Drucker defined marketing over thirty years ago in the following manner:

Marketing is so basic that it cannot be considered a separate function on a par with others such as manufacturing or personnel. It is first a central dimension of the entire business. It is the whole business seen from the point of view of its final result, that is, from the customers' point of view. (Drucker, 1973, p. 63)

In this definition Drucker is claiming that marketing must exist in the veins of the entire business; it is an integral part of all the functions of an organization. Furthermore, Gray (1991, p. 11) claims that marketing should be fully integrated with other aspects of institutional management so as to make better the quality of service offered by the school or college. Hence, the question then is what is the difference between integrated marketing and traditional marketing? This is discussed in detail in the following subsection.

Integrated Marketing vs. Traditional Marketing

In comparing and contrasting integrated marketing to traditional marketing, the first central concept is the marketing mix. Kotler (2000) defined the marketing mix as 'the set of marketing tools that the firm uses to pursue its marketing objectives in the target market' (p. 15). These tools of the marketing mix were classified over forty years ago by McCarthy into four
groups known as the 4 Ps: Product, Price, Promotion and Place (McCarthy and Perreault, 1993, p. 46). According to Lauer (2001, p. 132), one of the main concepts that has traditionally characterized marketing is the 4 Ps. 'The 4 Ps represent the sellers' view of the marketing tools available for influencing buyers' (Kotler, 2000, p. 16).

Although the 4 Ps are widespread, they have been criticized specifically for their representation of the sellers' view. Sevier (1999, p. 5) maintains that the traditional definition of marketing which includes the 4 Ps focuses on relating the needs of the organization and its stakeholders. Consequently it has less regard for the needs and expectations of the marketplace and target audiences (Sevier, 1999, p. 5). According to Sevier (1999, p. 5), in the traditional marketing approach of the 4 P's, it is the institution that determines the product offered, its price, its place and its promotion and hardly ever do the market forces and the needs of the target audiences fit into the equation. Conversely, according to Sevier (1999, p. 5), integrated marketing deals with a different paradigm: the 4 Cs that derive from the perspective of the customer or target audience. 'Where the 4 Ps have top-down orientation, the 4 Cs focus on the needs of the customer or, in this case, the consumer' (Sevier, 1998, p. 31). The way the 4 Ps respond to the 4 Cs can be seen in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4 Ps</th>
<th>4 Cs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Customer solution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price</td>
<td>Customer cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place</td>
<td>Convenience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td>Communication</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.2 – 4 Ps vs. 4 Cs (Source: Lauterborn, 1990, p. 26)
Understanding the difference between each of these pairs in the two columns will enable the study at International University to examine whether there is a tendency towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs in the university's marketing. Therefore, here is a comparison of each pair:

- **Product vs. customer solution** - Instead of a fixed product that the institution tries to sell, it searches for a solution that answers a customer's or consumer's needs, thereby involving the customer (Sevier, 1999, p. 5). The institution, realizing that it must have 'a deep understanding of consumer needs in order to reach and influence today's consumer effectively' (Garber and Dotson, 2002, p. 3), tries to listen to the customer first and then act, instead of first acting and then trying to listen (as in traditional marketing). For example, a university with a customer solution orientation does not try to sell its current curriculum, but rather researches the needs of its customers and then develops a new curriculum which it markets.

- **Price vs. customer cost** - As an alternative to price, in this approach there is cost. Although Sevier (1999) maintains that there is 'little significant difference between price and cost, save semantics' (p. 5), this is not so since cost includes more than just the price of a product. For instance, a price of a book may be one sum, but its cost could be higher as a result of delivery expenses. Furthermore, even if the price of a product is constant to all buyers, its cost may be different for each customer. For example, in addition to the price of tuition, a student can incur costs such as rent or travel expenses that could be different from one student to another.
• **Place vs. convenience** - As a substitute for the term place, in higher education the term convenience reflects the customer's point of view and contains other issues such as access (Sevier, 1999, p. 5) and not only the physical place of an institution. For example, in a college or university the term convenience could also include flexibility in study hours or various means of studies such as videoconferencing or distance learning.

• **Promotion vs. communication** - According to Sevier (1999) an institution of higher education that adopts a communication approach is thus dealing with a two-way communication process than with the one-way communication process of downward promotion (Sevier, 1999, p. 5). As ‘communication is what the receiver understands, not what the sender says’ (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 91), there is movement from the one-way linear model of communication to the idea of communication as a two-way occurrence (Riches, 1994, p. 246). Therefore, an institution of higher education can no longer promote its offering in one-way communication. It must understand the importance of two-way communication in modern marketing, as in the twenty-first century, unlike the historical marketing approaches of the 1960s that focused on the 4Ps, the marketplace is interactive (Schultz and Schultz, 1998, p. 9).

In this lies a major difference between traditional marketing and integrated marketing. In traditional marketing, ‘promotion’ is the fourth P, while in integrated marketing, ‘integrated marketing communication’ is the fourth C (Sevier, 1999, p. 3). In integrated marketing communication ‘the underlying thrust is the coordination of various marketing communication devices (e.g. advertising, direct marketing,
etc.) to create a unified message' (Grove, Carlson and Dorsch, 2002, p. 393). For example, at New Jersey Institute of Technology University there are integrated marketing efforts that include integrated marketing communication endeavours, such as developing 'a cohesive program of university visibility that utilizes consistent messages and themes as well as uniform graphic standards' (New Jersey Institute of Technology University, 2004, Online).

However, as stated by Sevier (1999, p. 5), the difference between traditional definitions of marketing and integrated marketing is not only limited to the 4 Ps versus the 4 Cs. Another difference, according to Sevier (1999, p. 5), is strategic thinking and execution of strategic decisions. As for the latter, according to Sevier (1999, p. 5), integrated marketing demands that strategic decisions be based on a realistic, even independent, assessment of problems and opportunities. Additionally, Sevier (1999, p. 5) maintains that a strategic plan must also recognize a realistic assessment of strategic assets. As Kotler (2000) puts it, a strategic plan must create ‘a viable fit between the organization's objectives, skills, and resources and its changing market opportunities’ (p. 64). This, however, is contrary to the situation in higher education where in many cases strategic planning seems to take place in a vacuum resulting in a plan that does not address the real needs and therefore cannot be executed (Sevier, 1999, p. 5). Integrated marketing aids institutions of higher education handle these strategic inadequacies as it:

- Forces marketing issues up to the strategic level
- Is built on realistic assessments
- Operationalizes the strategic plan and stresses accountability and ongoing evaluation (Sevier, 1999, p. 5).
Thus, the strategic plan of International University should be inspected on the basis of Sevier's three topics. First, the university's strategic plan must be examined to see if marketing issues were elevated to the strategic level. Secondly, the strategic plan must be reviewed as to find out whether it addresses the real needs discovered through independent assessment of problems and opportunities. Thirdly, an examination of the process by which the strategic plan was implemented is necessary at the university, including how it stresses accountability and continuing evaluation.

However, in examining these three issues pointed out by Sevier, it is not clear how integrated marketing is different from enrolment management (which was discussed in this chapter on pages 49-50), since it includes all of them. Enrolment management (1) contains the strategic level, (2) is built on realistic assessments of students' needs due to greater concentration on research and (3) operationalizes the strategic plan by optimizing the students' experiences at the institution through considerable supplementary changes in policies, procedures and services (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12). Therefore, the subsequent subsection will explain the relationship between integrated marketing and enrolment management.

### Integrated Marketing and Enrolment Management

In order to understand the connection between integrated marketing and enrolment management so as to further focus the research at International University, it is at first necessary to review the following statement on enrolment management by Kotler and Fox (1995):

> Enrolment management also involved a change in the way of thinking. The objective was no longer "to do one's job" but rather to respond to student needs. Faculty members spent time talking
with prospective students about courses and careers in their field, viewing themselves as members of the enrolment management effort. The instructor offering to help a student cope with academic difficulties realized that he or she was aiding retention every bit as much as was the counselor or the financial aid officer. (p. 12)

In this, enrolment management stresses that it is everyone's job to help enrolment activities. However, with such a situation, there was a danger that two members of an institution may communicate a contradictory message to students. For instance, a lecturer who decides to give out less homework since some of his/her students are working, while the dean emphasizes in each speech that in this institution only through hard work that includes home assignments will the students achieve a high level necessary in today's competitive world. In this case, both the lecturer and the dean are responding to student needs, but to different needs. The lecturer is addressing the short-term needs of the working students, which are to be able to cope with holding a job and studying, while the dean is focusing on the long-term professional needs of the students. Consequently, it is essential to ensure that all the members of the institution were communicating the same message in responding to students needs, creating the need for integration in an educational institution, i.e. for integrated marketing.

Overall, the objective of integrated marketing is to get everyone in the institution 'on the same page'. Everyone should understand the institution's mission, vision, and values. Everyone should be able to explain its market niche and its competitive advantages. And everyone should understand their responsibility to help tell the story - and to find students, raise money and lift visibility.

(Lauer, 2001, pp. 130-131)

Thus, it was important for the study at International University to examine whether such integration did occur at the university or was there a situation
where different members of the university communicated a contradicting message to students. It was also valuable to study the different levels of integration. This was achieved by considering the following three levels of integration that Sevier (1999, p. 4) argues integrated marketing must have:

- **Strategic integration** which involves the assessment and meeting of target student needs through the allocation of strategic resources to the 4 Cs within the constraint of the institutional mission,
- **Organizational integration** which concerns coordinating resources and sharing goals, and
- **Message integration** which means that messages are not only consistent and coordinated but are also driven by strategic decisions, and thus ‘have a common look, sound, and feel across various mediums and over time’ (Sevier, 1999, p. 4).

The need for these different levels of integration caused enrolment management to develop into integrated marketing and as a result, ‘integrated marketing includes enrolment management, but the integration may include aspects of institutional advancement, image enhancement, and public relations’ (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 4). These aspects do not exist in enrolment management, as one of the immediate international reasons to implement integrated marketing in higher education is ‘a demand by institutional stakeholders for more public visibility’ (Lauer, 2001, p. 129). Furthermore, according to Sevier (1999, p. 6), the institutions of higher education that should take into account integrated marketing are not the ones in which tuition dollars and/or donated dollars continue to rise, but rather those that are not so resource-rich and/or work in a marketplace that is more contested. Sevier (1999) maintains that these institutions might suffer from the following problems:

- Difficulties in student recruiting in primary recruiting market
• Difficulties in fundraising among alumni and core contributors
• High tuition discount rate
• Organizational lethargy and poor morale
• High administrative and faculty turnover
• Weak, inaccurate, or inconsistent image
• Over dependency on tuition and tuition increase
• Small or decreasing endowment or tapping endowment to meet operating expenses
• Inability to respond to problems and opportunities in a timely fashion (p. 6).

Additionally, in higher education there is an increase in the sophistication of consumers who are demanding higher quality (Lauer, 2001, p. 129). Enrolment management is no longer sufficient and thus it was widened into integrated marketing. Therefore, as integrated marketing should be considered the next stage after enrolment management in the evolution of marketing by educational institutions. However, as discussed in detail in the first section on marketing in this literature review chapter (pages 42-50), Kotler and Fox (1995, pp. 11-12) have only listed six stages in the evolution of marketing in education: (1) marketing is unnecessary, (2) marketing is promotion, (3) marketing is segmentation and marketing research, (4) marketing is positioning, (5) marketing is strategic planning, and (6) marketing is enrolment management. They did not mention integrated marketing.

Yet although Kotler and Fox's book 'is considered the best overall source about marketing higher education' (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 16), it is nevertheless dated 1995. Evolution may be a slow process, but it is still a dynamic process. It should be subsequently no surprise that marketing continued to evolve from enrolment management to its seventh stage of integrated marketing. (Indeed, no one should also be astonished if marketing continues to develop further from integrated marketing to
another form of marketing.) Accordingly, to understand the stages of the evolution of marketing in higher education, the following table was created that although it is based on the material offered by Kotler and Fox (1995, pp. 11-12), is also bringing something new to the table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marketing is...</th>
<th>Stage 1</th>
<th>Stage 2</th>
<th>Stage 3</th>
<th>Stage 4</th>
<th>Stage 5</th>
<th>Stage 6</th>
<th>Stage 7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unnecessary</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Segmentation &amp; market research</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positioning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic planning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolment management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic, organizational and message integration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>√</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.3 - The Stages of Evolution of Integrated Marketing

This table demonstrates that each stage in marketing builds on the previous stage and hence includes it. In the first stage, marketing was deemed unnecessary. Then, in the second stage, it was realized that marketing is important in recruiting students and marketing also represents promotion. Later, in the third stage, it was understood that in order to promote, market research that results in segmentation is required. In the fourth stage, it was comprehended that once information on segments was obtained from the market research, positioning could improve promotion, as positioning allows distinguishing the institution from its competitors. However, for an institution to distinguish itself from competition as well as respond to new market trends, it must have strategic planning, and so the fifth stage was created. Then, after researching the market, segmenting it and strategically
positioning the promotional activities, it was central to ensure students' optimal experience in the institution occur, and thus the sixth stage of enrolment management was born.

Finally, since enrolment management created a situation where members of an institution of higher education were in contact with students and potential students as part of the campus wide effort of enrolment, it was essential that integration takes place. Since successful integration required strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration, the evolution of marketing in higher education matured into its seventh stage: integrated marketing. This evolutionary process will specifically be used at International University to examine how far the university has actually evolved. Furthermore, this evolutionary process will also enable to examine in general at what stage of the evolution of marketing did institutions of higher education become responsive to the marketplace. This in turn allows a discussion that links integrated marketing to responsiveness, which is presented in the following subsection.

**Integrated Marketing and Responsiveness**

To understand the relationship between integrated marketing and responsiveness, it is firstly needed to review the following stages of evolution of traditional marketing into integrated marketing (offered in the previous subsection):

1. Marketing is unnecessary.
2. Marketing is promotion.
3. Marketing is segmentation and marketing research.
4. Marketing is positioning.
5. Marketing is strategic planning.
6. Marketing is enrolment management.
7. Marketing is integrated marketing

This will enable a view to develop as to what stage of the evolution of marketing did institutions of higher education become responsive to the market. To achieve this, it must be recalled (as presented in this chapter on page 54) that a responsive institution attempts 'to sense, serve, and satisfy the needs and wants of its customers and publics within the constraints of its mission and resources' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 35). Thus, the first stage of 'marketing is unnecessary' is obviously not when institutions started to be responsive. Nor did it occur in the second stage of 'marketing is promotion', since (as discussed on page 57 of this chapter) as long as educational institutions interpret marketing as being basically about promotion 'responsiveness will inevitably be hampered, in that the need to present the glossy and positive image will preclude honest engagement between stakeholders with the issues that confront the organisation' (Lumby, 1999, p. 204). Consequently, it would seem that responsiveness began with the third phase of 'marketing is segmentation and marketing research'.

However, the focus of this stage was not on the customer's needs but, according to Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 11), on researching the market to better understand how the college-choice decision was made, in order to provide the right promotional information at the right time (as explained in detail on pages 44-45 of this literature review chapter). In the fourth step of the evolution, 'marketing is positioning', although each of the institutions of higher education was attempting 'to distinguish the school from its competitors along real dimensions that students value in order to be the preferred school for certain student segments' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11), they could not be considered highly responsive
Institutions. The effort in this stage did not concentrate on serving the needs of customers and accordingly revise the institution's program and procedures. Rather it was on the exterior promotion of an institution that wanted to achieve 'distinctiveness in the minds of prospective students' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11).

The stage in which educational institutions did revise their programs, procedures, and other activities to better align their efforts with major market trends, according to Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 12), was 'marketing is strategic planning' (as presented on pages 46-47 of this chapter). Therefore, it is this stage of the evolution of marketing that may be considered the first in which institutions were truly responsive. As it was shown in the previous subsection that each stage of this evolutionary process builds on the former stage, then in 'marketing is enrolment management' institutions are also responsive. Indeed, Kotler and Fox (1995) argue that one of the steps in building a responsive institution is effective organization design in which 'a school with an enrolment management structure often finds that marketing expertise and activities can be better coordinated' (p. 39).

Since integrated marketing includes enrolment management, the last stage of 'marketing is integrated marketing' is also a responsive one. Lauer (2001, p. 129) maintains that integrated marketing in higher education is a way of understanding the needs of students and making sure that programs and services respond to those needs. By understanding this, the relationship of marketing, responsiveness and integrated marketing can be made clearer. As stated on page 57 of this chapter, marketing as an overall philosophy depends on responsiveness, as no marketing efforts will succeed unless the educational institution
has the level of institutional responsiveness necessary to culturally support those efforts. To achieve this needed level of responsiveness, an institution may choose from several marketing implementation possibilities, including strategic planning, enrolment management or integrated marketing. Thus, as Sevier (1999, p. 6) maintains that integrated marketing will not be of help to every institution that has problems, it is not the only means to achieve responsiveness. This is illustrated by the following diagram:

![Diagram](image)

In International University, in order to bring about responsiveness, integrated marketing was chosen. However, as for an institution 'to become more responsive, it needs to develop a plan for institutional change' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 39), the subsequent section of the literature review will accordingly deal with the subject of management of change.

**Summary of Integrated Marketing**

In this section a new definition of integrated marketing was offered that united the advantages of other definitions:
• Integrated Marketing is a strategic approach to advancing institutions of higher education that involves all of an educational institution's various departments working together to achieve the institution's objectives and to actively respond to the students' short and long-term interests. Defining these interests should depend on a database of marketing research which is updated continuously. Integrated marketing in higher education takes place on two levels. First, the various marketing functions, such as academic advising, registration, advertising and marketing research, must work together in the coordination of messages. Second, marketing must be well coordinated with other departments in the institution to ensure strategic, organizational, and message integration.

Then, the 4 Ps of traditional marketing were compared to the 4 Cs of integrated marketing, revealing:

- **Product vs. customer solution** - Instead of a fixed product that the institution tries to sell, it searches for a solution that answers a customer's or consumer's needs.

- **Price vs. customer cost** - Even if the price of a product is constant to all buyers, its cost may be different for each customer due to individual expenses such as travelling expenses.

- **Place vs. convenience** - As a substitute for the term place, in higher education the term convenience reflects the customer's point of view and contains other issues such as access.

- **Promotion vs. communication** - An institution of higher education that adopts a communication approach is thus dealing with a two-way communication process than with the one-way communication process of downward promotion. In this lies a major difference between traditional marketing and integrated marketing, as in traditional
marketing, 'promotion' is the fourth P, while in integrated marketing, ‘integrated marketing communication’ is the fourth C.

Subsequently, as integrated marketing has a strategic focus, it aids institutions of higher education as it forces marketing issues up to the strategic level, is built on realistic assessments and operationalizes the strategic plan and stresses accountability and ongoing evaluation. Then, it was shown that as enrolment management stresses that it is everyone's job to help enrolment activities, it was essential to ensure that all the members of the institution were communicating the same message in responding to students' needs, creating the need for integrated marketing. The three levels of integration in integrated marketing were presented: strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration. This demonstrated that marketing continued to evolve from enrolment management to its seventh stage of integrated marketing:

1. Marketing is unnecessary.
2. Marketing is promotion.
3. Marketing is segmentation and marketing research.
4. Marketing is positioning.
5. Marketing is strategic planning.
6. Marketing is enrolment management.
7. Marketing is integrated marketing

This section concluded by stating that as marketing is as an overall philosophy depending on responsiveness, to achieve the needed level of responsiveness, an institution may choose from several marketing implementation possibilities, of which one is integrated marketing. As this required institutional change, it set the stage for the final section of the literature review chapter on management of change.
MANAGEMENT OF CHANGE

Just as marketing is beginning to get accepted in education, the pace of change has increased in educational institutions (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12). ‘Higher education is being asked to be responsive to an ever-changing environment’ (Kezar, 2001, Online). Furthermore, Lumby (1999, p. 196) maintains that in order to achieve responsiveness not only do institutions need to learn of, and respond to, external views, but curriculum change will occur as a result of the dialectic of internal and external opinion. Therefore, according to Stey and Squelch (1994), educational managers ‘cannot decide whether to change; they can only decide how to change’ (p. 183). At International University, using a responsive integrated marketing approach, it was decided to change by developing the one-year programs. However, ‘one cliché about higher education has it that it is easier (and faster) to change the course of history than to change a history course’ (Skinner, 1999, p. 22).

Accordingly, the third section of the literature review chapter will focus on management of change. Definitions of change will be offered in general and in the context of higher education. Then, resistance to change in higher education will be examined, including conflict and organizational politics. Next, the changes required of an institution of higher education in implementing integrated marketing will be presented in detail, which will comprise recommendations on how to overcome resistance to the implementation process of integrated marketing. This section of the literature review chapter will conclude with a proposed instrument on how to measure the effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts, which will enable to later evaluate in the findings chapter the performance of integrated marketing at International University.
Definitions of Change

There are different views on how to define change as it ‘isn't new, and neither is its study’ (Ellsworth, 2000, Online). Newstrom and Davis (1993) define work change as ‘any alteration that occurs in the work environment’ (p. 270). Newstrom and Davis (1993) even generalize ‘that the whole organization tends to be affected by change in any part of it’ (p. 270). Although their definition does emphasize the importance of change to the entire organization, it does not define the scope of the work environment, nor does it address the relationship between internal forces in an organization and external ones, as does the following definition:

Change is the continuous adoption of corporate strategies and structures to changing external conditions. (Recklies, 2001, p. 1)

This definition first stresses that change is continuous as ‘today, change is not the exception but a steady ongoing process’ (Recklies, 2001, p. 1). It also emphasizes that organizations must adapt themselves to external forces. However, although it is useful in giving a general concept of change as a process, it does not consider the fact that there are different types of change and therefore does not give a framework for analyzing change in the context of higher education. One such possible framework is offered by Levy (2000, p. 46), who categories change into four main groups:

1. **Mission change** consists of changes in the field of occupation of an organization, in the organization's objectives, in the types of customers, and in the offered products/services. In International University, the one-year programs are an example of mission change.
2. **Structural change** that includes changes in the nature of relationships and authorities within the organization, and changes in the nature of relationships between the organization and other organizations in its environment. Thus, it was important to research at International University the structural changes that resulted due to integrated marketing.

3. **Technological change** that is not only comprised of introducing new technologies, but contains also changes in work processes and methods, such as movement from individual work to working in a team. Hence, technological change in this context is important for the study at International University, as integrated marketing does indeed require an institution to move in the direction of teamwork.

4. **Personnel change** that involves either changes in the values and beliefs of employees or changes in the current composition of employees by firing some and hiring new ones. As the values and beliefs of an institution's members influence their responsiveness, personnel change is also a significant issue for the research at International University.

Although this definition by Levy does aid in categorizing the different types of change at International University, it does not address the dynamics of change that must be initially understood in order to grasp the extremely complex process of change in education (Fullan, 1991, p. 16). After all, 'change is difficult in any organization, but it is perhaps more so in higher education where tradition is so treasured' (Sevier, 1997, p. 4). Therefore, a complementary approach to the types of change presented by Levy is necessary that takes into account the dynamics of change, such as
the one offered by Stevens (2000, p. 22) who differentiates between two types of pace in change: revolutionary and evolutionary.

In revolutionary change, whose source may be an idea or specific group support, the time span for change is fast, as if slow will result in failure (Stevens, 2000, p. 22). It also involves a paradigm shift and thus, under these circumstances, change is noisy, messy and unpredictable (Stevens, 2000, p. 22). In evolutionary change, according to Stevens (2000, p. 22), the source of change is not easily identified as change takes place over many years and is incremental. It is also quiet, subtle, with its outcomes fairly well known and hence with minimal resistance to it (Stevens, 2000, p. 22). Managing change requires both revolutionary one-off projects and evolutionary transformations (Recklies, 2001, p. 1). Consequently, research at International University should examine whether each of the four types of change proposed by Levy (2000, p. 46) - mission change, structural change, technological change and personnel change - occurred either at a revolutionary rate or at an evolutionary pace. This is the first step in studying how change and resistance to it were managed at the university intent on implementing integrated marketing.

Resistance to Change

Newstrom and Davis (1993, p. 276) state that although management might give its best efforts in handling change, it will not be necessarily welcomed. Stevens (2000, p. 21), a business school dean for 10 years, argues that ninety eight percent of the people support (or at least do not resist) change. However, Stevens (2000) maintains that ‘the other 2% not only do not get out of the way, they attempt to take up 98% of a dean's time’ (p. 21) in resisting change. Newstrom and Davis (1993) define this
resistance to change as any employee behaviours that are ‘designed to discredit, delay, or prevent the implementation of a work change’ (p. 276).

Employees resist change because it threatens their needs for security, social interaction, status, or esteem. The perceived threat stemming from a change may be real or imagined, intended or unintended, large or small. Regardless of its nature, employees will to protect themselves from the effects of change. Their actions may range from complaints, foot-dragging, and passive resistance to absenteeism, sabotage, and work slowdowns. (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 276)

Ansoff and McDonnell (1990) argue that ‘resistance to change is proportional to the size of the discontinuities introduced into culture and power, and inversely proportional to the speed of introduction’ (p. 416). Therefore, on one hand, according to Stevens (2000, p. 22), if incremental change takes place, resistance to change will be relatively low. On the other hand, if paradigm change (or revolutionary change) occurs, resistance to change could be quite high or as Stevens (2000) puts it: ‘revolutionary change is never without casualties’ (p. 22). As ‘in higher education it is of paramount importance that everyone should understand that integrated marketing is a way of thinking, not a way of commercializing’ (Lauer, 2001, p. 131), to some it is a paradigm shift and is thus resisted. Ansoff and McDonnell (1990, p. 408) list four circumstances in which individuals will resist change:

1. **A threat to individuals’ power** over decisions or resources exists.

   One example is an academic manager that resists change due to the fact he or she no longer controls the curriculum as before and must now be a part of an integrated team that develops the curriculum. Newton and Tarrant (1992) conclude that there is a relationship between the power of individuals and the level of resistance they are
likely to put forth, as 'people will resist positive innovation if to do so is their only or main influence over the system’ (p. 105).

2. Ansoff and McDonnell (1990, p. 408) also argue that another reason for resistance to change is any perceived potential reduction in rewards, reputation or prestige. An academic manager, working in a newly formed integrated team developing a curriculum, may feel a lost of status and thereby offer resistance to the whole process.

3. Resistance to change could also stem from any feeling of incompetence to carry out the proposed changes (Ansoff and McDonnell, 1990, p. 408). For instance, a lecturer might object to a new program offered at a university, if he or she had to engage in a different and unfamiliar form of teaching, such as experiential learning.

4. According to Ansoff and McDonnell (1990, p. 408), individuals will also resist change due to the uncertainty as to how the proposed changes might affect them. For example, an innovative curriculum may encounter resistance from a lecturer who is simply uncertain of what will be his or her role in it.

Although, Ansoff and McDonnell offer possible circumstances in which individuals will resist change, these do not include the ways in which a group will resist change and the fact that sometimes there are mixed circumstances that create resistance to change. Hence, a more complete framework for analyzing the reasons behind resistance to change is offered by Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 277-278) who define three different
types of resistance to change that, together in mixture, affect an employee's total attitude toward a change process:

1. **Sociological resistance** results in a change process challenging group interests, norms and social values, which are significant forces in any situation. It is also important to consider that on a small-group level, changes may disrupt work friendships and status relationships. For example, a group of students may resist a change process that breaks them up into smaller classes. Although each student would benefit individually from a higher level of learning, as a group they might choose to stay together resisting change due to personal relationships formed during the time spent studying and working collaboratively.

2. **Logical resistance** is created due to different views on facts, rational reasoning, logic or science. Such a fact is the school's curriculum which, according to Kotler and Fox (1995) 'changed very slowly because it was based on decades—even centuries—of tradition and had "stood the test of time"' (p. 11). This type of resistance is caused by the short-term costs, such as the actual time and effort needed to adapt to change, including additional job duties that must be studied. Hence, although in the long run a change may be beneficial to employees, these short-term costs create resistance.

3. **Psychological resistance** (where employees may fear the unknown, mistrust management's leadership, or feel that their security and self-esteem are threatened) is usually based on emotions, sentiments, and attitudes. Although these feelings may inaccurate, they must be dealt with, as they are very real to employees. Moreover, according to Hohn (1998, Online), in educational organizations these emotional resistances to change may erupt as conflict.
Conflict in Organizations

In many respects, the people with the greatest stake in the status quo - senior administrators and faculty - are the same people who are in the best position to effect change. At the same time, the people most interested in change are often new entrants into the system and lack experience, power, or both. As a result, the potential for conflictual relationships will increase.

(Sevier, 1998, pp. 39-40)

According to Newstrom and Davis (1993) ‘conflict arises from disagreements over the goals to attain or the methods used to accomplish these goals’ (p. 392). Although this definition differentiates between ‘where to go’ (goals) and ‘how to get there’ (methods), it is too general and does not describe between who the disagreements are. Putnam and Poole (1987) achieve this by defining conflict as ‘the interaction of interdependent people who perceive opposition of goals, aims, and values, and who see the other party as potentially interfering with the realization of these goals’ (p. 552). This definition also adds values which are an integral part of responsiveness, but it does not elaborate on the fact that ‘organizational conflict can take place at a variety of levels’ (Miller, 1999, p. 196). Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 392-393) list four levels of conflict:

1. **Intrapersonal conflict** - conflict within an employee, which can be created due to a person holding competing roles. For example, a person that is a manager of a team having the responsibility to protect the team's resources and at the same time a member of the executive staff that is charged with trimming down costs. In such an ambivalent situation intrapersonal conflict will arise.
2. **Interpersonal conflict** - conflict between individuals that affect a person's emotions and cause a need to protect one's self-image and self-esteem from damage by others. As stated by (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, pp. 393-394) there are a variety of sources that cause interpersonal conflict:

- Personality clashes - individual differences in personality.
- Different sets of values - people have dissimilar belief, values and philosophies that lead them in different directions.
- Threats to status - when status or social rank of an employee in a group is threatened, face saving becomes a powerful driving force as a person struggles to uphold a desired image.
- Contrasting perceptions - differences that arise from prior experiences and expectations of the employees.
- Organizational change - regarding differing views towards subjects, directions to go, ways to take and their possible success, the resources to be used and the probable outcomes. In this it would seem that conflict and change are intertwined as conflict creates change (Miller, 1999, p. 194), and change creates conflict (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 393).

3. **Intergroup conflict** - conflict between groups that is caused by different viewpoints group loyalties and competition for resources. ‘Not surprisingly, intergroup conflict can become complicated when members of a single group hold varying views about the conflict’ (Miller, 1999, p. 196).

4. Conflict across organizations due to competition in the marketplace, which Miller (1999) refers to as **interorganizational conflict**,
emphasizing that it highlights 'the importance of the environment in which organizations are embedded' (p. 196).

Therefore, it is important to research to what extent all these factors existed at International University, as well as their impact on the implementation of integrated marketing. According to Newstrom and Davis (1993, p. 394), conflicts are not only destructive but can be seen as nearly inevitable. Therefore a more positive way is to search for ways in which they can result in constructive outcomes (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 394). Newstrom and Davis (1993, p. 394) maintain that there are some advantages and disadvantages regarding conflicts:

- Advantages - people are stimulated to search for improved approaches that lead to better results, they have to be more creative and to experiment with new ideas and once-hidden problems are brought to the surface and must be confronted and solved.

- Disadvantages - especially if the conflict lasts a long period of time or becomes too intense, at the interpersonal level, cooperation and teamwork may worsen. Distrust may rise among people who need to coordinate their efforts. Individuals may feel defeated, self image may decline and their stress level will go up. Predictably, the motivation level of some employees will be decreased.

Therefore, according to Newstrom and Davis (1993, p. 395), conflict may create four distinct outcomes: a "lose-lose" situation when both parties are worse off that they were earlier; a "lose-win" situation when one person is defeated while the other one is victorious; a "win-lose" situation is the reverse, where the one who previously lost is the winner; and a "win-win"
situation when both persons perceive that they are in a better position than they were before the conflict started. Although, a "win-win" situation is the most desirable, there are those who focus only on the "win-lose" situation, which sometimes leads to a "lose-lose" situation, especially in organizational politics.

Organizational Politics

Buchanan and Badham (1999, p. 615) argue that politics are one of the essential means used by those who try deliberately to bring about a change. Organizational politics are behaviours that enhance or protect an individual's self-interest and 'may be used to help to reach a promotion, sell higher management on the merits of a proposal that will expand one's responsibilities and resources, or gain personal visibility. Employees involved in organizational politics usually put their self-interest above that of their employer in their attempts to gain and use political power' (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 406). According to Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 406-407), there are several tactics that may be used to achieve political power:

- **Social exchange** - relying on the powerful norm of reciprocity in society which means that two people feel an obligation to pay social 'debts' to each other.
- **Alliances** - continuing exchanges over a period of time usually lead to alliance in which at least two people unite in a longer-term power group to get benefits that they commonly want.
- **Identification with higher authority** - becoming identified with a higher authority or a powerful figure, such as a president's personal
assistant who has political power due to representing the president in numerous contacts with others.

- **Control of information** - being in charge of information that others need results in political power.
- **Selective service** - giving service only to those who support the service provider.
- **Power and status symbols** - having various assets and personnel that imply power such as an extremely large and lavishly decorated office or a personal assistant in an organizational function that previously did not have an assistant.
- **Power plays** - aggressively grabbing power from others, which is a risky tactic to grab political power, as those others may retaliate in ways that eventually will weaken the power grabber's power.
- **Networks** - joining or forming interest groups with common goals and that operate on the basis of friendship and personal contacts.

Therefore, it is necessary to research which of these tactics were used at International University. Additionally, as politics may damage organizational efficiency (Gandz and Murray, 1980, p. 244), it is important to examine their effects on the implementation of integrated marketing at International University.

**Change Management in Implementing Integrated Marketing**

Educational managers such as deans discover that a very large a portion of their job requires them to be directly involved with change (Stevens, 2000, p. 21). However, implementing change effectively in education is difficult as ‘productive educational change roams somewhere between overcontrol
and chaos' (Fullan, 1994, p. 19). The implementation of a change process is often unsuccessful due to lack of fundamental change management (Yazici, 2002, p. 539). Hence, in order to research how integrated marketing was implemented at International University, a framework for change management that will allow building the detailed subsidiary questions is necessary. Such a framework is offered by Recklies (2001) who defines change management as follows:

Change management means to plan, initiate, realize, control, and finally stabilize change processes on both, corporate and personal level. (Recklies, 2001, p. 1)

Accordingly, based on this definition, the following three subsections of the literature review will be:

1. Planning and initiating integrated marketing are united in the first subsection, as to plan integrated marketing cannot be done without initiating the change process by choosing a champion and a team that builds the marketing plan (as will be elaborated on in this subsection).

2. Realizing and controlling integrated marketing are combined into the second subsection as they are interconnected. This is due to the fact that in integrated marketing as implementation of the marketing plan begins so does evaluation and modification of it (Sevier, 1998, p. 162).

3. Stabilizing integrated marketing is the third subsection that focuses not on the implementation of integrated marketing but on its actual institutionalization, as 'it is generally recognized that institutionalization takes place when attempts are made to stabilize the change in state' (Williamson, 1999, p. 27).
Furthermore, this definition is also very useful as it emphasizes that change management should occur at both the group and individual level. This is significant as, according to Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 271-273), there is a response to work change on two levels:

1. **Personal response** - work change operates through every employee's attitudes to create a response that is conditioned by feelings toward the change. 'The way that people feel about a change then determines how they will respond to it' (Newstrom and Davis 1993, p. 272).

2. **Group response** - employees frequently demonstrate their attachment to the group by joining with it in some uniform response to the change. 'Basically, the group responds with the feeling, "We're all in this together. Whatever happens to one of us affects all of us"' (Newstrom and Davis 1993, p. 273).

Therefore, the research at International University should examine the implementation of integrated marketing both at the group and at individual level, starting with how the implementation of integrated marketing was planned and initiated.

**1. Planning and Initiating Integrated Marketing**

Most certainly, planning is an important part of integrated marketing efforts. (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 4)

Planning should firstly be at the strategic level as in integrated marketing 'strategic planning is designed to help institutions respond effectively to new situations' (Sevier, 1998, p. 121). However, to initiate such planning, there is need of leadership in higher education that is committed to strategic planning (Sevier, 1998, p. 19). Without the support of top administration an educational institution cannot develop a strong marketing orientation which
focuses on responsiveness (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 39). For an institution to change, its president should ‘personally understand, support, and operate with a marketing perspective’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 39). Moreover, ‘if the president doesn’t aggressively support marketing, it will fail’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 39).

The active commitment of the president to integrated marketing includes writing an integrated marketing plan (Sevier, 1998, p. 106). This written plan provides a detailed account of what will be done, by whom, and when, becoming thus a guide to action (Sevier, 1996, p. 6). ‘Marketing is too complex, dollars too scarce, and time too fleeting to proceed without a written plan’ (Sevier, 1996, p. 6). However, according to Sevier (1999, p. 6), before the integrated marketing plan can be written, the following interrelated issues should be taken into account: the institution's mission, its vision and its strategic plan. Therefore, the research should not only examine International University's integrated marketing plan, but it should also study these three issues, starting with the university's mission.

A mission describes the core, shared values that ‘the campus community has decided are unassailable’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 22). ‘All marketing plans and strategies must be founded on the institution's mission – its raison d'être’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 21). If marketing plans and strategies are not a logical and even heartfelt extension of an institution's mission, then integrated marketing change efforts will fail (Sevier, 1998, pp. 21-22). Nonetheless, although an institution's mission is a vital part in the planning process of integrated marketing, a mission by itself is not enough as vision is also a necessary prerequisite in building an institution's integrated marketing plan (Sevier, 1998, p. 22).
Tichy (1989, p. 100) defines a vision as a clear long-range impression of what should be accomplished. Thus, whereas a ‘mission clarifies an organization's purpose, vision clarifies what the organization should look like as it fulfills its mission’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 22). Vision provides an educational institution a sense of direction (Sevier, 1998, p. 22), but ‘must be articulated to the entire campus community before it acquires the force necessary to change the organization and move it in an intended direction’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 26). Vision must also be owned and shared by all those involved to succeed (Sevier, 1998, p. 27; Burton et al., 2001, p. 20). Newstrom and Davis (1993) illustrate the value, and the complexity, of introducing a vision by the experiences of a new university president who soon learned that having a dramatic vision is only one step in managing a change process:

He was chosen to lead the institution when the interview team was impressed with his master plan for transforming the university from a position of mediocrity to one of focused excellence. However, he incorrectly assumed that the positive reaction to his general vision would automatically translate into acceptance of his specific proposals. Here he met opposition from legislators, regents, faculty, students, and alumni. (P. 280)

Consequently, to handle such opposition and to transform an institution requires not only an integrated marketing approach but a strategic plan as well (Lauer, 2001, p. 131). Indeed, to become more responsive, an institution must develop a plan for institutional change (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 39). Newstrom and Davis (1993) state that managers may fail to create a general strategy for planning change. ‘An overall plan should address behavioral issues, such as employees' difficulty in letting go of old methods, the uncertainties inherent in change that cause workers to be fearful, and the general need to create an organization that welcomes change’ (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 280). Therefore, an effective
marketing plan must be part of an overall institutional change initiative (Lauer, 2001, p. 132), and 'integrated marketing must be part of the total planning of the institution' (Lauer, 2001, p. 140).

The strategic plan, which is an initiative for planning change for the whole institution, should not only clarify the institution's mission and vision, but must be dynamic as well (Lauer, 2001, p. 131). It ought to be dynamic in that it is based on solid research (Sevier, 1999, p. 6). Marketing research is 'the systematic design, collection, analysis, and reporting of data and findings relevant to a specific marketing situation and institution faces' (Sevier, 1998, p. 47). In higher education, although research is becoming a more regular part of the total marketing activity, 'it is embarrassing to think that most academic institutions which consider themselves to be teaching and research organizations do little research about their own marketplace' (Lauer, 2001, p. 136). This research is not only important to the strategic plan, but without it the first component of the integrated marketing plan, the marketing goals, cannot be developed (Sevier, 1999, p. 6).

The integrated marketing plan is focused on marketing issues, containing the five major components of (1) marketing goals, (2) communication plan, (3) marketing action plans, (4) budget and (5) master calendar (Sevier, 1999, pp. 6-7). Marketing goals express what is hoped to be accomplished through the integrated marketing plan and hence tend to be strategic, often involving the first three Cs (customer solution, customer cost and convenience) and image-related activities (Sevier, 1999, p. 7). The communication plan has the responsibility 'for coordinating the communication with both internal and external audiences' (Sevier, 1999, p. 7). Action plans help in achieving the marketing goals and so 'detail how the activity will support the marketing goal, who will be responsible for its
implementation, and note how the activity will be evaluated' (Sevier, 1999, p. 7). The budget ‘will be a compilation of the budgets established for each marketing action plan and other resources’ (Sevier, 1999, p. 8). The master calendar, or the time line, is a management tool that gives an exact understanding of what is happening when (Sevier, 1999, p. 8). Therefore, the research at International University should examine how the integrated marketing plan was developed and by whom.

To write an integrated marketing plan, the president should be committed not only to allocate resources and manage change, but he or she must also be committed to choose a champion (Sevier, 1998, p. 106). ‘A strong marketing champion gathers resources, mediates between the different power and organizational structures on campus, and leads’ (Sevier, 1996, p. 5). As leadership is essential for the successful initiation and implementation of organizational change (Bass, 1990, p. 19), a marketing champion must have a theoretical and experiential understanding of marketing as well as the respect of the campus community to lead (Sevier, 1996, p. 6). There are several other reasons why a powerful champion is important (Sevier, 1996, p. 5).

First, because the variables that affect an institution’s marketing efforts cross so many departmental and divisional lines, turf battles can only be avoided when a strong champion is actively involved. Second, because many marketing issues are related to policy and strategic planning, the marketing effort must be closely related to the institution’s policy-making body. And finally, because marketing is dependent on appropriate funding, the champion, and by extension the president, must actively support the reallocation of funds to support the marketing effort. (Sevier, 1996, pp. 5-6)

Nevertheless, although a champion is a necessary first step, care must be taken in establishing the marketing team the champion leads (Sevier, 1996,
p. 6). These teams, which focus on enrolment management, 'were often the first taste of integrated marketing that universities experienced – with combined efforts of recruiting, marketing, admissions, financial aid, billing, registrar's office, housing and more – all designed to attract students who would stay at the university and eventually graduate' (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 9). Indeed, in a USA study on integrated marketing by the higher education communications and marketing firm Lipman Hearne, these campus-wide marketing teams have been shown to increase applications and enrolment (Lipman Hearne, 1999, Online).

However, to initiate integrated marketing through these marketing teams, it is critical that everyone from the president downwards use the same definition of marketing (Sevier, 1998, p. 171). It is extremely frustrating 'for a marketing team to spend months writing a comprehensive plan only to be told that what the president really had in mind was promotion' (Sevier, 1998, p. 171). Additionally, to develop an integrated marketing plan requires a true team effort of individuals working together to achieve a common goal (Sevier, 1998, p. 111). At Florida Gulf Coast University, the goal of the team was not to merely produce a written plan, but to learn from the planning process and to coordinate implementation (Anderson and Lynch, 2002, p. 11). Thus, to achieve successful planning, initiation and implementation of integrated marketing, it is very important who are the persons selected to be on such a team.

There is no one universal answer as to who should be chosen for the marketing team (Sevier, 1998, p. 111), but it is recommended to 'include the people who will actually be involved in implementing the plan, the people who will pay for the plan, and the people, especially as part of the decision-making process, who will have to defend the plan to naysayers of
all stripes' (Sevier, 1998, p. 170). In Texas Christian University, for example, 'members ranged from the admissions dean to the bookstore manager to the assistant vice-chancellor for student affairs' (Lauer, 2001, p. 131). Members included even two outsiders: 'an alumnus who owns an advertising agency and the president of chamber of commerce' (Lauer, 2001, p. 131). Therefore, the study at International University should investigate who were the team members, how they were chosen and how did the champion and the marketing team go about planning and realizing integrated marketing at the university.

2. Realizing and Controlling Integrated Marketing

Achieving integrated marketing is actually about people in the different disciplines and areas talking and communicating, finding common ground for leveraging and combining ideas to get synergy. (Clarke, 2003, Online)

Although communication that results in synergy is a vital step in realizing integrated marketing (as will be elaborated in this subsection), it is not enough to successfully implement a strategy such as integrated marketing. According to Wheelen and Hunger (1995), strategy implementation requires management to translate its strategies and policies into action through the development of programs, budgets, and procedures, which might entail 'changes within the overall culture, structure, and/or management system of the entire organization' (p. 13). Furthermore, to succeed, the implementation of integrated marketing must be constantly evaluated and controlled (Sevier, 1998, p. 175).

**Evaluation and control** is the process by which corporate activities and performance results are monitored and actual performance compared with desired performance. Managers at all levels use the resulting information to take corrective action and resolve problems. (Wheelen and Hunger, 1995, p. 15)
An example of this is an administrator from a League of Innovation community college who stated that in her institution if a program does not reach its preset goals, it is either cut or reconfigured (Sevier, 1998, pp. 44-45). In higher education, to evaluate and control is not by any means an easy task due to 'the historic reluctance of colleges and universities to evaluate systematically whether programs, strategies, activities, and plans make sense, whether they are effective, and whether they are contributing value' (Sevier, 1998, p. 44). This, however, is changing as higher education is 'no longer a "sacred cow." Proactive and (to some) intrusive state legislatures and boards of regents are demanding that institutions be held accountable for performance. This is especially true in enrolment management activities. Performance measures exist for student access, retention, and graduation, effectiveness of learning, cost-effectiveness, contribution to knowledge, and the service mission and its integration with teaching and research missions' (Stevens, 2000, p. 23). Therefore, each of the phases of implementation must be constantly evaluated to achieve successful integrated marketing.

One of the phases is to identify the infrastructure necessary to successfully implement integrated marketing (Anderson and Lynch, 2002, p. 12). 'Infrastructure needs may include operating funds, additional personnel, revised job descriptions, reorganization, technology support, information management, and the like. Without the necessary support and infrastructure, there may be additional false starts; change will be slow and painful; staff morale will be low; and enrollment results will fall short of desired goals' (Anderson and Lynch, 2002, p. 12). Therefore, the study at International University must examine how management addressed the infrastructure needs, including changes to the structure of the institution as to achieve organizational integration.
Organizational integration is another requirement for integrated marketing. In fact, it is organizational integration that allows or encourages—from a systems perspective—complete strategic and message integration. At its most basic, organizational integration involves coordinating resources and sharing goals. In an ideal world, this is accomplished through the creation of organizational structures such as those outlined in the next diagram. (Sevier, 1999, p. 4)

In this model, all marketing and communication functions, including student recruiting and fundraising, are arrayed under one vice president, reflecting both the importance of and need for coordinated marketing activities (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). However, such organizational integration is not a simple task as some people ‘will be threatened by changes to their routine or areas of responsibility’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 175). Additionally, to successfully implement organizational integration in integrated marketing, middle managers and administrators of institutions of higher education must give up turf battles (Lauer, 2001, p. 137). They, as well as the faculty, must ‘be willing to make tough decisions’ (Sevier, 1998, p. 170). Integration of the organizational structure is a tough decision, since segregation typifies marketing communications (Hartley and Pickton, 1999, p. 98).
Not only does segregation typify the marketing communications industry at large, but it may be seen within the very structures of client organizations themselves. It is common for the various marketing communications functions to be the responsibility of different managers and departments which operate autonomously of each other. (Hartley and Pickton, 1999, p. 98)

This segregation is also true of higher education as ‘university Vice-Chancellors and Principals have typically restructured their domains into a smaller number of large scale faculties or divisions, in pursuit of a smaller number accountable strategic business units (SBUs), and a small number of senior managers accountable to them’ (Parker, 2001, p. 6). Initially, marketing responsibilities were incorporated into these familiar organizational structures, where the major changes were mainly attitudinal ones (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 48). A more committed approach to marketing resulted in the following structural change (Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 48):

![Organizational Segregation Diagram](Source: Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 48)
In this model, the various marketing activities are clearly segregated. Comparing this to the model offered by Sevier (1999, p. 4) sharpens further a topic discussed earlier in this chapter: the difference between traditional marketing and integrated marketing. While in enrolment management, the sixth stage of the evolution of marketing, under the president there are several 'major marketing positions, including the admissions director, director of development, director of alumni affairs, and public affairs director' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 39), in integrated marketing all marketing functions are arrayed under one vice president (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). Consequently, with such changes in the organizational structure that affect power relationships, it becomes clear why implementing integrated marketing encounters resistance from internal audiences (Sevier, 1998, p. 175).

Too often when we think about marketing, we focus only on external audiences. This is a mistake. Your ability to spread ownership of the marketing planning process and the resulting plan will increase dramatically if you remember that some of your most important audiences are internal. Some may find the notion of marketing a bit unsettling. Others will be threatened by changes to their routine or areas of responsibility. Some factions may use the pretext of marketing to advance personal agendas. Others may try to obstruct the process. And rumors and misinformation will fly. (Sevier, 1998, p. 175)

According to Sevier (1998, p. 175), the only effective countermeasure to such a situation is internal marketing. As one of the key ingredients that enable change is incentives (Sevier, 1997, p. 4), internal audiences must understand why integrated marketing is so important to the institution. The importance of marketing must be diffused throughout the institution (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 40), and thus a major element of internal marketing 'must be timely, accurate, continual internal communication. Keeping people informed will go a long way toward winning them over' (Sevier, 1998, p.
175). However, as 'communications tend increasingly to flow top-down within the university hierarchy, as decisions are increasingly formulated at top management levels and then passed down for comment or implementation to the 'line' academics' (Parker, 2001, p. 7), internal communication by itself is not enough to successfully implement integrated marketing.

The success of change projects depends on the organization's ability to make all their employees participate in the change process in one way or the other. (Recklies, 2001, p. 1)

One way to achieve this is internal marketing training, which results in each employee, whether administrator, staff or faculty, understanding 'how his or her role contributes to attracting and serving the institution's various publics and markets' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 40). Such training also aids in building message integration, which is a component of strategic communication (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). 'Message integration means that messages are consistent and coordinated and driven by strategic decisions' (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). These 'integrated messages have a common look, sound, and feel across various mediums and over time' (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). Therefore, it is important to research the various elements of internal marketing at International University and their effects not only on the implementation of integrated marketing but also on its institutionalization.

3. Stabilizing (i.e. Institutionalizing) Integrated Marketing

Levine (1996) argues that human beings could not endure constant change as 'one of the key ideas that drives the adult during a period of change is the idea that on the other side of change will come the down time - the time of stability' (Online). The attempt to preserve stability in the organization is called homeostasis and takes place when people act to establish a steady
state of need fulfilment, protecting themselves from disturbances of that stability (Newstrom and Davis 1993, p. 273). Therefore, while implementation is focused on the specific actions taken to create change, institutionalization occurs when attempts are made to stabilize the change in state (Williamson, 1999, p. 27). ‘It is at this stage that the innovation is no longer considered new or novel as it has become accepted as part of the normal practice within the system’ (Williamson, 1999, p. 27).

However, to achieve institutionalization is not a simple task, since ‘change within higher education depends on changes in the actions of individual faculty members, administrators, and students - changes which constitute a network of personal interactive forces affecting the motion of an innovation toward institutionalization’ (Martorana and Kuhns, 1975, p. 110). Therefore, institutionalization requires continued support from the institutions' leaders as ‘innovations cannot become lasting without a rather significant role from leaders’ (Curry, 1992, Online). Consequently, the study at International University cannot only examine the extent of institutionalization of integrated marketing at the university. It must investigate as well the level of support integrated marketing received from the university's leaders, especially its top management. It should also assess the effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts at the university.

**Effectiveness of Integrated Marketing Efforts**

Most educational institutions want to be more effective, but they are not sure how to proceed. Focusing on enhancing customer satisfaction and customer value is a good place to begin.

(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 41)
As the level of satisfaction is determined by the difference between the service's perceived performance and the expectations of the service (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 41), it is necessary to research into the customers' expectations as to achieve satisfaction. In Bellevue Community College, for instance, to assess the effectiveness of the marketing efforts, a representative sample of the corporate market in the Puget Sound area was interviewed as to get a clear picture of what motivates corporate customers to purchase training (Tilney, 1994, Online). Therefore, in order to evaluate International University's marketing performance by investigating the satisfaction of its students, the research must uncover the expectations of students from the university.

However, student satisfaction is only one indicator of marketing performance ranging from market share analysis to retention/attrition measurement (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 465). Indeed, ‘institutional effectiveness is not necessarily revealed by current performance’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 466). ‘The marketing effectiveness of an institution or school or department is reflected in the degree to which it exhibits five major attributes of a marketing orientation: a consumer-oriented philosophy, an integrated marketing commitment, adequate marketing information, a strategic orientation and, effective implementation’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 466). Thus, an additional method to student satisfaction that takes these five attributes into account is necessary for the research at International University. Kotler and Fox (1995) offer such a method of analysis named the ‘marketing-effectiveness rating instrument’ (p. 466), which will be presented in detail in the methodology chapter, which is a chapter based on the subsidiary research questions in the next concluding section of the literature review.
Summary of Management of Change

This third section of the literature review chapter has focused on management of change. It has defined change as the continuous adoption of corporate strategies and structures to changing external conditions. It also categorized change into four main groups of (1) mission change, (2) structural change, (3) technological change, and (4) personnel change, while differentiating between two types of pace in change: revolutionary and evolutionary.

Then, resistance to change was defined as any employee behaviours that are designed to discredit, delay, or prevent change implementation. Also, four circumstances in which individuals will resist change were introduced: (1) a threat to individuals' power, (2) any perceived potential reduction in rewards, reputation or prestige, (3) any feeling of incompetence to carry out the changes, and (4) uncertainty as to how the changes might affect them. Three different types of resistance to change were presented in this section as well: sociological resistance, logical resistance and psychological resistance, which can result in conflict.

Conflict was defined as the interaction of interdependent people who perceive opposition of goals, aims, and values, and who see the other party as potentially interfering with the realization of these goals. Four levels of conflict were established: (1) intrapersonal conflict, (2) interpersonal conflict, (3) intergroup conflict, and (4) interorganizational conflict. The next subsection focused on organizational politics that are behaviours that enhance or protect an individual's self-interest, introducing the following tactics to achieve political power: social exchange, alliances,
identification with higher authority, control of information, selective service, power and status symbols, power plays and networks.

Change management was then defined as to plan, initiate, realize, control, and finally stabilize change processes on both, corporate and personal level. Accordingly, based on this definition, the following three subsections of the literature review were:

1. **Planning and initiating integrated marketing** which centred on the active commitment of the president to integrated marketing, how to write an integrated marketing plan, choosing a champion and creating a team that builds the marketing plan.

2. **Realizing and controlling integrated marketing** concentrated on the infrastructure necessary to successfully implement integrated marketing, including organizational integration, and on the importance of internal marketing, including communication and training, in the implementation phase of integrated marketing.

3. **Stabilizing integrated marketing** is the third subsection that focused not on the implementation of integrated marketing but on its actual institutionalization, as institutionalization takes place when attempts are made to stabilize the change in state.

The last subsection on management of change represented how to measure the effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts. It achieved this appraisal by the following two means: (1) measuring performance through satisfaction, including expectations, and (2) evaluating effectiveness through an instrument based on the attributes of a marketing orientation. This instrument, the **marketing-effectiveness rating instrument**, will be presented in detail in the methodology chapter, which is a chapter stemming from the subsidiary research questions in the next section.
SUBSIDIARY RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This concluding section of the literature review will demonstrate how the review of previous research aided in developing 'sharper and more insightful questions about the topic' (Yin, 1994, p. 9), i.e. the subsidiary research questions. In building these subsidiary research questions, first the original research questions were considered:

1. What is the current situation of the *One Year Programs*, which were initiated due to International University's responsiveness to the market?

2. As responsiveness created a need for integrated marketing, since it required all the departments of this educational institution to work together to implement the 'One Year Programs', did effective integrated marketing take place?

3. What could be concluded from this case study on integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness and could a theoretical framework be developed that would be relevant to other institutions of higher education?

Then, in order to better construct the subsidiary research questions, it was decided to create a conceptual framework. According to Robson (1993, pp. 150-151), developing a conceptual framework aids the researcher in being selective, to decide which are the important features of the case study, to determine which relationships are likely to be significant, and consequently what data is going to be collected and analysed. Furthermore, Robson (1993, p. 153) maintains that the conceptual framework enables a researcher to outline the research questions, since there must be consistency between the research questions and the conceptual framework. 'As it is effectively the set of questions that drives the data collection process, it is important to ensure that all parts of the conceptual structure diagram are
covered by the set of questions' (Robson, 1993, p. 153). Therefore, the following diagram was created with this in mind:

![Figure 2.6 – Conceptual Framework](image)

From this conceptual framework as well as from the research questions, six types of subsidiary research questions were classified so as to create an outline for the actual wording of the subsidiary research questions based on the literature review:

1. Current level of responsiveness of the university, including the existing status of the 'One Year Programs'.
2. Present extent of integrated marketing at the university.
3. Past management of change: implementation of integrated marketing.
4. Overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts.
5. Discussion of results in order to arrive to conclusions.
6. Generalization including a theoretical framework.

In the following subsections, the six types of subsidiary research questions will be marked in Bold, while the subsidiary research questions themselves will be in Italic.

1. Current level of responsiveness of the university, including the existing status of the 'One Year Programs'.

Based on Kotler and Fox (1995, pp. 36-38) defining the general levels of institutional responsiveness (pages 57-60 in the literature review), the following subsidiary research questions were built:

What is the level of International University's responsiveness: unresponsive institution, casually responsive institution or highly responsive institution?

Which of the following four components exist at the university?

- Complaint system: Does a complaint system exist at the institution?
- Surveys of satisfaction: Are any actions undertaken to receive students' feedback about the lecturers or other subjects concerning the institution?
- Surveys of needs and preferences: Are any surveys of needs and preferences undertaken?

How does the institution distinguish explicitly its priority group/s for response? Based on Lumby (1999, p. 196), which is in the literature review on page 63.

Has research been undertaken to ascertain audiences' expectations so as to create an effective product mix? Based on Sevier (1998, p. 32), which is in the literature review on page 63.
• **Customer-oriented personnel:** Are the employees "customer-oriented" during their job?

*Does academic quality exist in International University which contains curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of students and outcomes?* Based on the framework presented by Sevier (1996, p. 2), which is in the literature review on page 65.

**Curriculum:**

*How does the curriculum actually operate according to the four levels of curriculum functions: the rhetorical curriculum, the planned curriculum, the delivered curriculum and the received curriculum?* Based on Middlewood (2001, p. 109), and referenced to in the literature review on page 69.

The rhetorical curriculum:

According to Davies and Scribbins (1985, p. 36), a customer-centred curriculum becomes a critical part of an institution of higher education's ability to respond to changing needs (see literature review on page 66). Therefore:

*Is the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs' customer-oriented?*

*What are the statements of aims and policies of the 'One Year Programs'?*

The planned curriculum:

*How are student needs addressed in the 'One Year Programs'?* Based on Toombs and Tierney's (1992, Online) definition of the curriculum (see literature review on page 67).
Are external factors, such as society's expectations and changes in knowledge, being expressed in the 'One Year Programs'?

The delivered curriculum:
How are the 'One Year Programs' actually being taught? Who is teaching in them?

The received curriculum:
Who is receiving the curriculum? How many students are currently enrolled to the 'One Year Programs'? What is ultimately in the minds or hearts of the students who participate in the 'One Year Programs'?

Faculty:
What contact is there between the employees of the university and the students?

Facilities:
Are the employees and the students satisfied with the institution's facilities and library resources? Based on Sevier (1996, p. 2) and Davies and Scribbins (1985, p. 38), which is in the literature review on page 72.

Quality of students:
How significant to the students is with whom they will study? Based on Padmanabhan (2002, Online), which is in the literature review on page 73.

Outcomes:
How significant to the students is the subject of the practical outcomes from the studies? Based on Fleisher-Levy (2002, p. 10), which is in the literature review on page 75.
2. Present extent of integrated marketing at the university.

Was there a tendency in International University’s marketing towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs? (Presented in the literature review, page 85.)

Product vs. customer solution:
In order to answer the customer’s needs, how do the employees know the customer’s expectations?

Price vs. customer cost:
Does the university consider the specific costs of a customer?

Place vs. convenience:
Does International University consider the convenience of the customers, e.g. flexibility in study hours or various means of studies?

Promotion vs. communication:
Does the approach of two-way communication process exist in International University (where the various marketing communication devices are coordinated) or is it the one-way communication process of downward promotion?

The next question is based on several problems that might result in an institution of higher education taking integrated marketing into account, as offered by Sevier (1999, p. 6), and which is referenced to in the literature review on pages 91-92:
Did one or more of the following problems occur at International University and were these problems the causes that initiated integrated marketing?

- Difficulties in student recruiting in primary recruiting market
- Difficulties in fundraising among alumni and core contributors
- High tuition discount rate
- Organizational lethargy and poor morale
- High administrative and faculty turnover
- Weak, inaccurate, or inconsistent image
- Over dependency on tuition and tuition increase
- Small or decreasing endowment or tapping endowment to meet operating expenses
- Inability to respond to problems and opportunities in a timely fashion

According to the 7th step of the "evolution of integrated marketing", do the following components occur in the institution in order to achieve integrated marketing? (Presented in the literature review, page 93.)

- **Promotion**: Does an effort to promote the institution exist, if so how?
- **Segmentation and market research**: Is the chosen student's segment based on market research? Who is the target audience of the institution?
- **Positioning**: Why do the students choose International University? What is the competitive advantage of the institution?
- **Strategic planning**: Does the strategic plan create a viable fit between the organization's objectives, skills, and resources and its changing market opportunities? Based on Kotler (2000, p. 64), noted in the literature review on page 88.
Are marketing issues elevated to the strategic level? Does strategic planning address the real needs or does it take place in a vacuum? How does the strategic plan stress accountability and continuing evaluation? Based on Sevier (1999, p. 5), which is in the literature review, page 88.

- **Enrolment management:** Do faculty members talk with students about courses and careers, viewing themselves as members of the enrolment management effort? Based on Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 12), which is in the literature review on page 71.

  Was there an attempt by every employee in the institution to help with enrolment activities? (As discussed in the literature review, page 90.)

Strategic, organizational and message integration:

*Are the three levels of integration - strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration - considered at International University?* Based on Sevier (1999, p. 4), which is in the literature review on page 91.

- **Strategic integration:** Does International University include the assessment and meeting of target student needs through the allocation of strategic resources within the constraint of the institutional mission?

- **Organizational integration:** Are the resources and sharing goals coordinated in the institution?

- **Message integration:** Are all members of the institution communicating the same message in responding to students needs or is there a contradicting message to students? Are the messages consistent and coordinated? Are the messages driven by strategic decisions? Are the strategic messages consistent and coordinated, arriving to all the employees? Is the staff being updated about the 'One Year Programs'? What contact there is among the employees?
Are the employees able to explain the institutions' market niche and its competitive advantages based on the institutions' mission, vision, or values? Based on Lauer (2001, pp.130-131), which is in the literature review on page 90.

Based on Sevier (1997, p. 4), which is in the literature review on page 123:
Does the staff understand why integrated marketing is so important to the institution?

3. Past management of change: implementation of integrated marketing.

Did any resistance to change (of implementing integrated marketing) by individuals or by groups occur in the institution? If so, which type of resistance: sociological resistance, logical resistance or psychological resistance? Based on Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 277-278), which is in the literature on page 105.

Did any kind of the following levels of conflict occur in the institution: intrapersonal conflict, interpersonal conflict or intergroup conflict? Based on Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 392-393), which is in the literature on pages 107-109.

Was there a conflict between the academic personnel and the business personnel in the institution?

Did one or more tactics exist that may be used to achieve political power occur in the institution: social exchange, alliances, identification with
higher authority, control of information, selective service, power and status symbols, power plays or networks? Based on Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 406-407), which is in the literature on page 110.

Based on Sevier (1998, p. 106) and Sevier (1999, p. 6) in the literature review on page 114:

*Did the president and top management actively initiate integrated marketing? What was their vision? What was their mission? Did they (the president and top management) initiate an integrated marketing plan that is based on these vision and mission?*

Based on Curry (1992, Online) in the literature review on page 125:

*Did the president and top management actively support integrated marketing (and continue to support it in the present) in order to achieve institutionalization?*

Based on Sevier (1996, pp. 5-6) in the literature review on page 117:

*Who was the "champion" that led the process of implementing integrated marketing? What did his job involve? Who were the team members that developed the 'One Year Programs'? Why were these people chosen?*

*What were their goals? Was the team focus on enrolment management?* Based on Morris and Cejda (2001, p. 9), which is in literature review on page 118.

*What was the strategy that they built on?*

*What were the strategic problems and what were the strategic solutions?*
• How did the team members work together in order to achieve their common goals? Based on Sevier (1998, p. 111), which is in literature review on page 118. How did they develop the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs'? How were the syllabuses of the 'One Year Programs' developed?

• Were there any problems in developing this new curriculum and if so what were the strategic solutions in addressing these problems?

• Was the staff involved in the development of the 'One Year Programs'?

• How did the team members work together with the others who were supposed to implement the 'One Year Programs'?

• Was the strategy well founded on marketing research, such as students' expectations? Based on Sevier (1999, p. 6), which is in literature review on page 116.

• Was there a marketing plan and if so what was the marketing plan and who built it? Based on Lauer (2001, p. 132), which is in literature review on page 116.

• What were the marketing goals?

• Were the staff involved in strategic decisions?

Were there any organizational changes according to the new strategy (or in order to respond the target market)? Did these include changes in the organizational structure due to integrated marketing, such as all the marketing functions being arrayed under one vice president? Based on Sevier (1999, p. 4), which is in literature review on page 116.

The following questions focus on internal marketing, which is in the literature review, pages 123-124:

Did internal marketing exist at International University?
• *Was there any training of staff concerning the 'One Year Programs'?* Based on Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 40) in the literature review page 124:

• *Were any incentives offered to the employees in order to encourage them to be more motivated to implement integrated marketing?* Based on Sevier (1997, p. 4) in the literature review page 123.

4. Overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts.

*Is there an increase in enrolment as a result of the 'One Year Programs'?*

According to Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 41) in the literature review on page 126, in order to examine the level of customer satisfaction, it is necessary first to examine what are the customer's expectations. Therefore:

*What are the students' expectations from International University? What are the important things for the students when they come to study at International University?*

*Are there any differences between students' actual expectations and how the university's employees perceive students' expectations?*

*Have the organizational changes succeeded in responding to the target market?*

*Does everyone in the staff know his or her job definition?*

According to Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 41), see literature review on page 126, the level of satisfaction is determined by the difference between the service's perceived performance and the expectations of the service. Thus:
What is the level of student satisfaction from the university? Note: This research focused on the students as customers since they are the main customers of International University.

What is the grade given to the overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts by the 'marketing-effectiveness rating instrument'? What does this grade mean? Note: This instrument was put forth by Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 466), as will be presented in detail in the methodology chapter.

5. Discussion of results so as to arrive at conclusions

In order to arrive to conclusions from this case study, such as the contribution of this research on integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness to the field of marketing in education, the following question was formulated:

What are the differences in the findings on the subject of integrated marketing when compared to the materials in the literature review?

6. Generalization including a theoretical framework

On the basis of this study at International University, can some sort of generalization, such as a theoretical framework on the implementation of integrated marketing, be formulated that would be relevant to other institutions of higher education? Can this generalization also lead to promising new directions for further research?
To answer this question a discussion on generalization is required, a review which is developed in the methodology chapter.
Chapter 3 – Methodology

According to BERA (British Educational Research Association):

Educational researchers should aim to report research conceptions, procedures, results, and analyses accurately and in sufficient detail to allow other researchers to understand and interpret them. (BERA, 2000, Online)

In attempting to achieve this, the following chapter will first define the term ‘case study’ in the context of educational research. This will be followed by a discussion on which paradigm to adopt for the study at International University. Then, it will be explained why the specific research tools of interviews, questionnaires and documents were selected for this research. The section on interviews will discuss the three types of interview (structured, semi-structured and specialized interviews), describe how the interview schedules were developed and how interviewing was conducted, including with whom and when. The subsequent section on survey questionnaires will differentiate between the three types of questionnaires (structured, unstructured and semi-structured), explaining how the questionnaire for the survey at International University developed and administered, including issues such as sample size and type of sampling. Then, the section on documents will include a categorization of documents based on the seven stages of the evolution of marketing in educational institutions, which was discussed in the literature review. This will be followed by a description of the qualitative analysis that was undertaken in this case study. Finally, this chapter will conclude with ethical considerations that include respect for democratic values, respect for persons, respect for the quality of educational research and respect for knowledge. The latter is composed of a discussion on construct validity, reliability, internal validity and external validity (i.e. generalization).
DEFINING A CASE STUDY

Since the outline purpose of the research that was conducted at International University was to examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in an institution of higher education in Israel during a period of change, the research is consequentially that of a case study. Therefore, the first issue in this methodology chapter is to define what a case study is. Davey (1991) proposed that 'the case study is a method of learning about a complex instance through extensive description and contextual analysis. The product is an articulation of why the instance occurred as it did, and what may be important to explore in similar situations' (Online). Davey (1991) also put forth a specific definition that is relevant to the study at International University of a program implementation case study, in which 'extensive, longitudinal reports of what has happened over time can set a context for interpreting a finding of implementation variability' (Online). This type of case study does not only aid in determining if implementation is in compliance with its original purpose but is also advantageous when concern exists regarding implementation problems (Davey, 1991, Online).

Although both the general definition and the specific program implementation definition are relevant to the study conducted at International University (since one of the goals of the research was to examine the use of integrated marketing in the actual implementation of the one-year programs), they are not specifically within the framework of education. Therefore, it was necessary to adopt another definition of a case study, which is in the explicit context of education. The next paragraph will present such a definition by Bassey, while adding comments in brackets to demonstrate its relevance to the study at International University:
An educational case study is an empirical enquiry which is:

- conducted within a localized boundary of space and time (i.e. a singularity); [which is the case at International University]
- into interesting aspects of an educational activity, or programme, or institution, or system; [the main aspects in this study are those regarding integrated marketing]
- mainly in its natural context and within an ethic of respect for persons; [Bassey's definition raises the issue of ethics, which will be discussed later in this methodology chapter]
- in order to inform the judgements and decisions of practitioners or policy-makers;
- or of theoreticians who are working to these ends;
- in such a way that sufficient data are collected for the researcher to be able
  (a) to explore significant features of the case,
  (b) to create plausible interpretations of what is found,
  (c) to test for the trustworthiness of these interpretations, [trustworthiness will be elaborated on later in this chapter]
  (d) to construct a worthwhile argument or story, [that will be presented in the findings chapter of this thesis]
  (e) to relate the argument or story to any relevant research in the literature, [this will be undertaken in the discussion chapter of the thesis]
  (f) to convey convincingly to an audience this argument or story,
  (g) to provide an audit trail by which other researchers may validate or challenge the findings, or construct alternative arguments. (Bassey, 1999, p. 58)

The last two points presented by Bassey are interrelated. In order to convince an audience, an audit trail is necessary. Indeed, in a thesis, the entire methodology chapter is part of that audit trail. The methodology chapter is intended to describe the exact steps that were undertaken in order to address the research questions (Rudestam and Newton, 1992, p. 60). Therefore, in order to initiate the creation of this audit trail, it was necessary to select a research paradigm for this case study at International University.
ADOPTING A PARADIGM

The second issue in approaching the methodology was to consider which paradigm to adopt for this case study conducted at International University. A paradigm, according to Kuhn (1970) is ‘the entire constellation of beliefs, values, and techniques shared by members of a given scientific community’ (p. 75). Although this definition does explain what constructs a paradigm, it does not address what are the influences of paradigms on scientific communities. Usher (1996) defines a paradigm as ‘frameworks that function as maps or guides for scientific communities, determining important problems or issues for it members to address and defining acceptable theories or explanations, methods and techniques to solve defined problems’ (p. 15). According to Coleman and Lumby (1999, p. 10), there are two basic paradigms that provide these frameworks for researchers: the positivist paradigm and the interpretive paradigm.

The positivist paradigm is based on the scientific approach (Coleman and Lumby, 1999, p. 10) where it is believed that the external reality can be measured objectively, and therefore ‘aims at objectivity, standard procedures and replicability’ (Johnson, 1994, p. 7). It has existed in social science research throughout most of the 20th century where ‘during this period, educational and other social science researchers have attempted, with moderate degrees of success, to devise and refine methods of measurement that would provide for precision akin to that achieved in the physical sciences’ (Custer, 1996, p. 3). Positivist researchers believe that they will be able to establish the truth, thinking that ‘they are studying the real world, which consists of things it is feasible to try to find out about’ (Oakley, 2000, p. 25). However, anti-positivists, rejecting the viewpoint of objectivity, disputed that research itself is a mutual experience, arguing that
to understand individuals' behaviour necessitates sharing their frame of reference not from the outside but from the inside (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, pp. 19-20). Therefore, it was only natural that another paradigm surfaced, the interpretive paradigm, which has gained significant acceptance especially during the 70s and 80s (Custer, 1996, p. 3).

The interpretive paradigm, known also as the relativist or phenomenological paradigm (Coleman and Lumby, 1999, p. 10), 'took the view that all human life is experienced and indeed constructed from a subjective point of view, and that social research should seek to elicit the 'meaning' of events and phenomena from the view of participants' (Johnson, 1994, p. 7). The interpretive researchers are 'aware of the constantly shifting ground of human social interaction and identity, and doggedly hound to the apparently more modest goal of reproducing faithfully and democratically whatever it is they think they may have found' (Oakley, 2000, p. 25). They disputed the idea the positivists held in which there is one single known reality and regarded 'the pursuit of 'hard data' as impractical and unachievable' (Oakley, 2000, p. 25). 'What for one side is a set of 'facts' is for the other a complex and impenetrable kaleidoscope of heavily constructed social meanings' (Oakley, 2000, p. 25).

This debate between the two paradigms escalated into what some researchers have even called the 'paradigm wars' (Gage, 1989, p. 4; Oakley, 2000, p. 23) with researchers often claiming adherence to one of the two camps as means of establishing their academic credentials (Oakley, 2000, p. 23). Since 'there is an obvious connection between the gathering of quantitative data and a positivist approach, and qualitative data and a relativist or interpretive approach' (Coleman and Lumby, 1999, p. 12),
selecting one of the two paradigms has an immediate effect on the methodology used. A key consideration in choosing a paradigm is the purpose of the research.

Since the purpose of this case study is to examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness, it is necessary to evaluate the effectiveness of integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness and increasing student enrolment. Effectiveness, in this case, does not depend on people's opinions, thoughts and perceptions, but rather it is received by precise measurements, such as the number of enrolled students. Quantitative data, as maintained by Neuman (1997, p. 329), are in the form of numbers from precise measurement. This does not contradict the case study approach, since some case studies can be quantitative and highly statistical (Brewer, 2000, p. 76). Consequently, in evaluating effectiveness, causation is important and it would seem that the positivist approach with a quantitative research method would fit the planned research.

Nevertheless, there are other considerations to take into account before choosing an approach. First, since the purpose of this case study is to examine integrated marketing, it is also necessary to research how the institution of higher education works as a whole, with its different departments, to respond to the market needs. In the positivist research, as stated by Coleman and Lumby (1999, p. 11), the researcher tries to formulate concepts for measurement. However, in order to research an institution as a whole, it is necessary to 'feel' the place and to do so using only numbers is not enough and even could be mistaken. According to Neuman (1997, p. 329), a qualitative researcher tries to seize aspects of the social world like sights, odours and atmosphere and these are hard to
acquire by exact numbers. Therefore, to achieve this, there is a need to use a different kind of view, the interpretive one.

A second consideration for using the interpretive paradigm, which emphasizes the subjective point of view (Johnson, 1994, p. 7), is the focus of the study on the responsiveness of an institution of higher education to the market needs, which are subjective and can be interpreted in many ways. In order to research the subject of market needs it is important to take into account people's perceptions. Additionally, responsiveness to "needs" and human relationships could lose their meaning if they are considered simple elements. According to Coleman and Lumby (1999, p. 10), the interpretive approach is expected to be used where complex issues are concerned and the emphasis has been on the subjective reality for individuals. Thus, since this case study involves complex issues, it would seem that the interpretive approach with a qualitative research method would also fit the planned research.

Another consideration in selecting a paradigm is the degree of the researcher's involvement. According to Coleman and Lumby (1999, p. 10), in positivist research the observer is separate of what is observed and the research is value free. Cohen and Manion (1994, p. 39) maintain that in the positivist approach the researcher is 'outside' of what is researched while in the interpretive approach the researcher is considered to be personally involved. To understand well the complexity of human relationships, the researcher should be sensitive to behaviours and pay attention also to things 'between the lines' that are not only said by the participants explicitly. Therefore, the researcher needs sometimes to flow with his or her feelings and impressions, which is difficult to do without being involved.
Also, in the positivist tradition, it is attempted to generalize from the specific, while in the interpretive tradition, and hence its namesake, there are interpretations of the specific (Cohen and Manion, 1994, p. 39). Integrated marketing involves relationships between people from different departments and such relationships are subjective and can change from one institution to another. Even though this research brings one example of a case study, it will still enable to learn in depth the reasons for success or failure of integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness to the market needs. Furthermore, it will enable to analyse the complex effects integrated marketing had on the institution and to learn from this so as to further the application of integrated marketing in other institutions of higher education.

This comparison of the two approaches demonstrates that although this research leans towards the interpretive approach with qualitative research methods, it also can use quantitative research methods. This should not be surprising since ‘it is simply a truism to state that these dichotomous, used stereotypes have dominated too long the comparative discussion between alternative educational research strategies. The complexity and subtlety of different approaches is reduced to simplistic and rigid polar positions’ (Rizo, 1991, p. 10). Many studies do not take one of the two polar positions, but rather take a stand somewhere between the two approaches (Johnson, 1994, p. 7; Miles and Huberman, 1994, p. 5), using a combination of several data-collection techniques, which are both quantitative and qualitative (Pitout, 1995, p. 122) and selecting a research tool on the basis of its ‘fitness for purpose’ (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 73).
SELECTING RESEARCH TOOLS

Research tools are the means by which different approaches to research are operationalised. (Johnson, 1994, p. 37)

According to Pitout (1995, p. 122), a case study may use multiple qualitative and quantitative tools to collect data, such as documents, interviews, observations and survey questionnaires. First, in choosing the research tools for this study at International University, the two initial research questions were examined:

1. What is the current situation of the 'One Year Programs', which were initiated due to International University's responsiveness to the market?
2. As responsiveness created a need for integrated marketing, since it required all the departments of this educational institution to work together to implement the 'One Year Programs', did effective integrated marketing take place?

In order to research responsiveness to the market that appears in research question number one and how the institution adapted the business oriented approach of integrated marketing in research question number two, observations and interviews were considered as the main research tools. Although observations are time-consuming, might influence the observed behaviour 'and, moreover, whether one takes on a very detached or very involved role as an observer, or something in between, there are related methodological and ethical problems' (Robson, 1993, p. 192), they have several advantages over interviews.

Observations allow noticing behaviours, actions or words that would not appear in interviews, since they study phenomena, such as people or organizations, in their natural settings (Pitout, 1995, p. 105). Since the behaviour and actions of people are a central aspect in practically any
study, 'a natural and obvious technique is to watch what they do, to record this in some way and then to describe, analyze and interpret that we have observed' (Robson, 1993, p. 190). Observations 'enable the researchers to understand the context of programmes, to be open ended and inductive, to see things that might otherwise be unconsciously missed, to be discover things that participants might not freely talk about in interview situations, to move beyond perception-based data (e.g. opinions in interviews), and to access personal knowledge’ (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 305).

By observations it is possible to 'pick up 'taken-for-granted' features of situations that would not be mentioned in [an] interview' (Johnson, 1994, p. 55) and thus to provide an accurate description of a situation (Johnson, 1994, p. 55).

In order to provide an accurate account of the implementation of integrated marketing at International University, it was necessary to examine how the different factors of the organization work together so as to achieve a common goal. In this, integrated marketing deals with the actions and not only with the opinions and perceptions of those concerned. Therefore, observations were taken into account as the main research tool in the study at International University, since they allow understanding in depth the situations from the field and are not based - as interviews are - on what the participants perceive the interactions between them to be. It was planned to take part in meetings concerning the 'One Year Programs' and to observe the interactions between the participants.

However, when the actual research took place, it became clear that it is impossible to carry out observations since the 'One Year Programs' were ended. Therefore, interviews were chosen, by default, as the main research tool for this study at International University. Although interviews are
different than observations, they do share a common point, which is that both are part of life itself. ‘Interviews enable participants - be they interviewers or interviewees - to discuss their interpretations of the world in which they live, and to express how they regard situations from their own point of view. In these senses the interview is not simply concerned with collecting data about life: it is part of life itself, its human embeddedness is inescapable’ (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 267). Nonetheless, whereas the researcher in observations can stay passive or external to the situation, in interviews it is much more difficult to do. Since interviews ‘are initiated by the interviewer, with a view to gathering certain information from the person interviewed’ (Johnson, 1994, p. 43), this could create power relations that could lead to bias.

The face to face interviews are an interaction between people and may contain bias due to this interaction. ‘The interviews should always be considered verbal reports only. As such, they are subject to the common problems of bias, poor recall, and poor or inaccurate articulation’ (Yin, 1994, p. 85). According to Robson (1993, p. 229), face to face interviews offer the option to alter the questions asked. Thus, ‘the lack of standardization that it implies inevitably raises concerns about reliability. Biases are difficult to rule out’ (Robson, 1993, p. 229). Another sort of bias could occur because of the time that the interviewee needs to devote to the interview. This is in contrast to an observation, in which the participant can continue his or her affairs as usual. ‘Anything under half an hour is unlikely to be valuable; anything going much over an hour may be making unreasonable demands on busy interviewees, and could have the effect of reducing the number of persons willing to participate, which may in turn lead to biases in the sample that you achieve’ (Robson, 1993, p. 229).
However, these dealings with biases are not necessarily a disadvantage. According to Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000, p. 267), interviews are conversations between participants who construct knowledge between them and therefore interviews are neither subjective nor objective, but rather intersubjective. According to Robson (1993, p. 229), interviews are flexible and adaptable. These features give the interview its uniqueness of gathering information not only by the things that are said but also by the behaviours that accompany them. 'Non verbal cues may give messages which help in understanding the verbal response, possibly changing or even, in extreme cases, reversing its meaning... it [the interview] has the potential of providing rich and highly illuminating material' (Robson, 1993, p. 229). As indicated by Yin (1994, p. 85), interviews are an essential way of gathering findings for case studies since most of the case studies are dealing with human affairs and interviewees can give important insights into a situation and provide shortcuts to the prior history of the situation. To control the bias that could happen, 'a reasonable approach is to corroborate interview data with information from other sources' (Yin, 1994, p. 85).

Hence, documentary analysis has been chosen to complement the interviews in the data collection of the study. 'The most important use of documents is to corroborate and augment evidence from other sources' (Yin, 1994, p. 81). As maintained by Robson (1993, p. 272), documentary analysis is an indirect research tool rather than a direct one like observations or interviews. Therefore, the context of the documents is important. As noted by Yin (1994, p. 82), it is necessary to understand that documents were written for a specific purpose that was not necessarily the same purpose of the case study but for achieving other objectives. In corroboration with the interviews, according to Yin (1994, p. 81),
documents are useful in confirming the correct spellings and titles or names that were mentioned in the interviews.

In order to research the subject of effectiveness mentioned in the second research question (see page 151 of this section), interviews and survey questionnaires were considered. According to Oppenheim (1992, pp. 81-82), interviews have higher response rate than questionnaires since interviewees become more involved and consequently more motivated. As indicated by Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000, p. 267), questionnaires are problematic to people of limited literacy and also people tend to fill them quickly, while interviews enable the interviewer with more appropriate speed and greater depth. In addition, the data from the questionnaires ‘are, necessarily, superficial. There is little or no check on the honesty or seriousness of responses. Responses have to be squeezed into predetermined boxes which may or may not be appropriate’ (Robson, 1993, p. 243).

In addition, in order to research effectiveness, there was a need to notice how the customers (i.e. the students) regard the subjects that emerged in the interviews of the employees, such as the relationships of the employees with students or the students’ expectations. According to Johnson (1994, p. 37), the format of an interview and a questionnaire could be the same but the interview is in the hands of the interviewer who completes it on the basis of information supplied by the interviewee while the questionnaire is in the hands of the respondent who fills it. During an interview, occasionally the interviewee asks for more clarification concerning some questions. In a questionnaire the situation is opposite, where the respondent needs to deal with the written concepts by himself or by herself.
Therefore, if the process of integrated marketing is effective, the attitudes of students to the subjects that arose in the interviews of the employees are supposed to be similar to those of employees. Thus, there was a need for the students' net answers without a willing to impress or any clarifications about the subject being asked that exist in interviewing. Hence, the most appropriate research tool was a survey questionnaire, in which it could be checked how many respondents address the subjects that arose in the interviews of the employees without any interference or clarification from the interviewer. According to Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000, p. 267), the survey questionnaire tends to be more reliable since it is anonymous, thereby encouraging greater honesty. If, in the survey, the students show they misunderstand a certain subject that was obvious or clear to the employees, this means that the communication between the students and the employees is poor and integrated marketing is not very effective. Therefore, survey questionnaires, in addition to interviews and documentary analysis, were chosen as the research tools for the study at International University, as presented next, starting with interviews.

INTERVIEWS

Any interview is a social encounter between two people, but any social encounter is not an interview. Interviews have a particular focus and purpose. They are initiated by the interviewer, with a view to gathering certain information from the person interviewed. (Johnson, 1994, p. 43)

In undertaking case study research, they are considered one of the most important sources of information (Yin, 1994, p. 84) and 'may serve as the principal means of gathering information' (Cohen and Manion, 1994, p. 272). Some even maintain that in case study research interviews are the
basic research instruments (Nisbet and Watt, 1984, p. 82). In educational research, interviews are a powerful means 'to gain insight into educational issues through understanding the experience of the individuals whose lives constitute education' (Seidman, 1991, p. 7). Nonetheless, interviews are time consuming (Robson, 1993, p. 229), since the interview session is only one facet of the whole process of interviewing, which also consists of aspects such as planning, organisation, preparation in arranging, confirming and rescheduling the meetings if necessary, recording, transcribing, analysis and reporting (Powney and Watts, 1987, p. vii; Robson, 1993, p. 230).

Just transcribing requires a substantial amount of time, since interviews notes need to be written up (Robson, 1993, p. 230). A good transcription, according to Powney and Watts (1987), should 'represent the whole interview, verbatim as far as possible, including hesitations, pauses, laughs, sighs, coughs and so on' (p. 148). To achieve this, it was necessary to schedule the meetings at International University in such a way that there was enough time between each interview session to write up the field notes, and thus no interview was to occur immediately after another finished. Rather the researcher would take the notes at the end of the interview session, sit down in a quite place, such as the university's library, and try to write up the interviews in order to avoid data loss, which unavoidably occurs when transcribing (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 281). Furthermore, in planning the interviews, a substantial amount of time was also spent on examining which types of interviews exist and on developing the appropriate interview schedules for the research at International University.
Chapter 3 - Methodology

Types of Interviews

Johnson (1994, p. 44) differentiates between the following types of interviews:

1. Structured interviews
2. Semi-structured interviews
3. Specialized interviews

In structured interviews, according to Johnson (1994, p. 45), the interview schedule is usually made of pre-determined closed questions, which offer a range of possible answers. Although probing is one advantage of interviews since they offer ‘the possibility of modifying one’s line of enquiry, following up interesting responses and investigating underlying motives’ (Robson, 1993, p. 229), it is limited in structured interviews because social interaction in them is kept to a minimum (Johnson, 1994, p. 44). The interviewer in them is left with little freedom to make any modifications, creating a closed situation (Cohen and Manion, 1994, p. 273). Therefore, since probing was a desired venue of action in researching integrated marketing, it was decided not to adopt structured interviews but rather consider other types of interviews.

Semi-structured interviews were considered for the research at International University since enable a more flexible style of collecting information, including the use of open questions ‘to which respondents may reply in their own words’ (Johnson, 1994, p. 45). However, although the semi-structured interview allows including probing, their focus is still on covering equivalent ground with each participant (Johnson, 1994, p. 47). Since the information sought from each interviewee differed substantially according to the position that person held at the university, semi-structured
Interviews could not be the only means of collecting information at International University and thus specialized interviews were also considered.

**Specialized interviews** 'are individually tailored for particular role-holders or individuals' (Johnson, 1994, p. 47) and as a consequence 'they do not necessarily cover equivalent ground with each interviewee' (Johnson, 1994, p. 47). However, since the aim of specialized interviews is 'to acquire complementary information which rounds out data already available from other sources' (Johnson, 1994, p. 47), they could also not be the only means of collecting information at International University. Therefore, it was decided to adopt an approach that combines elements from semi-structured interviews, such as the use of open questions and some similar questions for each interviewee, with elements from specialized interviews, including specific questions for the different role-holders. This was done by first categorizing the potential interviewees into groups according the organizational structure, as listed below:

**Management:**
1. The president of the Israeli company running the university extension in Israel.
2. A vice-president of the Israeli company, who is also the manager of the Israeli branch of International University.
3. A vice-president of the Israeli company, who is the marketing manager for both the corporate sector and private sector. (He was the former marketing manager - responsible for the corporate sector).
4. Former marketing manager - responsible for the private sector.
5. Former academic manager.
Chapter 3 - Methodology

Administration:
1. Marketing field coordinator.
2. Computer field coordinator.
3. Secretary.
4. Assistant of the manager of the Israeli branch of International University.

Marketing:
1. Secretary of the marketing manager (former secretary of the marketing manager - responsible for the corporate sector).
2. Assistant to the marketing manager (former assistant of the marketing manager - responsible for the corporate sector).

Israeli Marketing Department:
Those responsible for telemarketing:
1. Former person responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department.
2. Another former person responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department.
3. The current person responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department.

Employees of the Israeli Marketing Department:
1. Telemarketing employees
2. Academic consultants.

Russian Marketing Department:
1. Former assistant of the marketing manager responsible for the private sector, who was the former person responsible for the Russian marketing department.
2. Former academic consultant and current person responsible for the Russian marketing department.

3. Secretary.

**Lecturers:**

1. A lecturer and one of the developers of the 'One Year Programs'.
2. Other lecturers.

**Students:**

The last category of potential interviewees, which is not a part of the organizational structure, was the students of International University.

Once it was clear who the intended interviewees were, the types of interview schedules were matched for each group. However, during the research, due to unexpected occurrences, other interview schedules needed to be developed. This resulted in a total of 16 different interview schedules being created for the interviews conducted at International University (which are all presented in Appendix A - Interview Schedules).

**Conducted Interviews at the University**

A total of 34 interviews were undertaken at International University. These interviews were all carried in face-to-face sessions, except two telephone interviews. Since there was only one re-interview, overall 33 people were interviewed. The interviews took place during the end of February 2002 up to the beginning of June 2002. Each interview was based on its specific schedule prepared according to the organizational structure, as discussed in detail below:
Management - Each participant in the management group has his or her tailor made schedule (except for the two marketing managers who had the same type of schedule). The interviews schedules were based on the Marketing’s Schedule Pilot A and B and the Administration Schedule Pilot (see Appendix A – Interview Schedules). As a result the following five interviews were conducted with the management:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Schedule Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>29.04.02</td>
<td>Avi</td>
<td>President of the Israeli company running the university’s extension in Israel</td>
<td>40 minutes</td>
<td>President’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.04.02</td>
<td>Sharon</td>
<td>Manager of the Israeli branch of International University</td>
<td>50 minutes</td>
<td>Manager of the Israeli branch’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.05.02</td>
<td>Zvi</td>
<td>Marketing manager (and the one formerly responsible for the corporate sector)</td>
<td>60 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing manager’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.05.02</td>
<td>Yevgeni</td>
<td>Former marketing manager (who was responsible for the private sector)</td>
<td>90 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing manager’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.05.02</td>
<td>Gavri</td>
<td>Former academic manager</td>
<td>50 minutes</td>
<td>Academic manager’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 - Management Interviews

Administration - The interview with the marketing field coordinator was used as a pilot for the employees of the university (except for the marketing
department). This pilot was named “Administration’s Schedule (Pilot)”. After few amendments, the administration’s interview schedule was ready. This allowed the following four interviews to be conducted:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24.04.02</td>
<td>Rachel</td>
<td>Marketing field coordinator</td>
<td>25 minutes</td>
<td>Administration’s interview schedule (pilot)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.05.02</td>
<td>Katia</td>
<td>Computers field coordinator</td>
<td>20 minutes</td>
<td>Administration’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.05.02</td>
<td>Neta</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>90 minutes</td>
<td>Administration’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.05.02</td>
<td>Vered</td>
<td>Assistant to University’s manager</td>
<td>50 minutes</td>
<td>Administration’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.2 - Administration Interviews

Marketing - The secretary of the marketing manager and the assistant to the marketing manager were interviewed with the same type of interview schedule since they worked together and were even located in the same physical place on the third floor of the building.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>06.05.02</td>
<td>Svetlana</td>
<td>Secretary of marketing manager</td>
<td>60 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing manager’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.05.02</td>
<td>Yael</td>
<td>Assistant to marketing manager</td>
<td>70 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing manager’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.3 - Marketing Interviews
The marketing department is composed also of the Israeli marketing department and the Russian marketing department.

**Israeli marketing department** - The Israeli marketing department, like the marketing department's management, is also located on the third floor but on the other side of the building, in another hall.

**Responsible for telemarketing** - The three Israelis responsible for the telemarketing were interviewed with schedules that were a bit different than ones used in the interviews of the telemarketing and the academic consultants. Their interview schedule is based on the "Marketing’s Interview Schedule Pilot A" and "Marketing Interview Schedule Pilot B".

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30.05.02</td>
<td>Igor</td>
<td>Former responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department</td>
<td>35 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01.05.02</td>
<td>Ofer</td>
<td>Former responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department</td>
<td>70 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.05.02</td>
<td>Zahi</td>
<td>Present responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 4.4 - Responsible for telemarketing Interviews*
Employees of the Israeli marketing department - The telemarketing personnel and academic consultants were interviewed with the same kind of interview schedule. Two interviews of the telemarketing personnel and academic consultants were used as pilots for the marketing department. The first pilot was named “Marketing’s Interview Schedule Pilot A”. After minor amendments were made, the second pilot, named “Marketing’s Interview Schedule Pilot B”, was undertaken. Then, after some more minor amendments, the interviews interview schedules were ready for the marketing department.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24.04.02</td>
<td>Tania</td>
<td>Telemarketing and consultant Pilot A</td>
<td>45 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule (Pilot A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.04.02</td>
<td>Tatiana</td>
<td>Telemarketing and consultant Pilot B</td>
<td>35 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule (Pilot B)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.04.02</td>
<td>Dorit</td>
<td>Telemarketing &amp; consultant</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05.05.02</td>
<td>Masha</td>
<td>Telemarketing</td>
<td>25 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.05.02</td>
<td>Dafna</td>
<td>Former telemarketing, consultant and publicity</td>
<td>65 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.05.02</td>
<td>Revital</td>
<td>Former telemarketing</td>
<td>55 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.05.02</td>
<td>Nina</td>
<td>Former consultant</td>
<td>50 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.05.02</td>
<td>Tal</td>
<td>Former consultant</td>
<td>50 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01.06.02</td>
<td>Gilad</td>
<td>Former consultant (Telephone interview)</td>
<td>75 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.5 - Israeli Marketing Department Interviews
**Russian Marketing Department** - The Russian marketing department is located on the second floor. The telemarketing personnel and academic consultants were interviewed with the same type of interview schedule (which is the same one used for the Israeli telemarketing personnel and academic consultants).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27.05.02</td>
<td>Sonia</td>
<td>Former responsible for Russian marketing department</td>
<td>55 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.05.02</td>
<td>Regina</td>
<td>Present responsible for Russian marketing department</td>
<td>115 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.05.02</td>
<td>Natali</td>
<td>Secretary in the Russian marketing department</td>
<td>45 minutes</td>
<td>Marketing’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4.6 - Russian Marketing Department Interviews**

**Lecturers** - A tailor made interview schedule was built for the lecturer that was one of the developers of the ‘One Year Program’ and another kind of interview schedule was made for the other lecturers that were suppose to teach in the ‘One Year Programs’. However, when the research started it became clear that the ‘One Year Programs’ were not implemented so another interview schedule was created to re-interview the same lecturer that was one of the developers of the ‘One Year Programs’. Other lecturers did not participate in the research, except one lecturer in the field of marketing. This interview was considered to be knowledgeable about what the lecturers knew about the idea of the ‘One Year Programs’.
### Table 4.7 - Lecturers Interviews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19.04.02</td>
<td>Yosef</td>
<td>Lecturer and one of the developers of the ‘One Year Program’</td>
<td>90 minutes</td>
<td>Interview schedule number 1 for a lecturer and one of the developers of the ‘One Year Programs’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.05.02</td>
<td>Batia</td>
<td>Lecturer in marketing</td>
<td>20 minutes</td>
<td>Lecturer’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06.06.02</td>
<td>Yosef</td>
<td>Re-interview: Lecturer and one of the developers of the ‘One Year Program’</td>
<td>45 minutes</td>
<td>Interview schedule number 2 (Re-interview) for a lecturer and one of the developers of the ‘One Year Programs’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Students** - Since there were supposed to be about 30 students in the ‘One Year Programs’, it was decided to conduct pilot interviews of students as a preliminary stage for preparing the interview schedule for the students who are studying in these programs. First, one student was interviewed in “Student Pilot A”:

### Table 4.8 - Student Pilot A Interview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20.02.02</td>
<td>Orly</td>
<td>Business Management and Marketing student</td>
<td>20 minutes</td>
<td>Student pilot A’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After minor amendments, “Student Pilot B” was undertaken and also was comprised of interviewing one student:
Date of the Interview | Pseudonym | Title | Length of the Interview | Type of Interview Schedule
--- | --- | --- | --- | ---
20.03.02 | Boris | Business Management and Marketing student | 30 minutes | Student pilot B's interview schedule

Table 4.9 - Student Pilot B Interview

After the undertaking of these pilots (A and B), the situation of the ‘One Year Programs’ was not exactly clear. The participants in “Student Pilot A” and “Student Pilot B” did start to study the academic courses that were a part of the ‘One Year Programs’. In addition, the pilots revealed that there were other students that were enrolled to the institution because of the ‘One Year Programs’ and that some of them had also began to study the academic courses that were suppose to be a part of the ‘One Year Programs’. However, as noted earlier, it was soon realized that although some students still think that they are studying in the ‘One Year Programs’, the ‘One Year Programs’ were never really implemented. This realization would have a critical effect on the planning of the entire research at International University.

First, although a interview schedule was prepared for the students who would finish the ‘One Year Programs’, which was supposed to be the basis for the re-interviews with the same participants after they completed the ‘One Year Programs’, it was no longer relevant. Therefore, this interview schedule was not used in the research (although it is presented at the end of Appendix A – Interview Schedules). Secondly, it was decided to carry out
a third pilot with students, “Student Pilot C”, which included three students:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of the Interview</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Length of the Interview</th>
<th>Type of Interview Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01.05.02</td>
<td>Lior</td>
<td>Business Management and Marketing student</td>
<td>65 minutes</td>
<td>Student Pilot C’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06.05.02</td>
<td>Tami</td>
<td>Business Management and Marketing student</td>
<td>35 minutes</td>
<td>Student Pilot C’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.05.02</td>
<td>Roman</td>
<td>Business Management and Marketing student</td>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>Student Pilot C’s interview schedule</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Telephone interview)

Table 4.10 - Student Pilot C Interviews

After these three pilots (A, B and C) were undertaken, the picture started to become clearer regarding the situation of the ‘One Year Programs’ at International University. It was therefore decided to carry out a student survey in order to examine the effectiveness of integrated marketing in the institution in the eyes of the customers, i.e. customer satisfaction, and in relation to the subjects that came out in the employees’ interviews. Although the students’ pilot interviews, especially “Student Pilot C”, were important in serving as a preliminary stage for preparing the questionnaire for the students’ survey, the questionnaire still required much more development. This will be discussed in detail in the next section on survey questionnaires.
SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRES

The essence of a questionnaire, as a research tool, is that it is in the hands of the respondent, and is completed by him or her. (Johnson, 1994, p. 37)

In this a survey questionnaire is different than an interview schedule, which ‘is a set of questions read to the respondent by an interviewer, who also records responses’ (Neuman, 1997, pp. 231-232). A survey questionnaire empowers the respondent who may even fail to complete the questionnaire at all (Johnson, 1994, p. 37). To avoid this it is possible to distribute the questionnaires ‘to captive audiences’, such as pupils, students, or participants in a meeting, who are asked to complete and return the questionnaire on the spot’ (Johnson, 1994, p. 37). Therefore, it was decided that all questionnaires at International University will be given out in a face-to-face manner to 'captive audiences' to be filled on the spot. However, even when a survey questionnaire is carried out face-to-face and not by post, it is difficult to secure a high degree of involvement with the participants (Robson, 1993, p. 126). In addition, ‘questionnaires are often filled in hurriedly’ (Cohen and Manion, 1994, p. 283). Consequently, to ensure that participant are highly involved and do not fill the questionnaire in a hurry, it was vital to develop the appropriate type of questionnaire.

Types of Questionnaires

Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000, p. 247) differentiate between the following three types of questionnaires:

1. Structured questionnaires
2. Unstructured questionnaires
3. Semi-structured questionnaires

Structured questionnaires use closed questions, including numerical questions such as ranking an issue, and thus have the ability to generate frequencies of response that enable statistical treatment and analysis (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 247). Although it takes a substantial amount of time to develop structured questionnaires, they do have the advantage of allowing data analysis to be taken relatively rapidly, often using computer packages such as Results for Research™, SphinxSurvey (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 248) or SPSS (ibid, p. 255). However, structured questionnaires were not chosen for the research at International University, since it is in the form of a case study.

If a site-specific cases study is required, then qualitative, less structured, word-based and open-ended questionnaire may be more appropriate as they can capture the specificity of a particular situation.

(Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, pp. 247-248)

As a result, unstructured questionnaires were considered for the research at International University. Since an unstructured questionnaire is a word-based qualitative approach, it has the advantage of collecting rich and personal data (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 248). Such qualitative data could be then compared to the qualitative data collected in the interviews at the university. However, since the study at International University also intended to measure the effectiveness of integrated marketing and ‘where measurement is sought then a quantitative approach is required’ (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 248), the unstructured questionnaire could not be adopted for the research at the university.
Therefore, it was decided to consider the **semi-structured questionnaire**, which according to Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000, p. 248) is a powerful research tool that is somewhere in between the structured questionnaire and the unstructured questionnaire. Since the semi-structured questionnaire enables the integration of quantitative and qualitative methods, it was chosen for the research at International University. This choice allowed developing a survey questionnaire that on one hand measures quantitatively the level of student satisfaction while on the other hand examines qualitatively the reasons behind this level of customer satisfaction.

**Developing the Survey Questionnaire**

Questionnaires are a research tool which perhaps more than any other need a pilot run... The experience of pilot study respondents is used to improve and amend the questionnaire before sending it out to the main research population.

(Johnson, 1994, p. 39)

A pilot questionnaire for the survey was prepared based on the students' pilot interviews, especially “Student Pilot C”. After this pilot questionnaire was ready one student answered it as “Survey Pilot 1” on the 19th of May 2002. Subsequently, after minor amendments were made to the initial pilot questionnaire, such as changing the order of two questions, deleting two redundant words in one question and adding an explanation to another question in brackets, at the end of May 2002 another pilot was undertaken. This pilot was named “Survey Pilot 2” and it included 5 students. Then, after some final minor improvements were made again, such as the deletion
of one redundant question, the final questionnaire was ready (see Appendix B - Student Survey Questionnaire).

The student survey questionnaire was composed of 29 main questions and their sub-issues. This included general questions such as age or sex, which were structured and closed. It also included some questions that were dichotomous questions ('yes'/ 'no'). Questions concerning opinions, expectations and comments were open-ended. For example, question 16 states: ‘Why did you decide to enroll here and not to another institution?’ This was done to see whether students did enroll due to the ‘One Year Programs’, demonstrating that the marketing department did succeed in identifying student needs. In another example, the last question was open-ended, allowing for students to fill any comments they wish. However, the main weight of the questionnaire was to lie in the hands of questions concerning the customers’ satisfaction.

The questions regarding students’ satisfaction were composed of two parts: a numerical scale and a verbal part. The first part of the question was a quantitative one in order to check the prevalence of the subjects as a multiple choice question, numbered from 1 to 10. This even number of scale points was chosen since it requires, unlike an odd number scale that has a midpoint, a decision on rating to be indicated (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 254). This created a high degree of participant involvement since it forced participants to think before filling the second part of the question, which was a qualitative one composed of an open-ended question that provided explanations for the first quantitative part of the question.

In addition, this two part design of the questions concerning students’ satisfaction allowed issues to emerge from the survey questionnaires. For
example, question 26 asks the student to rank his or her satisfaction with the management of the university without however listing who the managers are. This was done on purpose since a more precise question would not have revealed who the students think the managers are at the university. It was intended that the students would say who the managers are and not tell them in advance who manages the university and thus lead them when administering the survey questionnaires.

Administered Questionnaires at the University

The first issue in administering the survey at International University was to consider the sample size. Although ‘for quantitative data, a precise sample number can be calculated’ (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 95), the survey questionnaire tended to be more qualitative than quantitative. In a qualitative survey, Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000, p. 95) give an example that five or six participants out of a population of thirty may be enough. Taking the conservative approach, it was decided to take the higher proportion of six out of thirty, i.e. 20%. Since approximately 700 students studied at the time at the university (according to a document dated April 2002 by a vice-president of the university that segmented the student population), this translated to a sample size of roughly 140 students.

The second issue was to choose which type of sampling to use. It was decided that the sample would be that of convenience sampling, which involves selecting the nearest individuals to serve as participants and continuing the process until the sample size has been achieved (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 102). This type of sampling was chosen
because it was resolved earlier that all questionnaires at university will be given out to captive audiences to be filled on the spot and 'captive audiences such as students or student teachers often serve as respondents based on convenience sampling' (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 102). In addition, 'a convenience sample may be the sampling strategy selected for a case study' (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 103).

As a result of this planning, at the beginning of June 2002 during several days, the survey sampled by means of convenience sampling 147 students of the 700 students that studied then at International University. In addition, in view of the fact that the 6 participants in survey pilots undertaken during May 2002 resulted in only minor amendments to the questionnaires (as discussed earlier in this section), it was decided to include these 6 pilots in the sample size. Consequently, the overall sample was 153 students, which is over 20% of the students studying at the university. According to Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2000), in a qualitative study such a sample 'may suffice the researcher who is prepared to obtain additional corroborative data by way of validation' (p. 95). Therefore, in addition to the corroborative data obtained in the various interviews, it was necessary to obtain supplementary corroborative data by collecting documents. Indeed, Yin (1994) argues that in case study research 'the most important use of documents is to corroborate and augment evidence from other sources' (p. 81). Accordingly, the various types of documents collected for this study at International University are discussed subsequently.
The essence of a document or record is that it already exists in a definitive form. Unlike a questionnaire or interview schedule, it cannot be individually designed to suit a particular research purpose, but must be drawn on as a source of data in the form in which it stands. (Johnson, 1994, pp. 58-59)

Although ‘documentary research relies primarily on the use of available printed data as a source of evidence’ (Johnson, 1994, p. 25), it nevertheless has an advantage over interviews and survey questionnaires of being ‘an 'unobtrusive' method of research’ (Johnson, 1994, p. 27). It is unobtrusive because the nature of the document is not affected by the fact that it is being used for the study (Robson, 1993, p. 272). Since the most important first step in using a document for research is ascertaining the purpose for which the document was originally prepared (Johnson, 1994, p. 59), it was essential to categorize the collected documents at International University into types so as to understand their original purpose.

Types of Documents

Robson (1993, p. 274) classifies documents into the three basic types of: (1) general documents that include minutes of meetings, letters and even magazine articles; (2) particular context documents that in educational institutions may be course documents such as written curricula, timetables, notices or course outlines; and (3) non-written documents such as films or photographs. However, this categorization is lacking since it is not clear where to put in it documents such as ‘formal studies or evaluations of the same "site" under study’ (Yin, 1994, p. 81). Should these studies be put in
general documents or in particular context documents? In addition, although some non-written documents were collected, such as pictures, these were always a part of the written documents. Therefore, it was necessary to develop in this research at International University a specific categorization for types of documents in the context of marketing.

Consequently, documents were categorized into the following types according to the seven stages in the evolution of marketing in educational institutions (see literature review, pages 42-50, 89-94):

1. Marketing is unnecessary – These are documents that demonstrate that the student is not seen as a customer and must receive what the 'professionals' dictate.

2. Marketing is promotion – The documents of this type illustrate that the university recognized that selling is central to its survival and therefore include not only advertising, sales promotion and public relations but also address hiring, training and motivating salespeople.

3. Marketing is segmentation and marketing research – These are documents that show how the institution segmented its client base either through researching the market itself or with the aid of hired outside consultants.

4. Marketing is positioning – These documents give an idea how the institution distinguishes itself from its competitors in order to achieve distinctiveness in the minds of prospective students.

5. Marketing is strategic planning – These documents show the institution strategic planning efforts include identifying major trends, assessing how well it was responding to these trends and revising its programs, procedures, and other activities to better align its efforts with these trends.
6. Marketing is enrolment management – These are documents that prove the university is focusing on student needs, viewing each student admission as the beginning of a long-term positive relationship with the institution that would continue through the period of enrolment to graduation and extend into many years as a satisfied alumna or alumnus.

7. Marketing is integrated marketing – These documents show that the university’s various departments are on the same page, working together to achieve the institution’s objectives and actively responding to the students’ short and long-term interests.

Collected Documents at the University

Although some documents on the ‘One Year Programs’ were already gathered during 2001, most of the documents were collected during the period of mid April 2002 up to the end of June 2002. Overall several hundred pages of documents were collected with some dating back to 1997. These were categorized as follows:

1. Marketing is unnecessary – The collected documents are syllabi of the Israeli Program from the end of the 90s syllabi, which are in different formats and even given out in low quality paper. Each lecturer developed whatever syllabus he or she saw fit.

2. Marketing is promotion – The collected documents range from cards given to potential students during the "2002 Studies Exhibition: The National Fair for Education and Career" up to a report from the marketing manager summarising the results of a lecture intended to train and motivate the telemarketing department.
3. **Marketing is segmentation and marketing research** – There are reports from 2001 and 2002 that segment the student population as well as surveys conducted by an external company, one dating back to December 2000.

4. **Marketing is positioning** – These materials from 2002 show how the university distinguished itself from its competitors by emphasising that some of its lecturers are from abroad, thereby giving the institution an international flavour. Documents here include high quality materials handed out to potential students as well as magazine advertisements.

5. **Marketing is strategic planning** – These 2001-2002 documents, such as new pricing strategies or reports by the academic manager, show how the university is responding to major trends and revising its programs and procedures accordingly.

6. **Marketing is enrolment management** – These 2002 documents, such as a workshop for directing students or proposals to accompany students in their careers, illustrate International University's intentions for long-term relationships with its students.

7. **Marketing is integrated marketing** – The documents here include the ‘Quality Resolution’ which is a document created by the management in 2000 designed to communicate its goals to all the university's department and thus get everyone on the same page. In addition, there are documents in the context of the ‘One Year Programs’, which show how different members of the institution collaborated to develop them.

This categorization of documents served as a preliminary first step in analysing the data collected at International University.
ANALYSIS

Although there is no clear and accepted set of conventions for qualitative analysis, to work within the scientific framework and to persuade scientific or policy-making audiences, qualitative data must be nonetheless handled systematically (Robson, 1993, pp. 370-371). Therefore, data analysis was carried out in three stages. First, the data from each of the three research tools of interviews, questionnaires and documents, was analysed separately in order to reduce the data, thereby making ‘the data mountain manageable’ (Robson, 1993, p. 390). The interviews, questionnaires and documents were analysed in a very similar manner. For each, a first reading of the findings was carried out, generating themes. Then, a second reading was performed so as to revise the existing themes. Some of these themes were clustered and some were divided. The second reading was also used to check for the existence of additional themes.

Still, the questionnaires, unlike the interviews and documents, also included quantitative data since the questions regarding students’ satisfaction were composed of both a numerical scale and a verbal part. However, the purpose of this two part design was not to enable a complex statistical analysis. Rather it was to see if there are differences (and if so, which) between what the participants mark in the numerical scale and their explanations for that rank in the open-ended part of the question. This made analysing the data from the questionnaires more difficult than that from the interviews and documents, since in addition to generating themes it also required examining if there are any contradictions between what the students marked on the scale to what they wrote.

In the second stage, once themes were created for each of the three research
tools, it was possible to compare them. This was achieved by combining
the various themes into the relevant subsidiary research questions
developed in the literature review chapter. In addition, in the findings
chapter, the appropriate data sources were quoted and referenced for each
theme. (The referencing system developed for this study will be explained
in the next chapter.) This was done not only to create what Yin (1994, p.
99) refers to as a ‘chain of evidence’ enabling an independent reader to
judge the reliability of the information, but also to avoid undermining the
credibility of the entire case study, which many case studies do undermine
by not citing their sources (Yin, 1994, p. 99).

In the third stage, based on the overall collected data, the marketing
effectiveness of International University was analysed using the
‘marketing-effectiveness rating instrument’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 466).
This instrument allows ranking the five major attributes of a marketing
orientation, which are a consumer-oriented philosophy, an integrated
marketing commitment, adequate marketing information, a strategic
orientation and, effective implementation (see Appendix C - Marketing-
Effectiveness Rating Instrument).

The instrument is used in the following way. The appropriate
answer is checked for each question. The scores are added – the
total will be between 0 and 30. The following scale shows the
level of marketing effectiveness:

- 0-5 = None
- 6-10 = Poor
- 11-15 = Fair
- 16-20 = Good
- 21-25 = Very good
- 26-30 = Superior

(Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 469)

Although this rating of the university's marketing effectiveness completed
the analysis, it is important to note that this analysis - or any part of this
study - did not occur without taking ethical considerations into account.
Chapter 3 - Methodology

ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

The first ethical guideline by BERA (British Educational Research Association) states:

The British Educational Research Association believes that all educational research should be conducted within an ethic of respect for persons, respect for knowledge, respect for democratic values, and respect for the quality of educational research. (BERA, 2000, Online)

From this it can be seen that this guideline's first concern are the people in the research. According to Bassey (1999), this respect for persons is what separate researchers from journalists, since 'most journalists do not concern themselves about the ethic of respect for persons, and in demanding the right to investigate and to publish what they perceive as the truth' (p. 74). The importance of respect for persons can be seen even in Bassey's discussion on respect for democratic values.

Respect for Democratic Values

Bassey (1999) notes that 'researchers in a democratic society can expect certain freedoms: the freedom to investigate and to ask questions; the freedom to give and to receive information; the freedom to express ideas and to criticize the ideas of others; and the freedom to publish research findings' (p. 74). However, Bassey (1999, p. 74) argues that respect for persons takes precedence over respect for democratic values, giving an example where in a research he conducted in a school he could not persuade the head to let him publish an important issue and consequently dropped the issue due to his ethical respect for persons.
Chapter 3 - Methodology

Respect for Persons

‘In order to sustain the concept of ‘respect for persons’ and, indeed, in order to obtain their cooperation in providing data, it is usual to negotiate the extent to which data taken from them can be used in writing the report’ (Bassey, 1999, p. 74). Therefore, as the guidelines by BERA (2000, Online) on responsibility to the participants suggest, interviewees were informed about the purpose of the study, requesting from them informed consent as well as explaining that they have the right to withdraw from the study at any time. Surprisingly, there were no problems of cooperation and interviewees even declined repeated offers to check out their interview transcripts.

Some credit for this cooperation may be due to the familiarity of this researcher with many of the interviewees, since (as noted in the introduction chapter, page 2) the author of this thesis has worked at International University as both a consultant and a part-time lecturer. Hence, since access includes not only obtaining the participants' approvals for the research but also building relationships with them (Measor, 1985, p. 57), these relationships already existed in many cases. For example, the researcher has consulted Sonia, the one formerly responsible for Russian marketing department, on marketing and curriculum development issues. In another example, Ofer, the one formerly responsible for telemarketing in the Israeli marketing department, was a student of the author in a course on electronic marketing. Therefore, although they were former employees of International University, they willingly cooperated since they knew the researcher.
However, the main reason that current employees cooperated was due to the fact that they knew that the research at International University had been given the approval of the president of the Israeli company running the university extension in Israel. Still, his approval was not without conditions. The first condition of access (which was presented in the introduction chapter of this thesis, page 15) was that the institution must remain as anonymous as possible and thus a pseudonym was given to the institution calling it 'International University' with certain identifying details being omitted. In the second condition the president requested that the confidentiality of the participants be maintained and consequently each participant was given a pseudonym. In his third condition, the president stipulated that no electronic recording may take place, which was unfortunate since 'tapes certainly provide a more accurate rendition of any interview than any other method' (Yin, 1994, p. 86). In his last condition he asked to be given the results immediately after the data collection phase of the study in order to improve the institution's marketing. Therefore, at the end of June 2002 a special report was prepared and submitted to him. This prompt response to his last condition of access was undertaken keeping in mind BERA's (2000, Online) sixth ethical guideline of conducting educational research in a way that will not jeopardize future research.

Respect for the Quality of Educational Research

BERA's first ethical guideline concluded with 'respect for the quality of educational research' (BERA, 2000, Online). Bassey (1999) explains that BERA added this ethical value to the first three in order 'to strengthen the bond between researcher and researched' (p. 74). 'This enjoins researchers not to conduct their research in ways which will damage the future
enquiries of other researchers, but to seek to enhance the image of research' (Bassey, 1999, p. 74). Therefore, not only were the conditions of the president addressed, but also at all times the researcher adhered to the ethical guidelines in order to demonstrate professionalism, thereby enhancing the image of educational research.

For example, a simple thing such as coming on time to the interviews goes a long way in showing professionalism. Consequently, on days where more than one interview were scheduled, enough time was taken into account not only to allow building up the field notes (as discussed earlier in this chapter), but also to ensure that the researcher was not late to the next interview. Had two interviews been scheduled too closely together, the researcher would have had to either cut one interview or come late to the next. Whatever choice made, one interviewee would be insulted and due to this may not want to participate in future research. In addition, cutting one interview in the middle or coming late to the next could damage the data collected from the interviews, which could result in unintentional misrepresentation of evidence, a problem that should be avoided by educational researchers (BERA, 2000, Online).

Respect for Knowledge

Respect for knowledge, known also as 'respect for truth' (Bassey, 1999, p. 74), involves educational researchers aiming 'to avoid fabrication, falsification, or misrepresentation of evidence, data, findings, or conclusions' (BERA, 2000, Online), whether intentionally or unintentionally (Bassey, 1999, p. 74). Bassey (1999) argues that 'it is here that trustworthiness becomes significant' (p. 74). However, Yin (1994, pp.
32-33) notes that although concepts such as trustworthiness, credibility, confirmability and data dependability have been offered, the most relevant for case studies are the four tests of construct validity, reliability, internal validity and external validity.

**Construct validity** is defined as ‘establishing correct operational measures for the concepts being studied’ (Yin, 1994, p. 33). According to Yin (1994, p. 34), this is first test is especially problematic when undertaking case studies. ‘People who have been critical of case studies often point to the fact that a case study investigator fails to develop a sufficiently operational set of measures and that "subjective" judgements are used to collect data’ (Yin, 1994, p. 34). However, there are several tactics available in order to increase construct validity (Yin, 1994, p. 34). One of them is to use multiple sources of data (Yin, 1994, p. 34), i.e. triangulation.

Triangulation is defined as ‘cross-checking of data and interpretations through the use of multiple data sources and/or data collection techniques’ (Lincoln and Guba, 1985, p. 109) or as ‘the ability to apply diverse techniques to address different aspects of a complex research problem’ (Schutt, 1999, p. 396). Therefore, the complex case study at International University may claim triangulation since multiple data sources were collected by using three collection techniques of interviews, questionnaires and documents. Another claim this case study can make is that of creating a chain of evidence.

According to Yin (1994, p. 34), establishing a chain of evidence during data collection is another tactic to increase construct validity. ‘The principle is to allow an external observer – the reader of the case study, for example – to follow the derivation of any evidence from initial research
questions to ultimate case study conclusions’ (Yin, 1994, p. 98). To achieve this, there must be enough citations from specific sources such as documents or interviews (Yin, 1994, pp. 98-99). Therefore, the findings chapter cites the relevant sources of data in order to create a chain of evidence. This creation of a chain of evidence is also important so as to increase the reliability of a case study (Yin, 1994, p. 98).

**Reliability** is defined as ‘the extent to which a research fact or finding can be repeated’ (Bassey, 1999, p. 75). Its objective is to minimize the errors and biases in a case study (Yin, 1994, p. 36). This is achieved by making sure that if another researcher followed exactly the same procedures as described by the case study’s researcher and conducted the same study again (i.e. doing the same case study over again and not replicating the results in another case study), he or she would arrive at the same findings and conclusions (Yin, 1994, p. 36). Since ‘in the past case study research procedures have been poorly documented, making external reviewers suspicious of the reliability of the case study’ (Yin, 1994, p. 37), each of the procedures was therefore documented in this methodology chapter. This was important in also strengthening the internal validity of this case study at International University.

**Internal validity** is a test ‘concerned with the relationships between cause and effect’ (Bassey, 1999, p. 75). Documenting the procedures in this case study at International University is important in demonstrating that the research did discover all the causes that affected integrated marketing at the university. Yin (1994, p. 35) notes that a researcher is making inferences that a particular event resulted from some earlier occurrence every an event cannot be observed and thus all the rival explanations and possibilities should be considered in making inferences. Since no observations took
place at International University, rival explanations were taken into account and are presented in the findings and analysis chapters. Without this, external validity could not be claimed.

**External validity** is a test 'concerned with the extent to which a cause-and-effect relationship can be generalized to other contexts' (Bassey, 1999, p. 75). The last subsidiary research question in the overview of the literature review chapter raised this issue whether, on the basis of the study at International University, some sort of generalization can be formulated that would be relevant to other institutions of higher education (see page 142). Indeed, one 'common concern about case studies is they provide little basis for scientific generalization. “How can you generalize from a single case?” is a frequently heard question’ (Yin, 1994, p. 10). It is maintained by some that case studies do not allow generalization (Custer, 1996, p. 4; Pitout, 1995, p. 123) or that they only permit generalizing by an intuitive judgment (Nisbet and Watt, 1984, p. 77).

Nevertheless, others argued that case studies do allow generalization (Brewer, 2000, p. 76; Cohen and Manion, 1994, pp.106-107; Yin, 1994, p. 31). Brewer (2000) argues that 'generalizability of the findings is possible with a case study, although attention needs to be given to the grounds on which generalizations are made’ (p. 76). One fatal flaw, according to Yin (1994, p. 31), is to use statistical generalization in a case study. In statistical generalization the population is sampled, thus claiming that there is a certain probability that the issues revealed in the sample will also be found throughout the population (Bassey, 1999, p. 12). However, case studies are not samples of populations ‘and should not be chosen for this reason. Rather, individual case studies are to be selected as a laboratory investigator selects the topic of a new experiment’ (Yin, 1994, p. 31). In
cases studies, the method of generalization should be that of analytic generalization, where 'a previously developed theory is used as a template with which to compare the empirical results of the case study' (Yin, 1994, p. 31). Therefore, the discussion chapter compares the data presented in the findings chapter with the theories on integrated marketing offered in the literature review chapter so as to set the stage for creating a generalization that would be relevant to other institutions of higher education, which is presented in the concluding chapter.
Chapter 4 – Findings

In order to process the collected data of this research into this findings chapter, it was first necessary to consider the purpose of the study, which is:

♦ To examine integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in an institution of higher education in Israel during a period of change.

From this it can be seen that the main focus of this research is to examine the implementation of the actual responsiveness of International University, which was carried out by means of integrated marketing. Reviewing the history of this institution revealed that several key changes were undertaken in order to implement integrated marketing. Therefore, this chapter will be structured with regard to the time aspects of past and present. In this study, the past aspect refers to the implementation of integrated marketing in the institution (which was carried out before this research began, during 2000 up to the end of 2001), while the present aspect (i.e. when this research was conducted during 2002) addresses the current extent of integrated marketing and the existing level of responsiveness.

Taking into account these past and present issues, this chapter commences with International University's organizational structure during both periods. This not only reveals some of the changes that were carried out in this institution, but also presents to the reader some of International University's key members, including their organizational functions and pseudonyms. This preliminary section on the organizational structure will
be followed by the central section of this chapter presenting the main findings of this case study, collected by means of interviews, survey questionnaires and documents. These findings are categorized into themes according to the relevant subsidiary research questions developed at the end of the literature review chapter. In addition, the appropriate data sources will be referenced for each theme. (The referencing system developed for this study will be explained in the beginning of this central section.)

ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE

This section of the findings chapter presents International University's organizational structure in the two time periods of past and present. However, before presenting these two organizational structures, it is important to note that no formal organizational structure document was found during the data collection phase of this research. Therefore, the following two organizational structures were gradually developed during the data collection phase, with final minor amendments made once this phase was complete. Creating these two organizational structures was instrumental in understanding the organizational structure changes that occurred as International University started to respond to its market needs.

The first organizational structure (figure 4.1 in the next page) deals with the past, i.e. the implementation of integrated marketing in the institution during 2000 up to the end of 2001, while the second organizational structure (figure 4.2 in the subsequent pages) presents the situation when this research was conducted during 2002, revealing some of the changes that implementing integrated caused. Comparing and contrasting these two
organizational structures can give much insight into the changes that occurred at the institution as it attempted to introduce integrated marketing. Below is International University's past organizational structure:

Figure 4.1 - Former Organizational Structure (before the External Marketing Company left the Organization, during 2000 up to the end of 2001)
By reviewing figure 4.1 in the previous page, it can be seen that at the time when the institution started to initiate integrated marketing, there were three senior management positions under the president of the Israeli company running the university's extension in Israel (Avi): one vice president of the Israeli company who is the manager of the Israeli branch of International University (initially Narkis from the beginning of 2000 up to mid 2001, later replaced by Meital, who managed from mid 2001 up to the beginning of 2002) and two marketing managers. The first one was a vice president in the Israeli company and the marketing manager responsible for the corporate sector (Zvi) and the second one was the marketing manager responsible for the private sector (Yevgeni). The latter was not a salary receiving employee but the owner and manager of an external marketing company which was hired in order to increase student enrolment.

Yevgeni, as the marketing manager responsible for the private sector, was looking for new ways in which International University can become more responsive to the ever-changing market needs and consequently increase student enrolment. To achieve this, in cooperation with Narkis (then the vice president who was the manager of the Israeli branch of International University) and Gavri (then the academic manager), he initiated the concept of the 'One Year Programs'. To attain this required responsiveness by means of the 'One Year Programs' necessitated the use of integrated marketing at the institution. This implementation of integrated marketing at International University resulted in change processes that ultimately lead to the departure of Yevgeni and his external marketing company from the institution. Theses changes can be partially observed in the following organizational structure (figure 4.2 in the next page):
Figure 4.2 - Current Organizational Structure (without the External Marketing Company, during 2002)

From this present organizational structure, it can be seen that marketing activities are indeed more integrated, all being under one marketing manager, Zvi. How these changes came to pass will be presented in detail with the relevant referenced data sources in the following central section of this findings chapter.
THE MAIN FINDINGS OF THE CASE STUDY

In order to present the main findings of this case study, which were collected by interviews, survey questionnaires and documents, first the referencing system for these data sources will be explained. This will set the stage for presenting the systematically cited findings, which will be categorized according to the subsidiary research questions developed at the end of the literature review chapter. As noted in the methodology chapter, this systematic citing of sources will enable an independent reader to judge the reliability of the information by creating what Yin (1994) refers to as a ‘chain of evidence’ (p. 99). The referencing system will also aid to avoid undermining the credibility of the entire case study, which many case studies do undermine by not citing their sources (Yin, 1994, p. 99).

The Referencing System

For each of the three data sources of interviews, survey questionnaires and documents, a specific referencing system was developed as follows:

I. **Interview citations** will include the underlined pseudonym of the interviewee, an abbreviation that includes the organizational structure as well as the date of the interview, such as Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02), where "Man.Int." stands for Management Interview or Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02), where "L.Re-int." stands for Lecturer Re-interview.

II. **Survey questionnaire citations** will be simply cited as "Student Survey 02", since the 6 pilots undertaken during May 2002 were combined with the 147 sample conducted in June 2002 into one sample of 153 students and analysed together.

III. **Document citations** will be categorized according to the seven stages of evolution of marketing in educational institutions (as explained in the
methodology chapter on pages 177-178). Each document will be cited according to its underlined name, category and available date (since some documents have a precise date to the day while others only offer the relevant year). For example: Syllabus Price List (SP.Doc. 21.03.02), where "SP.Doc." stands for Strategic Planning Document.

The overall referencing system is summarised below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Source</th>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Interviews</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Man.Int. Avi (Man.Int. 29.04.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>A.Int. Katia (A.Int. 26.05.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>M.Int. Svetlana (M.Int. 06.05.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Israeli Marketing</td>
<td>I.M.Int. Igor (I.M.Int. 30.05.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Russian Marketing</td>
<td>R.M.Int. Regina (R.M.Int. 12.05.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lecturers</td>
<td>L.Int. Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>S.Int. Orli (S.Int. 20.02.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Survey</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaires</td>
<td></td>
<td>Student Survey 02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Documents</td>
<td>Marketing is...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Promotion</td>
<td>P.Doc. Sales and Telemarketing Workshop (P.Doc. 11.06.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Segmentation and Marketing Research</td>
<td>SMR.Doc. Student Registration Data (SMR.Doc. 02.04.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Strategic Planning</td>
<td>SP.Doc. Price List (SP.Doc. 21.03.02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Enrolment Management</td>
<td>EM.Doc. Workshop for Directing Students (EM.Doc. 02)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Integrated Marketing</td>
<td>IM.Doc. Quality Resolution (IM.Doc. 00)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 - The Referencing System
The Main Findings Categorised According to the Research Questions

This section of the thesis presents, in detail, the main findings of this case study. These findings are categorized into four different subsections according to the first four types of subsidiary research questions (out of the overall six offered at the end of the literature review chapter\(^1\)), which were:

1. Current level of responsiveness of the university, including the existing status of the 'One Year Programs'.
2. Present extent of integrated marketing at the university.
3. Past management of change: implementation of integrated marketing.
4. Overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts.

Each of these four subsections will include a short introduction, followed by their subsidiary research questions (which will be indicated in *Italic*). After each subsidiary research question (or group of interconnected subsidiary research questions) a short narrative will be given, supported by relevant examples from the interviews, survey questionnaires and/or documents. Each of these data sources will be systematically cited as discussed in the previous pages.

\(^1\) Since the last two types of questions were (5) 'discussion of results in order to arrive to conclusions' and (6) 'generalization including a theoretical framework', they will each be accordingly addressed in the last two chapters of the thesis, the discussion and the conclusions chapters.
1. Current level of responsiveness of the university, including the existing status of the 'One Year Programs'.

This first subsection of the main findings will first assess the level of responsiveness of International University. Then, data on the subject of academic quality will be presented, which will be offered according to the curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of students and outcomes. This will partially explain why the 'One Year Programs' were ended (as noted in the methodology chapter) and thus enable to discuss what has been happening to those students who enrolled to these programs, which were initiated due to an attempt of International University to be responsive to the market.

*What is the level of International University's responsiveness: unresponsive institution, casually responsive institution or highly responsive institution?*

In order to answer this question, it was necessary to research the four components raised by the following question.

*Which of the following four components exist at the university?*

- **Complaint system**: Does a complaint system exist at the institution?

The research did not find any formal institutionalised complaint system for the students at International University, except for grade appeals. A student may file a formal appeal on a grade, as described in detail in the Information Booklet for Registering Students (Pos.Doc. 00) and only in one sentence in the Information Booklet for Registering Students (Pos.Doc. 01). However, other than this, the students do not have a clear address to turn to with problems and complaints. In Student Survey 02,
question 24 (see Appendix B) asked “When you run into a problem, whom do you turn to at the university?” Of the 153 students in the survey, the answers were:

- **61 students wrote to the secretaries**: 31 without giving a specific name (one stating “Maybe to the secretaries, usually I prefer to shut up”), 20 noted Vered (stating for example: “I have got an answer from her for every problem”), 7 Katia (“Any problem what’s so ever”), 2 Neta and 1 Rachel.

- **37 noted the management**: 27 Sharon (stating “At least she is always ready to help”, “Before Sharon came there was no one to turn to” or “She always listens and helps”), 6 Zvi (“Regarding any problem”), 3 Gavri and one student wrote a manager without mentioning a name.

- **10 wrote lecturers** without giving any specific names (stating sentences such as “In a problem concerning the studies”).

- **44 students did not fill** a specific answer, some of which even wrote: “I have no idea to whom I should approach” (4 students), “I’ve given up on everyone” (3 students), “I do not think I will find anyone who will listen” (2 students), “There is none to turn to” (one student) and “I have a problem for a year and a half and no one has been helping me” (one student).

- **One student wrote other students**, stating that “I turn to other students during any problem”.

The interviews also demonstrated that a formal complaint system does not exist and as a result some turn to other students. For example, Tal (I.M.Int. 28.05.02), a student who worked as an academic consultant in the Israeli marketing department for two months, commented: “But as a student, there
is contact with the students. The contact of the students with the marketing department [is as follows]: the students arrive sometimes with problems because they feel close to the marketing department since they came from there to International University. Sometimes they come with complaints because in the marketing department the people listen more than in the secretariat”.

Although this may not be true, since 61 students did write in Student Survey 02 that they go to the secretaries when running into a problem, it was nonetheless accurate that no formal complaint system existed. In her interview, Neta (A.Int. 10.05.02) mentioned that the students feel comfortable to come to the office and talk informally about all kinds of things, ranging from problems with lecturers up to personal problems at home, laughingly noting that “Israelis like to talk, to respond, [and] to complain”. Indeed, some complaints of the students were found in the surveys of satisfaction carried out by International University.

- Surveys of satisfaction: Are any actions undertaken to receive students' feedback about the lecturers or other subjects concerning the institution?

Each semester, a survey on each course was carried out. If a lecturer was giving two courses, even if the same course to two different classes, then he or she would be surveyed twice. There were five questions on the lecturer and on the lecture itself that students had to rank from 1 (=not true) to 5 (=very true), as well as a place for comments at the end (Feedback Questionnaire, SMR.Doc. 09.01). However, it was soon discovered that this may be of limited value, since “the students don’t
always fill the feedback on the lecturers because they don’t believe that it would help” (Lior, S.Int. 01.05.02). Furthermore, no surveys of student satisfaction with other issues were undertaken in a systematic manner.

Tatiana (I.M.Int. 25.04.02) said: “In my job, I offered once to Zvi to give questionnaires to the students to know if the students are satisfied. A week ago Zvi said that they gave the questionnaires and the results were a bit strange. To the question: ‘Are you satisfied?’ the students answered ‘Yes’ and to the question ‘Would you recommend the university to your friend?’ they answered ‘No’. I don’t know who did it (who wrote the questionnaires) but in my opinion, there is a need to invest first of all in the people here (the students) because the majority of the enrolment comes out from the ‘A friend brings a friend’ and if the majority of the students are not satisfied then it will be difficult to bring new students. In principle, in my job I don’t know if the students are satisfied. I initiated to check it”. Others who tried to initiate such surveys also ran into problems. Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02): “I tried to make a satisfaction survey among students but this did not take place. Zvi is nice, he wants to hear but he doesn't do anything in the end”. In addition, the students' needs and preferences were not always researched.

**Surveys of needs and preferences:** Are any surveys of needs and preferences undertaken? How does the institution distinguish explicitly its priority group/s for response? Has research been undertaken to ascertain audiences' expectations so as to create an effective product mix?

Some surveys of needs and preferences were undertaken by International University. For example, the Level of Student Anxiety of Finding a Job in
the Study Area (SMR.Doc. 12.00) or the Priority Level a Student gives a Lecturer that is succeeding in his/her Personal/Private Life (SMR.Doc. 02.01). However, these student surveys, which were conducted by an external market research firm, were carried out in a sporadic fashion, ordered by Narkis, the vice president who was the manager of the Israeli branch of International University. Meital, who later replaced Narkis, did not continue with this 'tradition'. Even a formal survey on the unique product mix of the 'One Year Programs' was not carried out. Rather, this initiative was based solely on Yevgeni's knowledge of the market.

As Sonia (R.M.Int. 27.05.02) noted, "the power of Yevgeni's company is that Yevgeni knows how to fit the product to the market and I also know how to fit the product to the market. He always fits little by little the product according to the demands. This is his science. That's why absolutely this place raised [students] because of the 'One Year Programs' that he raised according to the demand. He said: 'One needs a reason to enrol to this institute and not to another place especially when there is a stigma on a branch parallel to an Israeli institution'. And what is this reason? That there are real tools, even in one year the student will gain [more] parallel to another institution. The students will get a professional diploma and then it is worth the big sum of money that they pay. In the same direction he continued to build the 'One Year Programs' not only in the computing field but also in the marketing field and the communication field because we felt that in the high-tech there is going to be a revolution. All the time he promoted something and changed something when he saw the crisis in the high-tech, after he saw the 'One Year Programs' in the Computer field."
Therefore, it can be concluded that Yevgeni did attempt to create an effective product mix based on potential students' expectations, although this was not carried out by a systematic checking of the market founded on professional research. Indeed, Masha (I.M.Int. 05.05.02) gave several reasons why the 'One Year Program did not succeed, one of which was that "sometimes there are promises before checking them and that's what happened". Promises create expectations that may affect how the personnel are perceived by the students, an issue raised by the following subsidiary research question.

- **Customer-oriented personnel**: Are the employees "customer-oriented" during their job?

The Quality Resolution (IM.Doc. 00), which was signed by Avi and hanged on the wall for all to see, clearly states that "The customer-student will be put at the top of the priority measures and quality of service will be the central component in creating leverage for change and a continual conservation, by means of receiving feedback, setting measurable quality objectives and undertaking improvement activities". In this Avi was hoping to set the standard that would result in a high level of service performed by "customer oriented" employees. Indeed, it seemed he succeeded, since in the interviews all the employees testified that they give high quality of service and are thus "customer oriented".

However, although in the interviews the employees did feel that they themselves are "customer oriented", they also commented that it is the other role holders who are not. For example, Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02) speaking as a lecturer commented: "I think that they mainly are disappointed from the service of the secretaries. In my opinion most of the
lecturers today are good”. Svetlana (M.Int. 06.05.02), a secretary in the marketing department noted that: “There are students that are satisfied and there are students that complain about the secretaries - why they don’t always answer them”. However, at the end of the day, it is not how the employees perceive themselves but rather how they are perceived by the students.

In Student Survey 02, question 22 (see Appendix B) asked ‘Who gave you the best service at the university?’ Of the 153 students in the survey:

- 24 students ranked Vered as giving the best service at the university, noting that “In every meeting there is a feeling that Vered tries to help and find the appropriate solution for me”, “The only one that stood at my disposal when I had some problems with the courses” or “When one leaves a message she answers immediately, and always tries to solve the problem”. One even said “It is lucky that Vered exists”.

- 19 students ranked Katia as giving the best service, writing that “Katia is wonderful”, “Every time I turned to her ended with the needed help” and “In every approach there is an attentive answer from her”.

- 17 students wrote the secretaries without giving any names, noting that they are “Always helpful and trying to help” and that “To every approach, to every question that I asked I’ve got an answer”.

- 11 students ranked Sharon, writing that “My wife is pregnant and she took this into consideration when it comes to absenteeism” and “Personal problems and problems in the studies”.

- 8 students ranked Zvi, noting that “He supports and helps, he is charming” and “He helped me in enrollment problems”.

32 students ranked various other members of the university as giving the best service ranging from Rachel (who received 4 voices) to lecturers
or members of the marketing department. However, 42 students didn’t answer the question, 8 of which stated that no one gave them any good service at the university. This illustrates that for nearly 30% of the students in the survey, the employees at International University are not "customer oriented" since they couldn't even give a name of one employee that gave them the best service. This also created a problem in defining the level of responsiveness of International University.

The first question of this subsection raised the issue of whether International University is either an unresponsive institution, casually responsive institution or highly responsive institution. However, reviewing the findings on the components of (1) complaint system, (2) surveys of satisfaction, (3) surveys of needs and preferences, and (4) customer-oriented personnel, the answer is not clear. There isn't a formal complaint system, but some students do approach various members of International University informally. Surveys (of any kind) are carried out but not systematically. Finally, the students have mixed views on whether or not the personnel of International University are customer-oriented. Therefore, it was decided to leave the issue of the level of responsiveness to the discussion chapter and to continue to present the findings, such as academic quality, which is the subject of the following question.

*Does academic quality exist in International University which contains curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of students and outcomes?*

The Quality Resolution (IM.Doc. 00), as its name immediately suggests, demonstrates that quality became an issue at International University. The Quality Resolution (IM.Doc. 00) states “In order to fulfil its mission the university is committed to a high level of quality and to the assimilation of
continuous improvement in the organizational culture and way of life in operating the learning and training processes of all fields at the university, while optimally employing the resources at its disposal”. The reason that academic quality became a major issue not only for International University but also for other foreign extensions in Israel was due to a change in the law.

Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02): “The attitude of the market to the academic branches from abroad has changed. At the beginning the expectations from the branches were low. The image was of a place that ‘sells’ academic diplomas more than a place that teaches something serious. The entrance of the Council for Higher Education into the field and the conditions that they demanded from an institution that they gave a license to caused a rise in expectations. Especially clause 25d to the Council for Higher Education Law that presents in detail a list of 15 minimal conditions that a branch needs to adhere to in order to stay with a license. After a few months, branches that couldn’t meet the conditions were closed and just a few branches that succeeded in fitting themselves into the new conditions survived. They began to behave in accordance with the new conditions. That is to say they started to broadcast in their advertisement academic quality. Also, in their telephone answers they started to broadcast academic seriousness and quality”.

However, it is not enough to broadcast quality. As Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) noted, “I believe that if you do quality you sell quality”. Therefore, to examine the actual academic quality achieved at International University, the following subsections will present the findings on academic
quality categorised into the areas of curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of students and outcomes.

**Curriculum:**

_How does the curriculum actually operate according to the four levels of curriculum functions: the rhetorical curriculum, the planned curriculum, the delivered curriculum and the received curriculum?_

In order to answer this question, the following set of subsidiary research questions will focus on how the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs' has actually been operating according to the four levels of curriculum functions, starting with questions in context of the rhetorical curriculum.

_The rhetorical curriculum: Is the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs' customer-oriented? What are the statements of aims and policies of the 'One Year Programs'?_

The rhetorical curriculum of the 'One Year Programs' was indeed customer-oriented, since the aims and policies of these programs were created with students needs in mind. As Gavri, the former academic manager wrote in the _Work Plan for the Academic Manager_ (IM.Doc. 01.01): "Higher education is for most people a key for personal, economic and social advancement. The Israeli extension of International University is for most of the students the first and last encounter with academic studies. Therefore, we can contribute immensely to achieving their ambitions or not. Today, the curriculum does not meet their needs, ambitions and desires. While successful reforms have been undertaken in the systems that support the studies of management, administration and marketing, the academic curriculum has not undergone such a reform. The
reason is that there is a lack of strictness on a balanced, effective and analytical program of studies. Only 20% of the courses offered to students are professional courses in business administration. For the Israeli extension to flourish, it must be assimilated so that the students who need and demand a high academic level and preparation for the Israeli market are satisfied... Therefore, programs that are based on existing courses and enable the student to finish in a year with a professional certificate are suggested. (At the end is curriculum for these certificate programs, whose final plan was undertaken by myself and Yevgeni)."

*The planned curriculum: How are student needs addressed in the 'One Year Programs'? Are external factors, such as society's expectations and changes in knowledge, being expressed in the 'One Year Programs'?*

Student needs as well as external factors were addressed in the planning of the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs', as Proposal for a Study Program (IM.Doc. 03.01) written by Gavri, the former academic manager, clearly illustrates:

"The new program is intended to solve several problems simultaneously:

a. Building a professional program that increases the professional courses to 50% of all the courses the students study and thereby to increase their academic-professional level.

b. We can substantially raise their satisfaction from the program of studies. We must remember that the students in business administration are focused, practical people who strive to achieve the maximum possible from a degree as preparation for going into the work market."
c. The new program will also give a first grade marketing tool to the marketing department when they come to convince potential students. In this manner they could point the advantages of International University on other extensions and even over competing Israeli universities.

However, the problem with the 'One Year Programs' was not how they were planned (which will be discussed in detail later in this chapter) but how they were delivered. As Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) commented: “The Marketing department needs to impress people with what we have and not impress with what we don’t have and actually we impressed people with what we don’t have”.

*The delivered curriculum: How are the 'One Year Programs' actually being taught? Who is teaching in them?*

When the research at International University began, it soon became clear that the 'One Year Programs' were never actually carried out by anyone. As Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) noted, “I never knew how these programs work... The 'One Year Programs' is an expression that I hear all the time, but no one till now sent it to the mother institution [for approval]. Technically it is possible to operate them from tomorrow morning if we want to”. However, although the 'One Year Programs' never became operational, they were promised to students when they enrolled. As Tania (I.M.Int. 24.04.04) noted, “There was a situation that every week they changed the programs. All the time there were changes. Although, they didn’t completely finalize the ‘One Year Programs’, they marketed them. It turned out that the marketing sold something and after a week it was
changed”. She also added that “it was told to potential students that they could finish the 'One Year Programs' in two semesters in the end of the first year of the academic studies. They were told that there is a possibility to get a specialization and a professional diploma and it is also possible to start working during the studies and this will enable them to accumulate [professional] experience”.

In Student Survey 02, question 14 (see Appendix B) asked ‘What was told you during the consultation meeting that helped you enrol at the university?’ 22 of the 153 students in the survey (nearly 15%) noted the 'One Year Programs' as one of the reasons they enrolled. The students said that they were promised “A professional program that in the end of it I’ll get a diploma and a job” as one student put it or “A short period of studies with two diplomas” as another described it. These promises by the marketing department affected how the students viewed the actual received curriculum of the 'One Year Programs'.

The received curriculum: Who is receiving the curriculum? How many students are currently enrolled to the 'One Year Programs'? What is ultimately in the minds or hearts of the students who participate in the 'One Year Programs'?

As noted in the previous paragraph, no one was receiving the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs'. However, many students did enrol because of these programs. Trying to discover exactly how many students proved to be difficult. Indeed, even in the marketing department, an exact figure did not exist. As Tania (I.M.Int. 24.04.04) put it: “I don’t remember how many people were enrolled, the numbers, but there was a wave of enrolment”. In administration, Katia (A.Int. 26.05.02) remembered that: “Two classes of
the 'One Year Programs' were enrolled” but could not give a precise number. Reviewing hand written student registration data from New Students (SMR.Doc. 01.01), New Students (SMR.Doc. 03.01), New Students (SMR.Doc. 05.01), New Students (SMR.Doc. 08.01) and New Students (SMR.Doc. 01.02) did not help to get a precise number who enrolled for the 'One Year Programs' but it did aid in giving a minimum figure of at least 30 students. What was surprising to discover was that the students at International University had different information regarding the 'One Year Programs'.

For some of the students it was clear that the 'One Year Programs' never started. For example, Tami (S.Int. 06.05.02) noted: “I didn’t start the 'One Year Programs' because they didn’t happen” or Roman (S. Int. 16.05.02) who said: “I know about the ‘One Year Programs’ from the first academic consultation when they explained that we can start a specialization and in the end of the first year we get a specialization and a professional diploma. When I enrolled, already after a while they said that it was cancelled but anyway for me it didn’t matter... I came for the undergraduate degree”. Other students knew that the programs never began but weren't sure. As Lior (S.Int. 01.05.02) asked: “Is there any program at all? After I started to study I spoke here and I asked about the ‘One Year Program’ and they said to me that they didn’t open. I asked Yevgeni”.

Nevertheless, other students didn't even hear about the 'One Year Programs'. For instance, Orly (S.Int. 20.02.02) didn’t hear about them at all. When told about them in the interview, she said that they are interesting since through them it is possible to find a job in the field of the studies, thus getting experience in that field, which might later allow her to advance in that job with the academic diploma. However, what was the
most surprising was to discover students who did not realize that the 'One Year Programs' never began and still waited for the professional diploma of these programs. For example, Boris (S.Int. 20.03.02) noted, "I heard about the 'One Year Programs' before I enrolled. I was convinced [to enrol] from the fact that there is no need to finish the whole academic studies to get a professional diploma. I started immediately to study the courses of the 'One Year Programs' in the first semester. It was supposed to take 8 months but I am already studying one and a half years and I didn’t finish yet. These courses are not always available".

Boris (S.Int. 20.03.02) also added: “I am not pleased with International University. They simply have spread the 'One Year Programs' too long. In my opinion, they should have been concentrated them into 8 months. Now, even when they shortened the program, there are courses that require perquisite courses and then the students are forced to come more than 3 times a week. From the administrative aspect, every student chooses the courses, as he prefers, what is more convenient. I think that they had to do one program for the courses of the 'One Year Programs' for everybody with fixed study hours”. Boris's knowledge of the 'One Year Programs' - as well as the interviews with the other students - illustrates that there is a communication problem between the students and the faculty of International University.

Faculty:
What contact is there between the employees of the university and the students?

Interviewing several participants, it was not clear whether direct contact exists between the employees of the university (especially its managers)
and the students. On one hand, there are those that said there is direct contact, such as Lior (S.Int. 01.05.02) who noted that: “When compared to an Israeli university, the students here are talking in a direct way to the management. This is both an advantage and disadvantage. It is good that there is direct contact between a student and a lecturer. The direct contact with the management is an advantage. It is also an advantage and disadvantage. If I have a problem, I go alone to the management and other students go alone to the management. There is no student union that can help students in a centralised way”.

On the other hand, there are those who said there isn't enough direct contact and that there is distance between the students and the managers. For example, Dafina (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) commented: “Since this place is a private higher education institution whose tuition is very high, I would expect from the managers to be more favourable in their attitude towards the students. There is no need to keep a distance in such a place”. Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) said that: “It is impossible [for the students] to go up to Avi. The students come to my office”. Indeed, the centre of the communication problem seemed to be Avi.

As Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02) noted, “One of the worst problems here is that there is a complete disconnection between the management and the students. Usually this happened in universities but they are big institutions with tens of thousands of students. Here it is not suppose to happen because it is a small institution. Since I was a student here the management has been changed. None [of the new managers] bothered to go into the classrooms, present themselves and to tell what is happening. The first time that my class knew Avi was when he went down to the video conference classroom saw 3 students outside and he entered the classroom
to shout at the lecturer as to why the students are sitting outside. This is the way that we knew Avi. Later he tried to fire this lecturer and then he roused all the students - he fired her and then he brought her back. Probably he even doesn't know what students feel towards their lecturers, something that he has to take into account when he wants to take some actions”.

Other employees also criticised Avi. For instance, Zahi (I.M.Int. 26.05.02) complained: “In my opinion the president of this company [Avi] needs to be more involved. He needs to come down to the people a bit. People are fighting his war here and he doesn’t do anything. The man doesn’t do anything except to be buried in his office”. When asked in the interview how Avi could be more involved, Zahi (I.M.Int. 26.05.02) answered that Avi “needs to update us on what’s happening for example”. Avi (Man.Int. 29.04.02) himself acknowledged, when he was asked about his job definition, that he supervises and controls and is less personally involved, leaving personal involvement to the academic staff. As a result Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) maintained that “There is a lack of confidence in the institution” and he even claimed that “The students don’t know who Avi is”.

In order to see if the students are familiar with Avi as well as with other managers, in Student Survey 02, question 24 (see Appendix B) asked ‘Who are the managers of the University and of the Israeli Company, and what is their job?’ This question allowed listing several names. While only 23 students knew who Avi is and only 20 knew who Zvi is, 68 students knew who Sharon is although one student did complain that “Sharon - it is unclear what is her job. They didn’t bother to announce and this is a lack of respect for the student”. One even said that “Vered is the manager”.
However, 44 students did not fill at all, while 26 students wrote something like “I don’t know/ I have no idea” or “I don’t know and this is very serious. There is a deep disconnection between the students and the managers - the students don’t know who the managers are at International University”. Others wrote “I don’t know who they are - we don’t see them and we don’t hear them” and “I’ve never seen them and hear about them anything. Where are the conferences that they promised us when we enrolled?”

This comment by a student demonstrates that there is dissatisfaction with some of the faculty at International University, but it is not clear whether this is with the managers or with the marketing department. Therefore, to address this issue as well as to further examine the type of contact that there is between the employees of the university and the students, it was necessary to research how the students regard different members of the faculty. These were categorised into managers, marketing department, administration and lecturers. Accordingly, four questions on satisfaction with managers, marketing department, administration (referred to as secretariat) and lecturers were created in Student Survey 02 (see questions 15, 21, 23 and 26 in Appendix B).

The first of these four questions to be presented is number 26 on management, which stated:

26. Rank your satisfaction with the management of the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: ________________________________________________________________

The results were as follows:
Figure 4.3 – Satisfaction with Management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students’ reasons for the ranking (50% filled the reasons):</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1-4</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsuccessful management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no concern for students and no contact with students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We don’t see, don’t hear, and don’t know who they are!!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They didn’t help me when I needed help.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don’t feel the management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are not connected enough to the customers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They don’t have a regard for students feedback (like this one).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The responsibility of the promise that the studies will take two years is on the management.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A part of the 40 respondents still wrote reasons:

- I didn’t come across them, I have no idea.
- I didn’t really know the management.
- This is not relevant.
- We don’t see them except Sharon.
- I didn’t come across them.
- I almost don’t know them and this is a serious disadvantage. We have no ceremonies, motivation conversations, etc.

Table 4.2 – Satisfaction with Management
Reviewing the graph in the previous page (Figure 4.3) and its quantitative data, one may conclude that the students are overall relatively satisfied from the management of the university, since they did receive a high average rank of 6.858407. However, examining the qualitative data in table 4.2 in the previous page reveals that the highest ranks of 9 and 10 were only given to the manager Sharon. Taking these out would reduce the average rank to 5.61702. Furthermore, since some of the ranks between 5 and 8 were given to Sharon (especially 8s), this means that the average without Sharon may be even lower. This means that managers such as Avi or Zvi have gotten a very low grade from the 153 students in the sample.

In addition, not only have the managers of the institution received a low rank with numerous complaints (see table 4.2 on the previous page), but also 40 of 153 respondents (26%) did not fill the rank. This is much too high a percent that illustrates they are not acquainted with the management of International University, i.e. that there isn’t enough contact between the managers and the students of the university. To examine whether this lack of communication coupled with numerous complaints occurs in the marketing department, question 15 was created in Student Survey 02, which stated:

15. Rank your satisfaction with the marketing department at the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: ____________________________________________

The results were as follows:
Chapter 4 - Findings

Question 15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>15</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>25</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rank</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average: 5.727272
Standard Deviation: 2.451825

*21 did not fill

Figure 4.4 – Satisfaction with Marketing Department

Students’ reasons for the ranking (59% filled the reasons):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1-4</th>
<th>5-8</th>
<th>9-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| They lied to us.     | They talk nicely about things that they don’t honor. | There are problems in the secretariat - I waited half a year for the 500 Shekels of the ‘friend brings a friend’.
| Simply a lie.        | They said a lot of things that didn’t exist at all! | They are professionals but they have to be in contact with the students that already study.
| There is no connection between what was promised in written and what has actually happened. | Compare to other institutions, International University in anonymous. | They did their job.
| There is no marketing. | They gave a good feeling but I was disappointed. | They show dedication but when you arrive to the secretariat the impression is ruined.
| It became clear that everything that was said is not true. | There is not enough marketing-advertising in the radio and in the newspapers. | My friends.
| Liars.               | They paint the picture in pink without presenting the bad things. | Aggressive marketing is good to the institution, but it was promised only two years of studies and actually it is impossible, and they had to tell as that.
| Fallacious information concerning several things. | Aggressive marketing is good to the institution, but it was promised only two years of studies and actually it is impossible, and they had to tell as that. | The things that were said were not fitting the reality.
| They have to improve the marketing department. | They have to improve the marketing department. | They are not attentive enough to the customers.
| They don’t say the truth. | They don’t say the truth. | They don’t say all the truth.
| They are not attentive enough to the customers. | They didn’t help convincing. | They didn’t help convincing.
| They don’t say all the truth. | They don’t really say what’s happening. | They didn’t help convincing.

*21 of the 153 respondents (14%) didn’t fill the rank but still some of them wrote some reasons:

- There is a lot to improve.
- I didn’t get information about this department.
- I don’t know the department.
- I don’t know the marketing department.

Table 4.3 – Satisfaction with Marketing Department
Studying the graph in the previous page (Figure 4.4) and its quantitative data, it can be seen that the marketing department received a relatively low rank of 5.727272. The qualitative data in table 4.3 in the previous page supports this low grade of the marketing department. It emphasizes that for many students the personnel of the marketing department are perceived as liars, making promises that they cannot keep such as the 'One Year Programs'. Students enrolled expecting to start these programs and were naturally disappointed when the programs were never implemented. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02), being aware of this situation, noted: “The only failure was that it [the concept of the 'One Year Programs'] was not implemented. It could have been easily implemented and after one year would have provided a job. Then you can take a potential student to a classroom and that’s it, the students recommend. But the motivation of the employees went down because it was not implemented and we turned out liars. I understand the employees, they can’t lie”.

The personnel of the marketing department did feel frustrated with this situation. As Tal (I.M.Int. 28.05.02) noted, “They [the management] place the marketing employees in an inconvenient situation because all the time things are changed and the marketing employees look like liars”. However, in several cases when the people in the marketing department did not look like liars and were even give a high rank, the students did complain on other the secretariat of International University. Therefore, Student Survey 02 raised the following question:

21. Rank your satisfaction with the secretariat at the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: __________________________________________________________

The results to this question were as follows:
### Question 21

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Number of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average** 7.074829  **Standard Deviation** 2.186243

*7 did not fill*

![Figure 4.5 – Satisfaction with Secretariat](image)

**Students' reasons for the ranking** (59% filled the reasons):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1-3</th>
<th>4-6</th>
<th>7-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>They are antipathies. They are not willing to do anything. They are disgusting.</td>
<td>They don’t answer the phone.</td>
<td>I don’t blame them because they have no answers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is impossible to reach anyone.</td>
<td>They do not always answer nicely but Katia is wonderful!</td>
<td>It is lucky that Vered exists.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They don’t answer questions.</td>
<td>They help but they need to learn what kindness is.</td>
<td>There is need of improvement because there is no immediate response.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no answer.</td>
<td>There is no one to talk to.</td>
<td>Currently there is considerable improvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of professionalism except Katia.</td>
<td>It seems that we annoy them every time that we come to consult.</td>
<td>Improvement can be seen only lately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is hard to get to the secretaries because a lot of pressure and a lack of secretaries.</td>
<td>It is not a place that is fun to come and you know that it is fun to be helped in.</td>
<td>Sometimes their handling takes months.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It is hard to approach them.</td>
<td>Sometimes it takes more than a week to catch somebody.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>If you are not in the place it is impossible to reach them.</td>
<td>Now it is starting to get better.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Towards the opening of the semester it is impossible to reach someone.</td>
<td>They always help me.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>They are very nice.</td>
<td>[They're] professional, available and efficient.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Katia is really sweet.</td>
<td>They are very nice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rachel, the one that always helps me, is really nice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Examining the graph in the previous page (Figure 4.5) and its quantitative data, it could be concluded that the students are satisfied with the administration at International University and have thus given the relatively high average rank of 7.074829. However, reviewing the qualitative data in Table 4.4 does not fully support this. Reviewing the higher ranks between 7 and 10 demonstrates that some of the students that have given a high rank still feel the service they are getting from the secretaries is of low quality. For example, as the table reports, one complained "Sometimes their handling takes months" and another said "Towards the opening of the semester it is impossible to reach someone". One student was very emphatic and wrote "I don't blame them because they have no answers".

In this it seems that the students aren't blaming the secretaries for the situation at International University but rather other members of the organization. Since the managers and marketing department were presented already, it is important to complete the picture and see what the students think about the lecturers. Their thoughts will also enable to see which type of contact the students at International University have with the lecturers. Therefore, Student Survey 02 included the following question on the lecturers:

23. Rank your satisfaction with the lecturers at the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: ____________________________________________

The results to this are in the subsequent page.
Question 23

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.374149</td>
<td>1.585304</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 4.6 – Satisfaction with Lecturers**

**Students' reasons for the ranking (61% filled the reasons):**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>1-4</th>
<th>5-6</th>
<th>7-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The subjects are being taught in a very dry manner.</td>
<td>There are good lecturers and there are bad lecturers who don’t know how to teach.</td>
<td>In principle, high level lecturers. Most of the lecturers are very good.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low level lecturers.</td>
<td>Some are good and some are really bad!</td>
<td>The lecturers are fine, the content is not something.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half - 1 Half - 10</td>
<td>There are lecturers who don’t know how to teach the material.</td>
<td>Most of the lecturers are teaching in an interesting way.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some of the academic staff must be replaced since they are not knowledgeable in their work.</td>
<td>It is possible to talk with them, to approach them.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Excellent.</td>
<td>The lecturers are indeed familiar with the material and teaching in a very interesting way.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reviewing the quantitative data in figure 4.6, it can be seen that the students are relatively satisfied with the lecturers at International University and have consequently given them the average rank of 7.374149 (which is higher than any of the other three groups). The qualitative data in table 4.5 also supports this. Even some of those who gave lower ranks are more satisfied than they let on. For example, one student gave a rank between 1 and 4, writing that half of the lecturers are
ranked 1 while the other half are ranked 10. Although the average is 5 and thus the rank should have been 5 as well, the student ranked under 5, demonstrating that the problem of International University is not with the lecturers. Therefore, it is important to examine whether the students are satisfied with other issues that compose academic quality such as facilities.

Facilities:
Are the employees and the students satisfied with the institution's facilities and library resources?

The research revealed that neither the employees nor the students are satisfied with the institution's facilities and library resources. Below are some non exhaustive quotes from employees on this:

- **Dafna** (I.M.Int. 27.05.02): “About how this place looks like - there is a need to let people in here covered with plasters on their eyes like horses and then to give them an academic consultation”.

- **Regina** (R.M.Int. 12.05.02): “There is another important matter. The building is old. The walls and everything are really unpleasant and this is also important. The students pay a big sum of money and they want to enter first of all to a clean building. It is not a lot of money to paint the walls, to buy some flowers, it is enough. It is very important... The students sit here about 6 hours a day. I don’t talk about us anymore that we [the employees] are sitting here all day long. There are potential students who come with their parents”.

- **Tatiana** (I.M.Int. 25.04.02): “Maybe there is a need to do an esthetical treatment to this building”.

In Student Survey 02, the students also complained about the facilities, as the following examples illustrate:
• "I would improve the place of the studies - the library is too small, there is no suitable cafeteria, everything costs a lot of money and there is a feeling that they give the minimum concerning the conditions".

• "It is possible to improve the library”.

• "There is no convenient furniture”.

• "To improve the building. They do it but too slowly, especially the elevator”.

• "Out of date building that demands handling”.

• "In a higher education institution, the building is much more like a ruin and isn’t suitable to occupy an academic institution”.

• "If there was a bigger library and many more books, then it was better plus computers”.

The students interviewed mirrored these complaints:

• **Lior** (S.Int. 01.05.02): “They want to improve all the time. I have no doubt about that. They really want and this is the problem. They know that it makes a bad impression on the students. But all the logistic planning is defective... I don’t believe that it is a matter of money. To change carpets and to paint the walls does not cost millions. A normal cafeteria, elementary conditions were supposed to be in a place that a few hundreds of students - no, hundreds of people - are walking around in”.

• **Tami** (S.Int. 06.05.02): “The conditions are unbearable. For example, we have no cafeteria. All the conditions that are overall elementary conditions for students who come to be here a half of their day and pay a lot of money. When I enrolled they say to me that soon the place is moving [to another building] and it didn’t happen and also it is not going to happen”.

The last two quotes insinuate that management was aware the low level conditions of the building. Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) noted that she want to renovate a bit, to build a cafeteria, to put flowers during a holiday or a flag on Independence Day. Indeed, management has been aware of the problem for a long time. A Location Study (SMR.Doc. 03.01) was conducted by an external market research firm, examining two alternative buildings. Since the results were not positive, the management of International University decided not to relocate. However, they did not update all of the employees on this decision, such as those from the marketing department.

As Sonia (R.M.Int.27.05.02) commented, “they [the management] said that the institution is moving to another location and then without informing anyone I by accident discovered that they don’t move to another place. They said that they are going to overhaul the place. I wanted to show the potential students a simulation of the overhaul in order to show them why they are going to pay so much money. I said to Yevgeni: they don’t do any overhaul. And they didn’t do anything and a lot of people came and asked what about the overhaul. Marketing is built on trust! In the meantime, the people see that there is no overhaul and there are no other things and I look in the eyes of the customers and I am on their side”.

In this, Sonia demonstrates that she realizes that the unfulfilled promises have damaged the image of the university in the eyes of its customers, the students, as the following student quote illustrates: “Later they promised overhaul and I am already finishing the first year of the studies and we don’t see any overhaul” (Tami, S.Int. 06.05.02). This dissatisfaction could create customers who might not recommend the university to other
potential students. For example, Dafna (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) recounted that “I was very embarrassed from two serious potential students who came here. They met some students in the hall and the students told them harsh things about the place and they cancelled their enrolment because of that. If the students of the place say [negative] things, no marketing man can help. However, in the last half a year, there are more people who come here because of their friends who are students here at my surprise. So maybe something has been getting better”. Tal (I.M.Int. 28.05.02) also maintained that “Even though the look of the building and the atmosphere in the halls, there are still students who recommend on the place”. One possible reason for this could be the quality of the students, which is discussed next.

*Quality of students:
How significant to the students is with whom they will study?*

In order to address this question, it must be understood that International University has two main student segments: the Israeli sector and the Russian sector. As Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) put it: “Most of the people who choose International University are from the Russian sector. The Israeli sector chooses [International University] because it is not possible for them to go to another alternative. It is an option for them to get an academic diploma for [higher] salary ranking or for practical engineers to complete to an academic diploma”. This was corroborated by Boris (S.Int. 20.03.02), who noted that one of the reasons that he enrolled is because he saw a lot of Russian speakers. To address this issue indirectly, the following question was built in Student Survey 02:

28. Rank your satisfaction with the ambience at the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: ________________________________
The results to this question are presented below:

![Graph showing satisfaction with ambience](image)

**Figure 4.7 – Satisfaction with Ambience**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students' reasons for the ranking (52% filled the reasons):</th>
<th>1-4</th>
<th>5-7</th>
<th>8-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>We don’t feel among friends and family. There is a need to improve as soon as possible.</td>
<td>Maybe they should bring more Israelis.</td>
<td>A lot of Russian speakers - there is an unpleasant feeling when hearing only Russian.</td>
<td>We feel the ambiance only in the smoking room where we can speak to somebody.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They don’t care about the ambiance, so why should we?</td>
<td>Most of the people don’t “believe” in International University.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A very nice ambiance and fun.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is an ambiance like they did us favors and a low level of studies.</td>
<td>A warm and social ambiance among the students and also with the lecturers.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A warm and social ambiance among the students and also with the lecturers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no campus ambiance.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Good friends.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is an ambiance of uncertainty in the air concerning the future of the institution.</td>
<td>The ambiance is not good and not bad.</td>
<td>We are all on the same wave.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a lot to improve.</td>
<td>They don’t emphasis enough to forbid smoking in the area and the ones who don’t smoke are suffering.</td>
<td></td>
<td>A great bunch of guys, a fun learning ambiance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A lot of complains and uncertainty concerning the continuation of the institution.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nice people.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4.6 – Satisfaction with Ambience**

Reviewing the quantitative data in figure 4.7 illustrates that overall the students are relatively satisfied from the ambience at the university and have thus given the average rank of 7.081632. Examining the qualitative
data in table 4.6 reveals that one of the main reasons for either a high rank or a low rank is the students that they study with. For example, a student wrote “Maybe they should bring more Israelis” and another even noted “A lot of Russian speakers - there is an unpleasant feeling when hearing only Russian”. For these students, it is significant to study with more Israeli students in order for them to perceive the university as of high academic quality. However, one student gave a low rank, noting “There is an ambiance like they did us favours and a low level of studies” and in this demonstrated the importance of the outcomes from the studies to achieve academic quality.

Outcomes:

How significant to the students is the subject of the practical outcomes from the studies?

As to be expected, practical outcomes are very significant to the students. After all, as noted on page 16 in the introduction chapter, International University offers bachelor's degrees in Business or Professional Studies with career concentrations in business, software development, travel and tourism, hotel-restaurant management, and public relations and media-communications. Just these subjects create expectations of highly practical studies. Indeed, question 17 (see Appendix B) in Student Survey 02 asked ‘What were your expectations when you enrolled to the studies?’, to which 46 out of the 153 students replied practical outcomes and 41 noted they expected a high level of studies\(^2\). In other words, to overall 87 students (nearly 57%) the outcomes were very significant when enrolling.

\(^2\) The students' expectations will be presented in detail towards the end of this chapter in the subsection on the effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts.
To the enrolled students the outcomes are even more significant. “People are afraid from what they could do with this academic diploma, if they would be accepted at work, if they would be able to continue their studies to M.A.” (Masha, I.M.Int. 05.05.02). This student anxiety has existed for several years already at International University. In a survey of 95 students conducted by an external market research firm, entitled the Level of Student Anxiety of Finding a Job in the Study Area (SMR.Doc. 12.00), it was noted that the students have a high level of anxiety in finding a job in their field of study and that some of the students do not hold the degree in high esteem.

This anxiety was also relevant for the 'One Year Programs'. As Dorit (I.M.Int. 29.04.02) commented: “The question is how others outside would look on a professional diploma that the students get here? This is the question of this concept of the 'One Year Programs'”. These fears were not without a basis. “According to people [former students] who called up their friends [in the marketing department], I can say that there is a problem in finding a job and in being accepted onto second degrees in Israeli universities with the academic diploma of International University” (Dafna, I.M.Int. 27.05.02). In order to further understand the importance of practical outcomes the following two questions were created in Student Survey 02:

18. Rank your satisfaction with the content of the studies at the university:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: ____________________________________________

19. Rank your satisfaction with the level of studies at the university:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: ____________________________________________
The answers to question 18 were as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 18</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.651006</td>
<td>1.653591</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Graph showing the distribution of ranks for Question 18](image)

Figure 4.8 – Satisfaction with Content of Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students' reasons for the ranking (64% filled the reasons):</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1-3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low level and too many general courses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History, psychology, physics, why?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low level lectures and low level students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Courses that are not connected to the degree.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We don't do anything.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4-8</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half of the lecturers don't know the material.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Since I study programming, why I should study History?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bad video-conference.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The material of the professional courses is sometimes stupid.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don't like History.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video-conference and lecturers who don't teach.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The dates available are not always comfortable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recently there has been a big improvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Too many History lessons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9-10</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very unnecessary to study 4 courses in History.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History is unnecessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The material is interesting and presents the real-life field to the students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High level lecturers with experience</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.7 – Satisfaction with Content of Studies

Reviewing the quantitative data in figure 4.8, it would seem that overall the satisfaction with the content is relatively high, since the average rank given was 6.651006. However, the qualitative data in table 4.7 suggests that the students are highly dissatisfied with some of the unpractical courses, especially History. Some of the students that gave a high rank (9 or 10)
also complained on this issue, which was also corroborated by question 19 in the Student Survey 02:

![Bar chart showing the satisfaction with level of studies](image)

**Figure 4.9 – Satisfaction with Level of Studies**

### Students' reasons for the ranking (53% filled the reasons):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-4</td>
<td>Low level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The level should rise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There are lessons that are simple, a waste of time, and it is a shame.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In the general courses the level of the lecturers is high, but in the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>computer courses it is sometimes just bad.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-8</td>
<td>The videoconferencing spoils everything.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There are some lecturers who don’t know to teach the material.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It should be on a higher level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recently there is an improvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relatively easy studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some subjects are not arranged according to the study program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some of the studies are superficial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-10</td>
<td>In most cases investing and understanding are required to succeed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The studies could be on a much higher level but they ask too much in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>courses that do not belong to the subject.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5-8</td>
<td>Relatively easy studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some subjects are not arranged according to the study program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some of the studies are superficial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-10</td>
<td>In most cases investing and understanding are required to succeed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The studies could be on a much higher level but they ask too much in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>courses that do not belong to the subject.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4.8 – Satisfaction with Level of Studies**

Here too the quantitative average rank was high (6.838926), but the qualitative data revealed that the students wanted a high level in the professional courses and not in other courses. One student, giving a high rank, nevertheless noted that “they ask too much in courses that do not belong to the subject”. The students perceive that academic quality has to do with practical outcomes. Why they perceive academic quality as they do is also influenced by the extent of integrated marketing at the university.
2. Present extent of integrated marketing at the university.

This second subsection of the main findings first discusses whether there was a tendency in International University's marketing towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs. This review is followed by highlighting the problems that occurred at International University and how these problems were part of the causes that initiated integrated marketing at the university. Then, in the context of the 7th step of the "evolution of integrated marketing, the findings on the components of promotion, segmentation and market research, positioning, and enrolment management will presented in detail. The three levels of integration at International University - strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration - are now considered next. The last two questions, on the staff understanding the importance of integrated marketing and on their ability of the employees to explain the institutions' market niche and its competitive advantages, will set the stage for the third subsection of the main findings, entitled ‘Past management of change: implementation of integrated marketing’.

**Was there a tendency in International University's marketing towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs?**

In order find out which tendency existed at International University and thereby begin to understand the extent of integrated marketing at the university, it was necessary to compare each of the 4 Ps to its relevant counterpart in the 4 Cs.

**Product vs. customer solution:**

*In order to answer the customer's needs, how do the employees know the customer's expectations?*
Initially it seemed that International University did not try to sell its existing products, i.e. the former curriculums, but rather tried to provide a customer solution and consequently developed the 'One Year Programs'. However, the marketing department was selling these programs for awhile although it was known these programs never took off. In this, the university was not providing a customer solution but rather trying to sell its current product (i.e. the academic degrees) by promising the 'One Year Programs'. In addition, as noted earlier in this chapter, the students' expectations were not researched in a systematic manner, but were rather based on Yevgeni's personal knowledge of the market. Although Yevgeni did not actually research the students' expectation, he was nonetheless very connected to the market and thus took into account the cost to the students of the 'One Year Programs'.

*Price vs. customer cost:*

*Does the university consider the specific costs of a customer?*

The management of International University, especially Yevgeni, did consider the specific costs of the 'One Year Programs' for each student, especially when compared to other higher education institutions. "There is something similar [in the 'One Year Programs'] to other institutions, but it is also different because [in the programs of other institutions] the students must study additional hours and pay extra money. Here at International University the 'One Year Programs' were a part of the [academic] studies and without extra" (Tania, I.M.Int. 24.04.02). The managers at the university understand that "Because of the [unemployment] situation, people are afraid to invest a big sum of money without knowing what is going to come out of this" (Tatiana, I.M.Int. 25.04.02). Moreover, the managers of International University realized that the studies cost much
more to a student who cannot work when compared to a working student. “Flexibility in the hours of the studies is an advantage not only for working full time people, but also for people who work in a temporary job like waiters who really want to study” (Dafna, I.M.Int. 27.05.02). Therefore, it would seem that costs are connected to convenience.

Place vs. convenience:

Does International University consider the convenience of the customers, e.g. flexibility in study hours or various means of studies?

As stated in the previous paragraph, International University did take into consideration the convenience of the student in flexibility of study hours. As one student put it: “It is the only place that it is possible to work full time and to finish an undergraduate degree in 3 years...I was accepted to an Israeli university but finally I decided to continue working” (Roman, S.Int. 16.05.02). In Student Survey 02, question 16 (see Appendix B) asked ‘Why did you decide to enrol here and not to another institution?’ To this, 33 students (nearly 22%, more than any other single reason) replied that they enrolled at the university because of the convenient study hours that gave the possibility to combine work with study.

In addition, the university took into consideration other issues such as enrolment dates. Lior (S.Int. 01.05.02) commented in his interview that he didn’t have to wait until the winter to enrol like in other Israeli institutions and he could start studying right away. In Student Survey 02, responding to question 16, overall 20 students of the 153 in the survey (a little over 13%) commented that the convenience of immediate enrolment was one of the reasons they enrolled. Furthermore, International University even took
into account the physical location of the institution in the convenience considerations.

Boris (S.Int. 20.03.02) said that one of the reasons that he enrolled was because of International University's location. In Student Survey 02, responding to question 16, overall 7 students of the 153 in the survey (nearly 5%) commented that the location of the university was one of the reasons they enrolled. In the Location Study (SMR.Doc. 03.01), which was undertaken by an external market research firm, a preliminary stage for conducting a student survey on the two alternative buildings was conducted by interviewing 18 students. Of these students, 8 (nearly 45%) noted the current location as one of the reasons for enrolling. As noted earlier in this chapter, since the results on the location of the two alternative buildings were not positive, the management of International University decided not to relocate. However, this decision was not communicated enough to either students or even employees of the marketing department. As Sonia (R.M.Int.27.05.02), quoted on this earlier, complained, “they [the management] said that the institution is moving to another location and then without informing anyone, I, by accident, discovered that they don’t move to another place”.

Promotion vs. communication:

Does the approach of two-way communication process exist in International University (where the various marketing communication devices are coordinated) or is it the one-way communication process of downward promotion?

The research at International University discovered that the approach to communication at the university is that of one-way downward promotion,
with the various marketing communication devices not being coordinated. As Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) noted “There must be coordination and synchronization between the different departments and the employees. There must be cooperation. Not as giving directions but by setting a personal example. If others see that you are listening and advising, they will do it with you too. At the level of real action, I am connected to my secretaries, they know. I don’t like these sections that fit the KGB and not a small organization”.

Some of the reasons for this lack of coordination will be made clear later in this chapter. However, in the third subsection of the main findings on the implementation of integrated marketing, a key reason for this is negative communication situation was Avi. As Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) noted, “Avi was a high ranking officer in the army so it is like the army here. I feel that I need to call him 'commander' and this is his way of management”. Others agree with her. Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02): “I would expect to be more involved in decision making. The problem was that usually the decisions were made almost without cooperation with the one who was supposed to carry them out. They took a decision and then they dropped it down on the marketing department”. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02): “One of the biggest problems of this organization is that he [Avi] built a hierarchy similar to the army. He is on top, after that there are the 'colonels' and after that their deputies… The students don’t see them”.

As noted earlier in this chapter, in response to question 24 in Student Survey 02 that asked ‘Who are the managers of the University and of the Israeli Company, and what is their job?’, only 23 students knew who Avi and only 20 knew who Zvi is. As Yael (M.Int. 13.05.02) put it: “It is important for me to say that there must be contact here between the senior
management and the students. There is need of an effort to work on the lack of trust that was created. Decision-making needs to be done in cooperation and not by directions... The management needs to be connected to the students and not to be afraid of braking distance. The management must adapt the 'open door' policy and not just say that. When a student dares to call them, they turn him away. They have to be with the students during the breaks, in the cafeteria, to touch them”. In this, Yael is not only showing the lack of contact between senior management and the students, but also her own low morale caused by those managers, which is one of the subjects raised by the following question.

Did one or more of the following problems occur at International University and were these problems the causes that initiated integrated marketing?

- Difficulties in student recruiting in primary recruiting market
- Difficulties in fundraising among alumni and core contributors
- High tuition discount rate
- Organizational lethargy and poor morale
- High administrative and faculty turnover
- Weak, inaccurate, or inconsistent image
- Over dependency on tuition and tuition increase
- Small or decreasing endowment or tapping endowment to meet operating expenses
- Inability to respond to problems and opportunities in a timely fashion

Reviewing these subjects, it was immediately clear that neither 'difficulties in fundraising' nor 'endowment' have any relevance for International University, since the extension was managed by a private Israeli company
whose income was solely from the students. However, since this automatically means that there is an over dependency on tuition and tuition increase at the university (as stipulated by the seventh problem in the previous page), student recruiting is central for the success of International University. Accordingly, it is not surprising that the subsequent problem existed at the institution:

- **Difficulties in student recruiting in primary recruiting market**

There were difficulties in student recruiting, which resulted in a substantial decrease in enrolment. According to Student Registration Data (SMR.Doc. 02.04.02), comparing the January-March 2002 semester to that of the January-March 2001 semester, 65 students enrolled versus 87 previously, i.e. a decrease of 25%. As Igor (I.M.Int.30.05.02) commented: “I wouldn’t say a decrease. I would say a 'fall' according to what I have seen lately”. Gavri (Man.Int.22.05.02) agreed that “There is a crash in enrolment”, trying to explain it as follows: “It is also because of environmental reasons, not only local reasons, [i.e.] the economic and employment situation”. Several members of the university also gave similar explanations.

According to Tania (I.M.Int. 24.04.02), the decrease in enrolment is due to “the security situation in Israel, since usually in this time of the year there isn't less enrolment. Also, the economic situation of the market influences us. There are a lot of unemployed people who have no money so they can’t enrol”. Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02): “From what I see there is a decrease in enrolment. The reason is that first of all the market is difficult at the moment. People don’t have work, there is a difficult security situation and to spend $5,000 a year for studies is a lot of money. You know, there are
some students at the moment who are cancelling or freezing their studies because they were fired from their job”.

Natali (R.M.Int.14.05.02) agrees with Yosef, noting: “Sure there is a decrease in enrolment. It is because of the situation with the economy. A working potential student wants to study but how can he commit himself to 60,000 shekels if tomorrow he doesn’t know if he will be working or not. This situation exists not only here”. However, Gilad (I.M.Int.01.06.02) doesn’t concur with Natali, maintaining that “The place is falling, not taking off to anywhere and this is an institution that is supposed to teach Business Management. There is a crisis and the place not taking off. It is impossible to excuse this with the economic situation because it is a fact that the competitors are taking off”. In addition, the high costs of the studies are also not a completely valid excuse, since the problem of high tuition discount rate exists.

- **High tuition discount rate**

According to Early Registration for New Students (SP.Doc. 19.03.02), students that would enrol during March and April 2002 for the September semester of that year would receive an overall tuition discount of 3,000 NIS (New Israeli Shekels). Students that would enrol during March and April 2002 for the June semester of that year would receive an overall tuition discount of 2,000 NIS plus a trip abroad for two people. In addition, any student registering for the June semester could also choose the discount of 3,000 NIS offered to the September semester without the trip abroad. Several days after the Early Registration for New Students document, International University came out with its Price List (SP.Doc. 21.03.02), which on top of the discounts given those who register early,
also included discounts for soldiers who have just finished their military service. The high tuition discounts in these documents demonstrate the severity of the enrolment problem. Tal (I.M.Int.28.05.02) offered one possible explanation for this problem: “Yes, there is [a decrease in enrolment]. This is because of lethargy and demoralization of the employees and the marketing”.

- Organizational lethargy and poor morale

During the interviews, the organizational lethargy and poor morale at International University quickly became evident. Some employees showed this by criticizing the management of the university in a direct manner. Batya (L.Int. 28.05.02): “The treatment of the lecturers here is disgraceful. [Here she asked if it is sure that the interview is anonymous.] The management is problematic. The message that they pass to students is problematic. Eventually I don’t think that the students respect the place where they study. At the moment the students respect the lecturers who teach them, they will also like to come here. We, I mean most of the lecturers, are very not optimistic”. Gilad (I.M.Int. 01.06.02): “It doesn’t seem that the management upstairs wants to improve anything. The place is dead in my opinion. They already came to a situation where it is not the market that knocked them down but they knocked themselves”.

Others revealed their low morale by mentioning the salaries. For example, Gavri (Man.Int. 22.05.02) complained a lot about the lecturers’ salaries and compared them to other Israeli universities. Regina (R.M.Int. 12.05.02) said that “Even for new immigrants the salary is not good” and then she laughed. Vered (A.Int. 26.05.02) showed her frustration, noting: “All of a sudden they say: ‘this is for you to handle’. I am hurt from that. What, are
they getting their salary from a different place?” Vered (A.Int. 26.05.02) first insinuated that there is another underlying problem affecting morale (as well as why she was given more to handle) by saying: “The problem is manpower... We are left such a small staff today and the problem is that we are doing everything”. Later in her interview, she explained exactly what the problem is: “There was a wave of layoffs and then another wave of layoffs. There is a feeling that the sword is on the neck. The staff understands that there is a need to minimize the employees in the current situation, but this is the wrong use of manpower. If the staff is exhausted they don’t gain”.

• **High administrative and faculty turnover**

Not all agree with Vered that the high administrative and faculty turnover has a negative effect on morale. For example, Yael (M.Int. 13.05.02), who is the assistant to the marketing manager, commented: “Today, because a lot don’t work here anymore, the staff has been reduced so the frustration has been reduced. Once there was a bad atmosphere among the secretaries. There was a feeling that they didn’t put student care in front of their eyes” (which is an expression in Hebrew meaning that student care wasn’t important to them). Nevertheless, most the interviewees did not agree with this view, arguing that the high administrative and faculty turnover at International University did not only affect morale but also created other problems.

Neta (A.Int. 10.05.02) complained that management thinks that if there are fewer students they can load more work on less secretaries, but actually the number of students doesn’t always influence the amount of work. Giving an example of how job belonging to a dismissed employee was chopped up
with part of it being passed to her in addition to her regular responsibilities, Neta (A.Int. 10.05.02) protested: “There are a lot of tiny jobs that today are being dropped down on many people”. Other employees were also fired. Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02): “Yevgeni fired me and said that they are making some changes, so there is no need of a manager [in telemarketing] and they also fired a big part of those in telemarketing”. Even some of the management was let go. Batya (L.Int. 28.05.02): “Every two days the manager of the branch has been changed. The management has been changed in a mad rhythm... Every manager arrives, tries to make some changes and after 4 months leaves. This is a bad message to the students, that they have no one to trust in here”. As Zahi (I.M.Int. 26.05.02) put it: “People [the students] saw a lot of firing so they are afraid. I have some friends that are studying here”. Indeed, the firing of employees damaged further the image of International University in the eyes of the students.

- **Weak, inaccurate, or inconsistent image**

The negative image of International University in the eyes of many of its students was caused by other difficulties in addition to its high administrative and faculty turnover. As noted earlier in this chapter, promises were not kept. International University, in context of the 'One Year Programs', “promised a job after the first year of the studies and they didn’t keep their promise” (Tania. I.M.Int. 24.04.02). Thus, Igor (I.M.Int. 30.05.02) commented: “I know that nothing from all these promises has been actually carried out... A lot of people got hurt from this and got bad impression from the institution”. To research just how low the actual image of International University was in its students' eyes, the following indirect question (see Appendix B) was developed for Student Survey 02:

17. To **how many** people have you **recommended to enrol** to the university?
The answers were as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0 persons</th>
<th>1 person</th>
<th>2 persons</th>
<th>3 persons</th>
<th>4 persons and up</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.9 – Recommendations by Students

From this data it can be seen that 60 of the 153 students (nearly 40%) did not recommend International University to anyone and only 15 students (less than 10%) recommended it to 4 persons or more. This reveals that many of the students do not have a positive image of the institution. However, this was not caused only by promises not kept to some of the students. As one student noted in her interview: “There are rumours that something is happening to this place and no one talks with us about it, approvals problems, budgets problem” (Tami, S.Int. 06.05.02). In this she is demonstrating the following inability of the management of International University:

- *Inability to respond to problems and opportunities in a timely fashion*

The management of the university did not respond to the rumours that were circulating and only said that everything is fine. Since these rumours were based on actual problems, such as the aforementioned decrease in enrolment, this damaged the university's reliability. As Tal (I.M.Int. 28.05.02) described it: “The place doesn’t give a feeling of reliability. People don’t need to be told that everything will be fine. This is bad. What is needed is to make it fine... There is a need to tell [the students] what is going on”. As one student at the last section in Student Survey 02, entitled ‘29. Further comments’ (see Appendix B), wrote: “This institution has a very high potential in my opinion. It is only needs to invest more in the students, in regular information that will reach them, in social events and
to repair the building for the convenience of the students". The university, due to these problems as well as to the previous ones discussed in this subsection, realized the need to be responsive to its students. Thus, it was decided to adopt integrated marketing as the institution's means of improving responsiveness. To understand the present extent of integrated marketing at the university, the following comprehensive subsidiary research questions were developed in the literature review chapter:

*According to the 7th step of the "evolution of integrated marketing", do the following components occur in the institution in order to achieve integrated marketing?*

- **Promotion**: Does an effort to promote the institution exist, if so how?

There was an effort to promote International University by various means. Yevgeni's external marketing company was hired to strengthen the university's sales force. The salespeople were also given a workshop to improve skills and increase motivation (*Sales and Telemarketing Workshop*, P.Doc. 11.06.02). The promotional efforts also included advertisements in newspapers, such as in the *Academic Guide 2002* (Pos.Doc. 02), or participating in the "2002 Studies-Exhibition: The National Fair for Education and Career" that took place during 19th, the 20th and the 23rd of June 2002 (an advertisement for this fair can be found in the *Academic Guide 2002* (Pos.Doc. 02), page 69. However, this promotion was limited and not always effective. Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) explained that the decrease in enrolment “happened because we have no tools to attract potential students. In order to market a product there should be some tools. If there is advertising like the Studies-Exhibition, it is not enough... People don’t know International University... There is not enough advertising of this place".
Other interviewees, such as Gilad (I.M.Int. 01.06.02), Gavri (Man.Int. 22.05.02), Dafna (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) and Sonia (R.M.Int. 27.05.02), agreed that International University is not known due to inadequate advertising. This was best expressed by Regina (R.M.Int. 12.05.02): “About the advertising, I think that it is a problem that people don’t know International University. People know the competitors and why? Because their name is everywhere. The psychology of people is that if there is advertising, even a few words and not lots of pages, so the company is on the ground. If there is only advertising once in a while and that’s it, it simply doesn’t work. One time advertising is useless. Advertising over time shows that the place is strong and stands on its feet”. To research whether promotion was effective at International University, the following question (see Appendix B) was developed for Student Survey 02:

12. How did you come to this university?

   Advertising / studies-exhibition / friend / was called by the university / other _______

The results were as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advertising</th>
<th>Studies-exhibition</th>
<th>Friend</th>
<th>Was called by the university</th>
<th>My own initiative</th>
<th>Internet</th>
<th>I saw a sign on the building of International University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Some of the 153 students marked more than one answer.

**Table 4.10 – How Students came to the University**

From this data, it can be seen that the leading reason that people came to International University was due to recommendations by a friend and not because of promotional means such as advertising or the studies-exhibition. This is somewhat surprising, since the data in the previous table (Table 4.9 – Recommendations by Students, page 243) revealed that nearly
40% of the 153 surveyed in Student Survey 02 did not recommend International University to anyone. It was not expected that recommendations by a friend would be the leading category. This thus demonstrates how limited advertising was and also raises the question whether or not any advertising was based on market research.

- **Segmentation and market research**: Is the chosen student's segment based on market research? Who is the target audience of the institution?

As discussed earlier in this chapter, systematic market research was never performed at International University. Therefore, there was never a chosen segment based on market research. As a result of this lack of research based segmentation, "The marketing department now works with lists of potential students that are not up-to-date" (Dorit, I.M.Int. 29.04.02). This also explains why there was a decrease in enrolment at the university. When asked about this decrease, Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02) answered: "As much as I know, yes [there is a decrease in enrolment]. Although they [the management] blame the market and say that there is a decrease in enrolment in other institutions as well, I would not look at what's happening with everybody else, but try even now to look what people want. Because had they would have done all the surveys that I wanted to do, they would know exactly what people want".

Therefore, since no systematic market research was conducted over time as well as no segmentation was carried out, it is not clear for the various members of International University who is the target audience of the institution. This is best seen in the following table, which summarises the data on this subject from selected interviewees:
### Table 4.11 – Past and Present Students

Reviewing this data, it immediately becomes apparent that there are contradictions among the managers of International University of who comprises the target audience of the institution. Indeed, other employees and gave similar contradicting responses in their interviews. For example, Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02) said that the present students are “Young working people who need flexibility in the hours of the studies”; while Batia (L.Int. 28.05.02) noted that the present students are from “The Russian new immigrant sector”. Even students gave such contradicting responses. One student commented that “If you look around, the majority of the students are Russians” (Lior, S.Int. 01.05.02). Another said that present students are “People who work in the field of their studies and need an academic degree for promotion” (Roman, S.Int. 16.05.02). Nonetheless, it may be argued that there is no contradiction between these two students, since one is an Israeli and another a Russian new immigrant, and therefore
each has a different perception of International University, i.e. the positioning of the university varies for each of them.

- **Positioning:** Why do the students choose International University? What is the competitive advantage of the institution?

In order to address these questions, question 16 in *Student Survey 02* (already partially discussed earlier in this chapter) asked ‘Why did you decide to enrol here and not to another institution?’ The answers were as follows:

- 33 students (nearly 22%, more than any other single reason) replied that they enrolled because of the convenient study hours that give the possibility to combine work with study.
- 20 students (a little over 13%) commented that the convenience of immediate enrolment was one of the reasons they enrolled.
- 12 students (nearly 8%) said that they enrolled because they got a recommendation.
- 8 students (over 5%) said that they enrolled because it is an international degree.
- 7 students (nearly 5%) said that the location of the university was one of the reasons they enrolled.
- The rest of the students gave different individual answers such as “Easy studies”, “A credited degree”, “Small classrooms” and even “I didn’t check another place”.

Examining their responses, it is not clear where the competitive advantage of International University lies. Other institutions offer convenient study hours, enable to enrol immediately, have students recommend them, are
extensions of international institutions, located in central areas or any of the other reasons that were given. Indeed, when asked in his interview why potential students choose International University and not another university, Igor (I.M.Int. 30.05.02) replied: “Between us, I have no idea. Honestly, there is nothing unique in International University compared to other places. Moreover, this place is not as known as other places. In my opinion, it is just because of the skills of the academic consultants. They can sell the ice to the Eskimos. Maybe this is a bit crude but there is no other explanation. The flexibility in the hours of the studies is offered by almost any institution. So the reason is the sympathy of the academic consultants. Except that, it is hard for me to know why. Sometimes maybe they find something in the study program that they couldn’t find in other places, but this reason is not necessarily the critical reason”.

Others, such as Dorit (I.M.Int. 29.04.02) and Dafna (I.M.Int. 27.05.02), agreed that International University does not have a competitive advantage when compared to other institutions. The 'One Year Programs' were intended to be the competitive edge of the institution and indeed the reaction of the potential students to them “was very positive because we had something that the others didn’t have” (Zahi, I.M.Int. 26.05.02). However, “Eventually we stopped selling the 'One Year Programs' because people complained that the 'One Year Programs' are not implemented” (Tania, I.M.Int. 24.04.02). This raises the question how did International University’s strategic planning change to not include the 'One Year Programs'.

- **Strategic planning**: Does the strategic plan create a viable fit between the organization's objectives, skills, and resources and its changing market opportunities? Are marketing issues elevated to the strategic
level? Does strategic planning address the real needs or does take place in a vacuum? How does the strategic plan stress accountability and continuing evaluation?

During the research, no strategic documents were found. When Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) was asked directly about the marketing strategy, he evaded the question. Thus, other questions on this subject were not asked because he showed a lot of tension. It was then realised that strategic planning did not take place at International University. Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) also confirmed this lack of planning in an indirect manner, when he said: “Today we sell what we can and what we have, with licenses from the Council for Higher Education.” Thus, a viable fit between International University’s objectives, skills, and resources to the changing market opportunities was not carried out. Although this lack of strategic planning will be returned to later in this chapter (when the marketing plan is discussed), the immediate issue is to see how enrolment management was conducted without the essential strategic planning.

- **Enrolment management:** Do faculty members talk with students about courses and careers, viewing themselves as members of the enrolment management effort? Was there an attempt by every employee in the institution to help with enrolment activities?

Some faculty members did talk with students but not all of them. Many members confined themselves to aiding the students in accordance with the position they at the university. For example, as a lecturer, Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02) was only focused on being a good lecturer: “My contact with students is a contact of a supporting and helping lecturer that is also a bit of a ‘sadist’ in making them work hard although sometimes they want me to
ease up. From my experience the students want a high academic level and practical experience, and they don’t want to be released earlier. They cry during the course when I make them work very hard and later they give me sky-high ratings”.

Some secretaries would help with choosing courses but not with career plans, while others noted that students “come for scheduling courses or to deal with some troubles that they have during the studies. Sometimes they come just to talk” (Katia. A. Int. 26.05.02). In the marketing department, there were also those who viewed themselves as part of the enrolment management effort. For instance, Regina (R.M.Int. 12.05.02) noted: “I’m like a first door here. My aim is to make a connection between a potential student and International University from the first moment that he gets here. That’s why when they start to study a big percent of them comes to me as a sister. They arrive here and tell me what they learn and about lecturers and ask for advice. The relations are warm… My job is to explain to a potential student and not to accompany him… But if we work just according to our job sometimes it is not right. I think that we work from all our heart. There is a need to do a bit more since it is the same organization. We should work together”. In this, Regina is demonstrating that while some employees attempted to help enrolment activities, these actions were taken in an informal manner without integration.

Are the three levels of integration - strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration - considered at International University?

• **Strategic integration:** Does International University include the assessment and meeting of target student needs through the allocation of strategic resources within the constraint of the institutional mission?
The research revealed that assessment and meeting of target student needs through the allocation of strategic resources to the 4 Cs within the constraint of the institutional mission was not carried out at International University. For example, in the context of the 'One Year Programs', it was necessary “to undertake a survey to see if they are popular and not just to count on somebody’s word” (Svetlana, M.Int. 06.05.02). Nevertheless, this problem was not unnoticed by management. Sharon with the aid of two consultants wrote a letter to Avi entitled Academic Accompanying (EM.Doc. 18.6.02), where they suggested that students would receive academic accompanying by lecturers based on the mission of the mother institution. The letter noted that one advantage of this academic accompanying is that it “would follow the student and identify needs in the market”. This suggestion, however, was not implemented by Avi.

- **Organizational integration**: Are the resources and sharing goals coordinated in the institution?

The answer to this question is also a negative one. Several interviewees remarked that organizational integration is necessary at International University. For example, Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02) said that “The only way that this organization can succeed is to integrate between its different factors”. Tania (I.M.Int. 24.04.02) agreed with this, noting: “We are very united in the marketing department and work together. I hope that we will work in cooperation with the secretaries”. Sonia (R.M.Int. 27.05.02) also agreed but was angrier when she complained: “They never made a connection between the advertising and the marketing. They did an advertisement and they paid for it 300,000 shekels [nearly £40,000] on the radio without any means for us to react. I couldn’t even send any material.
I don’t want to get into this”. Her anger was reflected in Yosef’s (I.Int. 19.04.02) comment: “It is impossible that someone will promise something that somebody else is supposed to honour without checking if this person can really honour the promise”. This lack of organizational integration affected message integration at the university.

- **Message integration**: Are all members of the institution communicating the same message in responding to students needs or is there a contradicting message to students? Are the messages consistent and coordinated? Are the messages driven by strategic decisions? Are the strategic messages consistent and coordinated, arriving to all the employees? Is the staff being updated about the 'One Year Programs'? What contact there is among the employees?

In context of the 'One Year Programs', the research revealed that members of International University were communicating contradictory messages that were not consistent and coordinated to the students. As Tania (I.M.Int. 24.04.02) noted, “We started to talk about the 'One Year Programs' and we began to sell them to people. When potential students enrolled and came to the secretaries, the secretaries didn’t know what they were talking about. There was a need to agree between the different employees of the institution that they will help the students with the 'One Year Programs'. They promised people [potential students] the 'One Year Programs' and they didn’t keep the promise. At the moment there are students that are studying the field of Marketing in Business Management and a lot of them were enrolled to the 'One Year Programs' but they don’t actually study in the 'One Year Programs' and slowly they are entering the regular academic studies".
The reason students received contradictory messages stemmed from the simple fact that the employees of International University did not receive consistent and coordinated strategic driven messages such as systematic updates on the status of the 'One Year Programs'. Even in the same department, employees had different information. For example, while Tatiana (I.M.Int. 25.04.02) said, "We stopped selling the 'One Year Programs' 5 months ago because then it turned out to me that they do not exist", Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) commented that the 'One Year Programs' "existed until a month ago". This demonstrates just how low the contact is between the employees of the university.

Yael (M.Int. 13.05.02) complained on this issue: "I work here for one and a half years and I don’t know all the employees. There is nothing that connects the employees together. I can come here sometimes and don’t see anyone. The fact that there is a party from time to time doesn’t solve it.” Numerous others also commented that there is a low level of contact between the members of the institution. For instance, Sharon (Man. Int. 29.04.02) noted: "I am coordinated with Zvi but we don’t really work together”. Katia (A.Int. 26.05.02) said that there is almost no contact with the marketing department except if they need some help with a potential student who needs explanations in Russian. Although Avi (Man.Int. 29.04.02) does initiate visits to the marketing department and sometimes meets the academic consultants and the marketing team, most of his contact with the marketing department is at the management level. Therefore, due to the lack of communication between the various role holders at International University, the answer to the following question is not surprising.
Are the employees able to explain the institutions' market niche and its competitive advantages based on the institutions' mission, vision, or values?

The answer to this question is a resounding 'no'. The employees would like to have such advantages to offer to potential students but they were not given any by the management of the university. As Dorit (I.M.Int. 29.04.02) described it: “I would add if I could during the academic consultation something that will distinguish us from other places. I have nothing to attract potential students with! That we could say: we are different than other places because we have this advantage”. The management of the university did not invest time in discussing with the employees various possible competitive advantages of International University.

Dafina (I.M.Int. 27.05.02): “In every meeting we raised a few things. It was more important to discuss the issue of what is the relative advantage [of the university] than to talk about how many telephone calls people make a day in the telemarketing... I can't understand this order of priorities. They [the management] asked us why in other places they can sell the Communication field and the Business Management field and we can't... If I didn't have to explain in the first 5 minutes of the phone conversation what is International University maybe it would be possible to sell it like in other places but there are also other problems that we must find a solution for them”. Consequently, integrated marketing became very important at the university.

Does the staff understand why integrated marketing is so important to the institution?
The staff of International University did understand the importance of integrated marketing to the university but only partially, since this, as other strategic issues, was never communicated to them clearly. However, the staff did understand intuitively that integration is needed among the various departments to address the decrease in student enrolment. For example, Tatiana (I.M.Int. 25.04.02) maintained: “In my opinion the contact between the marketing department and the secretaries should be more of cooperation. That there would not be any situations that if there is a change in plans we would not know and continue to sell what we have and eventually enrolled people will be cancelling”. Since, as described earlier in this chapter, this is exactly what happened, integrated marketing became critical for International University.

Dafna (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) agrees with this view and even recommends how to create integration: “It is worthwhile to undertake some consolidation activities with the employees outside of the work hours. It is needed because of the crisis and all the problems. I know that now the situation is difficult”. Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) offers other ideas on how to integrate the staff of the university: “The cooperation must be done through a personal example. In management meetings, people must work in synergy, in synchronization”. However, as presented in detail earlier in this chapter, cooperation did not occur at the university. To understand why cooperation did not exist at the university, increasing the importance of integrated marketing, the change process by which integrated marketing was implemented will be examined in the following subsection of this chapter.
3. Past management of change: implementation of integrated marketing.

This third subsection of the main findings analyses resistance to change and illustrates the levels of conflict at the university. Then, tactics used at International University to achieve political power are reviewed. Subsequently, the findings on how the president and top management actively initiated integrated marketing are presented, including the supporting actions undertaken to achieve institutionalization. Next, the "champion" that led the process of implementing integrated marketing and the team members that developed the 'One Year Programs' is discussed. Organizational changes, such as changes in the organizational structure, due to integrated marketing are considered. Internal marketing at International University concludes this subsection, setting the stage for the fourth and final subsection of the main findings, entitled 'Overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts'.

Did any resistance to change (of implementing integrated marketing) by individuals or by groups occur in the institution? If so, which type of resistance: sociological resistance, logical resistance or psychological resistance?

According to Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02), “There was resistance from the management to the 'One Year Programs'”, and thus to integrated marketing, which was the means to implement these programs. Sharon (Man.Int. 29.04.02) maintained that this resistance came from Zvi, who confirmed he offered resistance: “The One Year Programs”, Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) said and giggled. “I was one of those who resisted the 'One Year Programs'. Why? Because this is not an Israeli institution. This institution
is a branch. We have a product that we can’t change. The meaning of this is that I can sell what I have and not what I don’t have. The 'One Year Programs' gave us a lot of trouble and promises that we can’t keep. If the students learn a course they can’t get two diplomas, can they? Israeli institutions have a lot of possibilities. Today, I say to the academic consultants and the telemarketing to sell just what we have now.” Although, in this it seems that Zvi objected to the 'One Year Programs' due to logical resistance, it quickly became apparent that his real resistance was psychological, connected to personal conflict.

Did any kind of the following levels of conflict occur in the institution: intrapersonal conflict, interpersonal conflict or intergroup conflict?

All of these levels of conflict existed at International University. Intrapersonal conflict occurred for some of the people in the marketing department who had to sell the 'One Year Programs' but personally objected to them. For example, Gilad (I.M.Int. 01.06.02) commented: “It was very difficult for me to inform potential students about the 'One Year Programs'... The 'One Year Programs' attracted the potential students, I admit. But the question is whom you want to attract and this question was not asked. They simply wanted to attract. I had a problem with that because to study certain courses, there is a need to have certain [basic] knowledge that in the 'One Year Programs' did not have. There was really no academic thought behind the 'One Year Programs'. It is obvious that it was a marketing thought”.

Interpersonal conflict also existed at the university, occurring between several individuals. For example, conflict took place between Meital, the former manager of the Israeli Branch of International University, and
Gavri, the former academic manager. When asked why the function of academic manager does not exist anymore at the university, Gavri (Man.Int. 22.05.02) gave three reasons of which “The third reason is a personal reason. The former manager of the Israeli branch Meital didn’t get along with me. If the manager of the branch isn’t interested that’s what happens”. However, this interpersonal conflict between Meital and Gavri was not the biggest one at International University.

The largest conflict at the university transpired between Zvi and Yevgeni. As Gilad (I.M.Int. 01.06.02) observed, “They [the two marketing departments of the corporate and private sectors] spend money on marketing that they don’t use at all. It only happens because of the fight between Zvi and Yevgeni. They are not professionals. They are not real marketing people... I don’t know about what they fought and I didn’t go into it. But they were all the time in fight and all the time they were preparing cases on each other and ran to Avi”. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02), after leaving International University, demonstrated his frustration with Zvi when he said: “The current job of Zvi is unnecessary. There is need of one who is responsible for the corporate sector, one responsible for the private sector and one responsible for operations... Only Zvi with his secretary and one agent is 500,000 shekels a year. Just like that, thrown money”. This business approach was both popular and unpopular at International University.

Was there a conflict between the academic personnel and the business personnel in the institution?

There was a conflict between the academic personnel and the business personnel at International University. Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02) expressed it
by saying: “Personally I believe in this organization but it’s a shame that there are some factors here that are only interested in their own little piece of God’s land. They are not academic people and their only interest is to make money. I think that at last they brought someone like Sharon who is also a lecturer here to manage is a good direction since only an academic person can manage a higher education institution”. Sharon (Man.Int.29.04.02) confirmed that she doesn’t believe in just business, commenting: “In my opinion, it hurts the academic side. It is like a ‘package deal’. It is not a travel agency here”.

During the interviews it seemed that everyone agrees with her point. Batia (L.Int.28.05.02) criticized that “all that matters here is the economic side and not the academic side”. Yael (M.Int.13.05.02), as a member of the marketing department, said: “There is an impression here that this is a commercial business and not an academic one. A student is not only money, he is the future, [and] he is intelligent”. Even Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) seemed to support the academic side. He told that he resisted the 'One Year Programs', including their promises of work, and even the possibility that exists at International University to complete from a practical engineer to an academic degree in two years, noting that “We consulted with an advertising company and they recommended not doing this because it makes the place look 'cheap'”.

However, two weeks after his interview, a contradiction appeared in the interview of Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02), a former employee who was also a student at the university, who complained: “They promised me a job in the second year of the studies. Even Zvi promised”. Another former employee, Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02), also criticised Zvi by saying that although the university started to broadcast academic quality in their advertisements
“the company that managed International University's branch continued to use the marketing and advertising line of discounts and sales as the main marketing line whereas the studies and the academic seriousness were secondary marketing information... I said to Zvi that people want to study and that we have to change the advertising line. Zvi said O.K. and continued to do the same things. Zvi used to listen, say O.K., O.K. and then he keep doing what he wanted”. In this it seems that Zvi was focused on the commercial business aspects and not on academic quality. Indeed, when he was interviewed, he talked of the studies as if he were talking about a product and its sales. His attitude was business and not academic at all. Yet none of the current employees who complained on the over commercialization of International University gave his name as one of those who is business-oriented, thereby illustrating his political power.

Did one or more tactics exist that may be used to achieve political power occur in the institution: social exchange, alliances, identification with higher authority, control of information, selective service, power and status symbols, power plays or networks?

The research discovered that all of these tactics existed at International University. The one that was easiest to locate was the tactic of power and status symbols. Although systematic observations were not carried out for this research (as discussed in the methodology chapter), in some cases a researcher cannot avoid an opportunistic observation. This was the situation during the interviews, which usually were conducted in the rooms of the managers. When going to Avi's room, it was immediately observed that it is by far the largest and most lavishly decorated room of all the managers, giving him a power and status symbol. Of course, other tactics were used to achieve political power.
Social exchange existed. For example, Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) commented that “I had good communication with Narkis”. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) also noted that Narkis supported his initiative of the 'One Year Programs' and it is therefore probable that he was in a continuing social exchange with her, i.e. they formed an alliance. Other alliances naturally transpired. For instance, Yael (M.Int. 13.05.02) openly criticized the 'One Year Programs', saying in a negative way that they were “a sales tool that Yevgeni used in his marketing”. In this she was supporting Zvi, whom she was in an alliance with since she was his assistant and she was promoted when Yevgeni left the university.

In addition, Yael acquired political power because she was identified with Zvi's higher authority as a senior manager since she would represent him in numerous contacts with others as his assistant. Others gained political power by controlling information. For example, Zvi made sure that Yevgeni would not have direct contact with Avi. As Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) put it: “Until December I had a direct contact with Avi”. This allowed Zvi to control the information supplied to Avi, which was critical to his 'winning' the conflict with Yevgeni who was fired. Of course there are several additional reasons why Yevgeni was dismissed, one of them being the failure of his initiative, the 'One Year Programs'.

At the end of the day, the 'One Year Programs' were not implemented due to the tactic of selective service that Meital adopted to attain political power. As Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02) expressed it: “The 'One Year Programs' did not succeed only because of organizational politics. If Meital was the one offering these programs, I am sure that the programs would be running now in an excellent way”. Meital also used the tactic of power plays,
aggressively grabbing power from others, such as having Gavri dismissed from the position of the academic manager or taking Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02) “out from the meetings with public relations”, which he used to go to, filling in for Narkis.

However, Meital did not realize that Gavri and Yosef were part of the same network that also included Yevgeni. This network retaliated and within several months Meital was replaced by Sharon. Although it may be argued that she was not replaced solely because of the actions of the network, there were several clues that Sharon was a part of this network. For example, Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02) insinuated that Sharon was a member of the network by commenting that “Meital never consulted with me or was helped by me like I used to do before her time and as is happening today after her time”. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) was more direct: “The 'One Year Programs' did not succeed because they [the management] didn’t understand them. The former manager of the Israeli branch Meital didn’t implement them. Narkis started to implement them and Sharon is now. But for Meital and Avi, these [programs] were not on their minds”. This suggests that Sharon was part of the network. However, it also reveals problems the top manager of the university, Avi, had with the 'One Year Programs'.

_Did the president and top management actively initiate integrated marketing?_

Not only did the president and the top management not initiate integrated marketing, but also they even did not look highly upon the 'One Year Programs'. Avi (Man.Int. 29.04.02) said that to offer these programs lowers the academic degree, commenting “It doesn’t look serious”. Igor (I.M.Int.
Chapter 4 - Findings

30.05.02) recalled: “If after one year that I worked there Avi still asked what are the 'One Year Programs' and laughed about them, if the whole management doesn’t decide that this is a serious step and implement so there is no use in my opinion”. Indeed, there were problems with the top management's vision.

*What was their vision? What was their mission? Did they (the president and top management) initiate an integrated marketing plan that is based on these vision and mission?*

The vision of integrated marketing belonged to Narkis. As Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02) commented: “Narkis was a person to whom integration was very important”. However, integrated marketing was not important to Meital: “Until Meital arrived there was complete collaboration between everybody” (Yosef, L.Int. 19.04.02). Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) criticized the top management, saying that: “Somewhere they lost their vision and started to fall down. At the beginning, in the building of the [integrated marketing] system, there was no communication”. As a result, neither vision nor plan was developed. “The 'One Year Programs' did not succeed because there was a lack of a vision from senior management (Yosef, L.Re-int. 06.06.02)” who also did not fully support integrated marketing as discussed next.

*Did the president and top management actively support integrated marketing (and continue to support it in the present) in order to achieve institutionalization?*

Avi, the president, did not actively support integrated marketing. In his interview, he attempted to avoid the subject, saying some contradicting
things such as claiming that he is involved in the marketing decisions and has regular meetings with the marketing personnel but at the same time denying that he approved the 'One Year Programs'. "I didn’t approve these ideas of Yevgeni... They looked ‘fishy’ to me" (Avi, Man.Int. 29.04.02). It is therefore not surprising that Avi (Man.Int. 29.04.02) said: “I asked to terminate them [the 'One Year Programs'] about two months ago”. In this it can be immediately concluded that Avi was not the "champion" who led the implementation of integrated marketing.

Who was the "champion" that led the process of implementing integrated marketing? What did his job involve? Who were the team members that developed the 'One Year Programs'? Why were these people chosen?

Yevgeni was the "champion" who led the process. Even Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02), who was not a part of the team, noted that the idea was his: “Maybe the team developed these programs, but it [the idea] was Yevgeni’s. I will not take this from him”. “The team who created the 'One Year Programs' was composed of Yevgeni, a bit Narkis, a bit Gavri and me” (Yosef, L.Int. 19.04.02). According to Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02), three lecturers including himself were offered to be involved in the development of the 'One Year Programs' but "The other two lecturers weren’t so enthusiastic and they even giggled and said that this Yevgeni has a brain that produces money... That’s why in the end, Yevgeni stayed with me”.

- What were their goals? Was the team focus on enrolment management?

The team's goals, which were definitely focused on enrolment management, were made clear in the first meeting of Yosef with Yevgeni. “In the meeting, Narkis explained to us what this was all about, that the
goal is to improve the curriculum without going over the law. Then, Yevgeni arrived and this was the first time that I met him, which was about one and a half or two years ago” (Yosef L.Int. 19.04.02). It was in this meeting, according to Yosef, that Yevgeni presented his strategy.

- What was the strategy that they built on?

Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) offered the following strategy: “We said that in the first year they will study only the profession [the professional courses] and then we will help them find a job. After that there are two years left [to finish the academic diploma] and hence they will have two years of professional experience”.

- What were the strategic problems and what were the strategic solutions?

One strategic problem was how to handle the law of the Council for Higher Education, which stipulated that “the studies in the branch have to be as close as possible to the studies in the mother institution” (Yosef L.Int. 19.04.02). Yevgeni’s solution to this problem, according to Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02), “was brilliant. On one side to improve the curriculums by means of the workshops and on the other side the workshops are extra [hours] beyond the study hours and therefore they are not under the law of the Council for Higher Education”. Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) maintained that another strategic problem is that “in the International University it is impossible to do all the professional courses in one year”. Since this was a basic goal of the 'One Year Programs', it is important to see how the team handled this issue.
Chapter 4 - Findings

- How did the team members work together in order to achieve their common goals? How did they develop the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs'? How were the syllabuses of the 'One Year Programs' developed?

Yosef (L.Int. 19.04.02) addressed these questions: “My job was to go through the syllabuses and see which courses to put in the first year. We took all the courses from all the academic years and we checked which courses are the most attractive in order to enter them to the first year and we checked that this does not contradict the prerequisites. We had to check every course after it was chosen for the first year, to take the general comments of Yevgeni and to write a workshop for it. I sat with Yevgeni a couple of times until we reached the construction that looked good to us and we got to one page of a table, do you have that page? [This document entitled Proposal for First Year Studies (IM.Doc. 00) was collected, which was composed of two semesters, six courses per semester, the university's code for each course, the course's name, the practical workshops and the lecturer's name.] And then actually my job was finished. My job was to develop the academic syllabuses for the workshops. I also decided who will be the appropriate lecturers in my opinion”.

- Were there any problems in developing this new curriculum and if so what were the strategic solutions in addressing these problems?

It turned out that “to have an approval from the Council for Higher Education there is a need to add more hours because it is impossible to get two diplomas for the same courses. That is, there is a need to add more hours to the workshops in marketing in order to have the diploma and in this case it elongates the time for the academic diploma” (Tatiana, I.M.Int.
25.04.02). Regina (R.M.Int.12.05.02) criticized Yevgeni: “I worked with Yevgeni before. He has a head on his shoulders but has no experience in education. It is necessary to know the field and the current laws. Therefore, a person needs to build programs according to the law”. In this, she was insinuating that she was not involved in developing the programs.

- Was the staff involved in the development of the 'One Year Programs'?

Some members, especially those close to Yevgeni, were very involved in the development of the 'One Year Programs'. For example, Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02) noted: “I was involved with all the programs that they were trying to develop”. However, many were not involved and were thus frustrated. For instance, Batia (L.Int. 28.05.02) complained: “All the time they are busy here with cosmetics and not with the essence. There is an organizational problem. They don’t harness the lecturers and turn the lecturers committed to the institution”. This frustration of some of the members of International University was to affect implementation.

- How did the team members work together with the others who were supposed to implement the 'One Year Programs'?

“There wasn’t any cooperation between the decision makers and the ones that tried to implement them” (Ofer, I.M.Int. 01.05.02). Yosef (L.Re-int. 06.06.02) confirmed this by noting that “several months ago I was involved in the academic side of the 'One Year Programs' but later I wasn’t involved anymore. In my opinion the right hand did not know of the left hand. Yevgeni continued to promise the 'One Year Programs' because he saw that it sells while the secretaries didn’t know that they exist and also the lecturers didn’t know that they exist”.

Chapter 4 - Findings

- Was the strategy well founded on marketing research, such as students' expectations?

As already noted several times earlier in this chapter, the strategy was not founded on research but on Yevgeni's knowledge of the market, who "knows how to fit the product to the market" (Sonia, R.M.Int. 27.05.02). Due to this lack of research, it was expected that a marketing plan would not exist.

- Was there a marketing plan and if so what was the marketing plan and who built it?

Initially, it seemed that not only did a marketing plan exist, but that it was continuously updated. As Avi (Man.Int. 29.04.02) commented: "There is and now we renewing it, a new marketing plan. Zvi is responsible for the marketing plan... I confirm the marketing plan and I'm very involved in its planning". Yael (M.Int. 13.05.02) also noted that "Zvi builds a marketing plan once a year" and even Svetlana (M.Int. 06.05.02) said that Zvi is responsible for the marketing plan. However, in his interview, Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) avoided any questions on the marketing plan. Furthermore, no documents of a marketing plan were found, making it perplexing how marketing goals were set without a written plan.

- What were the marketing goals?

The goals were to enrol as many students as possible. As Gilad (I.M.Int. 01.06.02) put it: "Yevgeni was rewarded according to his results... he said that what is important is to bring enrolment no matter what". Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) confirmed this: "Here we had an aggressive marketing system based on field data. In the academic consultation a potential student
doesn't feel that it is aggressive, it is a technology. What is important is to take out what the potential student really wants and then to go for it”.

- _Were the staff involved in strategic decisions?_

The staff were not involved in strategic decisions and this created frustration. Here are but a few examples:

- **Vered** (A.Int. 26.05.02), wanting that the management will collaborate with the administration staff, said: “I don’t want to criticize but at the head, the business thought is missing”.

- **Dafna** (I.M.Int. 27.05.02): “I felt that a part of the meetings with the managers here were a waste of time. We would raise again and again the same problems and we were answered: 'It will be handled' but they never told us when. I have a background of being an officer in the army. Even if we dared to ask when it will be handled, we'd get the answer: 'It is being handled’”.

- **Ofer** (I.M.Int. 01.05.02): "They [the management] make decisions and drop it on the marketing department, there is a disconnection between the ones that make the decisions and the ones that carry out the decisions”.

_Were there any organizational changes according to the new strategy (or in order to respond the target market)? Did these include changes in the organizational structure due to integrated marketing, such as all the marketing functions being arrayed under one vice president?_

The main organizational changes were to occur due to Yevgeni and his company leaving International University. Comparing figure 4.1 (page 192 of this chapter), which presents the former organizational structure before
Yevgeni left, with figure 4.2 (page 194), which depicts the current organizational structure without Yevgeni and his company, reveals that all the marketing functions were arrayed under one vice president, Zvi. (How effective these changes were are discussed towards the end of this chapter.) These changes did not result in improved internal marketing.

*Did internal marketing exist at International University?*

- *Was there any training of staff concerning the 'One Year Programs'?
- *Were any incentives offered to the employees in order to encourage them to be more motivated to implement integrated marketing?*

Although internal marketing was extremely limited at the university, there are those who realized its importance. Yael (A.Int. 26.05.02) remarked: “There is another subject that is regretfully not being taken care of: internal marketing. From the moment I came here, I thought that this is the first thing that needs to be taken care of and somehow it was always put aside”. Yosef (L.Int. 06.06.02) noted: “I think that to take care of the existing students in addition to smart internal marketing is the most important thing that a lecturer needs to do”. However, no training or incentives were offered to employees. It must be noted that several interviewees desired non-monetary rewards. For example, Neta (A.Int. 10.05.02) said that she wants “a bit of recognition [from the management]. I want to know that they know”. Vered (A.Int. 26.05.02) wanted the management to come visit more than just once a week. Dafna (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) noted that “it could be nice if there was an opportunity [for promotion] even if the promotion is symbolic”. This lack of effort from management in implementing integrated marketing resulted in Ofer (I.M.Int. 01.05.02) stopping “to initiate, it doesn’t lead anywhere. There were some ideas that I have thought about with Dafna but we didn’t bother to offer them to anyone”.

4. Overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts.

This fourth subsection of the main findings now describes how the 'One Year Programs' affected enrolment. Student expectations from International University are presented and compared with how the university's employees perceive students' expectations. This is followed by a discussion on the degree of success of the organizational changes in responding to the target market. Subsequently, the way in which each employee of International University defines his or her job is examined. Finally, the level of student satisfaction from the university will be reviewed, followed by the concluding part of this entire chapter on the grade given to the overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts by the 'marketing-effectiveness rating instrument'.

Is there an increase in enrolment as a result of the 'One Year Programs'?

Several members, such as Avi, Yevgeni, Gavri, Katia, Igor, Vered and Revital, remarked during their interviews that numerous students enrolled because of the 'One Year Programs'. However, it was soon discovered that these programs were a double edged sword. The reason was (as already discussed on several occasions earlier in this chapter such as on page 242) that promises were not kept to the students. As a result, as seen on page 243, nearly 40% of those in Student Survey 02 did not recommend International University to anyone. This, coupled with other reasons such as the economic and employment situation, resulted in a substantial decrease in enrolment. As already presented on page 238, according to Student Registration Data (SMR.Doc. 02.04.02), comparing the January-March 2002 semester to that of the January-March 2001 semester, there was a decrease of 25% in student enrolment, labelled by Igor...
(I.M.Int.30.05.02) as "a 'fall'." In this it seems that the 'One Year Programs' created unmet expectations that ultimately resulted in a decrease in student enrolment.

What are the students' expectations from International University? What are the important things for the students when they come to study at International University?

In order to understand students' expectations, question 17 (see Appendix B) in Student Survey 02 asked 'What were your expectations when you enrolled to the studies?' The 153 students answered as follows:

- 46 students (about 30%) listed practical outcomes as their expectations. Below are two examples:
  "Interesting studies that I can use them immediately."
  "To know English and specialize in marketing."

- 19 students (a little over 12%) wrote that they expected convenience, such as:
  "That I will be given photocopied materials so I won't have to run between the libraries of the different universities."
  "A lot more convenience! Especially in the studies and parking!"
  "To get a degree in three years while working."

- 41 students (nearly 27%) expected the studies to be on a high level, writing for instance:
  "The material studied will be of the highest level."
  "I had expected a higher level of studies."
47 students (a little over 30%) did not fill precise expectations, but did reveal they were expecting more than they received. For example:

"I had much more expectations than now."

"My expectations were higher than what I got."

"[My expectations] were what they told me when I enrolled."

Reviewing this data illustrates that overall the different student expectations were not met. The students in the interviews also reflected this. Boris (S.Int. 20.03.02), who enrolled because of the 'One Year Programs', revealed that his expectations were not met when he said that "there is no correlation between words and actions". Tami (S.Int. 06.05.02) complained that the studies “don’t have enough practical experiences. Lectures from the field are missing”, showing she expected practical outcomes. In order to understand why these students' expectations were not met, it is necessary to examine the knowledge the personnel of International University had of students' expectations.

Are there any differences between students' actual expectations and how the university's employees perceive students' expectations?

Since, as described earlier in this chapter, no systematic research on students' expectations was undertaken, each of the members of the institution relied on his or her personal judgment to assess these expectations. Gavri (Man.Int. 22.05.02) did say the students expect “Academic seriousness and that the studies will be implemented” but did not address the issue of convenience. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02), on the other hand, stressed convenience: “They need order, relationships, and sometimes a shoulder to cry on. They need someone that will hear them. The level of the lecturers is fine”. Tatiana (I.M.Int. 25.04.02) understood
that: “It is important that every enrolled [student] will get the knowledge that he expects to get. In my opinion, that’s why people come to study here and not in another place”. Yosef’s (L.Int. 06.06.02) opinion was quite off the mark: “I think that most of the student’s expectation met”. Others, instead of being wrong, simply said that they do not know what students expect from the university. For example, Zahi (I.M.Int. 26.05.02) candidly confessed: “I have no idea what are the student’s expectations from the studies”. Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) also admitted that he didn’t know the students’ expectations, making it unclear how he undertook all the organizational changes without this knowledge.

Have the organizational changes succeeded in responding to the target market?

As discussed earlier in this chapter (pages 270-271), the main organizational changes were to take place due to Yevgeni and the managers who worked for his company leaving the university. This resulted in organizational integration (an essential structural change when implementing integrated marketing) where all the marketing functions were arrayed under one vice president, Zvi. Comparing figure 4.1 (page 192), which presents the former organizational structure before Yevgeni and his company left, with figure 4.2 (page 194), which depicts the current organizational structure without Yevgeni, illustrates that integration did occur. The separation between the corporate sector (for which Zvi was responsible) and the private sector (for which Yevgeni was responsible) was terminated.

However, this comparison also reveals that the organizational integration was incomplete, since the separation between the Israeli marketing
department and the Russian marketing department remained. Initially, it seemed that this structural segregation was created intentionally by Yevgeni in what he claimed was an attempt to be responsive to the needs of potential Russian students. Yevgeni (Man.Int. 29.05.02) argued that: “The potential Russian students preferred an academic consultation in Russian. Maybe they were ashamed to admit it. I’m sure that if you’ll ask the students about it they will say in Hebrew but in their heart they will think in Russian”. Many members of the university agreed in their interviews that “Most of the potential Russian students prefer academic consultation in Russian” as Igor (I.M.Int. 30.05.02) put it, including Yael, Revital, Dafna, Nina, Gilad, Regina and Natali.

Nevertheless, there were those who disagreed with this view. For example, Zahi (I.M.Int. 26.05.02) said: “I know that the Russians don’t want an academic consultation in Russian. A lot prefer the academic consultation in Hebrew”. Others argued that maybe potential Russian students will be more comfortable with a consultation in Russian but they can handle a consultation in Hebrew as well. For instance, Dafna (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) noted: “Maybe a guy that comes to an academic consultation and he is Russian can feel better in an academic consultation in his mother tongue. But when he comes to a place that 70% of the studies are in Hebrew and 30% are in English and not in Russian, it doesn’t seem to me that this person could not confront an academic consultation in Hebrew”.

Both Sonia and Zvi argued that “the preference of an academic consultation in Russian depends on the immigration year of the potential Russian students” (Sonia, R.M.Int. 27.05.02), since “If a Russian new immigrant did the high school and the army in Israel he will want an academic consultation in Hebrew... But if this student did the high school
in Russia, he will prefer an academic consultation in Russian" (Zvi, Man.Int. 13.05.02). Therefore, in order to find out the preferred language for each type of student, the following question was created for Student Survey 02 (see Appendix B):

13. In which language was the consultation given? Hebrew / Russian Were you satisfied with this?
   1) Yes
   2) No, I'd have preferred consultation in ___
   3) It doesn't matter to me in which language the consultation is given.

The results were as follows:
- 78 Israeli students and ‘old’ new immigrants (above 20 years in Israel) were given an academic consultation in Hebrew and were pleased.
- 7 ‘old’ new immigrants (above 20 years in Israel) received an academic consultation in Russian and were pleased.
- For the 47 new immigrants who are at least 10 years in Israel but less than 20, the results were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Students</th>
<th>14</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>13</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>15</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Their Comments</td>
<td>Russian and it doesn’t matter for me in which language is the academic consultation</td>
<td>Russian but I prefer in Hebrew</td>
<td>Russian and I was pleased</td>
<td>Hebrew and it doesn’t matter for me in which language is the academic consultation</td>
<td>Hebrew and I was pleased (One of them is a new immigrant from India)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.12 – New Immigrants 10 to 20 Years in Israel

- For the 21 new immigrants who are less than 10 years in Israel, the results were:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Students</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Their Comments</td>
<td>Russian and it doesn’t matter for me in which language is the academic consultation</td>
<td>Russian and I was pleased</td>
<td>Hebrew and it doesn’t matter for me in which language is the academic consultation</td>
<td>Hebrew and I was pleased</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.13 – New Immigrants less than 10 Years in Israel
Examining this data reveals that Russians under 10 years in Israel tend to prefer consultation in Russian, while those over 10 to 20 years in the country are basically impartial. It is important to note that none of the 153 students were dissatisfied from the language of the consultation. Even the 7 'old' new immigrants (above 20 years in Israel) who received an academic consultation in Russian were pleased and did not write that they would have preferred Hebrew. Therefore, it can be concluded that the separation of the two departments because “The potential Russian students preferred an academic consultation in Russian" (Yevgeni, Man.Int. 29.05.02) was unnecessary.

However, it soon became clear that the real reason for the separation of the two departments was not the potential Russian students but rather the potential Israeli students. “The potential Israeli students arrived, heard Russian and they didn’t want to enrol because of that” (Sonia, R.M.Int. 27.05.02). In addition, “because the Russian segment is big, the Israeli potential students must not know that the majority here is Russian” (Yael, M.Int. 13.05.02). Moreover, “The potential Russian students' emphasis was that they don’t want to study in a Russian institution” (Sonia, R.M.Int. 27.05.02). Consequently, the Israeli marketing department and the Russian marketing department were created.

This segregation was to backfire on International University. First, it simply insulted some of the potential students. Nina (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) recalled that “the most difficult thing was to explain the potential students why the Russian speakers are in one room and the Israelis are in another room. The employees would recognize the potential Russian students who arrived to get an academic consultation by their look or by their accent and
sent them to another floor. The potential Russian students used to be hurt, for example they used to say: 'I am 10 years in Israel and speak Hebrew better than the Israelis so why do you send me?' I had to invent explanations”.

Secondly, according to Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02), the segregation created “competition and disparity. This is shown by hatred between the workers of the Israeli marketing department and the Russian marketing department. It is not nice, instead of being united. Initially the level of the academic consultations will rise if the two departments will be united. At the moment, each one tries to knock down the other. The marketing department must be the most united in the institution. It is the main department that brings the people to study here”. Regina (R.M.Int. 12.05.02), agreeing with this view, commented “I think that there must be the same marketing department without any separation at all”.

Regina (R.M.Int. 12.05.02) also suggested how to perform the integration: “We [the academic consultants] have no problem to speak in Hebrew. There should be some consultation rooms and to talk Hebrew there between us [i.e. with potential students] is no problem at all”. Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) had similar ideas: “I am going to seat the Israeli and the Russian telemarketing together. As for the academic consultants, till now they gave the consultations in the same large room. It disturbed the Israeli potential students that heard Russian all the time. The change that I want to do is to have a central hall and some private rooms around. The academic consultant will reason whether to consult in Hebrew or in Russian”. In this Zvi also illustrates the importance of the job definition in implementing successful integration.
Does everyone in the staff know his or her job definition?

Many members of International University knew their job definition when asked about this in the interviews. This included Avi, Sharon, Zvi, Yevgeni, Gavri, Neta, Svetlana, Regina, Natali, the three persons responsible for telemarketing (past and present), other telemarketing personnel and academic consultants. However, several employees of the university did not know their job definition. For example, Yael (M.Int. 13.05.02) noted that “there is no definition for the job”. Tatiana (I.M.Int. 25.04.02) laughed and said “I have no defined job and I do a bit of everything”. Nevertheless, this problem was especially apparent in the administration. Rachel (A.Int. 24.04.02) complained that “there are no clear categories of the jobs and everybody does everything [in the administration]”. This enlightened why Katia (A.Int. 26.05.02) laughed and said “a difficult question”. It also clarified why Vered (A.Int. 26.05.02), who thought a few seconds before answering this question, said: “I like things to be focused. I know where things begin and where they finish. A definition of the job” [she meant that there was no definition of her job]. In addition, these comments by the administration personnel explained why one student in response to question 5 in Student Survey 02 wrote that there is “No order in the secretariat”, which is presented next.

What is the level of student satisfaction from the university?

In order to address this, question 5 (see Appendix B) in Student Survey 02 was administered to the 153 students in the sample, stating:

5. Rank your satisfaction with the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reason for rank: _____________________________________________
The results were as follows:

![Figure 4.10 - Satisfaction with the University](image)

**Figure 4.10 – Satisfaction with the University**

**Table 4.14 – Satisfaction with the University**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students’ reasons for the ranking (71% filled the reasons):</th>
<th>1-4</th>
<th>5-8</th>
<th>9-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The building of the university, level of studies, the kind of students, the management, devices and other reasons.</td>
<td>Unsatisfactory learning conditions like bad air-conditioning.</td>
<td>The university recently passed a lot of improvements.</td>
<td>Good lectures and a good atmosphere.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low level, fallacious advertising, bad treatment, unsatisfactory learning conditions.</td>
<td>The studies in the videoconferencing are frustrating.</td>
<td>There are personal relationships between the students and the lecturers and the studies are on a high level.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lies about finding a job.</td>
<td>Only an academic diploma without knowledge.</td>
<td>In my opinion there is a need to invest more in the building and in the classrooms.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neglected place.</td>
<td>Quite high level but the main courses of the field are diluted in material.</td>
<td>It is possible to study and work and the lecturers help you all the way to achieve success.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This place won’t open doors for me as I expected in the beginning.</td>
<td>Not what I expected.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unserious treatment.</td>
<td>The University is unfamiliar.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is no student union and the furniture in the classes is not comfortable for seating.</td>
<td>The learning material and the lecturers meet the expectations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No order in the secretariat.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>It is possible to raise the level more as it rose in the current year.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Good lecturers.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reviewing the quantitative data (Figure 4.10) reveals that the overall student satisfaction is not high at all with an average grade of 6.368421.
The qualitative data (Table 4.14) samples almost all the issues, both positive and negative, offered in this chapter. To summarize briefly, the majority of the students are relatively satisfied with the lecturers, with Sharon's management and with the ability to work while studying. They are not satisfied with the university's top management (not counting Sharon), its administration, the building, level of studies, lies in context of the 'One Year Programs' or the lack of learning materials. In this it would seem that according student satisfaction, the marketing performance of International University is not very high indeed.

When this is combined with the 25% decrease in student enrolment (presented on several occasions in this chapter, such as pages 272-273), the marketing performance of the university may be regarded as low. However, as already noted in the literature review (page 126), Kotler and Fox (1995) argued that 'institutional effectiveness is not necessarily revealed by current performance' (p. 466) and developed a method of analysis named the 'marketing-effectiveness rating instrument' (p. 466), which is the subject of the following question:

What is the grade given to the overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts by the 'marketing-effectiveness rating instrument'? What does this grade mean?

In order to grade the overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts, several of the terms in Appendix C - Marketing-Effectiveness Rating Instrument must be understood. First, the term 'admissions officer' was taken to be the marketing manager of International University. Then, the term 'central administration' was equated with the top management of the university, mainly Avi. Then, each of the questions in this instrument was
addressed separately, with the appropriate answer checked according to the data in this chapter. The scores were added according to the scale in the methodology chapter (page 181), allowing the overall grade to be calculated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>This high score was given because Zvi, as the marketing manager, does participate in the annual and long-range planning of International University.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>This average score was checked since the university does try to reach everywhere and anywhere students can be found, such as in the Studies-Exhibition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>This low score was given because Zvi does not listen to others ideas as Ofer complained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>This average score was checked since Zvi is also dependant on Avi for this.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was given because Zvi is not in contact with the faculty.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was marked because the students at International University cannot even volunteer for a student union.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was given because the market research data was not conveniently organized in an information system, which was discovered during the effort to collect relevant documents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>This average score was checked because the studies were conducted several years ago.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was given since it was not clear how this issue was handled at the university.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was marked because no marketing plan was discovered during the research at International University.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was given due to the lack of strategy at the university.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was marked since no real contingency thinking and planning ever took place.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>This low score was given because there was a lack of communication at the institution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>This average score was marked since Zvi overspends as Yevgeni commented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>This average score was given due to the lack of systematic execution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Score</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.15 – Scores in the Marketing-Effectiveness Rating Instrument

According to the scale in the methodology chapter (page 181), the overall score of 9 falls in the 6-10 category and therefore the university’s marketing effectiveness is poor. The meaning of this grade will be considered in the subsequent chapter, the discussions chapter.
Chapter 5 – Discussion

A good discussion embeds each result within the theoretical context that was presented in the literature review.

(Rudestam and Newton, 1992, p. 122)

With this in mind as well as to set the stage for the conclusions in the concluding chapter of this thesis, the following subsidiary research question was developed at the end of the literature review (see page 141):

*What are the differences in the findings on the subject of integrated marketing when compared to the materials in the literature review?*

In order to achieve this comparison it was necessary to plan an appropriate structure for this chapter. Since a conceptual framework ultimately aids the researcher in analysing the collected data (Robson, 1993, p. 151), the conceptual framework of this thesis was revisited:

![Conceptual Framework](image)

Figure 5.1 – Conceptual Framework (Originally Figure 2.6, page 130)
Therefore, based on this conceptual framework, this chapter was divided into the following four sections (in a similar manner to division in the main section of the findings chapter):

- **Level of responsiveness** - in which an attempt will be made to deduce International University's actual level of responsiveness, an issue left unanswered in the findings chapter.

- **Extent of integrated marketing** - where discussions revealing the actual extent of integrated marketing at International University will be undertaken. This section will also include one of the most pivotal discussions of this chapter, explaining why institutions of higher education should adopt integrated marketing and not alternative methods.

- **Implementation of integrated marketing** - in which issues in the context of management of change will be examined so as to comprehend the implementation processes of integrated marketing at the International University.

- **Effectiveness of integrated marketing** - where a discussion will take place on the meaning of the overall low score of 9 given to the university's effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts by the 'marketing-effectiveness rating instrument'.

Each of these four sections will include a comparison of the relevant materials in the literature review to the key results presented in the findings chapter. In comparing the secondary data from the literature review with the primary data collected at International University, an attempt will be made to move beyond the descriptive into the analytical and, when possible, even into the theoretical. This will be a first step in laying the foundations for the theoretical model in the concluding chapter of this thesis on implementing integrated marketing as a means of achieving responsiveness in institutions of higher education.
LEVEL OF RESPONSIVENESS

This section of the chapter first picks up where its parallel section in the findings chapter left off. Its first subsection, entitled 'International University's Level of Responsiveness', will summarize the collected data on the subject of International University's level of responsiveness using Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) table, which classifies institutions into three categories: unresponsive institution, casually responsive institution or highly responsive institution. Then, Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) table is examined, thereby revealing problems. Subsequently, a new general table, which is based on Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) table, is developed, enabling the reader analyze, in a more quantitative manner, an institution's level of responsiveness. Using this new analytical tool, two possible scenarios for International University are developed and compared.

The second subsection discusses how the university responded to the market by means of its academic quality. This subsection is organized according to Sevier's (1996, p. 2) framework, which lists the following five components that create the academic quality in an institution of higher education: (1) curriculum, (2) faculty, (3) facilities, (4) quality of its students, and (5) outcomes. Finally, the third subsection, entitled 'Academic Quality and the Level of Responsiveness' presents another new analytical quantitative tool in a table created for this study, which grades an institution's responsiveness based on these five components of academic quality. This illustrates International University's actual level of responsiveness.
International University's Level of Responsiveness

As noted in the findings chapter (page 205), it was decided to leave the issue of International University's level of responsiveness to this chapter. The reason for this stemmed from the fact that it was not clear on the basis of Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) categorization whether International University is an unresponsive institution, casually responsive institution or highly responsive institution. This is illustrated by the following table, which attempts to define International University's level of responsiveness using Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) table (see page 60):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Complaint System</th>
<th>Unresponsive</th>
<th>Casually Responsive</th>
<th>Highly Responsive</th>
<th>International University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No formal complaint system existed, but students did approach members of the university informally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveys of Satisfaction</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Surveys of satisfaction were carried out but not systematically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surveys of Needs and Preferences</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Surveys of needs and preferences were carried out but not systematically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer-oriented Personnel</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>According to the students, some of the personnel are customer-oriented while others are not</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.1 - International University's Level of Institutional Responsiveness

Examining this reveals that problem with the table created by Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 36) is that it is not collectively exhaustive, i.e. it does not allow for all possible outcomes. For example, an answer of 'no' to the complaint system and 'yes' to the remaining three in the table does not clearly fall in any of the categories of unresponsive institution, casually responsive institution or highly responsive institution. Furthermore, in an endeavour to be mutually exclusive (meaning that the choice of one answer
automatically excludes the other), Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) table is simply too clear-cut, allowing only for the black and white choice of either 'yes' or a 'no'. However, choosing grey should also be a possibility. For instance, the answer to surveys of satisfaction is neither a 'yes' nor a 'no' but rather somewhere in between. Therefore, in order to analyze International University's level of responsiveness, it was decided to create the following new table founded on Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Complaint System</td>
<td>$W_1$</td>
<td>$R_1$</td>
<td>((W_1/100)\times R_1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Surveys of Satisfaction</td>
<td>$W_2$</td>
<td>$R_2$</td>
<td>((W_2/100)\times R_2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Surveys of Needs and Preferences</td>
<td>$W_3$</td>
<td>$R_3$</td>
<td>((W_3/100)\times R_3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Customer-oriented Personnel</td>
<td>$W_4$</td>
<td>$R_4$</td>
<td>((W_4/100)\times R_4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Grade:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\sum_{i=1}^{4} (W_i/100)\times R_i)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 5.2 - Grading the Level of Institutional Responsiveness**

In this table each of the four factors are given a different weight, thereby acknowledging that the importance of a factor may not be identical in classifying the level of institutional responsiveness. The table also allows ranking each of these factors from 1 to 10, hence enabling to choose more than just a 'yes' or 'no' answer. As in developing the questionnaire in the methodology chapter (see page 173), this even number of scale points was chosen since it requires, unlike an odd number scale that has a mid-point, a decision on the rank to be taken (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2000, p. 254). Once the ranking process is complete, the weight is multiplied by the rank for each factor and then summed up to give the overall grade of the level of institutional responsiveness, which can only be between a number
between 1 and 10. Adopting Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) terminology, the range of 1 to 4 was defined as an unresponsive institution, the range of 4 to 7 as a casually responsive institution and the range of 7 to 10 as a highly responsive institution. This is illustrated by the figure below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unresponsive Institution</th>
<th>Casually Responsive Institution</th>
<th>Highly Responsive Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.2 - Scale for Levels of Institutional Responsiveness

In order to grade International University’s level of institutional responsiveness, the weights of the four factors were first taken to be equal, i.e. each 25%. The complaint system was given the rank of 5 since although no formal complaint system existed at the university, students did approach members of the university informally. The factor of surveys of satisfaction was ranked at 6 because although surveys on lecturers were carried out each semester, overall surveys of satisfaction were not carried out systematically. The factor of surveys of needs and preferences was awarded the lower rank of 4 when compared to surveys of satisfaction because surveys of needs and preferences were even rarer than those of satisfaction. Finally, the fourth factor of customer-oriented personnel was given the rank of 3 in view of the fact that students perceive only part of the university’s personnel as customer-oriented with nearly 30% of the students in Student Survey 02 not even being able to name one employee that gave them the best service. This resulted in table 5.3 in the subsequent page.
Table 5.3 – Grading International University’s Level of Institutional Responsiveness with Equal Weights given to each Factor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Complaint System</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Surveys of Satisfaction</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Surveys of Needs and Preferences</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Customer-oriented Personnel</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Grade: 4.5

From this table it can be seen that International University received an overall grade of 4.5. Since this falls in the range of 4 to 7, it suggests that the university is a casually responsive institution. However, this grade is only valid when the weights of each factor are the same. As noted in the literature review on page 60, many educational institutions do not succeed in being highly responsive, as ‘most rarely take formal surveys of their students' real needs and desires, nor do they encourage and train their faculty and staff to be student-minded’ (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). In this it would seem that the third factor (surveys of needs and preferences) and the fourth factor (customer-oriented personnel) of the table are essential in achieving the level of a highly responsive institution. Therefore, it was decided to create an alternative table that puts more emphasis on their relative importance by giving each the weight of 40%, while the first two factors (complaint system and surveys of satisfaction) were given the weight of only 10% each. This resulted in table 5.4 in the following page.
Table 5.4 - Grading International University's Level of Institutional Responsiveness with Different Weights given to each Factor

From this table it can be seen that International University received an overall grade of 3.9. Since this falls in the range of 1 to 4, it suggests that the university is more of an unresponsive institution than of a casually responsive one (as indicated by the 4.5 grade in table 5.3 in the previous page). Although it is evident that in either of the two tables International University does not fall in the category of a highly responsive institution, the difference between the grades of 3.9 to 4.5 is nonetheless not a substantial one. It is consequently not entirely clear whether International University is an unresponsive institution or a casually responsive one. Therefore, in order to better analyze International University's level of responsiveness, the following subsection will discuss how the university responded to the market by means of its academic quality. This subsection will be organized according to Sevier's (1996, p. 2) framework (see page 35), which lists five components that create the academic quality of an institution: (1) curriculum, (2) faculty, (3) facilities, (4) quality of its students, and (5) outcomes.
1. The Curriculum

According to Sevier (1998, p. 33), it is very important to consider carefully how an institution can use its curriculum to differentiate itself from the competition in meaningful ways such as offering courses and programs that no one else in the marketplace is offering (see page 66 in the literature review). In this it would seem that International University was extremely responsive to the market needs since it developed the 'One Year Programs' with their unique practical workshops, creating a product mix that no one else in the higher education marketplace was offering. In addition, Davies and Scribbins (1985, p. 36) noted that when properly directed, a customer-centred curriculum becomes a critical part of an institution of higher education's ability to respond to changing needs (also see page 66).

Examining the findings on the rhetorical curriculum (see pages 207-208 in the findings chapter), which Middlewood (2001) defined as 'what is stated in policies and statements of aims' (p. 109) of an institution (see page 69 in the literature review), strengthened the notion that the 'One Year Programs' were customer-centred. This was supported even further when by scrutinizing the findings on the planned curriculum, which is what is 'found in schemes of work, syllabuses' (Middlewood, 2001, p. 109). As noted in the findings chapter (see pages 208-209), student needs as well as external factors were addressed in the planning of the curriculum of the 'One Year Programs'.

However, when evaluating the third level, the delivered curriculum, which is 'how it is taught in the classrooms or through other media' (Middlewood, 2001, p. 109), it turned out that although the 'One Year Programs' never actually took off, they were still being marketed by the
university (see pages 209-210 of the findings chapter). As Revital (I.M.Int. 27.05.02) commented (see page 209): “The Marketing department needs to impress people with what we have and not impress with what we don’t have and actually we impressed people with what we don’t have”. Thus, the received curriculum, defined as ‘what is ultimately in the minds and some would say hearts of the students’ (Middlewood, 2001, p. 109), was different for each student with some even trying to still complete the non-existing 'One Year Programs' (see pages 210-212).

This situation created complaints for International University, which can be witnessed on numerous occasions in the findings chapter. For example on page 212, Boris (S.Int. 20.03.02) complained: “I am not pleased with International University. They simply have spread the 'One Year Programs' too long. In my opinion, they should have been concentrated them into 8 months”. This negative attitude was expected. As noted on page 59 in the literature review, if an institution merely offers a semblance of responsiveness, including openness and interest, but without intending to use the results in any way, some consumers will resent the institution and may try to force it into greater responsiveness (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 37). Boris, in his complaints, is attempting to force International University into greater responsiveness, although at the time he was not aware that the 'One Year Programs' never actually took place. It is a safe guess that his frustration grew substantially when he discovered sooner or later that there was no such thing as the 'One Year Programs' at International University. However, his lack of knowledge regarding these programs is not surprising, since, in the findings chapter, it was clearly shown that even some members of the faculty were not updated on the status of the 'One Year Programs'.
2. Faculty

In the literature review (see pages 71-72), it was noted that:

Teachers and the resources which support them are not the only significant influence on the quality of a course. Administration of student admissions, queries, results and periodic reports to employers are also part of the product as perceived by the customer. Inefficiency in these areas creates discontent and throws doubt on quality in other areas... The initial administrative responses to those attracted by a college's marketing and recruitment strategies are of particular importance in shaping their perception of the product under consideration.

(Davies and Scribbins, 1985, p. 38)

The importance of members other than lecturers in influencing the perceived quality of a course was clearly supported by the evidence collected at International University. The subsection of the findings chapter (see pages 212-223) on the faculty of the university demonstrated that overall the students were satisfied with the lecturers but were not too satisfied with other members of the university, such as with management (except Sharon), administration or the marketing department. Many of these members were shown to be unresponsive to students' needs, who accordingly resented these members and their departments. The lack of responsiveness of International University was also evident in its facilities.

3. Facilities

In the literature review (see page 72), in the context of facilities it was noted that:

Apart from the explicit communication that the institution has with its stakeholders, the state of its physical location can
contribute greatly. Clean rooms, carpeting, regular washroom cleaning, all set a context in which the individual learner comes to understand who he or she is in the context of the learning experience. (Gibbs and Knapp, 2002, p. 55)

The importance of facilities in influencing the perceived academic quality of an institution was confirmed in the study at International University. As presented in the findings chapter (see pages 223-226), the research revealed that neither the employees nor the students are satisfied with the institution's facilities. The low level of facilities, especially the unappealing building, resulted in students perceiving International University in a more negative manner. Consequently, their perception of academic quality is also negatively affected. For example, as one student wrote in Student Survey 02 (see page 224): “In a higher education institution, the building is much more like a ruin and isn’t suitable for occupations an academic institution”.

In addition, since those in the marketing department promised students that an overhaul would be carried out to the building and this was not undertaken, some students lost faith in the marketing department, thereby perceiving International University as an unresponsive institution with reference to even minimal conditions. For instance, Lior (S.Int. 01.05.02) complained (see page 224) that “elementary conditions were supposed to be in a place [i.e. promised by the marketing department] that a few hundreds of students - no, hundreds of people - are walking around in”. In this quote, Lior is demonstrating that he is not alone in his negative feelings towards the university. It is possible that he is also insinuating that it is important to him who he is studying with.
4. Quality of its students

As noted on page 73 of the literature review, the academic quality of an institution is also dependent on the quality of its students (Sevier, 1996, p. 2). Indeed, it may be argued that the quality of students determines an institution's credibility (Padmanabhan, 2002, Online). This dependence of the academic quality with the quality of its students was corroborated in the study at International University. In the findings chapter (see pages 226-228), it was illustrated that one reason Russian students enrolled to the university is because they found it had majority of Russian students with a similar background. For Israeli students it was also important with whom they study, revealed by the fact that many of them complained that there were too many Russians at the university. Nevertheless, both the Russian students and the Israeli students were concerned with the practical outcomes from their studies.

5. Outcomes

As discussed on page 75 of the literature review, practical outcomes are important to most students and parents, who want to know about the job and career and graduate school successes of an institution's alumni (Sevier, 1996, p. 2). In Israel, as students come to the university with some business or military experience, they demand that their studies have practical outcomes (Fleisher-Levy, 2002, p. 10). It is therefore not surprising that practical outcomes were very significant to the students of International University and that they were highly dissatisfied with some of the impractical courses, especially History (see pages 228-231 in the findings chapter). The students linked, in their minds, academic quality to practical outcomes.
Academic Quality and the Level of Responsiveness

The previous subsection on curriculum, faculty, facilities, quality of students and outcomes demonstrates that academic quality and responsiveness are interrelated. An institution may have a complaint system, it may also carry out surveys of satisfaction as well as surveys of needs and preferences, and it may even have customer-oriented personnel, but without being responsive in all five components of academic quality it could not be considered a highly responsive institution. Therefore, it was decided to develop the following table, which grades an institution's responsiveness based on its academic quality:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. A continuously responsive curriculum, at the levels of the rhetorical, the planned, the delivered and the received curriculum</td>
<td>$W_1$</td>
<td>$R_1$</td>
<td>$(W_1/100) \times R_1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Responsive trained faculty, including management, administration, marketing department and lecturers</td>
<td>$W_2$</td>
<td>$R_2$</td>
<td>$(W_2/100) \times R_2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Facilities that illustrate the institution's responsiveness to students' needs</td>
<td>$W_3$</td>
<td>$R_3$</td>
<td>$(W_3/100) \times R_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Quality of students created by accepting students according to criteria based on market research</td>
<td>$W_4$</td>
<td>$R_4$</td>
<td>$(W_4/100) \times R_4$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Practical outcomes that are planned and implemented due to continuously researching and responding to students' needs</td>
<td>$W_5$</td>
<td>$R_5$</td>
<td>$(W_5/100) \times R_5$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Grade: $\sum_{i=1}^{5} (W_i/100) \times R_i$

Table 5.5 - Grading the Level of Institutional Responsiveness by Academic Quality

Here too as in table 5.1, the overall grade can only be between a number between 1 and 10. Adopting again Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 36) terminology, the range of 1 to 4 was defined as an unresponsive institution, the range of 4 to 7 as a casually responsive institution and the range of 7 to 10 as a highly responsive institution. In order to grade International University's level of institutional responsiveness by means of its academic quality, the following table is used.
quality, the weights of the five factors were taken to be equal (20% each) since, as noted in the literature review (see pages 75-76), all five must be coordinated together so as to achieve academic quality. The curriculum was given the rank of 2 since not only were the 'One Year Programs' not implemented but also this was not communicated to all the students that enrolled to these programs. The second factor of faculty was given the rank of 4 in view of the fact that students perceive only part of the university's personnel as customer-oriented with nearly 30% of the students in Student Survey 02 not even being able to name one employee that gave them the best service. The extremely low level of International University's facilities resulted in a rank of 1 given to the university. The quality of students was given the rank of 5 because almost anyone can be accepted. Finally, the practical outcomes were ranked as 2 due to the failure to implement the 'One Year Programs' as well as to the existence of unpractical courses such as history. This resulted in table 5.6:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Curriculum</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Faculty</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Facilities</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Quality of students</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Outcomes</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Grade:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.6 - Grading the University's Level of Responsiveness by Academic Quality

From this it can be seen that the level of International University is of an unresponsive institution. In order to understand why the level of responsiveness is so low, it is necessary to compare the extent of integrated marketing at the university to the relevant materials in the literature review.
EXTENT OF INTEGRATED MARKETING

This second section of the discussion chapter will first analyze in a more quantitative manner, by means of an analytical tool created for this purpose, whether there was a tendency in International University's marketing towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs. This is followed by a short summary of the findings on several of the problems that occurred at International University. These problems were factors stimulating the implementation of integrated marketing at the university, as they were in other similar institutions of higher education. Subsequently, in the context of the evolution of integrated marketing, the findings on the components of promotion, segmentation and market research, positioning, strategic planning and enrolment management will be compared in detail to the relevant materials from the literature review, each receiving a rank.

In order to further understand the evolution of integrated marketing at International University, the findings on the three levels of integration at International University - strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration - are assessed against information from the literature review and given a rank. The rank of these three with the five components develops an overall grade for the extent of integrated marketing at the university. Finally, the findings on the staff understanding the importance of integrated marketing and on the ability of the employees to explain the institutions' market niche and its competitive advantages will conclude this section. This lays the foundations for the next section of the discussion chapter, comparing the findings on the implementation of integrated marketing at International University to the relevant information from the literature review.
4 Ps vs. 4 Cs

In order to understand whether there is a tendency in International University's marketing towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs, the following table was created:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P vs. C</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Product vs. Customer Solution</td>
<td>$W_1$</td>
<td>$R_1$</td>
<td>$(W_1/100)*R_1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Price vs. Customer Cost</td>
<td>$W_2$</td>
<td>$R_2$</td>
<td>$(W_2/100)*R_2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Place vs. Convenience</td>
<td>$W_3$</td>
<td>$R_3$</td>
<td>$(W_3/100)*R_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Promotion vs. Communication</td>
<td>$W_4$</td>
<td>$R_4$</td>
<td>$(W_4/100)*R_4$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Grade:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$\sum_{i=1}^{4} (W_i/100)*R_i$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.7 - 4 Ps vs. 4 Cs

In a similar manner to other analytical tools developed for this thesis, in this table each of the four pairs may be given a different weight. The table also allows ranking each of these pairs from 1 to 10, where 1 is towards the 4 Ps, while 10 is towards the 4 Cs. Once the ranking process is complete, the weight is multiplied by the rank for each factor and then summed up to give the overall grade of the tendency towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs, which can only be between a number between 1 and 10. Since the midpoint between 1 and 10 is 5.5, the lower the number is under 5.5, the greater is the tendency towards the 4 Ps, and the higher the number is over 5.5, the greater is the tendency towards the 4 Cs. This is illustrated by the figure below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tendency towards the 4 Ps</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tendency towards the 4 Cs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.3 - Scale for Tendency towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs
The first issue, so as to be able to fill this table and thus reveal whether there is a tendency in International University's marketing towards the 4 Ps or towards the 4 Cs, was which weight to give each of the four pairs. Reviewing the findings chapter (see page 248), it would seem that convenience should be given a higher weight since it is more important at International University. In Student Survey 02, question 16 (see Appendix B) asked ‘Why did you decide to enrol here and not to another institution?’ To this, 33 students (nearly 22%, more than any other single reason) replied that they enrolled because of the convenient study hours and 20 students (a little over 13%) commented that the convenience of immediate enrolment was one of the reasons they enrolled. Therefore, since convenience was at least 35% of the reason why students enrolled to International University, it should be given its weight accordingly.

However, as noted in the findings chapter (see page 234), convenience and costs are connected. The 33 students, who replied that they enrolled to the university because of the convenient study hours, said that these hours give the possibility to combine work with the studies. Had they gone to another university with the same price per year (i.e. the same tuition fees), the actual cost of the studies to them would be higher since they would have to reduce or quit their jobs and thereby possibly have a lower income. These convenient study hours are also providing a customer solution to the problem of work and study, and therefore convenience and costs are connected to customer solution as well. Since International University used these convenient study hours in their marketing communications when giving consultations to potential students, it would seem that all four pairs are interconnected. It was therefore decided to give the same weight to each of the pairs, i.e. 25%.
The second issue, in order to be able to fill this table, is to rank each of the four pairs. Therefore, below is a comparison of materials from the literature review on the 4 Ps vs. the 4 Cs (see pages 85-88) to the relevant data from the findings chapter (see pages 232-237), which results in each pair given a rank:

**Product vs. customer solution** - Instead of a fixed product that the institution tries to sell, it searches for a solution that answers a customer's needs, thereby involving the customer (Sevier, 1999, p. 5). The institution, realizing that it must have 'a deep understanding of consumer needs in order to reach and influence today's consumer effectively' (Garber and Dotson, 2002, p. 3), tries to listen to the customer first and then act, instead of first acting and than trying to listen. Since initially it seemed International University did not try to sell its existing products, i.e. the former curriculums, but rather tried to provide a customer solution and consequently developed the 'One Year Programs', it would suggest it tends more towards customer solution, and thus deserves a higher rank.

However, International University's marketing department was selling the 'One Year Programs' for awhile although the personnel of the marketing department knew these programs never took off. In this, the university was not providing a customer solution but rather trying to sell its current product (i.e. the academic degrees) by promising the 'One Year Programs'. In addition, the students' expectations were not researched in a systematic manner, but were rather based on Yevgeni's personal knowledge of the market. Therefore, it was decided to give this pair the rank of 3, which illustrates that there is a greater tendency towards the product than the customer solution.
Price vs. customer cost - Although Sevier (1999) maintains that there is 'little significant difference between price and cost, save semantics’ (p. 5), this is not so as cost includes more than just the price of a product. The management of International University did consider the specific costs of the 'One Year Programs' for each student when compared to other higher education institutions and therefore it was planned the 'One Year Programs' would not incur an additional sum to the tuition fees. Moreover, the managers of International University realized that the studies cost much more to a student who cannot work when compared to a working student. Therefore, it would seem that there is a substantial tendency towards customer cost, and hence these two factors should receive a high rank.

However, recalling that the 'One Year Programs' never actually occurred means that some students were hoping to receive the programs professional diploma and get a job in the taught profession of the 'One Year Programs'. Since this could not happen, these students had to decide whether to throw away the money spent on the first year of studies or whether to continue another two years and leave with an academic degree. Therefore, it was decided to rank this pair with a 4 since not only did this situation result in two more years of expenses for the students who enrolled to the 'One Year Programs', but also this caused them to spend two more years of time, an inconvenience they had not planned for.

Place vs. convenience - As a substitute for the term place, in higher education the term convenience reflects the customer's point of view and contains other issues such as access (Sevier, 1999, p. 5) and not only the physical place of an institution. For example, in a college or university the term convenience could also include flexibility in study hours or various
means of studies such as videoconferencing or distance learning. Although 'One Year Programs' never happened at International University, thereby creating inconvenience for some students, and facilities were limited, overall the university did attempt to offer convenience via study hours, registration dates and choosing not to relocate the building. Therefore, it was decided to rank this pair at 6.

**Promotion vs. communication** - According to Sevier (1999, p. 5), an institution of higher education that adopts a communication approach is thus dealing with a two-way communication process than with the one-way communication process of downward promotion. In integrated marketing communication, which is basically is the fourth C (Sevier, 1999, p. 3), 'the underlying thrust is the coordination of various marketing communication devices (e.g. advertising, direct marketing, etc.) to create a unified message' (Grove, Carlson and Dorsch, 2002, p. 393). Since this research discovered that the approach to communication at the university is that of one-way downward promotion, with the various marketing communication devices not being coordinated, it was decided to give this pair the rank of 2, which can be seen in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P vs. C</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Product vs. Customer Solution</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Price vs. Customer Cost</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Place vs. Convenience</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Promotion vs. Communication</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Overall Grade:</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 5.8 - The 4 Ps vs. 4 Cs at International University*
This grade of 3.75 on the previous page illustrates that there is a tendency towards the 4 Ps of traditional marketing at International University and not towards the 4 Cs of integrated marketing. This was somewhat surprising since it appeared that there were all the causes for the extent of integrated marketing to be higher and thus towards the 4 Cs. The findings (see pages 237-244) clearly demonstrated that except for the two problems that were not relevant of fundraising and endowment, all the other following problems existed at International University, which according to Sevier (1999), cause institutions to take integrated marketing into account (see literature review, pages 91-92):

- Difficulties in student recruiting in primary recruiting market
- Difficulties in fundraising among alumni and core contributors
- High tuition discount rate
- Organizational lethargy and poor morale
- High administrative and faculty turnover
- Weak, inaccurate, or inconsistent image
- Over dependency on tuition and tuition increase
- Small or decreasing endowment or tapping endowment to meet operating expenses
- Inability to respond to problems and opportunities in a timely fashion (p. 6).

As noted in the previous chapter (see page 244), due to existence of these problems, International University realized the need to be responsive to its students. Thus, it was decided to adopt integrated marketing as the university's means of improving responsiveness. Therefore, so as to further analyze the extent of integrated marketing at International University, the following subsection will compare the findings on the extent of integrated marketing at the university with the relevant materials from the literature review chapter.
The Extent of Integrated Marketing

In order to examine the actual extent of integrated marketing at International University, it was first necessary to develop an analytical tool that measures this, which proved to be a more difficult task than anticipated. Initially, the following table, based on the evolution of marketing in the literature review (see pages 93-94), was created:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Promotion</td>
<td>$W_1$</td>
<td>$R_1$</td>
<td>$(W_1/100)\times R_1$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Segmentation &amp; market research</td>
<td>$W_2$</td>
<td>$R_2$</td>
<td>$(W_2/100)\times R_2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Positioning</td>
<td>$W_3$</td>
<td>$R_3$</td>
<td>$(W_3/100)\times R_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strategic planning</td>
<td>$W_4$</td>
<td>$R_4$</td>
<td>$(W_4/100)\times R_4$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Enrolment management</td>
<td>$W_5$</td>
<td>$R_5$</td>
<td>$(W_5/100)\times R_5$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Strategic, organizational and message integration</td>
<td>$W_6$</td>
<td>$R_6$</td>
<td>$(W_6/100)\times R_6$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Grade: $\frac{6}{\sum_{i=1}^{6} (W_i/100)\times R_i}$

Table 5.9 - The Extent of Integrated Marketing

The idea here, as with the previous tables in this chapter, was to give each of the factors a weight and then rank them with the total score ranging between 1 and 10, whereas 1 means a low extent of integrated marketing and 10 means a high extent. Since findings on each of these six factors existed (see pages 244-254), it seemed grading the extent of integrated marketing at International University is a relatively simple task. However, the difficulties began when an attempt was made to give a weight to each of these factors. If each factor would be given the same weight (16.67%), then it means that all factors are equally important. Yet a case could be
made that strategic, organizational and message integration are more important than promotion since they are higher up the evolutionary latter. Furthermore, even if it is agreed that all factors are not equally significant and thus not deserving of the same weight, it was not clear how much each is more central than the other and hence what its weight should be.

Therefore, to address these issues, it was necessary to go back to the theoretical aspects on the evolution of marketing into its seventh stage of integrated marketing, which was presented in the literature review (see pages 93-94). Here it was noted that, after researching the market, segmenting it, and strategically positioning the promotional activities, it was vital to ensure students have the optimal experience and thus management was born. Since enrolment management created a situation where members of an institution of higher education were in contact with students and potential students as part of the campus wide effort of enrolment, it was essential that strategic integration, organizational integration and message integration took place. Examining this evolution of marketing revealed that integrated marketing is a continuous process in an institution, where the six factors are interconnected, which is not obvious in table 5.9 on the previous page. To further sharpen the understanding of this process, the following figure was created:

![Figure 5.4 - The Ongoing Process of Integrated Marketing](image-url)
The figure on the previous page stresses that market research is continuously carried out both on external potential students and on internal current students. This allows strategic planning to address real market needs and not take place in a vacuum, which according to Sevier (1999, p. 5) does seem to be the situation in many cases of higher education (see page 88 in the literature review). In addition, the arrow from strategic, organizational and message integration to promotion illustrates that promotion must be also integrated, i.e. the messages from promotional activities must not contradict other messages by the institution. This arrow also insinuates to the relative importance of strategic, organizational and message integration in achieving integrated marketing. Thus, the table below, which is based on table 5.9, takes these issues into account:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Weight (In %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Integrated promotion</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₁</td>
<td>0.125*R₁</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Segmentation &amp; internal and external market research</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₂</td>
<td>0.125*R₂</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Positioning</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₃</td>
<td>0.125*R₃</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strategic planning</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₄</td>
<td>0.125*R₄</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Enrolment management</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₅</td>
<td>0.125*R₅</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Strategic integration</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₆</td>
<td>0.125*R₆</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Organizational integration</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₇</td>
<td>0.125*R₇</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Message integration</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>R₈</td>
<td>0.125*R₈</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Grade: \[ \sum_{i=1}^{6} 0.125*R_i \]  

Table 5.10 – The Weighted Extent of Integrated Marketing
Although in a rapid review of the table 5.10 on the previous page it might be concluded by that all the factors received the same weight (12.5%). This is not actually the case. The factor of strategic, organizational and message integration was broken up into three distinct factors and since each received a weight of 12.5%, this means that integration overall received the weight of 37.5%. Since all the other factors are interdependent - for instance, strategic planning cannot be carried out without market research which in turn cannot be undertaken without strategically planning what to should be researched - it was decided to give all of the factors the same weight of 12.5%. Now, so as to give an overall grade to the extent of integrated marketing at International University, what remained was to rank each of these factors by comparing the findings to materials in the literature review. First, integrated promotion needed to be ranked.

In the first step of promotion, as discussed in the literature review on page 43, an organization [such as a university] has to hire, train, and motivate salespeople (Kotler, 2000, p. 87). As noted in the findings chapter (see page 244), this was carried out at International University, which hired Yevgeni’s external marketing company to strengthen the university's salespeople, who were also given a workshop to improve their skills and to increase their motivation. In addition, according to Kotler (2000, p. 87), an organization, when promoting, has to arrange communication and promotion programs including advertising, sales promotion and public relations. Although promotion was carried out by various means, such as advertisements in newspapers and participating in the Studies-Exhibition, the findings revealed that it was limited (see pages 244-246). Only on the basis of this the rank of promotion from 1 to 10 would have been chosen to be 4.
However, the term in integrated marketing is not just promotion but, as discussed earlier in this chapter, integrated promotion, i.e. the messages from promotional activities must not contradict other messages by the university. The fact that the marketing department was still selling the 'One Year Programs' when they no longer existed just to enrol more students (see page 209 or page 249, for example) demonstrates how disintegrated promotion was at the university. Therefore, not only was promotion limited at International University, but also it was being done on something that basically did not exist. Accordingly, it was decided to rank promotion with 2 instead of 4, although even 1 might be viable in this case since promotion was not based on systematic market research.

As stated in the literature review (see page 44-45), an institution of higher education must undertake market research in order to segment their market better and thus, in order to attract students, 'provide the right information at the right time' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 11). However, as noted on page 246 of the findings chapter, no systematic market research was conducted over time at the university and no segmentation was carried out. This resulted in a situation where it was not clear for the various members of International University who was the target audience of the institution. In addition, the current students were also not sufficiently researched, i.e. internal market research on current students was limited mostly to lecturers' satisfaction surveys given out each semester. Hence, segmentation & internal and external market research was ranked at 3.

Although research and segmentation was not carried out, International University did address positioning. As written on page 45 of the literature review, Kotler and Fox (1995) argue that positioning in education 'is an attempt to distinguish the school from its competitors along real
dimensions that students value in order to be the preferred school for certain student segments' (p. 11). However, as noted on page 249 of the findings chapter, the university attempted to position itself with the competitive advantage of the practical 'One Year Programs'. As these programs did not exist, International University was without a competitive edge and therefore could not successfully distinct itself from its competitors. In this the institution has not only failed in its positioning, which accordingly was given the grade of 3, but also it was unsuccessful in its strategic planning.

The literature review (see pages 46-49) discussed institutions beginning a strategic planning process, including extending their planning efforts to identify major trends and to assess how well the institution responded to these trends, resulting in the institution revising its programs, procedures, and other activities to better align its efforts with these trends (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 12). Although International University did revise its programs and thus developed the 'One Year Programs', it did not actually implement them and even did not prepare a marketing plan for them. According to Kotler (2000, p. 64), one way to achieve strategic planning is to create a marketing plan. However, as presented on page 250 of the findings chapter, no strategic documents of any kind seemed to exist at International University, let alone a marketing plan. Therefore, strategic planning was also given the low rank of 3.

With the low rank of strategic planning as well as the previous factors, it might be expected that enrolment management would also receive a low grade. As stated on page 49 of the literature review, enrolment management's objective, as described by Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 12), are no longer to just "do one's job" but rather to react to student needs and
wants. In this, the research at International University (see pages 250-251) discovered that various employees attempted to help enrolment activities and it would thus seem that a high rank of say 8 or 9 should be given to the university when it comes to enrolment management. However, since these actions were taken in an informal manner without integration, the rank enrolment management received in the end was only of 6.

On page 91 of the literature review, strategic integration was defined as involving the assessment and meeting of target student needs through the allocation of strategic resources to the 4 Cs within the constraint of the institutional mission (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). As the findings chapter revealed (see page 252) this was not carried out at International University. Organizational integration was defined as concerning the coordination of resources and sharing goals (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). The findings (see pages 252-253) also illustrated this was not undertaken at the university. Message integration means that messages are not only consistent and coordinated but are also driven by strategic decisions, and thus ‘have a common look, sound, and feel across various mediums and over time’ (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). The research revealed that members of International University were communicating contradicting messages not consistent and coordinated for students (see pages 253-254). These three levels of integration demonstrate that on the whole integration was not taking place at International University. Thus, each of the three was given the rank of 3, which completed the ranking of the various factors on table 5.10 (see page 308), enabling to develop the overall grade for the extent of integrated marketing at International University. This grade is offered in table 5.11, which is on the subsequent page.
Chapter 5 - Discussion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
<th>Weight (in %)</th>
<th>Rank (1-10)</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Integrated promotion</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Segmentation &amp; internal and external market research</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Positioning</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Strategic planning</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Enrolment management</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Strategic integration</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Organizational integration</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Message integration</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.375</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Grade: **3.375**

**Table 5.11 – The Extent of Integrated Marketing at International University**

This overall low grade of 3.375 clearly reveals that the extent of integrated marketing at International University is relatively low. This is not surprising when compared to the grade of 3.75 on page 305, which illustrated that there was a tendency towards the 4 Ps of traditional marketing at International University and not towards the 4 Cs of integrated marketing. The low grade is also not unexpected when the findings reveal that the university's employees are not able to explain the institutions' market niche and its competitive advantages based on the institutions' mission, vision, or values (see page 255 in findings chapter). Moreover, as noted on the findings chapter (see page 256), the staff of International University understood the importance of integrated marketing to the university but only partially. This, in addition to the low grade of 3.375, suggests that there were problems in implementing integrated marketing at the university.
IMPLEMENTATION OF INTEGRATED MARKETING

From the previous section, it can be seen that integrated marketing was not successfully implemented at International University. The discussion in this section attempts to distinguish from all the various factors which were the critical factors that were the main causes for this unsuccessful management of change. (This differentiation is essential for developing recommendations on implementing integrated marketing as well as the theoretical model on the implementation of integrated marketing in the last chapter of this thesis, the conclusions chapter.) In order to achieve this, each of the findings on the factors that affected the implementation of integrated marketing is compared to materials in the literature review.

Therefore, this third section of the discussion chapter first examines resistance to change and the levels of conflict in the university. Then, the tactics used at International University to achieve political power are reviewed. Subsequently, a discussion takes place on senior management's support of integrated marketing, followed by another discussion on the "champion" that led the process of implementing integrated marketing and the team members that developed the 'One Year Programs'. The subject of organizational changes due to integrated marketing, such as changes in the organizational structure, is considered. An examination of the last factor of internal marketing follows, enabling a discussion on the importance of each of these factors to transpire, thereby creating the abovementioned differentiation. This discussion sets the stage for the fourth and final section of the discussion chapter, entitled 'Effectiveness of Integrated Marketing'.
Chapter 5 - Discussion

Resistance to Change and Conflict in Organizations

As discussed in the literature review (see pages 103-106), resistance to change may occur for several reasons, such as sociological resistance, logical resistance or psychological resistance (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, pp. 277-278). The findings chapter (see pages 257-258) revealed that the main resistance to the 'One Year Programs', and thus it seems to the implementation of integrated marketing, came from Zvi, then the vice president and marketing manager responsible for the corporate sector. It was noted that his resistance to these programs was in reality psychological and not logical, created due to his personal conflict with Yevgeni, then the marketing manager responsible for the private sector from an external marketing company.

As offered in the literature review (see pages 107-110), three of the four levels of conflict are intrapersonal conflict, interpersonal conflict and intergroup conflict (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, pp. 392-393). Although it was noted that all three exist in the findings chapter (see pages 258-259), this does not mean they held the same weight in affecting the implementation of integrated marketing. Gilad (I.M.Int. 01.06.02), who was having intrapersonal conflict, commented that it was very difficult for him to inform potential students about the 'One Year Programs' because he claimed there was no real academic thought behind the 'One Year Programs' but only a marketing thought. However, he did market them, which illustrates that intrapersonal conflict was not the key factor for the lack of success of the 'One Year Programs' at International University.

Reviewing intergroup conflict, which is conflict between groups that is caused by different viewpoints group loyalties and competition for
resources (Newstrom and Davis, 1993, p. 393), it might be concluded that
this was the level of conflict that was the key reason for the lack of success
of the 'One Year Programs' at International University. After all, it was
clearly noted in the findings chapter that there was a conflict between the
academic personnel and the business personnel at International University
(see page 259). However, it was also revealed that International University
through Zvi was focusing on the commercial business aspects and not on
academic quality (see page 261). Since it was shown that potential students
were enthusiastic from the practical business orientation of the 'One Year
Programs', Zvi should have supported them. Although the findings
insinuated that he might have initially supported these programs, it is
obvious that, overall, he did not. The reason he resisted the 'One Year
Programs' is related to interpersonal conflict.

There were various interpersonal conflicts at International University, such
as the one between Meital, the former manager of the Israeli Branch of
International University, and Gavri, the former academic manager (see
pages 258-259 in the findings chapter). However, none was as severe as
the one between Zvi and Yevgeni. It was this level of conflict, above any
of the other level, which caused the most harm to the implementation of
the 'One Year Programs'. As noted in the findings chapter (see page 259),
this interpersonal conflict also created intergroup conflict. Gilad (I.M.Int.
01.06.02) observed that “They [the two marketing departments of the
corporate and private sectors] spend money on marketing that they don’t
use at all. It only happens because of the fight between Zvi and Yevgeni.
They are not professionals. They are not real marketing people... I don’t
know about what they fought and I didn’t go into it. But they were all the
time in fight and all the time they were preparing cases on each other and
ran to Avi”. Zvi won this conflict due to his use of organizational politics.
Organizational Politics

As discussed in the literature review (see pages 110-111), according to Newstrom and Davis (1993, pp. 406-407), there are several tactics that may be used to achieve political power such as social exchange, alliances, identification with higher authority, control of information, selective service, power and status symbols, power plays and networks. In the findings chapter (see pages 261-263), it was noted that all of these occurred at International University. Although many of these tactics had a substantial affect on the success - or rather lack of success - of implementing the 'One Year Programs' and hence integrated marketing, they are not the key factor behind this failure. Rather they were driven by personal conflict such as the one between Meital and Gavri as well as the one between Zvi and Yevgeni. One result of this personal conflict between Zvi and Yevgeni was that Avi, the top manager of International University, ultimately also cut all ties with the 'One Year Programs' and did not support them.

Top Management's Support of Integrated Marketing

As noted in the literature review (see page 114), for an institution to change, not only should its president personally support and operate with a marketing perspective (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 39), but also its president must aggressively support marketing or it will fail (Sevier, 1998, p. 39). However, as presented in the findings chapter (see pages 263-265), not only did the president and the top management not initiate integrated marketing, but also they even did not look highly upon the 'One Year Programs'. Avi, the president, did not actively support integrated
marketing, denying even that he approved the 'One Year Programs'. This lack of continuing top management support resulted that Yevgeni, the champion of the 'One Year Programs', was in the end, dismissed from his post at International University.

**The Champion and the Team**

As noted in the literature review on page 117, according to Sevier (1996), 'because the variables that affect an institution's marketing efforts cross so many departmental and divisional lines, turf battles can only be avoided when a strong champion is actively involved' (p. 5). Yevgeni was clearly not strong enough to avoid his turf battle with Zvi. The reason for this had a lot to do with changes in his team. The findings chapter (see page 265) revealed that Yevgeni's team included Gavri, the former academic manager, Yosef, a lecturer, and in a way Narkis, who was then a vice president and the manager of the Israeli branch of International University. Narkis, who was part of the top management of the university, did not only actively support the 'One Year Programs' (see page 262 for example), but also the vision of integrated marketing belonged to her (see page 264). She was the manager who empowered Yevgeni as the champion for integrated marketing by means of the 'One Year Programs'. However, once she was replaced by Meital, who did not see integrated marketing as important for International University (see page 264), Yevgeni's power as integrated marketing's champion was substantially reduced. This demonstrates the importance of such organizational change in affecting the implementation of integrated marketing.
Organizational Changes

As argued in the literature review in the context of organizational changes necessary to implement integrated marketing (see page 121), organizational integration is essential for integrated marketing since it allows or encourages complete strategic and message integration (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). Sevier (1999, p. 4) also maintained that organizational integration involves coordinating resources and sharing goals, which is accomplished in an ideal world through the creation of organizational structures such as the ones outlined in the following diagram:

![Organizational Integration Diagram]

Figure 5.5 – Organizational Integration (Source: Sevier, 1999, p. 4)
(Originally Figure 2.4, page 121)

As noted in the findings chapter (see page 270), the main organizational changes were to occur sometimes after Narkis and later even Meital were replaced with Yevgeni and his privately owned marketing company being 'let go' by International University. Since Narkis and Yevgeni supported integrated marketing it might be expected that after they'd leave, the organizational structure of International University would be more
segregated. However, the findings revealed that the opposite was true, as demonstrated by the university's current organizational structure:

![Current Organizational Structure Diagram](image)

**Figure 5.6 - Current Organizational Structure, without the External Marketing Company, during 2002 (Originally Figure 4.2, page 194)**

In this figure, as Sevier (1999, p. 4) recommends on the subject of organizational integration in the literature review (see page 121), all marketing and communication functions at International University were
arrayed under one vice president. This was not the case earlier, during Yevgeni's time:

Figure 5.7 - Former Organizational Structure, before the External Marketing Company left the Organization, during 2000 up to the end of 2001 (Originally Figure 4.1, page 192)
By reviewing figure 5.7 in the previous page, it can be seen that the situation was much less integrated at International University prior to Yevgeni leaving the university. The figure also reveals that integration was a process at the university with all the consultants and telemarketing personnel, who were initially employed by the external marketing company, becoming employees of the Israeli company running the university's extension. This situation is somewhat surprising since this process of organizational integration was continuously led by Zvi. Therefore, it was decided to return to this issue later in the last part of this third section of this chapter, which discusses the importance of each of these factors in creating the aforementioned differentiation. However, before this can be undertaken, internal marketing needs further scrutiny.

**Internal Marketing**

In the literature review (see pages 123-124) it was noted that implementing integrated marketing may result in various problems such as resistance to change or rumours and misinformation flying with the only effective countermeasure to this being internal marketing (Sevier, 1998, p. 175). Training allows helping each member of the institution to understand 'how his or her role contributes to attracting and serving the institution's various publics and markets' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 40) as well as aiding in building message integration (Sevier, 1999, p. 4). The research at International University (see page 271) discovered that internal marketing was extremely limited with no training or incentives being offered to employees, resulting in many employees stopping to initiate new ideas for improving the institution. This illustrates that internal marketing is an important factor when implementing integrated marketing.
The Critical Factors in Implementing Integrated Marketing

Reviewing this third section of the findings chapter, it could seem that the most critical factor for the lack of success in the implementation of integrated marketing at International University was the personal conflict between Zvi and Yevgeni. Examining the materials in this section, it can be seen that not only Zvi wasn't against integrated marketing, but he was for it since he integrated the organizational structure. Since Zvi was also very business oriented, it is quite possible that he didn't even really object to the 'One Year Programs' but did resist them because they weren't his 'baby'. As Zvi (Man.Int. 13.05.02) noted in his interview, "Maybe the team developed these programs, but it [the idea] was Yevgeni's. I will not take this from him" (see 265 in the findings chapter).

However, although this conflict had a profound negative effect on the 'One Year Programs', and hence on integrated marketing, it was not the most critical factor. Rather the most critical factor was the dismissal of Narkis who supported integrated marketing and thus the 'One Year Programs'. Without Narkis, who had the vision for integrated marketing, top management support disappeared. Had she remained at the university it is possible that the conflict between Zvi and Yevgeni would have either turned out completely different or even not occurred at all. Therefore, the most critical factor is top management support, which when it is lacking personal conflicts may occur. These may result in intergroup conflict and in organizational politics. To avoid organizational politics as well as resistance to change internal marketing that includes training must be undertaken. Without internal marketing intrapersonal conflict could arise, resulting in integrated marketing being ineffective.
EFFECTIVENESS OF INTEGRATED MARKETING

This fourth and final section of this chapter considers how effective integrated marketing was at International University. Therefore, this section reviews effective enrolment in the context of students' expectations that resulted from promises during enrolment such as the 'One Year Programs', which in reality did not exist. A discussion of student satisfaction is undertaken using a typology of students' expectations. This is followed by a comparison of students' expectations compared to actual performance and how this influences perceived performance. This subsection is summed up by viewing enrolment as a continuous process involving all the factors identified in this paragraph.

The degree of success concerning organizational changes in responding to the target market is reviewed, focusing specifically on changes in the organizational structure. This leads into a significant discussion on the dependence of responsiveness in integrated marketing. This in turn allows the concluding part of this entire chapter to be presented, entitled 'rating marketing effectiveness', which revisits the overall low score given to the effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts by the 'marketing-effectiveness rating instrument'. These issues set the stage for developing the model for the implementation of integrated marketing that will be presented in the next, and last, chapter of this thesis, the conclusions chapter.
Effective Enrolment

According to Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 465), as noted in the literature review (see page 126), market share analysis is one of the indicators of marketing performance. As presented in the findings chapter (see pages 272-273), several interviewees commented that initially numerous students enrolled to International University because of the 'One Year Programs', thereby increasing the university's market share. However, later, since the 'One Year Programs' did not exist and promises to students were not kept, current students did not recommend the university. As revealed on page 243 of the findings chapter, 60 of the 153 students in Student Survey 02 (nearly 40%) did not recommend International University to anyone and only 15 students (less than 10%) recommended it to 4 persons or more. As a result there was a 25% decrease in student enrolment (see pages 272-273 in the findings chapter), thus decreasing International University's market share, since current students were dissatisfied with the institution due to their expectations not being met.

Student Satisfaction

Overall, student satisfaction was not a high one (see pages 281-282 in the findings chapter). As discussed in the literature review (see page 126), the level of customer satisfaction is determined by the difference between the service's perceived performance and the expectations of the service (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 41). From the previous paragraph it can be seen that enrolling students' expectations were created by promotional information given on International University, such as the existence of the 'One Year Programs', as well as recommendations given by current enrolled students.
Since the level of student satisfaction is determined by the difference between the university's perceived performance and the expectations of the university, the following typology was developed:

**Figure 5.8 - Typology of Customer Satisfaction**

From this figure it can be seen that (1) the highest student satisfaction occurs when perceived performance is higher than the students' expectations. The findings show that this situation was practically nonexistent at International University, since none of either the interviewed students or those in the survey said that they received from the university more than they expected (see pages 273-274). On the contrary, most of the students complained that their expectations were not met, and therefore the most common situation that existed at International University can be seen in the figure as (4). The lowest student satisfaction occurs when perceived performance is lower than the students' expectations. The research demonstrated that in many cases (see pages 273-274) even students who enrolled with low expectations were still negatively surprised, resulting in
(3) low satisfaction or medium satisfaction at the most. Regarding situation
(2) in the typology of high expectations being met by perceived
performance, this was also relatively rare (see pages 273-274 as well as
pages 281-282). The issue now that remained unresolved is what affects
perceived performance. From the previous subsection, this was clearly
expectations as actual performance. Accordingly, the typology below was
created based on the research at International University:

![Figure 5.9 - Typology of Perceived Performance]

From this figure it can be concluded that (1) the highest perceived
performance occurs when actual performance is higher than students' expectations. This situation did not occur at International University, since
students were given various promises regarding not only the 'One Year
Programs' but also convenience and high level of studies, which resulted in
unrealistically high expectations of the university (see pages 273-274).
Therefore, a situation that did occur at the university was that of (2) low-
medium perceived performance due to actual high performance (even
when this really took place) not meeting overly high expectations. For example, one student, who gave a high satisfaction rank between 9 and 10, still complained more needs to be invested in the building and in the classrooms (see page 281). Of course some students did have low expectations from the university (perhaps due to recommendations from their friends who were already enrolled), which resulted in (3) perceived performance being low due to the actual low performance of the university being as expected. Another common situation at the university was that of (4) the lowest perceived performance occurring when actual performance is lower than the students' expectations. The connection between actual performance and students' expectations, as well as the other issues discussed in the previous paragraphs, can be seen in the figure below:

![Figure 5.10 - Enrolment as a Continuous Process](image)

This figure illustrates enrolment is an ongoing process, where not only promotional activities, such as advertising, result in enrolment but satisfaction of current students is also necessary in giving recommendations that affect enrolment. At International University,
promises regarding the 'One Year Programs' did initially attract more students, creating certain expectations when enrolling. However, when the actual performance did not meet these expectations, resulting in a low perceived performance with more students were dissatisfied with the university. Consequently, fewer students recommended International University, which resulted in less potential students enrolling to the institution. One reason less students recommended International University was the lack of successful organizational changes.

As discussed in detail in the findings chapter (see pages 275-280), during Yevgeni's time at the university the marketing department was divided into two separate bodies: the Israeli marketing department and the Russian marketing department. Yevgeni was attempting to be responsive to both the potential Russian students' needs (as he perceived them) of consultations in the Russian language and to the potential Israeli students' needs, who were would not enrol if they heard the Russian language. However, this segregation was to backfire on International University, not only since it insulted the Russian students, thereby damaging their perceptions of the university, but also it created negative competition between the two departments. Zvi, after Yevgeni left the institution, tried to solve this by integrating the two departments.

This is a significant issue for this thesis, since it demonstrates that Yevgeni was trying to be responsive without undertaking integration, i.e. institutional responsiveness did exist but integrated marketing did not for the organizational structure during Yevgeni's time. Although it was discussed in the literature review that integrated marketing is one of several possible strategies available so as to achieve institutional
responsiveness (see page 97), this failure of International University raises
the issue whether a university can effectively achieve responsiveness
without integrated marketing. The answer according to Kotler and Fox's
(1995) seems to be a negative one (see page 126 in the literature review).

Rating Marketing Effectiveness

Kotler and Fox (1995) argue that the marketing effectiveness of an
institution 'is reflected in the degree to which it exhibits five major
attributes of a marketing orientation: a consumer-oriented philosophy, an
integrated marketing commitment, adequate marketing information, a
strategic orientation and, effective implementation' (p. 466). From this it
can be seen that not only responsiveness, or as Kotler and Fox (1995, p.
466) refer to it as a consumer-oriented philosophy, is essential to achieve
effectiveness, but integrated marketing is necessary as well. As discussed
all through the literature review, to succeed integrated marketing must
have commitment, be based on marketing information, take a strategic
orientation and have effective implementation.

Therefore, the low score of 9 that International University received in
Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 466) 'marketing-effectiveness rating
instrument', illustrating that the university's marketing effectiveness is
poor, is not surprising at all. As this discussion chapter clearly
demonstrated, International University had a low level of responsiveness,
the extent of integrated marketing was low with almost no commitment by
senior management, systematic market research was not carried out, no
strategic orientation took place, and even implementation failed. Even the
university's performance, which Kotler and Fox (1995, p. 466) argue does
not necessarily reveal institutional effectiveness (see page 126 in the literature review), was low with a decrease in enrolment and overall dissatisfied students.

However, these failures of International University are not only negative for this thesis. After all, as Thomas Edison put it: 'I have not failed 700 times. I have not failed once. I have succeeded in proving that those 700 ways will not work. When I have eliminated the ways that will not work, I will find the way that will work' (Famous Quotes, 2004). These failures of International University were thus instrumental in eliminating the ways that will not work when implementing integrated marketing and consequently aided in developing the model for the implementation of integrated marketing that will be presented in the next concluding chapter of this thesis.
Chapter 6 – Conclusions

This chapter presents an overview of what has been learnt from the research undertaken at International University in order to address the following subsidiary research questions, which were developed at the end of the literature review (see page 141):

*On the basis of this study at International University, can some sort of generalization, such as a theoretical framework on the implementation of integrated marketing, be formulated that would be relevant to other institutions of higher education? Can this generalization also lead to promising new directions for further research?*

Accordingly, this chapter is divided into three parts. The first and largest section, entitled ‘Recommendations’, commences by offering a model for the implementation of integrated marketing. This theoretical model attempts to achieve analytic generalization since it is based both on the research at International University and on selected materials from the literature review. This first section continues by presenting various practical recommendations, in context of the developed model, on implementing integrated marketing. The second section of this chapter, entitled ‘Contribution of this Case Study’, critically examines what this thesis has contributed to the field of integrated marketing in higher education. Finally, the third section of this chapter, entitled ‘New Directions for Further Research’, concludes the entire thesis by suggesting several new possibilities for further educational research on the subject of integrated marketing.
RECOMMENDATIONS

Below is the developed model relating to the implementation of integrated marketing. This is explored in general, by means of an overview, and then, in detail, via recommendations given in the context of each of the issues raised by this model:

![Clock Model for the Implementation of Integrated Marketing](image)

Figure 6.1 – Clock Model for the Implementation of Integrated Marketing

Overview of the Model

The model was built as a chronological clock in order to demonstrate that implementing integrated marketing is a circular ongoing process due to the fact that marketing is a dynamic activity and not a static one. As discussed in the literature review (see page 33), marketing is a dynamic
two-way process since it 'involves designing the institution's offerings to meet the target markets' needs and desires' (Kotler and Fox, 1995, p. 6). These needs and desires change over time. In order to address these needs and desires, responsiveness is essential. Therefore, top managers, who should view marketing as an overall philosophy, must have a vision of a responsive institution achieved by integrated marketing. Accordingly, this theoretical model puts a committed top management at its centre because without top managers' true commitment to integrated marketing throughout the process of its implementation, integrated marketing will ultimately fail (as was the case at International University). An institution's top management must also be committed to research, as the hands of the clock suggest.

**Commitment to Research**

Each of the five hands of the clock on the previous page is entitled 'Research' so as to illustrate that any action is not carried out unless it is supported by research. In this model, research includes not only external market research on topics such as potential students' needs, but also internal research subdivided into two categories: (a) internal market research, on issues such as satisfaction of current enrolled students, and (b) organizational research on issues such as employees' understandings of the importance of integrated marketing. This is an important recommendation since usually the focus of research is on external market aspects and not on internal ones, especially not on organizational issues. Without this external and internal research that provides top management continuous feedback on the implementation process, integrated marketing may not be effective.
Current Effectiveness

Once an institution's top management is committed to implementing integrated marketing so as to achieve institutional responsiveness, it must first assess the current effectiveness of its marketing. This can be done using Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 466) marketing-effectiveness rating instrument (see page 181 in the methodology chapter as well as Appendix C - Marketing-Effectiveness Rating Instrument). It is recommended to research not only information to fill this instrument in order to obtain a score for the institution's marketing effectiveness, but also to research deeper into the causes of the current score. This will allow performing an evaluation of the current competitive advantages and disadvantages of the institution so as to assure that the inherent competitive advantages of the institution are not damaged when integrated marketing is implemented in order to address the disadvantages.

For example, the study revealed that International University's location was a competitive advantage when potential students considered enrolling (see page 235 in the findings chapter) but its facilities were a disadvantage (see pages 223-226 in the findings chapter). To relocate to a building with high quality facilities would solve one problem but could also create another problem in the context of location (and therefore International University did not relocate). Only when the current competitive advantages and disadvantages of the institution are clearly mapped out, can the top management go about initiating the implementation process of integrated marketing by choosing a champion and later the team that plans and executes integrated marketing.
Champion and Team

Top management must choose as early as possible a champion who will lead the process of implementing integrated marketing. As noted in the literature review by various researchers (see page 117), the selected champion must be a strong one who is empowered by the top person of the institution, such as the university's president. When this is not the case, problems may arise. For instance, as discussed in the previous chapter (see page 318), Yevgeni was initially empowered by Narkis, who was then a vice president and the manager of the Israeli branch of International University, but not by Avi, who was International University's top manager as the president of the Israeli company running the university's extension in Israel. Once Narkis was replaced by Meital, who did not consider the 'One Year Programs' to be of high importance to International University, Yevgeni's power, as integrated marketing's champion, was substantially reduced. This allowed Zvi, who was then a vice president and marketing manager responsible for corporate sector, to eventually have Yevgeni and his company dismissed from the university due to a personal conflict between the two of them.

Therefore, care must be taken when choosing a champion. First, an institution's top management should undertake internal organizational research to assure that any of the candidates to hold the position of integrated marketing's champion possess not only the necessary managerial skills but also have sufficient power to create the changes necessary for implementing integrated marketing. Secondly, any candidate not having the required power must be automatically ruled out. Then, it is important that the champion is selected by the top manager of the institution as well as by as many of the top managers as possible to ensure that the champion
receives continuous top management support. This enduring support must be seen by all. Top management therefore should carry out internal marketing demonstrating the significance of integrated marketing for the organization. This process strengthens the power of the champion within the institution. This support can also be witnessed by additional members added to the team responsible for planning and executing integrated marketing.

In a similar manner to selecting a champion, an institution's top management should undertake internal organizational research to assure themselves that any of the candidates for the team led by the champion have the necessary skills and power to aid in implementing integrated marketing. As noted in the literature review (see pages 118-119), there is a need to 'include the people who will actually be involved in implementing the plan, the people who will pay for the plan, and the people, especially as part of the decision-making process, who will have to defend the plan to naysayers of all stripes' (Sevier, 1998, p. 170). Yevegni's team was too limited, including only Gavri, the former academic manager, Yosef, a lecturer, and in a way Narkis before she was replaced by Meital as the manager of the Israeli branch of International University (see discussion chapter, page 318). There weren't enough people involved in developing the plan. In addition, once Narkis left the institution, there was no one remaining with sufficient power on the team to defend the plan, which in itself was limited since this academic-oriented team focused on developing the 'One Year Programs' instead of developing a wider integrated marketing plan.
**Integrated Marketing Plan**

In the literature review (see pages 116-117), it was noted that a strategic plan based on research had to be developed before the undertaking of an integrated marketing plan could begin. However, revisiting the model on page 333, it can be clearly seen that no strategic plan existed, but rather immediately after choosing the champion and the team, an integrated marketing was offered. The reason for this is that one conclusion drawn from research at International University is that an integrated marketing plan needs enfolding into a strategic plan. Going back to the literature review (see page 116), it was noted that the integrated marketing plan was focused on marketing issues, containing the five major components of (1) marketing goals, (2) communication plan, (3) marketing action plans, (4) budget and (5) master calendar (Sevier, 1999, pp. 6-7). It was also stated there that marketing goals express what is hoped to be accomplished through the integrated marketing plan and hence tend to be strategic, often involving the first three Cs (customer solution, customer cost and convenience) and image-related activities (Sevier, 1999, p. 7).

However, an integrating marketing plan should always involve the first three Cs and not just often. Indeed, reviewing Sevier's (1999, pp. 6-7) definition of an integrated marketing plan, it can be seen that it is focused on marketing activities and therefore in reality it is more of an integrated marketing communication plan than a plan for implementing integrated marketing. As discussed in the literature review (see pages 87-88), integrated marketing communication is the fourth C (communication) and hence is only a part of integrated marketing that includes all 4 Cs. Therefore, since integrated marketing encompasses the entire institution, the integrated marketing plan must be strategic. The model on page 333,
taking this strategic aspect of the integrated marketing plan, suggests that it must be developed keeping the top management continuously involved.

Therefore, one recommendation of this research is that an integrated marketing plan should be based on ongoing research. This includes external market issues as well as internal research comprising internal market aspects and organizational topics. Top management must not only approve the plan when it is complete but must constantly be involved in its development. For example, top management should verify that the plan is based on sound research so as to avoid the situation that occurred at International University where planning was solely based on Yevgeni's personal knowledge of the market (see page 202 in the findings chapter for example). Thus, a further recommendation is to develop an integrated marketing plan in the following stages, which are based on Sevier's (1999, pp. 6-7) definition of an integrated marketing plan:

1. The overall purpose of the plan.
2. The marketing strategy.
3. Action plans.
4. The budget.
5. The master calendar.

1. **The overall purpose of the plan** should first review the institution's mission and vision. The champion and team should undertake this while involving the top management so as to assure them that everyone is on the same page (as integrated marketing requires). Then, the marketing goals can be set. These must be goals that cannot be interpreted by two people in a different manner. For example, a goal of increasing enrolment may hold two very different meaning for various role holders. Indeed, this was the case at International University, where the goals were to enrol as many
students as possible without any numbers to make them clearer (see page 269 in the findings chapter). Consequently, it is vital these goals have some sort of quantifiable element in them. For instance, a goal of increasing enrolment by 15% in each of the following three years is very clear. It also facilitates evaluation of whether it has been achieved or not after integrated marketing is implemented. Further, it is important that goals are realistic and based on research. For example, if no other competing institution of higher education achieved an enrolment increase of more than 5% a year in the marketplace and there are no radical market trends, to set a goal of increasing enrolment by 15% a year is unrealistic. Once these goals are set, it is important that they are approved in writing by the institution's top management (to ensure documentation that did not exist at International University) before the following stage of choosing the marketing strategy begins.

2. The marketing strategy should aim to achieve the marketing goals set in the previous stage. First, at least three different marketing strategies should be reviewed, each covering in detail the 4 Cs. This is to avoid a similar situation to the one at International University where the only market strategy was based on the 'One Year Programs' with no alternatives considered. These alternatives should be examined by undertaking research, including organizational research. Such organizational research is basically involving the staff in formulating strategic decisions. International University's staff was not involved in strategic decisions and this created frustration (see page 270 in the findings chapter). This also kick starts internal marketing of integrated marketing at a very early stage of the process. Involving staff at an early stage may also help identify potential resistance that each marketing strategy may encounter and thereby offer aid in selecting the one that has the highest chance of being
successfully implemented. Then, the various alternatives should be presented to the institution's top management for their written approval of a chosen strategy. This is done in order to assure support from top management before planning any actions.

3. **Action plans**, as discussed in the literature review (see pages 116-117), aid in achieving the marketing goals and thus 'detail how the activity will support the marketing goal, who will be responsible for its implementation, and note how the activity will be evaluated' (Sevier, 1999, p. 7). For example, if action plans include training, it is necessary to ensure that effective training takes place by seeing how it supports a marketing goal and that it does not contradict the marketing strategy. At International University, no training was given to the staff (see page 271 in the findings chapter), which also sent a message to employees, i.e. that integrated marketing is not really important to the university's top management since no money was invested in training the staff.

4. **The budget**, which was presented in the literature review (see page 117), 'will be a compilation of the budgets established for each marketing action plan and other resources' (Sevier, 1999, p. 8). The budget must be also based on sound research. For example, if an advertising campaign is proposed, it is important to research what are the actual costs of such a campaign. When implementing integrated marketing, the costs of integration should also be considered. At International University, a radio advertisement was produced, costing the university 300,000 NIS (nearly £40,000) without any means for the marketing department to react, including not being able to send potential students any promotional materials (see page 252-253 in the findings chapter). Therefore, it is important to create a precise budget, which considers interrelated costs,
and then get it approved in writing by the institution's top management. The budget must address time issues, for example, when is the money for each activity is actually allocated and according to which criteria. These calendar aspects are recorded in the master calendar.

5. The master calendar, or the time line, was offered in the literature review (see page 117), is a management tool that gives an exact understanding of what is happening when (Sevier, 1999, p. 8). The length of each activity must be based on research in order to achieve a realistic master calendar which may be substantially different for each institution and for each strategy. Then, the master calendar must be also presented to the institution's top management so as to obtain their written approval of it, including verifying when actual funds are expected to be given. This will enable the implementation process of integrated marketing within an institution to begin.

Realizing Integrated Marketing

Although the actual implementation of integrated marketing can only begin when there is a detailed well-documented integrated marketing plan, it is important to understand that unexpected obstacles may be encountered once the execution of the plan is underway. It is here that the importance of a strong champion becomes evident. At International University, Yevgeni was simply not strong enough when Narkis left (see page 318 in the discussion chapter) and thus could not overcome his conflict with Zvi, who was one of the main resistors to the 'One Year Program'. The members of Yevgeni's team were also not strong enough to handle conflict. Gavri, the former academic manager and one of the team members, could not win his
conflict with Meital, the former manager of the Israeli Branch of International University who replaced Narkis, which resulted ultimately in his losing the position of the academic manager and remaining only as a lecturer (see pages 258-259 in the findings chapter).

However, as argued in the previous chapter (see page 323), prevailing over conflict is not the most critical factor in implementing integrated marketing but rather the most critical factor is support from top management. As argued in the literature review (see page 114), to successfully implement integrated marketing the top manager of an institution, such as a university's president, should not just personally support integrated marketing but he or she should aggressively support integrated marketing or it will fail (Sevier, 1998, p. 39). Therefore, it is recommended that the top manager continuously undertake internal marketing to demonstrate to the various participants in the change process that he or she is actively involved in the implementation of integrated marketing led by the champion.

This aggressive support could include the top manager relentlessly communicating updates on the implementation of integrated marketing to the staff using various means such as meetings, bulletin boards or emails. As noted earlier in this chapter, investing in training also demonstrates to the staff that the top manager supports integrated marketing in more than just words. Undertaking actual organizational changes, such as putting all the marketing and communication functions, including student recruiting and fundraising, under one vice president (see page 121 in the literature review), also internally markets the top manager's support of integrated marketing. This support must be continuous and not decrease once institutionalization commences.
Institutionalizing Integrated Marketing

As discussed in the literature review (see page 125), implementation is focused on the specific actions taken to create change, while institutionalization occurs when attempts are made to stabilize the change in state (Williamson, 1999, p. 27). There is no clear line between the initial steps of implementation and institutionalization. However, as argued in the literature review (see page 125), institutionalization also requires continued support from the institution's leaders (Curry, 1992, Online). It is therefore not enough for the institution's top manager to initially support the implementation of integrated marketing. He or she must support its institutionalization as well.

For example, it may be possible that at the start of the implementation process, when Narkis was still at the university, Avi actually supported the 'One Year Programs', sharing Narkis's vision of integration, but later changed his mind regarding their importance and stopped supporting them. This lack of support was clearly expressed by Igor (I.M.Int. 30.05.02), who recalled (see page 264 in the findings chapter): "If after one year that I worked there Avi still asked what are the 'One Year Programs' and laughed about them, if the whole management doesn't decide that this is a serious step and implement so there is no use in my opinion". In such a situation, it would be practically impossible to institutionalize integrated marketing. However, even if integrated marketing's institutionalization did take place while being continuously supported by the top manager, there is a probability that these efforts were not in fact successful in improving the marketing effectiveness of an institution, which consequently must be reviewed again.
Current Effectiveness

The model (figure 6.1 on page 333) emphasizes that implementing integrated marketing is a circular ongoing process. In this model it is argued that the overall effectiveness of integrated marketing efforts cannot be reviewed during the initial implementation stage (entitled 'Realising Integrated Marketing' in the model). Rather it is argued that these efforts must be examined after institutionalization takes place since, after all, initial changes required by integrated marketing, such organizational integration, may disrupt the work and thus lower the effectiveness. This examination can be undertaken as it was when the process began by using Kotler and Fox's (1995, p. 466) marketing-effectiveness rating instrument.

This research suggest the need to investigate not only information relating to an institution's marketing effectiveness, but also to research deeper into the causes of the current score, thereby mapping out the current competitive advantages and disadvantages of the institution. Now it remains to examine whether change was successful, asking questions such as: Did the implementation of integrated marketing result in more competitive advantages for the institution? Has this change process been carried out while successfully maintaining the inherent competitive advantages of the institution? What still needs to be done to increase the score? The answers to such questions should result in initiating the implementation process of integrated marketing all over again with possibly a new champion and team chosen. Indeed, one of the contributions of this thesis to the field of integrated marketing in higher education is that the implementation process of integrated marketing in not a one-off process but rather a circular continuous process, which will be discussed in detail in the following section of this chapter.
CONTRIBUTION OF THIS CASE STUDY

This thesis has contributed in several ways to the field of integrated marketing in higher education. First, the case study at International University shed light on integrated marketing in higher education, which is a subject that has not been extensively researched. As noted in the introduction chapter (see page 20), only a few formal studies have discussed integrated marketing in the higher education setting (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 9). As also observed in the introduction chapter (see page 21), in Israel, not only did this lack of formal research on integrated marketing exist, but also the general subject of marketing has received surprisingly little attention.

For example, during the time this thesis's purpose was being formulated, none of the 52 faculty members in Bar-Ilan University's School of Education had published any material regarding the subject of marketing in education (School of Education at Bar-Ilan University, August 2001, Online). Furthermore, during April 2005, Bar-Ilan University's web site was revisited, and recent publications by the School of Education were reviewed, revealing that none addressed the subject of marketing (School of Education at Bar-Ilan University, March 2005, Online). This strengthened Lauer's (2001) claim (see page 116 in the literature review), that 'it is embarrassing to think that most academic institutions which consider themselves to be teaching and research organizations do little research about their own marketplace' (p. 136).

Second, the model for implementing integrated marketing (see figure 6.1 on page 333) is another important contribution resulting from the research at International University to the field of integrated marketing in higher
education. Although other models were found regarding implementing integrated marketing in higher education - and indeed the model in this thesis is partially based on them - no model was discovered that offered all the stages of implementing integrated marketing from a bird's eye view. For example, Sevier neither in his book, which is entitled 'Integrated Marketing for Colleges, Universities, and Schools', nor in his various articles (see references for a complete list) presents such an overview. In addition, reviewing Sevier's models reveals that they are somewhat linear with some limited feedback but are not circular like the model put forward in this chapter.

Finally, several analytical tools for grading quantitatively responsiveness as well as the extent of integrated marketing were developed in the discussion chapter, which may be additional contributions of this thesis to the field of integrated marketing in higher education. These analytical tools are partially based on materials in the literature review combined with the research at International University, and in this can claim some sort of analytic generalization. However, although these tools may be integrated into the model in this chapter, going over the model it can be easily seen that they were not actually integrated into it. The reason for this is that the thesis has also its limitations, which must be taken into account when considering using these analytical tools. After all, these tools were developed and tested on only one case study. Indeed, this is also true of the model for implementing integrated marketing offered in this chapter. Therefore, new research should be undertaken in order to refine both the abovementioned analytical tools and the aforementioned model, which will be discussed in detail in the following and last section of the entire thesis, accordingly entitled 'New Directions for Further Research'.
NEW DIRECTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

The outcome of any serious research can only be to make two questions grow where only one grew before.

Thorstein Veblen (1929) in Ehsan (2001, Online)

In order to achieve this view of research held by Veblen, an American economist and social scientist, this final section of the thesis suggests new directions for further research. First, in a general context, more formal studies of integrated marketing in the higher education setting need to be undertaken. As discussed in the literature review (see page 80), integrated marketing is fast becoming widespread, when already by the year ‘1999, a majority of colleges and universities in the United States reported practicing integrated marketing concepts at some level’ (Morris and Cejda, 2001, p. 4). It is therefore an intolerable situation that integrated marketing has not been sufficiently formally researched (as noted in the previous section of this chapter). Accordingly, below are a few questions for further research on the subject of integrated marketing in higher education:

- What is the present global extent of integrated marketing in higher education? Which countries have the highest degree of institutions of higher education implementing integrated marketing and why?
- In which institutions of higher education is there the highest success of implementing integrated marketing, and why?
- In which institutions is there the lowest success of implementing integrated marketing, and why?

Second, in a more specific context, new research should be undertaken so as to refine both the analytical tools and the model for implementing integrated marketing developed in this thesis. A number of potential questions might be taken into account, including:
• Are the analytical tools successful in grading quantitatively responsiveness or the extent of integrated marketing in other case studies?
• How can these tools be integrated into the model of implementing integrated marketing?
• Does the model require major changes? If so, what are the amendments and why were they chosen over other possibilities to improve the model?

Finally, research on integrated marketing should be carried out in education (i.e. schools) and not only higher education. There are several possible questions that should be examined when considering integrated marketing in education, such as:

• What should be the definition of integrated marketing in the context of education?
• How relevant is integrated marketing for each type of schools, such as comparing elementary school to high schools?
• Who is the customer in education? Is it the children or is it their parents?

Although these questions bring this thesis to its conclusion, they may yet be the start of someone else's research. As noted in the literature review (see page 27), 'experienced investigators review previous research to develop sharper and more insightful questions' (Yin, 1994, p. 9). It is thus sincerely hoped that this thesis will aid those who read it to continue Veblen's view of making two questions grow where only one grew before.
References


References


Appendix A - Interview Schedules

President’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compare to the past? (If so, which).
5. What is your relationship with students? With potential students?
   Do you have any relationship with students during their studies? (If there is, what kind?).
6. Does International University have a strategic marketing plan?
   (If not, why wasn’t it built? How do you plan a marketing strategy?)
   (If there is, May I have it? Who build this marketing strategy plan?
   What are the guidelines of this marketing strategy plan?
   How much time did you allocate for this?
   From which period is the marketing strategy plan?
   Is it up to date?).
7. How do you control that everything is going according to the marketing strategy plan?
8. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
9. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
   When did they begin? What is their status now?
10. How were the potential students informed about the ‘One Year Programs’?
11. Did any students or potential students approach you in regards to the ‘One Year Programs’?
12. Why, from your point of view, did the ‘One Year Programs’ not succeed?
13. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not other university?
14. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
15. What are the students’ expectations from the studies?
16. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
   B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
17. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
18. What is your relationship with the Marketing Department?
19. With whom are you in contact or relationship within the institute?
   (People or departments).
20. If you could, would you change something in your job? (For example, in working with the Marketing Department).
21. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Manager of the Israeli Branch’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compare to the past? (If so, which).
5. What is your relationship with students? With potential students?
   Do you have any relationship with students during their studies? (If there is, what kind?).
6. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
7. What do you know about the “One Year Programs”?
   When did they begin? What is their status now?
8. How were the potential students informed about the ‘One Year Programs’?
9. Did any students or potential students approach you in regards to the ‘One Year Programs’?
10. Why, from your point of view, did the ‘One Year Programs’ not succeed?
11. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not other university?
12. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
13. What are the students’ expectations from the studies?
14. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
15. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
16. Do you have any relationship with the Marketing Department?
    (If so, what kind).
17. With whom are you in contact or relationship within the institute?
    (People or departments)
18. If you could, would you change something in your job?
19. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
    If there is, you can contact me.
    Thank you very much for your time.
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Marketing Manager’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long have you been working here and what were your previous jobs in the institute?
3. What does your job include?
4. What are the functions of the Marketing Department?
5. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compare to the past? (If so, which).
6. How do you know what the market wants?
7. With whom are you in contact or relationship within the institute?
   (People or departments)
8. Does International University have a strategic marketing plan?
   (If not, why wasn’t it built? How do you plan a marketing strategy?)
   (If there is, May I have it? Who build this marketing strategy plan?
    What are the guidelines of this marketing strategy plan?
    How much time did you allocate for this?
    From which period is the marketing strategy plan?
    Is it up to date?).
9. How do you control that everything is going according to the marketing strategy plan?
10. With whom do you collaborate regarding marketing decisions?
    Are you pleased with this cooperation?
11. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
12. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
13. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
14. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
15. What is the present and past status of enrollment?
    Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
16. Do you have any relationship with students during their studies?
    With potential students (If so, what came out of it)?
17. What are the students’ expectations from International University? (From the studies or any other subject)
18. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
19. What was your involvement in the ‘One Year Programs’?
20. When did the idea of the ‘One Year Programs’ come up?
    Who was in the team that developed them?
    How did the team develop them?
    Did the team inform other functions in the institute about the ‘One Year Programs’?
21. When did you start to market the ‘One Year Programs’?
    How did potential student react to the ‘One Year Programs’?
22. Why did the ‘One Year Programs’ not succeed?
23. Does International University meet the needs of the students?
24. If you could, would you change something in your job? (If so, what and why)?
25. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me. Thank you very much for your time.
Academic Manager's Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
   Since when have you been the Academic Manager?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compare to the past? (If so, which).
5. Did you have any relationship with the Marketing Department? (If so, what kind).
6. What do you know about the 'One Year Programs'?
   Who did develop them and how?
7. Did you inform potential students about the 'One Year Programs'?
8. Did any students or potential students approach you in regards to the 'One Year Programs'?
9. Did you inform any lecturers about the 'One Year Programs'?
10. Why, from your point of view, did the 'One Year Programs' not succeed?
11. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
12. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
13. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
14. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
15. What are the potential students' expectations from the studies?
16. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
17. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
18. What type of relationship did you have with the students during their studies?
19. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
20. If you could, would you change something in your job?
21. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Administration’s Interview Schedule (Pilot)

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
4. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
5. How did you inform potential students about the ‘One Year Programs’?
6. Did any students or potential students approach you in regards to the ‘One Year Programs’?
7. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
8. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
9. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
10. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
11. What are the potential students’ expectations from the studies?
12. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
13. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
14. Do you have any relationship with students during their studies?
    (If there is, what kind?).
15. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
16. If you could, would you change something in your job?
17. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
    If there is, you can contact me.
    Thank you very much for your time.
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Administration’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
5. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
6. How did you inform potential students about the ‘One Year Programs’?
7. Did any students or potential students approach you in regards to the ‘One Year Programs’?
8. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
9. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
10. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
11. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
12. What are the potential students’ expectations from the studies?
13. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
   B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
14. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
15. Do you have any relationship with students during their studies?
   (If there is, what kind?).
16. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
17. If you could, would you change something in your job?
18. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Marketing’s Interview Schedule (Pilot A)

1. Age, sex.
2. How long have you been working in the Marketing Department?
3. What does your job include?
4. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
5. How did you inform potential students about the ‘One Year Programs’?
6. What was their response?
7. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
8. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
9. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
10. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
11. What are the potential students’ expectations from the studies?
12. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met and is this a part of your job?
13. Why, in your opinion, is there a decrease in enrollment?
14. Regarding the students that you enrolled, do you have any relationship with them during their studies?
15. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
16. Does International University fulfil the students’ needs?
17. If you could, would you change anything in your job in the Marketing Department? (If so, why?)
18. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
    If there is, you can contact me.
    Thank you very much for your time.
Marketing's Interview Schedule (Pilot B)

1. Age, sex.
2. How long have you been working in the Marketing Department?
3. What does your job include?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compared to the past? (If so, which).
5. What do you know about the 'One Year Programs'?
6. How did you inform potential students about the 'One Year Programs'?
7. What was their response?
8. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
9. Which field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most and why, from your point of view?
10. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
11. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
12. What are the potential students' expectations from the studies?
13. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
   B) How do you know that their expectations were met and is this a part of your job?
14. Why, in your opinion, is there a decrease in enrollment?
15. Do you have any relationship with students that you enrolled during their studies?
16. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
17. Does International University fulfill the students' needs?
18. If you could, would you change anything in your job in the Marketing Department? (If so, why?)
19. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
20. Why did the 'One Year Programs' not succeed?
21. When did the 'One Year Programs' begin?
   When did you start to market the 'One Year Programs'?
   When did you stop marketing the 'One Year Programs'?
   Thank you very much for your time
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Marketing’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
2. How long have you been working in the Marketing Department?
3. What does your job include?
   A) What do you think about the separation of the Russian Marketing Department from the Israeli Marketing Department?
   In your opinion, do the Russian students prefer academic consultation in the Russian language?
   Do Russian students prefer a situation in which the majority of students in the classroom are Russians?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compare to the past? (If so, which).
5. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
6. How did you inform potential students about the ‘One Year Programs’?
7. What was their response?
8. When did the ‘One Year Programs’ begin?
   When did you start to market the ‘One Year Programs’?
   When did you stop marketing the ‘One Year Programs’?
9. Why did the ‘One Year Programs’ not succeed?
10. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
11. What field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most? And why, from your point of view?
12. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
13. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
14. What are the potential students’ expectations from the studies?
15. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met and is this a part of your job?
16. Is there a decrease in enrollment?
    Why, in your opinion, is there a decrease in enrollment?
17. Regarding the students you enrolled, do you have any relationship with them during their studies?
18. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
19. Does International University fulfil the students’ needs?
20. If you could, would you change anything in your job in the Marketing Department? (If so, why?)
21. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Interview Schedule Number 1 for a Lecturer and One of the Developers of the ‘One Year Programs’

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compared to the past? (If so, which).
5. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
   Who did develop them and how?
   Who did approach you regarding the ‘One Year Programs’?
   What was your part in their development?
   With whom did you work in collaboration to develop them?
   When did the planning of the ‘One Year Programs’ begin?
   When did the ‘One Year Programs’ start to function?
   What was your involvement in the ‘One Year Programs’ after they started to function?
6. Did you inform potential students about the ‘One Year Programs’?
7. Did any students or potential students approach you regarding the ‘One Year Programs’?
8. Did you have any relationship with the Marketing Department? (If so, which?)
9. Did you inform any lecturers about the ‘One Year Programs’?
10. Why, from your point of view, did the ‘One Year Programs’ not succeed?
11. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
12. Which field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most and why, from your point of view?
13. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
14. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
15. What are the potential students’ expectations from the studies?
16. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
   B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
17. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
18. What type of relationship did you have with the students during their studies?
19. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
20. If you could, would you change something in your job?
21. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Lecturer’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
   Do you have an academic degree?
2. How long do you work here?
3. What does your job include?
4. Who is the target market of International University?
   Were there any changes when compared to the past? (If so, which).
5. What do you know about the ‘One Year Programs’?
6. Did you inform potential students or students about the ‘One Year Programs’?
7. Did any students or potential students approach you in regards to the ‘One Year Programs’?
8. Did you inform any other lecturers about the ‘One Year Programs’?
9. Why, from your point of view, did the ‘One Year Programs’ not succeed?
10. What are the potential students mainly interested in when coming to enroll?
11. Which field of studies are the potential students attracted to the most and why, from your point of view?
12. What are the potential students attracted to in the studies?
13. Why, from your point of view, do potential students choose International University and not another university?
14. What are the potential students’ expectations from the studies?
15. A) In your opinion, are their expectations met?
    B) How do you know that their expectations were met?
16. Is there any decrease in enrollment? (If so why, from your point of view).
17. Are you in contact or relationship with any other people or departments in the institute?
18. If you could, would you change something in your job?
19. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Interview Schedule Number 2 (Re-interview) for a Lecturer and One of the Developers of the 'One Year Programs'

1. What is the current situation of the 'One Year Programs'?
2. What was the process regarding the 'One Year Programs' that actually took place and what is the situation regarding updated planning and control?
3. Why, from your point of view, did the 'One Year Programs' not succeed?
4. How did the students respond to the fact that the 'One Year Programs' did not succeed?
5. How did the institute respond to the fact that the 'One Year Programs' did not succeed?
6. If you could go back in time, would you change something in the planning of the 'One Year Programs'?
   Do you think that the 'One Year Programs' should have been developed differently? (If so, how?)
7. In hindsight, do you think that the 'One Year Programs' were a good idea for International University? (If so, why?)
8. Is there still a decrease in enrollment? (If so, why?)
9. Is there anything that you would like to add or say?
   If there is, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Student Pilot A's Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
2. Academic year (1,2,3).
3. Academic field of studies.
4. Previous academic institute. (If exists, what did you not like about it?)
5. Are you working now? (If so, where?)
   Are you working or worked in the field that you are studying now?
6. Parents education.
   Did your parents come with you to enroll? (Or to have an academic consultation?)
7. How do you finance your studies? (By yourself, your parents, a scholarship, your employer such as the police, the army or a company).
   (This question was not asked in the interview)
8. How did you hear about International University? (By newspaper, conference, advertising or any other means).
9. With whom did you speak in International University? (Including phone, a meeting with someone representative or any other way).
10. Did you come alone to the academic consultation meeting in the Marketing Department? (If not, why did you bring that certain person)
11. What was the thing that helped you to enroll in the academic consultation meeting?
12. Before you enrolled, which academic institutions or special programs did you examine?
13. What convinced you to enroll to International University?  
   (Comment: the ‘One Year Programs’, high chance of finding a job or any other interest. Did the student hear about International University before but the decision to enroll came just when the student heard about the ‘One Year Programs’? This comment was not asked in the interview but was an example of answering the question for the interviewer).
14. What are your expectations from the ‘One Year Program’ (From an academic and professional point of view)
15. What are the advantages of the ‘One Year Program’?  
   (Comment: Is the student expecting to find a job more easily after passing the ‘One year program? This comment was not asked in the interview but was an example of answering the question for the interviewer).
16. Do you think to continue another two years to complete the academic degree?  
   (If so, what causes you to continue?)
17. What are your professional ambitions? What is the ‘job of your dreams’?  
   Why did you choose the field of studies that you are in?
18. Which courses, in your opinion, will contribute to you the most in the ‘One Year Program’?  
   Which courses, in your opinion, will contribute to you the most in the entire academic degree?
19. What are your demands of the studies?
20. Which courses do you expect to be taught in the ‘One Year Program’?
21. What do you expect from the lecturers of the ‘One Year Program’?
22. Are there important subjects that are not being taught in the ‘One Year Program’? (If so, which?)
23. Are there any subjects that are not directly related to the specific field of the ‘One Year Program’, but in your opinion need to be taught?
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Student Pilot B’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex.
2. Academic year (1,2,3).
3. Academic field of studies.
4. Previous academic institute. (If exists, what did you not like about it?)
5. Are you working now? (If so, where?)
   Are you working or worked in the field that you are studying now?
6. Parents education.
   Did your parents come with you to enroll? (Or to have an academic consultation?)
7. How do you finance your studies? (By yourself, your parents, a scholarship, your employer such as the police, the army or a company).
   (This question was not asked in the interview)
8. How did you hear about International University? (By newspaper, conference, advertising or any other means).
9. With whom did you speak in International University? (Including phone, a meeting with someone representative or any other way).
10. Did you come alone to the academic consultation meeting in the Marketing Department? (If not, why did you bring that certain person)
11. What was the thing that helped you to enroll in the academic consultation meeting?
12. Before you enrolled, which academic institutions or special programs did you examine?
13. What convinced you to enroll to International University?
   (Comment: the ‘One Year Programs’, high chance of finding a job or any other interest. Did the student hear about International University before but the decision to enroll came just when the student heard about the ‘One Year Programs’? This comment was not asked in the interview but was an example of answering the question for the interviewer).
14. What are your expectations from the ‘One Year Program’ (From an academic and professional point of view)
15. What are the advantages of the ‘One Year Program’?
   (Comment: Is the student expecting to find a job more easily after passing the ‘One year program’? This comment was not asked in the interview but was an example of answering the question for the interviewer).
16. Do you think to continue another two years to complete the academic degree? (If so, what causes you to continue?)
17. When did you hear about the ‘One Year Program’ and what was attracting to you about it?
   When did you start studying in the ‘One Year Program’?
18. Which courses of the ‘One Year Program’ did you expect would contribute to you the most?
   Which courses did actually contribute to you and how?
19. Are there any other courses from the academic degree that you would add to the ‘One Year Program’? (If so, why?)
20. Which courses did you expect to be taught in this ‘One Year Program’?
   What would you change in the ‘One Year Program’?
21. What did you expect from the lecturers of the ‘One Year Programs’
when compared to those of the academic degree? (Is there any
difference?)
Are you pleased with the lecturers that taught in the ‘One Year Program’? (If so,
in what sense? If not, what would you change?)
22. In your opinion, are there any important subjects that are not being
taught in this ‘One Year Program’? (If so, which?)
23. Are there any subjects that are not directly related to the field of studies
of the ‘One Year Program’ that you believe need to be taught? (If so,
which?)
24. Do you feel that the ‘One Year Program’ is contributing to your future
career? (If so, in which way?)
Do you feel that the studies of the academic degree are contributing to your
future career? (If so, in which way?)
Did the studies meet your expectations?
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Student Pilot C’s Interview Schedule

1. Age, sex, year of immigration to Israel, country of origin.
2. Academic year.
3. Academic field in the ‘One Year Program’.
   Academic field in the degree.
4. Did you already begin the studies of the ‘One Year Program’? (If so, when? When do you estimate that you will finish the ‘One Year Program’?)
5. Parents’ education: academic/ not academic.
   Did they come with you to enroll?
6. Did you study in another academic institution? (If so, criticize. What didn’t you like about it?)
7. Do you work during the studies? (If so, do you work or have you worked in the field of your studies?)
8. Are you on any scholarship or does your employer or somebody else finance your studies?
9. How did you hear about International University? (By newspaper, conference, advertising or any other means)
10. Who did you contact the first time you approached International University and by which means? (Telephone, face to face)
11. Did you come by yourself to the academic consultation in the Marketing Department? (If not, why did you bring that certain person?)
   Was the academic consultation given in Russian or in Hebrew?
   Would you prefer the academic consultation to be in Russian or in Hebrew?
12. What was the specific thing that convinced you to enroll to International University and not to any other university? Was it something that you spoke about in the academic consultation in the Marketing Department?
   (Comment: The ‘One Year Programs’, high chance to find a job, other interests. This comment was not asked in the interview but was an example of answering the question for the interviewer).
13. Before you enrolled, did you check any other academic institutions or special programs? (If so, why did you not pick them?)
14. In your opinion, which is the target market of International University?
15. What are your academic and professional expectations of the ‘One Year Program’?
16. What are your impressions from the ‘One Year Program’ so far?
17. In your opinion, what are the advantages of the ‘One Year Programs’?
   (Comment: Is the student expecting to find a job more easily after passing the ‘One year program? This comment was not asked in the interview but was an example of answering the question for the interviewer).
18. Do you plan to also finish the academic degree? (If so, why?)
19. What are your professional ambitions? What is the ‘job of your dreams’?
   Why did you choose this specific field of studies?
20. In your opinion, which courses in the ‘One Year Program’ will contribute to you the most and why?
21. Which courses or subjects do you expect will be taught in this ‘One Year Program’?
22. Which courses, in your opinion, will contribute to you the most in the entire academic degree and why?
23. What sort of demands do you have from the studies in the ‘One Year Program’?
   Do these demands differ from the demands from the studies of the academic degree? (If so, in which way?)

24. What do you expect from the lecturers of the ‘One Year program’?
   Are you pleased with the lecturers of the ‘One Year Program’?
   Are your expectations from the lecturers of the ‘One Year Program’, different from those of the lecturers of the academic degree. (If so, in which way?)

25. In your opinion, are there any important subjects that are not being taught in this ‘One Year Program’? (If so, which?)

26. Are there any subjects that are not directly related to the field of the ‘One Year Program’ that need to be taught in it? (If so, which and why?)

27. What is your impression of International University?
   Is it different from your first impression? (If so, in which way and why?)

28. Do you have any comments, subjects or some other things that you would like to add or say? If you do, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Appendix A - Interview Schedules

Interview Schedule for Students who finished the 'One Year Program'

1. Age, sex, year of immigration to Israel, country of origin.
2. Academic year (If continuing to the academic degree).
3. Academic field in the 'One Year Program'.
   Academic field of the degree.
4. Have you been interviewed during the period of the studies of the 'One Year Program'?
5. When did you begin the studies of the 'One Year Program' and when did you finish them?
   Did the length of the studies meet your expectations?
6. Do you work in the field that you studied in the 'One Year Program' or in the academic degree?
7. Who were you in touch with during the studies of the 'One Year Program' in International University?
8. Did the 'One Year Program' meet your expectations academically and professionally?
9. What is your overall impression of the 'One Year Program'?
10. What are the advantages and disadvantages of the 'One Year Program'?
11. Which courses in the 'One Year Program' contribute to you the most and why?
   Which courses in the 'One Year Program' did you expect would contribute to you the most?
12. Are there any courses in the 'One Year Program' that you would have preferred not to take if you could? (If so, which courses and why?)
13. (Comment to the interviewer: if the student is continuing to the academic degree), Are there any courses in the academic degree that you would add to the 'One Year Program'? (If so, why?)
14. Are there any important subjects that were not included in the 'One Year Program'? (If so, which and why?)
15. Did the studies in the 'One Year Program' meet your expectations? (If so, in which way?)
16. Are you pleased with the lecturers that taught in the 'One Year Program'? (Why?)
17. What would you change in the 'One Year Program'?
18. Did the 'One Year Program' contribute to your career?
19. Would you recommend the 'One Year Program'? (If so, what especially would you like to recommend? If not, why?)
20. What are your impressions of International University?
   Is it different from the past? (If so, in which way and why?)
21. Would you recommend International University's academic degree?
22. Do you have any comments, subjects or some other things that you would like to add or say? If you do, you can contact me.
   Thank you very much for your time.
Appendix B - Student Survey Questionnaire

*Please, fill the entire questionnaire (two pages). There is no need to fill names, as it is anonymous. Thank you in advance!

1. Age _____ Sex: m / f Country of birth: _____ Year of immigration: _____

2. Year at the university: 1 / 2 / 3 / more than 3
   If more than 3, indicate the reason: __________

3. When did you enroll to the university? _____ When did you start to study? _____
   Month Year Month Year

4. Program of study at the university: ________________________________

5. Rank your satisfaction with the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   Reason for rank: _____________________________________________

6. Did your parents come with you to the registration or to consultation? Yes / No

7. Father’s education academic? Yes / No Mother’s education academic? Yes / No

8. Are you working during the studies? Yes / No
   If you are working, do you work in the area you are studying at the university? Yes/No

9. Who is financing your studies (it is possible to mark more than one)
   Self financing / scholarship / parents / employer / other _______

10. Did you learn at another institution of higher education before here? Yes/No (Which? _____)

11. Did you, before enrolling here, check other institutions of higher education? Yes / No
    (Which institutions? ______________)

12. How did you come to this university?
    Advertising / studies-exhibition / friend / was called by the university / other ___________

13. In which language was the consultation given? Hebrew / Russian Were you satisfied
    with this?
    1) Yes
    2) No, I’d have preferred consultation in _____
    3) It doesn’t matter to me in which language the consultation is given.

14. What was told you during the consultation meeting that helped you enrol at the university?

15. Rank your satisfaction with the marketing department at the university:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low satisfaction</td>
<td>High satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   Reason for rank: _____________________________________________

16. Why did you decide to enrol here and not to another institution?

   ____________________________________
Appendix B - Student Survey Questionnaire

17. What were your expectations when you enrolled to the studies?

18. Rank your satisfaction with the content of the studies at the university:

   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   Low satisfaction  High satisfaction

   Reason for rank:

19. Rank your satisfaction with the level of studies at the university:

   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   Low satisfaction  High satisfaction

   Reason for rank:

20. When you started to learn, who helped you put together your system of hours?

21. Rank your satisfaction with the secretariat at the university:

   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   Low satisfaction  High satisfaction

   Reason for rank:

22. Who gave you the best service at the university?
   Elaborate on the case:

23. Rank your satisfaction with the lecturers at the university:

   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   Low satisfaction  High satisfaction

   Reason for rank:

24. When you run into a problem, whom do you turn to at the university? (Elaborate on the type of problem and to whom you turn)

25. Who are the managers of the University and of the Israeli Company, and what their job is?

26. Rank your satisfaction with the management of the university:

   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   Low satisfaction  High satisfaction

   Reason for rank:

27. To how many people have you recommended to enrol to the university? 0/ 1/ 2 / 3/ 4 and up

28. Rank your satisfaction with the ambience at the university:

   1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

   Low satisfaction  High satisfaction

   Reason for rank:

29. Further comments:
Appendix C - Marketing-Effectiveness Rating Instrument

Source: Kotler and Fox (1995, pp. 467-469)

CONSUMER-ORIENTED PHILOSOPHY

SCORE

A. Does the admissions officer participate in the overall college planning process?
0 □ The admissions officer does not participate in college planning. The officer is simply given recruitment goals set by the central administration.
1 □ The admissions officer is asked for certain data and suggestions relative to college needs but does not participate in the formal college planning process.
2 □ The admissions officer is a participant in the annual and long-range planning of the college's future.

B. What is the dominant philosophy of the admissions office?
0 □ Wait and see how many applications come in and go out and beat the pavement to fill the sales gap.
1 □ Reach out everywhere and anywhere students can be found.
2 □ Identify major college sources, rate them on their potential student yield, and allocate time and choose strategies accordingly.

C. How aware and responsive is the admissions office to major environmental trends and developments?
0 □ The admissions office pays little attention to the changing environment.
1 □ The admissions office keeps informed but is slow to respond to new opportunities.
2 □ The admissions office is on top of changing trends and opportunities and is quick to respond.

INTEGRATED MARKETING COMMITMENT

SCORE

D. Does the admissions officer have sufficient influence or control over the resources that matter to effective recruitment?
0 □ No.
1 □ Somewhat.
2 □ Yes.

E. Is the admissions officer in close touch with the faculty and deans?
0 □ The admissions officer rarely meets faculty members to learn what they are doing.
1 □ The admissions officer occasionally attends faculty functions to sense possible opportunities for admission strategy.
2 □ The admissions officer cultivates close relations with the faculty or specific faculty members to sense possible admissions opportunities.

F. Does the admissions office make good use of volunteers?
0 □ Volunteers are expected to work hard for the college, and little motivation is provided.
1 □ Volunteers are thanked in the course of their work.
2 □ Volunteers are treated to special benefits and acknowledgment and helped to feel like a major force in the total effort.
Appendix C - Marketing-Effectiveness Rating Instrument

ADEQUATE MARKETING INFORMATION

SCORE

G. Is the information system adequate and easy to use?
0 □ The information system is missing some important data and is not conveniently organized.
1 □ The information system contains most of the needed data and is conveniently organized.
2 □ The information system contains all of the needed data and is conveniently organized.

H. When were the latest studies conducted of the perceptions and attitudes of key college sources toward the institution?
0 □ Several years ago.
1 □ A few years ago.
2 □ Recently.

I. What effort is expended to measure and improve the cost-effectiveness of different recruitment approaches?
0 □ Little or no effort.
1 □ Some effort.
2 □ Substantial effort.

STRATEGIC ORIENTATION

SCORE

J. What is the extent of formal recruitment planning?
0 □ The admissions office does little or no formal recruitment planning.
1 □ The admissions office develops an annual recruitment plan.
2 □ The admissions office develops a detailed annual recruitment plan and a careful long-range plan that is updated annually.

K. What is the quality of the current recruitment strategy?
0 □ The current strategy is not clear.
1 □ The current strategy is clear and represents a continuation of traditional strategy.
2 □ The current strategy is clear, innovative, data-based, and well reasoned.

L. What is the extent of contingency thinking and planning?
0 □ The admissions officer does little or no contingency thinking.
1 □ The admissions officer does some contingency thinking but little formal contingency planning.
2 □ The admissions officer formally identifies the most important contingencies and develops contingency plans.

EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION

SCORE

M. How well are the recruitment strategies, policies, and techniques communicated and implemented up and down the line?
0 □ Poorly.
1 □ Fairly.
2 □ Successfully.

N. Does the admissions office have adequate resources, and does it use them effectively?
0 □ The resources are inadequate for the job to be done.
1 □ The resources are adequate but they are not employed optimally.
2 □ The resources are adequate and are employed efficiently.

O. What are the quality and adequacy of written communications going to the market?
0 □ The written communications are inadequate and poor in execution.
1 □ The written communications are adequate but uneven in execution.
2 □ The written communications are adequate and high in quality.